

KARL F. DEAN
MAYOR



METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission
Sunnyside in Sevier Park
3000 Granny White Pike
Nashville, Tennessee 37204
Telephone: (615) 862-7970
Fax: (615) 862-7974

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

217 South 10th Street

August 15, 2012

Application: Appeal

District: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Council District: 06

Map and Parcel Number: 083130 0300

Applicant: Paul Plummer, Southeast Venture

Project Lead: Robin Zeigler, robin.zeigler@nashville.gov

Description of Project: Application is to appeal staff's decision regarding a violation of an issued Preservation Permit.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the request to retain the inappropriate siding based on the facts that the building is highly visible and the existing siding does not meet Section II.B.4 of the *Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay: Handbook and Design Guidelines*.

Attachments

A: Site Plan

B: Elevations

Vicinity Map:



Aerial Map:



Applicable Design Guidelines:

II.B. New Construction

4. Relationship of Materials, Textures, Details, and Material Colors

The relationship and use of materials, textures, details, and material color of a new building's public facades shall be visually compatible with and similar to those of adjacent buildings, or shall not contrast conspicuously.

T-1-11- type building panels, "permastone", E.I.F.S. and other artificial siding materials are generally not appropriate. However, pre-cast stone and cement fiberboard siding are approvable cladding materials for new construction; but pre-cast stone should be of a compatible color and texture to existing historic stone clad structures in the district; and cement fiberboard siding, when used for lapped siding, should be smooth and not stamped or embossed and have a maximum of a 5" reveal.

Shingle siding should exhibit a straight-line course pattern and exhibit a maximum exposure of seven inches (7").

Four inch (4") nominal corner boards are required at the face of each exposed corner.

Stud wall lumber and embossed wood grain are prohibited.

Belt courses or a change in materials from one story to another are often encouraged for large two-story buildings to break up the massing.

When different materials are used, it is most appropriate to have the change happen at floor lines.

Clapboard sided chimneys are generally not appropriate. Masonry or stucco is appropriate.

Background: 217 South 10th Street is an institutional building constructed in 1939. In the 1950s, the building housed a YMCA facility, and later was used by Metro for a Head Start program. In the fall of 2011, the Liberty Collegiate Academy, a Metro charter school, opened in the building. In May 2011, MHZC staff issued a permit for a detached modular classroom (Preservation Permit #2011-079, dated May 2, 2011). The permit required that the cladding be "horizontal cement fiberboard." The building was installed with vertical siding. Because it was known that a second modular building was planned, and the new building would obscure the view of the first modular building, staff did not require that the siding be corrected.

On May 16, 2012, the applicant requested approval of the second modular building. Because of the limit on choices available for modular buildings, the applicant requested a reveal of 7.25 inches, even though the Commission has consistently required a maximum reveal of 5". The Commission approved the building with the wide reveal since the building is long-term temporary and Preservation Permit # 2012-00130 was issued by Staff. The permit states that the "siding and trim shall be smooth-faced, cement-fiberboard."

During a routine check on July 17, 2012, staff noticed that the building had embossed siding. The applicant was notified and they chose to appeal to the Commission to keep the inappropriate siding.



217 South 10th Street, front façade.



217 South 10th Street, modular classroom approved and constructed in 2011. The inappropriate siding was not required to be corrected as second modular unit was planned to be installed in front of it.

Analysis and Findings:

Embossed siding is a material that has never been approved by the Commission in the past and does not meet section II.B.4 of the design guidelines for new construction. The guidelines require that material textures be visually compatible with and similar to those of adjacent buildings. Historic wood lapped buildings have a smooth finish as opposed to a deep grain. Further, the design guidelines explain the Commission's policy for cement fiberboard siding, stating that is appropriate for new construction but when used it should "be smooth and not stamped or embossed and have a maximum of a 5" reveal."

In order to obtain a temporary occupancy permit, the applicant agreed to replace the siding within two weeks of the Commission's hearing, if the decision is to disapprove.

Staff recommends disapproval of the request to retain the inappropriate siding based on the facts that the building is highly visible and the existing siding does not meet Section II.B.4 of the *Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay: Handbook and Design Guidelines*.



South Elevation facing Fatherland Street



Close up of embossed grain.



West elevation as seen from Fatherland Street.



South elevation as seen from Fatherland Street