



METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission
Sunnyside in Sevier Park
3000 Granny White Pike
Nashville, Tennessee 37204
Telephone: (615) 862-7970
Fax: (615) 862-7974

METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION SUMMARY MEETING MINUTES January 16, 2013

Commissioners Present: Brian Tibbs (Chair), Ann Nielson (Vice Chair), Menié Bell, Samuel Champion, Richard Fletcher, Hunter Gee, Aaron Kaalberg, Ben Mosley
Zoning Staff: Robin Zeigler, Sean Alexander, Susan T. Jones (City Attorney)
Applicants: Mark Bixler

Chairperson Tibbs called the meeting to order at 2:05 p.m. and read aloud the processes for the consent agenda and appealing the decisions of the Metro Historic Zoning Commission.

I. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion:

Commissioner Fletcher moved to approve the December 19, 2012 summary minutes without changes. Commissioner Bell seconded and it passed unanimously.

Chairperson Tibbs explained the process of the consent agenda and the appeal process.

Staff member, Sean Alexander, presented the cases listed on the consent.

II. CONSENT

a. 2612 ESSEX PL

Application: Demolition -non-contributing
Council District: 18
Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Robin Zeigler
Permit ID #: 1902557

b. 1902 RUSSELL ST

Application: New construction – accessory building and Reduced setbacks
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Sean Alexander
Permit ID #: 1904313

c. 2001 18TH AVE S

Application: Demolition; New construction — accessory structure and Setback reduction
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Michelle Taylor
Permit ID #: 1903865

d. 1516B FERGUSON AVE

Application: New construction-addition
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Robin Zeigler
Permit ID #: 1903948

e. 4302 ELKINS AVE

Application: New construction – accessory structure and Setback reduction
Council District: 24
Overlay: Park and Elkins Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock
Permit ID #: 1904110

f. 1420 CALVIN AVE

Application: Demolition--partial; New construction - addition and Accessory structure
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock
Permit ID #: 1904112

g. 1209 SHELBY AVE

Application: Demolition-accessory structure; New Construction--Accessory Structure; Setback reduction.
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock
Permit ID #: 1904119

h. 1221 FORREST PARK DR/ WARNER PARK

Application: Demolition - non-contributing
Council District: 99
Overlay: Historic Landmark Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Michelle Taylor
Permit ID #: 1904654

i. 1511 FATHERLAND ST

Application: Demolition – non-contributing
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Sean Alexander
Permit ID #: 1904314

There was no request to remove an item from the consent agenda. Commissioner Nielson moved to approve all items with their respective conditions recommended by Staff. Commissioner Mosley seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

III. NEW BUSINESS

j. 104 5TH AVE S

Application: New construction-addition
Council District: 19
Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Robin Zeigler

Permit ID #: 1904031

Ms. Zeigler, historic zoning administrator, explained that this was a project that they had seen several times as the first rooftop addition was added without a permit by a previous owner, the previous owner received a permit to revise the addition but never corrected it, and the new owner submitted another design in July of last year. The current owners are now proposing a revision that was different enough that it could not be approved at the staff level. The overall design and materials have not changed but the height has. The previous version was approved, even though it does not meet the setback requirements for roof top additions, because the building is unusually shallow and has a low sloped roof where most buildings in the overlay have a parapet wall to help obscure rooftop additions. Also because the proposed addition was pushed back on the building as far as it could go and had a minimal height.

Under the new proposal, the alterations to the addition are now approximately eleven feet (11') tall from the parapet wall. This additional height runs across approximately thirty-two feet (32') of the front façade, where initially only a small portion of the addition reached the peak height of nine feet (9'). In addition, little of the original roof form was evident in the previously-approved plans, but in order to screen the mechanicals there will now be what appears as a side gable roof. Ms. Zeigler stated that because the addition does not fully meet the setback requirements, the additional height is inappropriate and pushing beyond the limits of the definition of a one-story height as required in the design guidelines. Staff recommended disapproval based on the fact that the one-story height, as required by the ordinance, should be minimal since the addition does not meet the setback requirements.

Mark Bixler, architect for the project explained that the mechanical equipment location had to be changed for structural reasons and that that was the reason for the redesign. The roof would be metal. He stated that nothing would be seen from the sidewalk. He explained several other alterations to the plan that had been approved on the staff level.

The Commissioners asked the applicant and staff for clarification of height, location and design guidelines.

Commissioner Fletcher stated that he was inclined to support staff's recommendation but that the issue could be resolved and told the applicant that he might want to delay and work with staff on a solution. Commissioner Gee stated that the addition will be minimally visible and they had done a good job at trying to minimize the impact and he is inclined to approve it, or approve it with minor modifications.

Commissioner Mosley stated that because of the form of the buildings additional height the necessary stair piece

Chairperson Tibbs asked the applicant if he wanted to defer to next month. Mr. Bixler stated that if the decision is for disapproval he would look for specifics as to why it is not approvable with some direction.

All Commissioners provided the following direction for the applicant:

- The mechanical should be pushed towards the parapet roofed building since it is deeper
- Some of the screening can rise 2' above what was originally approved but not as much as what is shown. 25% of the current width would be desirable.
- Minimize the visual impact
- Remove the left wall that was to serve as the original screening of mechanicals

Commissioner Gee moved move to approve as submitted. Motion failed for lack of a second.

Motion:

Commissioner Fletcher moved to approve with the condition that a member of the board work with staff and the applicant to come up with a better means of screening and for the additional height to be less visible. Some portions can be 2' taller than the original plan but not as much as what is currently shown. Vice Chairperson Nielson seconded and moved that the motion be amended to read that the approval was conditional. Commissioner Mosley seconded the proposed amendment and the amendment was approved unanimously. The Commission voted unanimously to approve the revised motion.

k. 1508 PARIS AVE

Application: New construction – infill and Detached accessory dwelling unit

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Sean Alexander

Permit ID #: 1904312

Staff member, Sean Alexander presented the case for 1508 Paris Avenue which is currently a vacant lot. There had been a modular or mobile home there since 1995, until it was moved out of the district this past September. The applicant proposes to construct a new single-family structure and a detached accessory dwelling unit.

The form of the primary building will be similar to that of a historic Craftsman style house, with a side-gabled roof and a gabled front dormer. The house will be one and one-half stories tall, the width and height similar to historic houses nearby... across the street, and a recent infill a few houses up. The front setback will match the adjacent houses, and the side setbacks will maintain the established rhythm of the street. With the accompanying accessory structure, roughly 2/3 of the lot will be retained as open space, which is compatible with surrounding historic houses in the area, for which the average open space is seventy percent (70%).

The exterior materials of the building will be: smooth-faced cement-fiber siding with a five inch (5”) exposure, cement-fiber trim, asphalt roof shingles, and split-faced concrete block foundation. The porch rack, porch floor, and eave brackets will be wood. Additional information on the material of the windows, doors, and porch columns is needed. With the condition that those materials are approved by Staff, these materials meet guideline II.B.1.d. The window pattern and roof form are also compatible with historic houses.

There will also be a one story garage with living space in an upper half-story, explained Mr. Alexander. The building will have a footprint of 550 sq. ft., and will meet the design standards for DADU, with the exception of one: because of the living space, zoning requires a minimum of ten feet of separation between the primary and accessory buildings. There is sufficient space behind the proposed location to move the building back and meet the standard and not require a setback reduction.

The materials will match those of the house, and the roof form and general character of the building are compatible with the house as well, and will meet the accessory structure guidelines.

Staff recommended approval of the proposed new primary building and accessory building, with the conditions that:

- 1. The accessory building is moved back so that it is at least ten feet (10’) from the primary building;
- 2. The color of the roofs and the material of the windows, doors, and porch columns is approved by Staff.

With those conditions, staff finds the proposed construction to meet the applicable sections of the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

There were no requests from the public to speak and the applicant was not present.

Commissioner Mosley stated that the plan showed 4 or 5 steps but the grade will likely require 9 steps and he was concerned that the foundation will rise during construction. Mr. Alexander showed an image of a historic home that used a retaining wall at the front of the lot to lessen the perceived height of the house. Commissioner Mosley explained that either solution would work but that staff should work with the applicant to lessen surprises during construction.

Commissioner Gee asked about the rear setback of the garage. Mr. Alexander stated that the applicant has agreed to staff’s recommended condition.

Motion

Commissioner Mosley moved to approve the project with the conditions that:

- 1. The accessory building is moved back so that it is at least ten feet (10’) from the primary building;**
- 2. The color of the roofs and the material of the windows, doors, and porch columns is approved by Staff.**

3. Work with the applicant to confirm the actual height of the foundation and assure that it is minimized to more closely matches the rhythm of the historic porch elevations of the 2-3 adjoining properties on either side of the lot. Vice-chairperson Nielson seconded. Commissioner Gee moved to amend the motion to use the word “reduce” rather than “minimize.” Commission Kaalberg seconded the amendment and it passed unanimously. The motion passed unanimously.

Ms. Zeigler informed the commission about the Old House Fair, March 9, 2013.

The meeting was adjourned at 3:07 p.m.

MINUTES RATIFIED BY COMMISSION ON FEBRUARY 20, 2013.