

MINUTES

METROPOLITAN EMPLOYEE BENEFIT BOARD

September 5, 2006

The Metropolitan Employee Benefit Board met for their regularly scheduled meeting on Tuesday September 5, 2006 in the Civil Service Conference Room, Suite 163, 222 Building, Third Avenue North, Nashville, Tennessee, at approximately 9:30 a.m.

Benefit Board members: Chair: David Manning; Vice Chair: Clyde D. Smith; Members: Steve D. Bumpus, Douglas D. Conquest, Sr., Gary R. Dowdy, B.R. Hall, Sr., *Edna J. Jones, Dorothy Shell-Berry, Betsy Walkup and H. Russell White.

Other Members present: Nicki Eke, Attorney, Metro Legal Department and Dr. Christopher Fletcher, Civil Service Medical Examiner.

A. MINUTES: Chair David Manning called the meeting to order and said the first order of business was to determine if there were any amendments, corrections or questions of the minutes from the last regular meeting held on August 1, 2006. With no corrections, nothing further was noted and Betsy Walkup moved for approval. Gary Dowdy seconded and the Board approved without objection.

B. DISABILITY PENSIONS: (new requests, reexaminations and return to work)

The terms of the approval or extension of the items listed in the above motion are specifically stated in these minutes.

Dr. Christopher Fletcher reported to the Board that he recommends approval of items B.-1. through B.-6. for the length of time as recommended. Clyde Smith moved approval of the recommendation. B.R. Hall seconded and the Board approved without objection.

NEW REQUESTS:

	Name	Department	IOD or Medical Disability	Recommendation
1.	Shirley Forbes	MNPS	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension request was approved without stipulation of scheduled reexamination.
2.	Carl Fuston	MNPS	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension request was approved for six months, (March 07) with reexamination at that time.
3.	Melissa Ingram	MNPS	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension request was approved without stipulation of scheduled reexamination.
4.	Donna Jones	Bordeaux	IOD	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension request was approved for two months, (November 06), with reexamination at that time.
6.	Terry Watts	Police	IOD	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension request was approved for three months, (December 06), with reexamination at that time.

Dr. Christopher Fletcher reported to the Board that he recommends denial of items B.-.7through B.-10. based on medical information to support the disability request.

On item B.-7. the individual was present and addressed the Board.

*Denotes the arrival of Edna Jones.

After some discussion on item B.-7., of accommodations, medical information to support the request for an in line of duty pension and issues within her place of employment, Steve Bumpus moved that the request be deferred and asked that Human Resources work with this applicant on placement and alternate work locations. Clyde Smith seconded and the Board approved without objection.

	Name	Department	IOD or Medical Disability	Recommendation
7.	Barbara Bolin	Police	IOD	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension request was deferred.

**At this time, Dr. Fletcher provided the Board with a revised spreadsheet. Dr. Fletcher stated that he recommends approval of the disability pension request and that the individual also be placed on the return to work list.

Steve Bumpus moved approval of the recommendation. Clyde Smith seconded and the Board approved without objection.

	Name	Department	IOD or Medical Disability	Recommendation
**5.	Caroline Martin	Bordeaux	IOD	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension request was approved without stipulation of scheduled reexamination and the individual placed on the return to work list.

On item B.-8., the individual was present and addressed the Board.

After some discussion of the individual requesting a medical disability pension, additional medical information to support the request for an in line of duty disability pension and in line of duty stress related claims, it was determined that the individual would be allowed to make the request for a medical disability pension. The individual made a verbal request for a medical disability pension. Steve Bumpus moved that the request be approved as medical for six months with reexam at that time.

	Name	Department	IOD or Medical Disability	Recommendation
8.	Deidre Forte	Police	IOD	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension request was approved as a medical disability for six months, (March 07), with reexamination at that time.

On item B.-9., Betsy Walkup moved approval of the recommendation to deny the request. Edna Jones seconded and the Board approved without objection.

	Name	Department	IOD or Medical Disability	Recommendation
9.	Perian Gooch	Bordeaux	IOD	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension request was denied.

On item B.-10., the individual was present and addressed the Board.

After some discussion of the medical information to support the in line of duty request, and who has authority to determine the in line of duty injury, B.R. Hall moved that the request for the in line of duty disability pension be approved. Clyde Smith seconded and the Board approved without objection.

	Name	Department	IOD or Medical Disability	Recommendation
10.	William Tapley	MNPS	IOD	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension request was approved and the individual placed on the return to work list.

Dr. Christopher Fletcher reported to the Board that he recommends items B.-11. through B.-16. be continued without stipulation of scheduled reexamination. B.R. Hall moved approval of the recommendation. Clyde Smith seconded and the Board approved without objection.

On items B.-17. through B.-19., Dr. Fletcher recommended deferral for one month. Without objection, items B.-17. through B.-19. were deferred. On items B.-20. through B.-23, Dr. Fletcher recommended the individuals be placed on the return to work list. Clyde Smith moved approval of the recommendation. Betsy Walkup seconded and the Board approved without objection.

Dr. Christopher Fletcher reported to the Board that he recommends approval of the return to work request, item B.-24. Clyde Smith moved for approval. Douglas Conquest seconded and the Board approved without objection.

Dr. Christopher Fletcher reported to the Board that he recommends deferral on item B.-25. Without objection item B.-25 was deferred for one month.

REEXAMINATIONS:

	Name	Department	IOD or Medical Disability	Recommendation
11.	Donna Dobbs	MNPS	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension reexam was continued without stipulation of scheduled reexamination.
12.	Alfred O. Hibler	Police	IOD	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension reexam was continued without stipulation of scheduled reexamination.
13.	Thomas E. Jones, Jr.	Police	IOD	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension reexam was continued without stipulation of scheduled reexamination.

REEXAMINATIONS: (continued)

	Name	Department	IOD or Medical Disability	Recommendation
14.	Buford E. Justice	Fire	IOD	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension reexam was continued without stipulation of scheduled reexamination.
15.	Bobby D. Lawrence	Police	IOD	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension reexam was continued without stipulation of scheduled reexamination.
16.	Monty B. Mendenhall	Police	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension reexam was continued without stipulation of scheduled reexamination.
17.	Angela Inglis	MNPS	IOD	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension reexam was deferred for one month, (October), with reexamination at that time.
18.	Tammie Lehmann	General	IOD	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension reexam was deferred for one month, (October), with reexamination at that time.
19.	Kenneth B. Murphy	Fire	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension reexam was deferred for one month, (October), with reexamination at that time.
20.	Sarah Akins	Bordeaux	IOD	As moved seconded and approved, this disability pension reexam was continued and the individual placed on the return to work list.
21.	James L. Bobo	General Services	IOD	As moved seconded and approved, this disability pension reexam was continued and the individual placed on the return to work list.
22.	Roger A. Daniels	Water	IOD	As moved seconded and approved, this disability pension reexam was continued and the individual placed on the return to work list.
23.	John H. Elizer	Sheriff	Medical	As moved seconded and approved, this disability pension reexam was continued and the individual placed on the return to work list.

RETURN TO WORK:

	Name	Department	IOD or Medical Disability	Recommendation
24.	Scott M. Armes	Fire	IOD	As moved seconded and approved, this return to work request was approved.
25.	Richard Bell	MNPD	IOD	As moved seconded and approved, this disability pension request for return to work was deferred for one month, (October).

C. PENSIONS: (service, disability to service, options elected and survivor)

MOTION: Clyde Smith moved approval of the pensions. Steve Bumpus seconded and the Board approved without objection.

Service

Employee	Department	Classification	Plan A/B	Application Date	Estimated Effective Date
Gordon McGuire	Police	Police Officer 3	B	07/21/06	08/16/06
Hazel King	Parks	Specialized Skills Instructor	B	07/28/06	12/01/06
Charisse Westfall	Convention Center	Sales Manager	B	07/28/06	08/24/06
Terri Johnson	Historical Commission	Office Support Manager	B	08/02/06	10/01/06
Paul Woodroof, Sr.	Fire	Fire Engineer	B	08/04/06	08/05/06
David Crane	Assessor of Property	Appraiser 2	B	08/03/06	08/19/06
Mel Davenport	Fire	Fire Engineer	B	07/11/06	08/01/06
David Crane	Assessor of Property	Appraiser 2	B	08/03/06	08/19/06
Ronald Kendall, Sr.	Fire	Fire Captain	B	08/08/06	08/21/06
John Hines	MNPS	Custodian Helper	B	08/08/06	08/15/06
Betty Evans	Parks	Concessions Clerk 2	B	07/24/06	09/01/06
Rita Allgood	NCAC	Accounting Associate	B	08/10/06	10/07/06
Melba Reese	Sheriff	Program Supervisor	B	08/14/06	11/01/06
Ernest Kimble	Police	Police Lieutenant	B	08/10/06	09/01/06
Lee Gilbert	Parks	Maintenance and Repair Leader 1	B	08/17/06	11/01/06
Stephen Moore	Fire	Fire Engineer	B	08/21/06	09/06/06
Inessa Sanovich	MNPS	Library Clerk	B	08/16/06	08/10/06
Barbara Tyree	MNPS	Bus Driver	B	08/21/06	11/04/06
William Cunningham	Police	Police Lieutenant	B	08/25/06	09/16/06
Carol Crews	General Sessions Court	Judicial Assistant 2	B	08/22/06	09/01/06
Surajit Sircar	General Hospital	Registered Nurse	B	08/25/06	10/01/06
Steven McClure	County Clerk	Deputy Clerk 4	B	08/25/06	09/09/06
Sylvester Thomas	Parks	Custodian 1	B	08/16/06	01/01/07

Disability to service

Employee	Department	Plan A/B	Effective Date of Conversion
Frederick Carney	MNPS	A	05/01/2006
Thomas Baldwin	Public Works	A	07/01/2006
Mildred McClain	Social Services	B	07/01/2006
Harry Reavis, Jr.	Police	A	07/01/2006

Disability to service

Employee	Department	Plan A/B	Effective Date of Conversion
Duncan Evans, III	Fire	B	08/01/2006
John Goforth	Municipal Auditorium	A	08/01/2006

Options Elected

Name	Department	Pension Type	Plan A/B	Effective Date	Option	Drop Election
Aquino, Roberto M.	General Hospital	Early Service	B	6/14/2006	B	
Barwari, Muhammad S	Metro Action Commission	Service	B	6/1/2006	Normal	
Beard, Ronald T.	General Hospital	Early Service	B	6/17/2006	Normal	
Bender, Claudia G.	General Hospital	Early Service	B	6/17/2006	Normal	
Biggers, Kaye L	MNPS	Early Service	B	5/27/2006	E	
Blackwell, James E	Water and Sewer	Service	B	7/29/2006	F	3
Carnegie, Judy Helms	Clerk and Master	Service	B	7/1/2006	F	1
Chatham, Rebecca Elizabeth	General Hospital	Early Service	B	7/3/2006	Normal	
Chumney, Sandra J.	General Hospital	Early Service	B	4/21/2006	D	
Clark, Helen R	MNPS	Service	B	6/1/2006	Normal	
Cothran, William E.	Police	P&F Service	B	7/1/2006	F	3
Covington, Brenda J	MNPS	Service	B	5/26/2006	Normal	
Davis, Linda Faye	MNPS	Early Service	B	6/3/2006	Option F	
Dean, Norma C	Social Services	Service	B	6/17/2006	Normal	
Foster, Michael S	Information Technology	Service	B	7/29/2006	B	
Fox, Jerry W	Water and Sewer	Service	B	7/1/2006	Normal	
Frierson, Evelyn B	MNPS	Service	B	5/31/2006	D	2
Hollis, Deborah L	MNPS	Early Service	B	6/3/2006	E	
Johnson, David L.	Police	P&F Service	B	4/1/2006	F	
Jolley Iii, Cornelius V.	Police	P&F Service	B	7/15/2006	Normal	
Jones, Donald W.	Metropolitan Council	Service	B	7/1/2006	B	
Killingsworth, Daniel L.	Police	Service	B	5/20/2006	F	1
King, Carolyn G.	Parks	Early Service	B	6/1/2006	Normal	
Lewis, Michael A	MNPS	Early Service	B	4/1/2006	D	
Lockridge, Patricia R	Metro Action Commission	Service	B	7/29/2006	Normal	3
Long, Sherry A	Bordeaux Long Term Care	Early Service	B	7/12/2006	D	
Milliken, Jeanie G	MNPS	Early Service	A	5/26/2006	Normal	
Murphy Jr, John A	Fire	P&F Service	B	7/17/2006	E	
Norman, Marvin L.	Police	P&F Service	B	6/20/2006	A	1
Owens Jr, Harvey E	Criminal Court Clerk	Service	B	6/1/2006	E	3
Parker, Annie	General Hospital	Service	B	6/17/2006	Normal	
Puckett, Alice Faye	MNPS	Service	B	6/1/2006	B	1
Ransom, Billy G.	Emergency Communication	Service	B	7/29/2006	D	
Ray, Nancy K.	Health	Service	B	7/6/2006	Normal	
Richardson, Teddy H.	Police	P&F Service	B	7/1/2006	A	3
Sawyer, Donna Jean	MNPS	Early Service	B	7/1/2006	Normal	
Shockley, Karl Lance	MNPS	Service	B	6/1/2006	Normal	
Smith, Pamela A.	Emergency Communication	Early Service	B	2/5/2005	F	
Taylor, Finis	MNPS	Service	B	07/17/2002	Normal	
Thompson, Shirley Ann	MNPS	Service	B	5/31/2006	Normal	3
Troutt, Judy F	Police	Service	B	7/1/2006	Normal	3
Tuggle, Robert E	Fire	P&F Service	B	6/8/2006	F	

Options Elected (continued)

Name	Department	Pension Type	Plan A/B	Effective Date	Option	Drop Election
Vincent Sr, Daniel M	Circuit Court Clerk	Service	B	7/1/2006	E	
Wallace, Shirley E.	General Hospital	Early Service	B	6/30/2006	Normal	
Whitehorn, Raymond	MNPS	Service	B	7/15/2006	Normal	
Wingo, Robert J.	Water and Sewer	Early Service	B	7/6/2006	B	

Pension options key:

- Normal - life annuity (no option elected)
- Option A - Joint & Survivor - 100% to surviving beneficiary
- Option B - Joint & Survivor - 50% to surviving beneficiary
- Option C - Social Security
- Option D - 120 payments certain and life
- Option E - Joint & Survivor - 100% to surviving beneficiary with pop-up feature
- Option F - Joint & Survivor - 50% to surviving beneficiary with pop-up feature

Survivor

Employee Name	Department	Survivor Name	Plan Membership	Effective Date
Clay Peeples	Pensioner	Eugenia Peeples	A	07/23/06
J C Peach	Pensioner	Jean Peach	Old City	07/28/2006
Waymon Maxwell	Pensioner	Josephine Maxwell	B	7/31/2006
William T. Primm	Pensioner	Sandra Primm	B	8/7/2006
Jimmie J. Jones	Pensioner	Hazel Joyce Jones	B	8/6/2006
Brenda Strachan	Pensioner	Jeffrey Strachan	B	7/30/2006
Doris M. Barnes	MNPS	John Robert Barnes, Jr.	B	8/18/2006
Charles Lloyd	Water	Mary Lloyd	B	8/21/2006
Joe Kirkpatrick	Pensioner	Vedelia Kirkpatrick	Old City	8/8/2006
Charles Raymond Simms	Pensioner	Beulah M. Simms	Old City	08/22/06
Joyce Norris	Pensioner	Bennie Sears	A	8/25/2006
Phillip W. Ryman	Pensioner	Patricia Ryman	B	8/23/2006

BENEFIT BOARD ITEMS

The Human Resources staff submitted the following for the Board's consideration and appropriate action:

1. Health plan design update.

This item required no action by the Board.

2. In line of duty death benefit for Paul Satterfield.

Shannon Beehan reported to the Board that the surviving spouse was unaware of any pending benefits. Therefore, she never applied to receive an issuance. Ms. Beehan further stated that the Department of Law has issued a statement regarding this benefit due to the time of the individuals death and any possible statute of limitations.

B.R. Hall moved approval of the in line of duty death benefit. Dorothy Shell Berry seconded and the Board approved without objection.

3. Resolution No. RS2006-1431.

Shannon Beehan reported to the Board that this item is being presented as requested by the Metro Clerk's office. Ms. Beehan noted that Section I of the resolution incorrectly refers to inclusion of deputy sheriffs and correctional officers in the police and fire pension plan and it was not corrected prior to its

3. Resolution No. RS2006-1431. (continued)

adoption. She also stated that it appears to be a request for the Board to do an actuarial study to include judicial court officers as members of the police and fire pension plan.

After some discussion of costs for such a study, benefit changes being discussed before a Study and Formulating Committee, and having staff reply on behalf of the Board to the Council, Betsy Walkup moved that staff respond citing the Board's concern with the error in the resolution and the issue not being discussed by a Study and Formulating Committee. Dorothy Shell-Berry seconded. A vote was taken on the motion and the motion failed. After further discussion of staff responding to council and an actuarial study, B.R. Hall moved to refer this back to council voicing concerns relating to the error in the resolution. Steve Bumpus seconded and the Board approved without objection.

4. Disability pension appeal(s): Disability pensioner request to switch from medical to IOD.

Shannon Beehan reviewed this request with the Board.

Dr. Christopher Fletcher reported to the Board that the additional medical information received does not support the request to return this pension to an in line of duty pension. Dr. Fletcher recommends that the pension stand as a medial disability pension.

Betsy Walkup moved that the Board not reconsider this issue. Russell White seconded and the Board approved without objection.

5. IOD medical care appeal – Employee from Parks Department.

Shannon Beehan reviewed the report with the Board.

The individual was present and addressed the Board.

James Gray, Parks Department, was also present on behalf of the department.

After some discussion of the injury, the Board requested more information on the in line of duty injury to help determine if continuing the IOD treatment is necessary. The Board wanted clarification of whether or not the last diagnosis is backed by medical findings to support the IOD treatment.

The Board also noted that this item is an initial request for IOD medical treatment not an appeal.

6. IOD network

Dorothy Shell-Berry stated that the Board needs to start the process to extend or remove the sunset date for the IOD pilot program. The Board discussed the issues and suggested that known problems be solved prior to a formal program being implemented.

David Manning moved that legislation be drafted and sent to council to remove the sunset date on the IOD pilot program. Betsy Walkup seconded and the Board approved without objection.

The Board also discussed scheduling the next IOD Committee meeting.

7. Voluntary benefit vendors.

John Dodson and Wayne Lewis of American General were present and addressed the Board on their products and services and requested being allowed to start solicitations.

The Board also discussed scheduling the next Payroll Deduction Committee meeting.

8. Committee Reports:

a. Investment Committee

Celia Yancey reported to the Board that the Investment Committee met on August 25, 2006. She stated that Bob Liberto and Rich Ranallo of Segal Advisors, reviewed the quarterly performance reports for the MetroMax plan and Metro pension plan.

9. Correspondence:

- a. Utilization report from Blue Cross Blue Shield and pharmacy rebate.
- b. Utilization report from CIGNA.
- c. Utilization report from HealthSpring.
- d. Utilization report from Walgreens Health Initiatives.
- e. Standards on return to work processes.

Items 9.-a. through 9.-e were for information only and no action was required.

10. Reports for your information:

- a. Return to work.
- b. Social Security approvals.
- c. Refund of pension contributions. (none to report at this time)
- d. Repayment of pension contributions. (none to report at this time)
- e. Reports from Treasury.
- f. Social Security referrals. (none to report at this time)
- g. Non-compliant disability pensioners. (none to report at this time)
- h. Pending litigation(s). (reported quarterly)
- i. Disability status reports.
- j. CMS Subsidy Quarter 1 & 2.

Items 10.-a. through 10.-j were for information only and no action was required.

11. Late item(s):

There were no late items reported.

David Manning requested an update on PERC.

At this time Dorothy Shell-Berry commended Michael Turner, Charles Trost, and Tom Storey for their service to the Benefit Board and requested that staff draft resolutions in honor of their service to the Metropolitan employee Benefit Board. Russell White moved for approval of the resolutions. B.R. Hall seconded and the Board approved without objection.

With nothing further presented, the meeting adjourned at 11:43 a.m.

ATTEST:

APPROVED:

**Mrs. Dorothy Shell-Berry, Interim Director
Human Resources**

**Mr. David Manning, Chair
Employee Benefit Board**