

**RFQ #926600 - Repair of 60" PCCP at Four Locations
Evaluation Team Score Sheet**

Offeror	Civil Constructors, LLC	Garney Companies, Inc.
Contract Acceptance	Accept	Accept
Firm Qualifications and Capacity to Perform (20 Points)	15.00	18.00
Project Approach (20 Points)	12.00	19.00
Project Schedule and Risk Mitigation (15 Points)	8.00	14.00
Team Qualifications (10 Points)	8.00	10.00
Cost Criteria (35 Points)	20.86	33.59
Total Evaluation Scores	63.86	94.59

Evaluation Comments

Civil Constructors, LLC

Strengths - Experience with water mains and traffic control. Project Approach with traffic control. Large inventory of specialty equipment and staging of equipment within Project Schedule and Risk Mitigation. Capacity of local staff and equipment within Team Qualifications.

Weaknesses - Experience with large diameter pipes and pipe repair. Generic Project Approach; no mention of the assigned professional engineer; no mention of specific potential hazards. No mention of potential pipe break within Risk Mitigation. Project Manager's qualifications were lacking in Team Qualifications.

Garney Companies, Inc.

Strengths - Experience with large diameter pipe repair. Thorough Project Approach; provided alternative for steel band repair; good traffic control plan and community outreach. Risk Mitigation included detail of addressing potential pipe break. Strong local and national staff experience in Team Qualifications.

Weaknesses - Risk Mitigation did not address any cost overruns.

Enter Solicitation Title & Number Below

Repair of 60" PCCP at Four Locations,
RFQ #926600

						Lowest Bid	
						\$759,000.00	35
Offeror's Name	Bids	SBE	SBE Participation Requirement	SBE Participation Incentive	Incentive Evaluation Amount	RFP Cost Points	
Garney Companies, Inc.	\$759,000.00	\$156,000.00	\$0	\$0	\$759,000.00	33.59	
Civil Constructors, LLC	\$1,533,705.00	\$195,386.00	\$0	\$0	\$1,533,705.01	20.86	
	Pts for Raw Cost	Pts for SBE Cost	Cost Score				
	28.00	5.59	33.59				
	13.86	7.00	20.86				

PNP Compliance Results Form

Department Name: Water Services
926600
Procurement Name: Repair of 60" PCCP at Four Locations

Primary Contractor	PNP Compliant (Yes/No)	Determination Comments/% of Participation Proposed or Bid
Garney Companies, Inc.	Yes	Garney Companies, Inc. was compliant on their outreach as required by the Procurement code

*Denotes Contractor with whom follow up was required
 Date: 04/27/2016
 Metro Buyer: Kevin Edwards
 BAO Staff: Flake Hudson

BAO SBE Assessment Sheet

BAO Specialist: Flake Hudson

Contract Specialist: Kevin Edwards

Department Name: Water Services

RFP/ITB Number: 926600

Project Name: Repair of 60" PCCP at Four Locations

Primary Contractor*	Prime Bid Amount	Total Offered SBE (\$)	SBEs approved?	Total Approved SBE (\$)	SBE (%)	Comments
Garney Companies, Inc.	\$759,000.00	\$156,000.00	Yes	\$156,000.00	20.55%	Subcontractors who will be performing the work are approved SBEs which will result in 20.55% SBE participation.

Column Headings

Shaded cells in columns E and G are formula driven and should not be changed

White cells with text are fields that you can edit.

Gray cells with bold text contain formulas that can not be changed.