



METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

SUNNYSIDE IN SEVIER PARK

METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION SUMMARY MEETING MINUTES

February 27, 2015

(Originally scheduled on February 18 but rescheduled due to weather.)

Commissioners Present: Chair Brian Tibbs, Vice-chair Anne Nielson, Menie Bell, Rose Cantrell, Richard Fletcher, Hunter Gee, Aaron Kaalberg, Ben Mosley

Zoning Staff: Paul Hoffman, Robin Zeigler (Historic Zoning Administrator), Susan T. Jones (City Attorney)

Applicants: Joe Kovalick, Brent Hunter, Lynn Taylor, Susan Hager, Rob Cushman, Bob Potter, Champ Webb

Public: None

Chairperson Tibbs called the meeting to order at 2:04 p.m. and read aloud the process for appealing the decisions of the Metro Historic Zoning Commission and the time limits on presentations.

I. RECOGNITION OF COUNCILMEMBERS

II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion:

Commissioner Bell moved to approve the minutes as presented. Vice-chairman Nielson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

III. OVERLAY RECOMMENDATIONS

None

IV. CONSENT AGENDA

Chairperson Tibbs read the process for consent agenda items. Staff member, Melissa Baldock, presented the list of items on the consent agenda.

2405 BELMONT BV

Application: Partial demolition; New construction--addition

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: MELISSA BALDOCK

Permit ID #: 2018862

3618 RICHLAND AVE

Application: Partial demolition; New construction--addition

Council District: 24

Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: MELISSA BALDOCK

Permit ID #: 2023808

1419 CALVIN AVE

Application: New construction-infill; New construction-detached accessory dwelling unit, Setback determination
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: PAUL HOFFMAN
Permit ID #: 2023757

1714 4TH AVE N

Application: Demolition
Council District: 19
Overlay: Salemtown Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: PAUL HOFFMAN
Permit ID #: 2023754

1905 FATHERLAND ST

Application: New construction-addition
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: PAUL HOFFMAN
Permit ID #: 2023751

2534 ASHWOOD AVE

Application: New construction-addition
Council District: 18
Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: PAUL HOFFMAN
Permit ID #: 2023748

123 BLACKBURN AVE

Application: New construction-addition
Council District: 23
Overlay: Belle Meade Links Triangle Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: PAUL HOFFMAN
Permit ID #: 2023762

1608 DOUGLAS AVE

Application: New construction - addition
Council District: 06
Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: SEAN ALEXANDER
Permit ID #: 2023899

3517 RICHLAND AVE

Application: New construction - addition; Setback determination
Council District: 24
Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: SEAN ALEXANDER
Permit ID #: 2023901

1511 FERGUSON AVE

Application: Partial demolition; New construction--addition
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: MELISSA BALDOCK
Permit ID #: 2023806

There were no requests to remove any items from the consent agenda.

Motion:

Vice-chairperson Nielson moved to approve all consent items with their respective conditions. Commissioner Gee seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

V. PREVIOUSLY DEFERRED ITEMS

The items below were deferred from a previous MHZC meeting at the request of the applicant.

None

VI. MHZC ACTIONS

128 2ND AVE N

Application: Signage

Council District: 19

Overlay: Second Avenue Historic Preservation Overlay

Project Lead: MELISSA BALDOCK

Permit ID #: 2023802

This item was removed at the owner's request.

1403 ELMWOOD AVE

Application: New construction-porte cochere, Setback determination

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: PAUL HOFFMAN

Permit ID #: 2023764

Staff member, Paul Hoffman, presented the case for a porte cochere, which does not meet the bulk zoning setback requirements, at 1403 Elmwood,. The proposed addition would be one foot and six inches from the right side property line, instead of the required five feet side setback. Although there are several examples of porte-cocheres in the district that are less than five feet from the property line, Staff's review is that the conditions do not warrant a reduction of the setback, and Staff recommends disapproval of the application.

Joe Kovalick, owner of the property, explained that he constructed the house based on the 1920s plan, but that the house is too wide to accommodate the porte cochere, they cannot park on the street because of the public parking for 12th Avenue, water drainage in this area, and that a hackberry tree creates bird droppings and berries to fall on his vehicle. He presented examples of other porte cocheres found in the neighborhood. He has received signatures from all his neighbors who are in support of the project. He said the house next door was vacant, has likely always been vacant, and there are no plans to develop it.

Commissioner Mosely stated that another porte cochere had been approved with a setback reduction and Commissioner Kaalberg said it was set further back. Commissioner Mosley continued that what was different about this project is that the porte cochere is the forward most element when it shouldn't be.

Mr. Hoffman clarified details of the examples presented: 1401 Sweetbriar is not in the overlay and appears to meet the setback requirements, 1607 Linden is 2 or 3 feet from the side property line, 1505 Elmwood replaced a side addition, 1401 Elmwood was a reconstruction of an existing porte cochere, 2405 Belmont meets the setback requirements, 2512 Belmont replaces a side addition, 1517 Paris was an existing porte cochere reconstructed, and 2401 Belmont was constructed prior to the overlay and also appears to meet the setback requirement.

Staff confirmed that there is an existing driveway and an alley.

Commissioner Gee moved to approve the application as submitted based on the fact that there are historic examples of porte coheres that sit closer than 5' to the side property line. Commissioner Cantrell seconded. Motion failed for lack of four concurring votes with Commissioner Cantrell, Gee and Kaalberg voting in favor and Commissioner Fletcher abstaining, due to his late arrival, Chairman Tibbs voting against it.

Commissioner Mosley recommended that the porte cochere be redesigned so that it is a straight continuation of the porch, even though it will not cover the entire car, so that it can appear more subordinate and be more like historic porte coheres.

Commissioner Kaalberg stated that since this is a non-contributing home, a decision to approve the project does not set a precedent for allowing for porte cocheres on historic homes.

Motion:

Commissioner Gee moved to approve the application as submitted based on the fact that there are historic examples of porte coheres that sit closer than 5' to the side property line, with the condition that the porch rack continue flush from the porch to the porte cochere. Commissioner Kaalberg seconded and the motion passed with Vice-chair Nielson voting against the motion.

1410 LILLIAN ST

Application: New construction--infill and detached accessory dwelling unit; Setback determination

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: MELISSA BALDOCK

Permit ID #: 2023805

Staff member, Melissa Baldock, explained that the applicant agreed to all conditions, so she would not be presenting the case unless there were questions.

Brent Hunter with Van Pond Architects confirmed that they agreed with the conditions.

Commissioner Mosley advised that if they do find that a railing is needed that they submit the design to staff prior to construction.

There were no requests from the public to speak.

Motion:

Commissioner Gee moved to approve the project with the conditions that:

- 1. The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;**
- 2. Staff approve the final details, dimensions and materials of windows and doors prior to purchase and installation;**
- 3. Staff approve the roof color and masonry color, dimensions and texture;**
- 4. Windows of at least four square feet be added on the east/left elevation, towards the front of the house, in the location of "Bedroom 1" and "Bedroom 2"; and**
- 5. The owner submit a restrictive covenant for the detached accessory dwelling unit.**

Vice-chairman Nielson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

1315 LILLIAN ST

Application: New construction - infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: SEAN ALEXANDER

Permit ID #: 2023900

Staff member, Melissa Baldock, explained that the applicant agreed to all conditions, she would not be presenting the case unless there were questions.

There were no requests from the public or the applicant to speak.

Motion:

Vice-chairman Neilson moved to approve the project with the conditions that:

- **Staff verifies that the front setback is compatible with surrounding houses;**
- **Staff verifies that the floor height is compatible with surrounding historic houses;**
- **The window and door selections are approved by Staff;**
- **The roof color is approved by Staff;**
- **That there is a front walkway, and any off-street parking is approved by Staff;**
- **The HVAC is located behind the structure or on the sides, beyond the mid-point of the structure.**

Commissioner Bell seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

0 DOUGLAS AVE

Application: New construction-infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: PAUL HOFFMAN

Permit ID #: 2023750

Staff member, Paul Hoffman, explained that the applicant agreed to all conditions so he would not be presenting the case unless there were questions.

Bent Hunter with Van Pond Architect confirmed that they agreed with the conditions.

There were no requests from the public to speak.

Motion:

Commissioner Mosley moved to approve the project with the conditions that:

- **The site plan be revised to include the adjacent buildings, in order to verify the street setback;**
- **The porch wall separating the two units be removed from the front, as has been required of other projects;**
- **A walkway be added to connect the front porch of each unit to the street;**
- **The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;**
- **Siding have a maximum reveal of five inches (5”);**
- **Staff approve the roofing color, masonry, windows and doors prior to purchase and installation; and,**
- **The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house.**

Commissioner Cantrell seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

1718 GREENWOOD AVE

Application: New construction-infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: PAUL HOFFMAN

Permit ID#: 2018104

Staff member, Paul Hoffman, explained that the applicant agreed to all conditions so he would not be presenting the case unless there were questions.

Commissioner Mosley noticed that the grade dropped at the rear, creating an unnecessarily tall crawl space and the project might be improved if it were not so tall in the front. Several commissioners agreed, including Commissioners Kaalberg and Gee.

There were no requests from the applicant or the public to speak.

Motion:

Vice-chairman Nielson moved to approve the project with the conditions that:

- **The front porches be increased in size to at least six feet (6') deep;**
- **A window opening be added to the second story of both side elevations;**
- **The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;**
- **Staff approve the roofing color, windows and doors prior to purchase and installation; and,**
- **The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house.**

Commissioner Gee seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

215 SCOTT AVE

Application: Demolition; New construction - infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: SEAN ALEXANDER

Permit ID #: 2023893

Staff member, Paul Hoffman, explained that the applicant agreed to all conditions so he would not be presenting the case unless there were questions.

The applicant, Rob Cushman, stated he was available for questions and that he agrees with the conditions.

There were no requests from the public to speak.

Motion:

Vice-chairman Nielson moved to approve the project with the conditions that:

- **Staff verifies that the floor height is compatible with surrounding historic houses;**
- **The window and door selections are approved by Staff;**
- **The roof color is approved by Staff;**
- **The HVAC is located behind the structure or on the sides, beyond the mid-point of the structure.**

Commissioner Bell seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

0 (1111) MCKENNIE AVE

Application: New construction - infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: SEAN ALEXANDER

Permit ID #: 2023896

Staff member, Paul Hoffman, explained that the applicant agreed to all conditions so he would not be presenting the case unless there were questions.

Commissioners Fletcher and Cantrell asked for clarification about the context.

Susan Hager, architect for the project stated that she agreed with the conditions.

There were no requests from the public to speak.

Motion:

Vice-chairman Nielson moved to approve the project with the conditions that:

- **Staff verifies that the floor height is compatible with surrounding historic houses;**
- **The window and door selections are approved by Staff;**
- **The roof color is approved by Staff;**

Commissioner Cantrell seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

1012 GRANADA CT

Application: New construction-infill; Setback determination

Council District: 05

Overlay: Greenwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: PAUL HOFFMAN

Permit ID #: 2023763

Staff member, Paul Hoffman, explained that the applicant agreed to all conditions so he would not be presenting the case unless there were questions.

Lynn Taylor, designer, stated she agreed with the conditions and was available for questions.

There were no requests from the public to speak.

Motion:

Commissioner Mosley moved to approve the project with the applicable conditions that:

- 1. The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field; and,**
- 2. Staff approve the roofing color and final details, dimensions and materials of windows and doors prior to purchase and installation.**

Commissioner Bell seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

913 PETWAY AVE

Application: Demolition; New construction - infill

Council District: 05

Overlay: Greenwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: SEAN ALEXANDER

Permit ID #: 2023898

This item was removed from the agenda at the applicant's request.

912 APEX ST

Application: Demolition; New construction – infill, Setback determination

Council District: 05

Overlay: Greenwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: SEAN ALEXANDER

Permit ID #: 2023895

Staff member, Melissa Baldock, explained that the applicant agreed to all conditions so she would not be presenting the case unless there were questions.

Bob Potter, applicant, stated he agreed with the conditions.

There were no requests from the public to speak.

Motion:

Vice-chairman Nielson moved to approve the project with the conditions that:

- Staff verifies that the floor height is compatible with surrounding historic houses;
- That the driveway extend along the right side of the building to the midpoint, instead of having a front-yard parking area;
- The window and door selections are approved by Staff;
- The roof color and brick porch column bases are approved by Staff;
- The HVAC is located behind the structure or on the sides, beyond the mid-point of the structure.

Commissioner Cantrell seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

105, 108, 113 and 116 RANSOM AVE

Application: New construction--infill

Council District: 18

Overlay: Elmington Place Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: MELISSA BALDOCK

Permit ID #: 2023820

Staff member, Melissa Baldock, explained that the applicant agreed to all conditions so she would not be presenting the case unless there were questions.

Applicant for the project, Champ Webb, stated that he agreed with the conditions. He presented a streetscape that showed preliminary views of the additional houses that will be brought to the Commission for approval next week.

There were no requests from the public to speak.

Motion:

Commissioner Mosley moved to approve the project with the conditions that:

- Staff verify the construction height of the foundation and floor systems in the field to ensure that the finished floor line of the new construction is compatible with the historic context;
- Staff provide final review of the windows and doors, roof color, railing design and material, brick and stone samples, and the material for the entryway floors;
- The maximum reveal of the lap siding on Lot 10 be five inches (5");
- The shutters be fully operational;
- All double and triple, double-hung windows have four to six inch (4" – 6") mullions in between them;
- The houses have eave overhangs of at least twelve inches (12");
- Walkways leading from Ransom Avenue to the front entries be added;
- The front porch on lot 10 have a depth of at least six feet (6'); and
- The HVAC units be placed on the rear façades, or on a side façade beyond the midpoint of the houses.

Commissioner Bell seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

Commissioner Gee left the meeting.

1311 AND 1313 5th AVENUE NORTH

Application: New construction-infill

Council District: 05

Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: ROBIN ZEIGLER

Permit ID #: 2024420

Staff member, Robin Zeigler, explained that the applicant agreed to all conditions so she would not be presenting the case unless there were questions.

Scott Morton with Smith Gee Studio, applicant, stated he agreed with the conditions and was available for questions.

There was discussion about greenspace and the different greenspace needs for cottage developments vs. townhouses.

There were no requests from the public to speak.

Motion:

Commissioner Bell moved to approve the project with the conditions:

- **Materials: foundation, trash wall (including height), roofing material color and design, doors, driveway, lighting, steps, reveal and texture of lap siding; and**
- **Utility location, at the rear or beyond the mid-point of the front facing units.**

Commissioner Fletcher seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

VII. PRELIMINARY SP REVIEW

None

VIII. ADMINISTRATIVE ACTIONS

None

IX. OTHER BUSINESS

- a. Administrative Permits Issued for Prior month

RATIFIED BY THE COMMISSION ON MARCH 18, 2015.