



METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission
Sunnyside in Sevier Park
3000 Granny White Pike
Nashville, Tennessee 37204
Telephone: (615) 862-7970
Fax: (615) 862-7974

STAFF RECOMMENDATION
2501 Barton Avenue
November 20, 2013

Application: New construction-addition
District: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Council District: 18
Map and Parcel Number: 10411025600
Applicant: David & Elizabeth Wildman, owners
Project Lead: Sean Alexander, sean.alexander@nashville.gov

<p>Description of Project: The applicant proposes to construct a two-story addition at the rear of the house, attached to the original structure by a narrow “hyphen.” The addition will be narrower and shorter than the historic house. The materials of the addition will include a split-faced concrete block foundation, cement-fiber siding with a six inch (6”) reveal, and a composition shingle roof. The windows will be aluminum clad, but the material of the doors has not been indicated.</p>	<p>Attachments A: Photographs B: Site Plan C: Elevations</p>
<p>Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the application to construct a rear addition at 2501 Barton Avenue, with a condition that the siding reveal is no greater than five inches (5”) on the primary walls, and that staff approves the material and appearance of the windows and doors. Meeting those conditions, staff finds that the project meets the applicable sections of the Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay design guidelines.</p>	

Vicinity Map:



Aerial Map:



Applicable Design Guidelines:

II.B. GUIDELINES

a. Height

The height of the foundation wall, porch roof(s), and main roof(s) of a new building shall be compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with those of surrounding historic buildings.

b. Scale

The size of a new building and its mass in relation to open spaces shall be compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with surrounding historic buildings.

Foundation lines should be visually distinct from the predominant exterior wall material. This is typically accomplished with a change in material.

c. Setback and Rhythm of Spacing

The setback from front and side yard property lines established by adjacent historic buildings should be maintained. Generally, a dominant rhythm along a street is established by uniform lot and building width. Infill buildings should maintain that rhythm.

d. Materials, Texture, Details, and Material Color

The materials, texture, details, and material color of a new building's public facades shall be visually compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with surrounding historic buildings. Vinyl and aluminum siding are not appropriate.

T-1-11- type building panels, "permastone", E.F.I.S. and other artificial siding materials are generally not appropriate. However, pre-cast stone and cement fiberboard siding are approvable cladding materials for new construction; but pre-cast stone should be of a compatible color and texture to existing historic stone clad structures in the district; and cement fiberboard siding, when used for lapped siding, should be smooth and not stamped or embossed and have a maximum of a 5" reveal.

Shingle siding should exhibit a straight-line course pattern and exhibit a maximum exposure of seven inches (7").

Four inch (4") nominal corner boards are required at the face of each exposed corner.

Stud wall lumber and embossed wood grain are prohibited.

Belt courses or a change in materials from one story to another are often encouraged for large two-story buildings to break up the massing.

When different materials are used, it is most appropriate to have the change happen at floor lines.

Clapboard sided chimneys are generally not appropriate. Masonry or stucco is appropriate.

Texture and tooling of mortar on new construction should be similar to historic examples.

Asphalt shingle is an appropriate roof material for most buildings. Generally, roofing should not have strong simulated shadows in the granule colors which results in a rough, pitted appearance; faux shadow lines; strongly variegated colors; colors that are too light (e.g.: tan, white, light green); wavy or deep color/texture used to simulate split shake shingles or slate; excessive flared form in the shingle tabs; uneven or sculpted bottom edges that emphasize tab width or edges, unless matching the original roof.

e. Roof Shape

The roof(s) of a new building shall be visually compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with the roof shape, orientation, and pitch of surrounding historic buildings.

Roof pitches should be similar to the pitches found in the district. Historic roofs are generally between 6/12

and 12/12.

Roof pitches for porch roofs are typically less steep, approximately in the 3-4/12 range.

Generally, two-story residential buildings have hipped roofs.

Generally, dormers should be located on the roof. Wall dormers are not typical in the historic context and accentuate height so they should be used minimally and generally only on secondary facades. When they are appropriate they should be no wider than the typical window openings and should not project beyond the main wall.

f. Orientation

The orientation of a new building's front facade shall be visually consistent with surrounding historic buildings.

New buildings should incorporate at least one front street-related porch that is accessible from the front street.

Side porches or porte cocheres may also be appropriate as a secondary entrance, but the primary entrance should address the front.

Front porches generally should be a minimum of 6' deep, have porch racks that are 1'-3' tall and have posts that include bases and capitals.

Generally, curb cuts should not be added.

Where a new driveway is appropriate it should be two concrete strips with a central grassy median.

Shared driveways should be a single lane, not just two driveways next to each other. Sometimes this may be accomplished with a single lane curb cut that widens to a double lane deeper into the lot.

g. Proportion and Rhythm of Openings

The relationship of width to height of windows and doors, and the rhythm of solids (walls) to voids (door and window openings) in a new building shall be compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with surrounding historic buildings.

Window openings on the primary street-related or front façade of new construction should be representative of the window patterns of similarly massed historic structures within the district.

In most cases, every 8-13 horizontal feet of flat wall surface should have an opening (window or door) of at least 4 square feet. More leniencies can be given to minimally visible side or rear walls.

Double-hung windows should exhibit a height to width ratio of at least 2:1.

Windows on upper floors should not be taller than windows on the main floor since historically first floors have higher ceilings than upper floors and so windows were typically taller on the first floor.

Single-light sashes are appropriate for new construction. If using multi-light sashes, muntins should be fully simulated and bonded to the glass, and exhibit an interior bar, exterior bar, as well as a spacer between glass panes.

Four inch (nominal) casings are required around doors, windows and vents on non-masonry buildings.

Trim should be thick enough to extend beyond the clapboard. Double or triple windows should have a 4" to 6" mullion in between.

Brick molding is required around doors, windows and vents within masonry walls but is not appropriate on non-masonry buildings.

i. Utilities

Utility connections such as gas meters, electric meters, phone, cable, and HVAC condenser units should be located so as to minimize their visibility from the street.

Generally, utility connections should be placed no closer to the street than the mid point of the structure.

Power lines should be placed underground if they are carried from the street and not from the rear or

an alley.

2. ADDITIONS

- a. Generally, an addition should be situated at the rear of a building in such a way that it will not disturb either front or side facades. To distinguish between the historic structure and an addition, it is desirable to set the addition in from the building side wall or for the addition to have a different exterior cladding. Additions normally not recommended on historic structures may be appropriate for non-historic structures in Hillsboro-West End. Front or side alterations to non-historic buildings that increase habitable space or change exterior height should be compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with the adjacent historic buildings.

Placement

Additions should be located at the rear of an existing structure.

Connections to additions should, as much as possible, use existing window and door openings rather than remove significant amounts of rear wall material.

Generally rear additions should inset one foot, for each story, from the side wall.

Additions should be physically distinguished from the historic building and generally fit within the shadow line of the existing building.

Foundation

Foundation walls should set in from the existing foundation at the back edge of the existing structure by one foot for each story or half story. Exception: When an addition is a small one-room deep (12' deep or less) addition that spans the width of the structure, and the existing structure is masonry with the addition to be wood (or appropriate substitute siding). The change in material from masonry to wood allows for a minimum of a four inch (4") inset.

Foundation height should match or be lower than the existing structure.

Foundation lines should be visually distinct from the predominant exterior wall material. This is generally accomplished with a change in materials.

Roof

The height of the addition's roof and eaves must be less than or equal to the existing structure.

Visually evident roof slopes should match the roof slopes of the existing structure, and roof planes should set in accordingly for rear additions.

Skylights should not be located on the front-facing slope of the roof. Skylights should be flat (no bubble lenses) with a low profile (no more than six inches tall) and only be installed behind the midpoint of the building).

Side Additions

- b. When a lot width exceeds 60 feet or the standard lot width on the block, it may be appropriate to add a side addition to a historic structure. The addition should set back from the face of the historic structure and should be subservient in height, width and massing to the historic structure.

The addition should set back from the face of the historic structure (at or beyond the midpoint of the building) and should be subservient in height, width and massing to the historic structure.

Side additions should be narrower than half of the historic building width and exhibit a height of at least 2' shorter than the historic building.

To deemphasize a side addition, the roofing form should generally be a hip or side-gable roof form.

- c. The creation of an addition through enclosure of a front porch is not appropriate. The creation of an addition through the enclosure of a side porch may be appropriate if the addition is constructed in such a way that original form and openings on the porch remain visible and undisturbed.

Side porch additions may be appropriate for corner building lots or lots more than 60' wide.

d. Contemporary designs for additions to existing properties are not discouraged when such additions do not destroy significant historical, architectural, or cultural material; and when such design is compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the property, neighborhood, or environment.

e. A new addition should be constructed in such a manner that if the addition were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the original structure would be unimpaired.

Connections should, as much as possible, use existing window and door openings rather than remove significant amounts of rear wall material.

f. Additions should follow the guidelines for new construction.

III.B.1 Demolition is Not Appropriate

- a. if a building, or major portion of a building, is of such architectural or historical interest and value that its removal would be detrimental to the public interest; or
- b. if a building, or major portion of a building, is of such old or unusual or uncommon design and materials that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced without great difficulty and expense.

III.B.2 Demolition is Appropriate

- a. if a building, or major portion of a building, has irretrievably lost its architectural and historical integrity and significance and its removal will result in a more historically appropriate visual effect on the district;
- b. if a building, or major portion of a building, does not contribute to the historical and architectural character and significance of the district and its removal will result in a more historically appropriate visual effect on the district; or
- c. if the denial of the demolition will result in an economic hardship on the applicant as determined by the MHZC in accordance with section 17.40.420 D of the historic zoning ordinance.

Background: The house at 2501 Barton Avenue is a one and one-half story Craftsman style house, constructed circa 1920. The house has typical Craftsman features like exposed rafter tails and three-over-one double-hung windows, but the roof is a cross-gable instead of the more common front or side-facing gable. Due to the age and architectural character of the house, it contributes to the historic character of the district.



Analysis and Findings: The applicant is proposing to construct an addition to the rear of the house.

Demolition:

To accommodate the new addition, a portion of the rear wall of the original structure will be removed. Because it is at the rear and cannot be seen from the front or either side, this portion of the house is not significant to its historic character.

This partial demolition meets section III.B.2 for appropriate demolition and does not meet section III.B.1 for inappropriate demolition.

Location & Removability:

The addition will be two-stories tall with a square primary mass, twenty-eight feet (28') wide and twenty-eight feet (28') deep. This primary component will be sixteen feet (16') narrower than the historic house, connected to the rear of the house by twelve foot (12') wide hyphen. The hyphen will be set in from the outside wall of the house by twenty-three feet (23') on the left side and eight feet (8') on the right. Because the addition will be located at the rear of the structure and set in from the sides of the historic house so as to not impact the front or sides, Staff finds that the project meets guidelines II.B.2.a and II.B.2.e.

Height & Scale:

The roof of the addition will be a rear-facing gable with a ridge height of twenty-five feet (25') from grade, or one foot (1') below the ridge of the house. The hyphen that connects the addition to the house will be six inches (6") lower than the primary roof of the addition.

The hyphen and addition will add forty-five feet (45') to the depth of the house, which is currently only thirty-two feet (32') from the front to the rear. Although the depth of the addition is greater than the existing structure, the primary component is clearly subordinate in scale and massing. The hyphen is shorter and significantly narrower than the historic house as well, and its scale and massing will be minimal in comparison.

Staff finds that the project meets section II.B.1.a. and b.

Design:

The design of the addition is contemporary, but relates to the historic house by incorporating compatible architectural features, including matching trim, raking fascia, and eave brackets. The form of the addition, with matching floor heights and roof pitches is also compatible with the historic house.

The project meets section II.B.2.a, d, and f.

Setback & Rhythm of Spacing:

The addition will be narrower than the historic house, which is more than two feet (2') closer to the right property line than current codes would allow. The addition will be five feet (5') from the right property line and eighteen feet (18') from the left. Although the addition increases the depth of the structure to seventy-seven feet (77'), the rhythm along

25th Avenue North will not be greatly disrupted because the addition is set back from the side of the property.

The setbacks and rhythm of spacing along Barton Avenue will not be disrupted.

The project meets section II.B.1.c.

Materials:

No major changes to the historic house's materials were indicated on the drawings. The addition will primarily be clad in smooth face cement fiberboard with a six inch (6") reveal on the first story with shingle in the upperstory. (Clapboard may be used in the upperstory as well) Cement-fiber clapboard is an appropriate material, but the Commission generally requires clapboard siding to have a maximum five inch (5") reveal except in contemporary applications or when matching wider original siding. The hyphen will have eleven inch (11") clapboard siding which is appropriate because of the contemporary nature of that portion of the addition. The window casings, cornerboards, and other trim will be wood-composite. The foundation will be split-faced concrete block, and the roof will be architectural fiberglass shingles in a color to match the existing roof. The windows and doors will be aluminum clad-wood on the primary walls with store-front type aluminum windows in the hyphen, and staff asks to approve the final window and door selections prior to purchase and installation. The bays will be clad in smooth face cement fiberboard panels. With the siding reveal no greater than five inches (5") on the primary walls, and with staff's final approval of the windows and doors, the project meets section II.B.1.d of the design guidelines.

Roof form:

The roof of the addition will have a 6:12 pitch side-facing gable with a 4:12 pitched rear gabled dormer. The hyphen will have a 6:12 pitched gable roof connecting the primary roof of the addition to the rear of the existing structure.

The gable roof form is common throughout the surrounding area, and although the pitches are lower than those of the historic house they are compatible. Staff finds that the project meets section II.B.1.e.

Orientation:

The orientation of the historic house will not be altered.

The project meets section II.B.1.f.

Proportion and Rhythm of Openings:

No changes to any visible window and door openings on the existing house were indicated on the plans. A rear window, obscured by a side-gable on the existing structure will be bricked in. The windows on the proposed addition are all generally twice as tall as they are wide, thereby meeting the historic proportions of openings. There are no large expanses of wall space without a window or door opening. Staff finds the project's proportion and rhythm of openings to meet Section II.B.1.g.

Appurtenances & Utilities:

No changes to the site's appurtenances were indicated on the drawings. The location of the HVAC and other utilities was also not noted. Staff asks that the HVAC be located on the rear façade, or on a side façade beyond the midpoint of the house. The project meets section II.B.1.i.

Recommendation:

Staff recommends approval of the application to construct a rear addition at 2501 Barton Avenue, with a condition that the siding reveal is greater than five inches (5") on the primary walls, and that staff approves the material and appearance of the windows and doors. Meeting those conditions, staff finds that the project meets the applicable sections of the Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay design guidelines.



Looking Southwest from intersection of Barton Avenue and 25th Avenue South.



Left side of house from 25th Avenue South.



Rear of house from alley.



Barton Ave.

25th St.

North

2501 Barton Ave	



○ Left Side Elevation (25th St)

Project: 2501 Barton Ave.	
Owner: David & Elizabeth Wildman	
Scale: 1/8" = 1'-0"	
Revision:	Date:



○ ————— Right Side Elevation

Project: 2501 Barton Ave.	
Owner: David & Elizabeth Wildman	
Scale: 1/8" = 1'-0"	
Revision:	
	Page:



○ Rear Elevation

Project: 2501 Barton Ave.	
Owner: David & Elizabeth Wildman	
Scale: 1/8" = 1'-0"	
Date: 02/15/11 (approximate)	
Revision:	
	Page: