

**RFQ #926564 Stormwater Improvements - 1807 21st Ave South
Evaluation Team Score Sheet**

Offeror	Cumberland Valley Constructors	Garney Companies, Inc.	Jarrett Builders, Inc.	L & G Construction Co., Inc.	SBW Constructors, LLC	Walker Building Group
Contract Acceptance	Accept	Accept	Accept	Accept	Accept	Accept
Project Approach (25 Points)	24.00	23.00	22.00	10.00	19.00	15.00
Project Schedule and Risk Mitigation (25 Points)	24.00	23.00	18.00	10.00	15.00	20.00
Firm Qualifications and Capacity (10 Points)	9.00	10.00	7.00	5.00	6.00	8.00
Team Qualifications (5 Points)	5.00	4.00	3.00	2.00	3.00	4.00
Cost (35 Points)	28.13	28.08	28.39	31.20	35.00	26.33
Total Evaluation Scores	90.13	88.08	78.39	58.20	78.00	73.33

Evaluation Comments

Cumberland Valley Constructors

Strengths - Formatted response to RFP requirements was very organized across all evaluation criteria sections.

Project Approach: Organized and detailed; detailed communication plan; thorough traffic control plan and easy to follow.

Project Schedule and Risk Mitigation: Mentioned Belmont hours and bus routes; provided sketches related to any utility conflicts.

Firm Qualifications and Capacity: Provided major subcontractors on referenced projects; detailed presentation for referenced projects.

Team Qualifications: Detail regarding subcontractor experience.

Weaknesses -

Project Approach: No indication if storage laydown is near the project limits.

Project Schedule and Risk Mitigation: No indication of when potholing will be completed within schedule; gantt chart and final completion date listed do not fall within the requested schedule of 90 calendar days.

Firm Qualifications and Capacity: Did not provide number of change orders on referenced projects; did not provide subcontractor workload.

Team Qualifications: N/A

Garney Companies, Inc.

Strengths -

Project Approach: Good, detailed communication plan including daily website updates; offered to do pre-con meeting with the public; strong approach with traffic control phases; did offer to have a storage laydown and office near the project limits; did mention all lanes would be open during morning and evening rush hours.

Project Schedule and Risk Mitigation: N/A

Firm Qualifications and Capacity: Provided major subcontractors on referenced projects; detailed presentation for referenced projects; provided number of change orders on referenced projects; provided subcontractor workload.

Team Qualifications: Detailed Team Qualifications.

Weaknesses -

Project Approach: No indication that traffic control has been coordinated with Public Works.

Project Schedule and Risk Mitigation: Stated completion of project within timeframe but gantt chart was inconsistent with the schedule; unclear on potential overruns within Risk Mitigation; not potholing before notice to proceed within schedule.

Firm Qualifications and Capacity: N/A

Team Qualifications: No listing of subcontractor's years experience and capacity.

Jarrett Builders, Inc.

Strengths -

Project Approach: Good communication plan; did offer to have a storage laydown and office near the project limits; mentioned pre-con pictures within approach; thorough detail in sewer bypassing within approach; good exhibit and understanding to traffic control phasing plan.

Project Schedule and Risk Mitigation: Discussion of daily cleanup and quality assurance.

Firm Qualifications and Capacity: Detailed presentation for referenced projects.

Team Qualifications: N/A

Weaknesses -

Project Approach: Proposed additional drainage structures; overruns related to 3 bypass pumps; no indication that traffic control has been coordinated with Public Works; no mention of how daily updates would be handled.

Project Schedule and Risk Mitigation: Overruns related to 3 bypass pumps and pole relocation within risk mitigation.

Firm Qualifications and Capacity: Did not state number of employees or crews dedicated to capacity to perform scope of work; did not include subcontractor's workload; did not list major subcontractors and unclear information related to the number of change orders on referenced projects.

Team Qualifications: Mentioned usage of subcontractor for flatwork, but not depicted on subcontractor form or within Team Qualifications; no listing of subcontractor's years experience and capacity.

L & G Construction Co., Inc.

Strengths -

Project Approach: N/A

Project Schedule and Risk Mitigation: N/A

Firm Qualifications and Capacity: Prime contractor's experience related to scope of work.

Team Qualifications: N/A

Weaknesses -

Project Approach: No cover letter as part of the approach; did not include any major tasks or subtasks; phasing plan lacked detail; lacked detailed communication plan; no indication that traffic control has been coordinated with Public Works; did not offer to have a storage laydown near the project limits.

Project Schedule and Risk Mitigation: Not enough detail or understanding within Project Schedule and Risk Mitigation to justify meeting deliverables requested; no mention of potholing before pre-construction meeting.

Firm Qualifications and Capacity: No mention of firm's capacity to perform the work; no photos or graphics in referenced projects; no major subcontractors listed; no change orders listed; explanation of liquidated damages at Old Matthews Road was incorrect.

Team Qualifications: Did not list any information about subcontractors.

SBW Constructors, LLC

Strengths - Formatted response to RFP requirements was very organized across all evaluation criteria sections.

Project Approach: Good communication plan; detailed phasing approach.

Project Schedule and Risk Mitigation: Clearly defined potential risk; defined indirect deliverables.

Firm Qualifications and Capacity: Prime contractor did have experience related to scope of work.

Team Qualifications: N/A

Weaknesses -

Project Approach: Did not detail information related to electronic updates; did not provide a detailed approach to the traffic control plan; did not offer to have a storage laydown near the project limits; did not list subcontractors qualifications on similar projects.

Project Schedule and Risk Mitigation: No potential cost overruns discussed; gantt chart and final completion date listed do not fall within the requested schedule of 90 calendar days.

Firm Qualifications and Capacity: Did not list firm's capacity related to employee availability to perform the work; did not list all the required information on experience and references; did not include workload on major subcontractors.

Team Qualifications: Did not list all the subcontractor's capacity or number of year's experience for subcontractors.

Walker Building Group

Strengths - Formatted responses to RFP requirements was very organized across all evaluation criteria sections.

Project Approach: N/A

Project Schedule and Risk Mitigation: N/A

Firm Qualifications and Capacity: Prime contractor's experience related to scope of work.

Team Qualifications: N/A

Weaknesses -

Project Approach: No indication that traffic control has been coordinated with Public Works; no clear description of when lanes will be shutdown; did not offer to have a storage laydown or near the project limits.

Project Schedule and Risk Mitigation: No mention of potholing before pre-construction meeting.

Firm Qualifications and Capacity: No list of major subcontractors, number of change orders, or original contract amounts on referenced projects; did not provide prime contractor's capacity to perform the work; did not include subcontractor's workload.

Team Qualifications: No listing of subcontractor's years experience and capacity.

Enter Solicitation Title & Number Below						
Stormwater Improvements - 1807 21st Ave South, RFQ 926564	Min. SBE/SDV Participation		Lowest Bid			
	20.0%			\$462,322.50		35
Offeror's Name	Bids	SBE	SBE Participation Requirement *	SBE Participation Incentive	Incentive Evaluation Amount	RFP Cost Points
SBW Constructors, LLC	\$462,322.50	\$429,477.90	\$88,265	\$0	\$462,322.51	35.00
L & G Construction Co., Inc.	\$518,627.25	\$103,680.55	\$99,525	\$0	\$518,627.26	31.20
Jarrett Builders, Inc.	\$569,928.00	\$533,928.00	\$109,786	\$0	\$569,928.01	28.39
Cumberland Valley Constructors	\$575,279.00	\$537,606.00	\$110,856	\$0	\$575,279.01	28.13
Garney Companies, Inc.	\$576,357.50	\$132,520.00	\$111,072	\$0	\$576,357.51	28.08
Walker Building Group	\$614,505.00	\$579,616.00	\$118,701	\$0	\$614,505.01	26.33

* 20% SBE/SDV Requirement applies to the Base Bid Amount and not the Total Bid Amount which included \$21,000 in Allowances/Contingencies

PNP Compliance Results Form

Department Name: Water Services
RFP/ITB Number: 926564
Project Name: Stormwater Improvements - 1807 21st Ave South

Primary Contractor	PNP Compliant (Yes/No)	Determination Comments/% of Participation Proposed or Bid	Note
Walker Building Group	Yes	14.00%	Proposer is compliant with the Procurement Nondiscrimination Program requirements having reached out to three certified MWBE firms as required by the Procurement Code. Proposed BAC Paving Company for asphalt paving.
SBW Constructors, LLC	Yes	18.70%	Proposer is compliant with the Procurement Nondiscrimination Program requirements having reached out to three certified MWBE firms as required by the Procurement Code. Proposed BAC Paving Company for asphalt paving.
L & G Construction Co., Inc.	Yes	0.00%	Proposer is compliant with the Procurement Nondiscrimination Program requirements having reached out to three certified MWBE firms as required by the Procurement Code. Proposed no MWBE.
Jarrett Builders, Inc.	Yes	0.00%	Proposer is compliant with the Procurement Nondiscrimination Program requirements having reached out to three certified MWBE firms as required by the Procurement Code. Proposed no MWBE.
Cumberland Valley Constructors	Yes	15.97%	Proposer is compliant with the Procurement Nondiscrimination Program requirements having reached out to three certified MWBE firms as required by the Procurement Code. Proposed Bac Paving Company for asphalt paving and Custom Earthworks for trucking.
Garney Companies, Inc.	Yes	16.66%	Proposer is compliant with the Procurement Nondiscrimination Program requirements having reached out to three certified MWBE firms as required by the Procurement Code. Proposed BAC Paving Company for asphalt paving and Superior Traffic Control for traffic control.

Date: 04/22/16
Metro Buyer: Kevin Edwards
BAO Rep: JoeAnn Carr

BAO Small Business Assessment Sheet				
BAO Specialist:		JoeAnn Carr		
Contract Specialist:		Kevin Edwards		
Date		4/22/2016		
Department Name:		Water Services		
RFP/ITB Number:		RFQ#926564		
Project Name:		Stormwater Improvements - 1807 21st Ave South		
Primary Contractor*	Prime Bid Amount	Total Proposed SBE (\$)	SBE Subs approved?	Comments
SBW Constructors, LLC	\$462,322.50	\$429,477.90	Yes	Acknowledged Participation Expectation that Offerors must use Small and/or Service Disabled Veteran businesses (SBE/SDV) for at least 20% over the life of the project
L & G Construction Co., Inc.	\$518,627.25	\$103,680.55	Yes	Acknowledged Participation Expectation that Offerors must use Small and/or Service Disabled Veteran businesses (SBE/SDV) for at least 20% over the life of the project
Jarrett Builders, Inc.	\$569,928.00	\$533,928.00	Yes	Acknowledged Participation Expectation that Offerors must use Small and/or Service Disabled Veteran businesses (SBE/SDV) for at least 20% over the life of the project
Cumberland Valley Constructors	\$575,279.00	\$537,606.00	Yes	Acknowledged Participation Expectation that Offerors must use Small and/or Service Disabled Veteran businesses (SBE/SDV) for at least 20% over the life of the project
Garney Companies, Inc.	\$576,357.50	\$132,520.00	Yes	Acknowledged Participation Expectation that Offerors must use Small and/or Service Disabled Veteran businesses (SBE/SDV) for at least 20% over the life of the project
Walker Building Group	\$614,505.00	\$579,616.00	Yes	Acknowledged Participation Expectation that Offerors must use Small and/or Service Disabled Veteran businesses (SBE/SDV) for at least 20% over the life of the project