

NASHVILLE, TENNESSEE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION CONSULTANTS
THOMASON AND ASSOCIATES
REPORT PREPARED BY

April 25, 1988

NASHVILLE, TENNESSEE
METROPOLITAN NASHVILLE HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
PREPARED FOR

NASHVILLE, TENNESSEE
LOCKELAND SPRINGS AND EAST END NEIGHBORHOODS
HISTORIC OUTBUILDING STUDY

On-site inspection. Sanborn Insurance maps from 1936 (updated to 1951) were recorded. Historic outbuildings were identified by their presence on maps and by area were walked or driven by the survey team and outbuildings were noted and south and Shelby Park on the east. All streets and alleys within the project Eastland Avenue on the north, Gallatin Road on the west, Shelby Avenue on the each outbuilding in the project area. The project area was defined generally by The project was completed by a survey director and assistant who examined

*Journal of the
City of Nashville*

Project Methodology

April and May of 1988.

Thomasson and Associates of Nashville was directed to carry out this study in their significance and recommend future actions regarding their preservation. assess the types of historic outbuildings found in these neighborhoods, evaluate changes and alterations to historic structures. The purpose of this study was to overlay of Conservation Zoning and the Historic Zoning Commission reviews Springs-East End Neighborhood of Nashville. These neighborhoods have an Zoning Commission funded a survey of outbuildings in the Lockeland To increase knowledge concerning these resources the Metropolitan Historic

*Journal of the
City of Nashville*

and were in use across the city.

horses and automobiles. By 1930, thousands of outbuildings had been constructed stables, garages and other structures to provide accessory space and shelter for the century illustrate that the majority of homes possessed sheds, privys, the rear or adjacent to the main residence. Maps of Nashville from the turn of late 19th century and garages from the early 20th century were often built at collection of historic resources. Stables, servant's quarters and sheds from the Outbuildings in Nashville's older neighborhoods comprise a relatively unknown

Scope of Project

consulted and they illustrated the location of outbuildings on lots, their size and use. The map key listed outbuilding usage such as garages, servant's quarters and stables.

Following the identification of a pre-1951 outbuilding an inventory form and photographic documentation was completed for most properties. The inventory form was devised by the consultant with the assistance of the Historic Zoning Commission staff. The purpose of the inventory form was to illustrate the location, size, design and details of the outbuildings in order to fully assess its significance. Attached to each form was a black and white contact print of the structure and representative slides were also taken. Surveyed outbuildings were circled on the Sanborn maps and others not surveyed were also noted and coded on the Sanborn maps.

Survey Results

A total of 134 outbuildings were identified as being built prior to 1951 in the Lockeland Springs-East End neighborhood. Of this number many had been altered and a total of 89 properties were inventoried. These 88 properties are classified as follows:

Construction - Frame 69; Brick 11; Concrete Block 5; Hollow Core Tile 1; Hollow Core Concrete Block 1; Stone Veneer 2.
Frame Siding - Vertical Board 32; Weatherboard 12; Shiplap 12; Board and Batten 11; Added Metal or Asbestos 2.
Height - One-story 84; Two-story 5.

Roof Form - Gable 55; Pyramidal 15; Shed 8; Jerkinhead 6; Hipped 3; Flat 2.
Orientation - Front Towards the Street 51; Horizontal or Parallel to the Street 38.

Roof Materials - Composition shingles 85; Metal Standing Seam 4.

copy
attached
FS

The largest number of inventoried outbuildings were gable roof frame garages constructed between ca. 1920 and ca. 1950. Common characteristics of this form were vertical board or weatherboard siding, gable roof of composition shingles and hinged doors of vertical board construction. Beneath the roof eaves are often exposed roof rafters. These structures occasionally displayed fixed casement windows on a facade but this was uncommon. Shed roof wings or

A. Frame Garage: Gable Roof Form - ca. 1920-ca. 1950

The overwhelming percentage of the outbuildings surveyed were simple gable roof frame garages constructed between 1920 and 1950. These structures shared many of the same design features and represent the most common property type in the survey area. Variations of this structure include pyramidal, hipped and jerkinhead roof forms and various types of wood siding such as vertical board, weatherboard, shiplap and board and batten. Decoration was non-existent in most cases. Other property types surveyed were brick and stone veneer garages. Approximately 13 buildings of this type were inventoried and share similar detailing.

Property Types

Doors (Some outbuildings had more than two) - Original Hinged Frame 60; Double Doors (Sliding Track and Overhead Spring) 59; Single Light Door 21; Modern Overhead and Other 15.
Windows - Multi-Light Sash 12.
Foundation - Concrete Slab 41; Concrete Block 34; Brick 12.
Access - From Rear Alley 57; From Street Via Driveway 31; No Vehicular Access 1.
Function - Automobile Garage 71; Garage and Living Quarters 9; Shed 4;
Servant's Quarters 3; Stable 1; Dwelling 1.
Date of Construction - Before 1900 1; 1900-1920 2; 1920-1930 72; 1930-1950 14.

additions and drive-thru sheds were also frequently surveyed. Many were built on concrete slab foundations or rested on concrete block foundations. Almost all were one-story in height with a mix of orientation towards the street and alley.

B. Frame Garage: Pyramidal, Jerkinhead and Hipped Form, ca. 1920-ca. 1950

This structure form is similar in design and detail with the gable roof forms with the exception of various roof types. Roof forms such as jerkinhead, pyramidal and hipped were all surveyed and make up a large sub-group of the frame garage form.

C. Brick Garages: ca. 1920 - ca. 1950

Brick outbuildings from the early 20th century were rarely built or have been razed in the survey area. Only ten brick garages from this period were inventoried. Many of those surveyed were along Eastland Avenue adjacent to the large brick and stone veneer homes which characterize this street. Construction techniques differ little from the frame garages with the exception of having a brick veneer added to the exterior structure. Most are gable roof forms and have a variety of doors and windows. Brick patterns represented include common bond variations and stretcher bond.

Several brick garages appear to have been built with a specific area for a servant or work space. These structures were built with large work areas and brick flues for stoves. This was not unusual for large garages as many auto owners of the period did their own repair and a heated, comfortable work space was incorporated into the garage where possible. A good example is the two car garage located at 1415 Eastland Avenue. A two-story garage with living quarters above built ca. 1920 exists at 511 N. 14th Street. Variations of this design include jerkinhead and flat roof designs.

Within the survey area two substantial servant's quarters were inventoried. These buildings are associated with ca. 1910 stone veneer Foursquare residences located at 1501 Eastland Avenue and 125 S. 11th Street. The servant's quarters on 11th Street is a simple one-story gable roof building with a small inset porch, ship lap siding and an interior flue. It appears to consist of no more than two rooms. A larger and remodeled servant's quarters is located at 1501 Eastland and has a pyramidal roof, four-over-four sash windows and weatherboard siding. The present porch is a recent addition. Both buildings are common vernacular forms of the period with no decorative detailing. A small frame building identified on the Sanborn maps as servant's quarters exists at 1309 Stratton. This building is a small one-story frame dwelling with a

E. Servant's Quarters and Stables

A small but significant group of outbuildings were stone veneer garages and those constructed of hollow core concrete block and tile. Two stone veneer garages were surveyed at 1403 Eastland Avenue and 1512 Stratton. These buildings are also of the same size and design of frame garages but differ in that they have stone veneer added over the interior framework. ^{Two} ~~Four~~ buildings were inventoried which were of hollow core concrete block or hollow core tile construction. Hollow core concrete block is a term used to describe concrete blocks which are molded with a rusticated pattern on the external face. ^{One} ~~Two~~ garages of this material ^{was} ~~were~~ surveyed and several frame garages had foundations of this type of concrete block. ^{One} ~~Two~~ buildings of hollow core tile ^{was} ~~were~~ also surveyed. This type of construction features large rectangular clay tile hollow core blocks which are joined by mortar and essentially stacked atop one another. These buildings were considered relatively fireproof but their expense kept their use limited in the East Nashville area.

D. Stone Veneer and Hollow Core Concrete Block and Tile Forms

pyramidal roof.

All 19th and early 20th century frame stables have been razed with the exception of the brick stable at 1409 Forrest Street. This simple shed roof structure appears to have been built ca. 1900 when the main residence at this residence was constructed. Although the stable doors on the alley facade have been altered, the original entrance facing the rear of the residence retains its brick relief arching and vertical board door. This stable was built with a stove flue and later became an automobile garage.

Garage Construction and Features

Garage construction remained fairly uniform during the early 20th century. The standards of balloon frame construction were followed using techniques of the period. In most cases a concrete slab floor was poured or gravel applied in the rectangular space to be utilized. A foundation of concrete blocks or bricks was common to protect the wood siding and sills from contact with the ground. Over the foundation sill boards were laid and vertical 2x4 vertical studs rose to connect with the plate boards. From the plate boards 2x4 rafters were added which were designed in various roof pitches. Horizontal studing was also added and the siding attached directly to this framing. Roof sheathing was then added and the roof surface, generally asphalt shingles, was then applied.

For brick and stone veneer garages it was a simple matter to face the exterior of the structure. The brick or stone used was not an integral part of the support structure but was instead a decorative element. Hollow core concrete block and tile were joined together by standard mortar techniques for the walls and frame rafters were then added for the roofs. Hollow core concrete and tile had the advantage of being somewhat fireproof although more expensive.

Windows for garages were designed for illuminating the interior and often for ventilation. Garage windows were usually small stock windows found in residences of the period with multi-light sash the most common surveyed. While some windows were functional double hung sash, others were hinged casement design or were fixed in place.

Doors for garages have a variety of designs. Because of the large space needed for automobile access garage doors were much larger than typical doors in residences. Doors were designed at least eight feet in width and sometimes as much as ten feet to accommodate cars with wheelbases of 100 to 110 inches. The height of the doors was at least eight feet and sometimes larger. To span this large area two hinged doors were often used for a single car garage rather than one single door. In the early days of garages double doors with large hinges were the most common. Two garage door designs of this type are illustrated in the Gordon-Van Tine architectural catalog of 1915 (see appendices). Doors in the 1920s and 1930s became more sophisticated such as sliding tracks and sectionalized roll-up doors using spring mechanisms. The garage at 1414 Eastland displays excellent sliding track doors. Many garages were also built with small frame doors to the side of the large garage doors or on other facades for easier access.

As in the case of residences, later additions or expansion to the original garage also occurred. The addition of additional storage space or work sheds was common and many of the garages surveyed displayed later single room frame additions essentially grafted onto the original structure. The garage and shed at 1204 Calvin is a good example of this type of addition. Other garages were

expanded to accommodate two cars and shed or flat roof additions were added laterally to the original structure. An example of this style of addition is seen at 1116 Ordway.

Construction techniques for frame outbuildings have differed little in the past seventy-five years. Simple frame gable roof garages with retractible overhead doors continue to be built today although artificial sidings such as vinyl or aluminum are more prevalent. New detached brick and stone veneer garages also often follow the same forms that were used in the early 20th century. Because of this commonality of form and design, dating some frame garages would prove difficult without the use of historic maps. The outbuildings of East Nashville display similarities in design and form from 1918 to 1988.

Historic Contexts

A. Settlement

The area which now comprises the East End and Lockeland Springs neighborhoods in East Nashville was originally open farmland belonging to several families in the mid-19th century. The residence of the Weakley family adjacent to the Lockeland Spring and the A.V.S. Lindsley House known as Springside, were the primary estates in the area. By the 1870s, however, the expansion of neighboring Edgefield resulted in the subdivision of these estates into small urban lots. From the 1870s until the early 1900s all of this area would be platted and sold and residences built on the lots. By 1889, there were sixty-nine homes in the East End area south of Woodland Street and streetcar lines extended into this growing section of the city. By the early 1900s all of the land around the Lockeland mansion had also been subdivided and residences erected. Final subdivisions occurred when the Springside and Lockeland mansions were razed in the 1930s.

By the 1930s most of the lots in this section of Nashville had been developed. The earliest residences in the area were built between 1880 and 1900 and displayed Eastlake, Queen Anne and Italianate features. Others were simple one-story T-plan or Pyramidal Folk Victorian styles of the period. The Sanborn maps of the period reveal that most of the outbuildings constructed for these residences were of frame construction. These outbuildings consisted of stables for horses, sheds for storage and privies. With the proliferation of wood burning stoves and ice boxes the need for detached kitchens lessened and few are listed on the maps. Frame outbuildings from this period have either been razed or were replaced with later frame garages.

Brick outbuildings for stables and servant's quarters were rarely built in the survey area. The only remaining example is the ca. 1900 brick stable at the rear of 1409 Forrest Street. This shed roof building has had the stable doors altered but its basic plan and form remain. No other brick outbuilding from this period was identified.

After 1900, homes were increasingly built with Colonial Revival and Bungalow details. Several sheds appear to date from this period and there also two significant servant's quarters which exist. These buildings were constructed ca. 1910 when the large Foursquare residences at 1501 Eastland and 125 S. 11th Street were built. They were constructed to house servant's and are simple frame vernacular designs of the period with minimal detailing. A smaller servant's quarters residence is located at 1309 Stratton. Other servant's buildings were erected adjacent to large homes on Eastland, Holly and other streets but only these examples remain extant. No other outbuildings appear to date from the early 20th century settlement of the area.

B. Transportation

After 1910, the type of outbuilding constructed in East Nashville was transformed by the growing popularity of the automobile. Prior to 1910, the automobile remained something of a novelty in America and was primarily enjoyed by the upper class. Only two hundred thousand automobiles were registered in the entire country in 1910. Mass production made Ford and other automobiles more accessible for the general population and between 1910 and 1920 the number of registered cars increased to six million. During the 1920s this figure more than tripled with twenty-three million registered by 1929. The result in many cases was the razing of previous horse stables and the construction of automobile garages.

Garages from ca. 1915 to ca. 1935 make up the largest number of inventoried outbuildings in the East Nashville area. Over one hundred and twenty-five pre-1950 garages were located in the survey area and approximately eighty were inventoried. The great majority of these garages were simple one-story frame structures with gable roofs, vertical board or weatherboard siding, hinged or sliding doors and little or no decorative detailing. These structures are generally associated with one to two-story frame residences from the early 20th century and especially with frame Bungalows of the 1920s and 1930s. Also inventoried were over a dozen brick veneer, stone veneer and hollow core concrete and tile garages. These structures were generally associated with larger and more expensive residences on Eastland Avenue and other streets.

Most garages from this period were erected by local builders using standard plans from pattern books. Others may have been purchased and built from mail order companies such as Sears, Roebuck and Alladin Homes. Sears had many designs available in the 1920s and 1930s for automobile garages and sold thousands throughout the country. Alladin Homes of Michigan also sold many garage buildings and their advertisements from their 1919 catalog featured several common designs (see Appendices). Alladin's "Buick" garage is a variation of the popular one-bay, gable roof structure with hinged doors. A bit more elaborate with windows and exposed rafters is the "Peerless" and "Maxwell". The "Winton" differs only with its hipped roof. The two car "Packard" is the company's top garage with a small door leading into the garage plus two sliding doors and several windows. Variations of these type designs are found throughout the East Nashville area.

1950
1930
1920
1910

Architectural publications of the period stressed that the best design for a garage was one which matched the design of the primary residence. Gable roof residences should have gable roof garages and hipped roof homes should have hipped roof garages. In Los Angeles, for example, it was legislated that garages must be "miniatures of fine homes". Although this extreme was never introduced in Nashville, a number of homes in the East Nashville area have matching garages. The most notable of these is the brick jerkinhead garage at the rear of the brick jerkinhead Bungalow at 1417 Eastland Avenue and the hollow core concrete garage behind the stone veneer Bungalow at 1500 Eastland Avenue.

The placement of garages was dictated by accessibility from the house, street and alley. In the early years of automobiles they were considered a fire hazard and garages were placed well away from the house, generally at the rear lot line. The presence of flammable materials such as gas and oil and the frequency of do it yourself repair in these years resulted in frequent garage fires. Insurance companies were wary of the proximity of garages to residences and required fire walls if the garages were located adjacent to the home.

Garages were often placed at the rear of lot lines also due to the access from rear alleys. Alleys are common on most blocks in East Nashville and almost two-thirds of the garages surveyed were entered from the alley. This is especially true for areas subdivided before 1910 when automobiles were uncommon. Lots were laid out with the buildings close together and no room was allocated for driveways. The need for street access did not exist at this time with stables and sheds reached from the alley. In areas developed in the 1920s with Bungalows such as along Eastland Avenue and Edgewood Place, many lots platted to be wide enough to accommodate both the residence and a side

driveway to a rear garage. In some areas of West Nashville during the 1920s, alleys were done away with in developments with each lot wide enough to accommodate side driveways and rear garages. By the end of the 1920s, access from the street became extremely common for new residences.

As the automobile became more and more a part of everyday life in the mid-20th century new homes were frequently built with an attached garage. In older sections such as in East Nashville, this trend was illustrated by the profusion of attached carports and similar enclosures adjacent to historic homes. Original garages were allowed to deteriorate or were replaced with new buildings. The original garages which remain are an important physical reminder of our changing transportation patterns and needs.

Assessment of Significance and Recommendations

Maps of the East Nashville area from 1951 reveal hundreds of frame garages, sheds and other outbuildings at the rear of lot lines and lining alleys. The survey of 1988 revealed that the majority of these buildings were razed, burned or moved in the intervening thirty-seven years. Those which remain are therefore, of significance to the East End and Lockeland Springs neighborhoods and should be maintained and preserved.

The brick and stone veneer structures in the neighborhood and those of hollow core block and tile are especially significant since so few are extant. Every effort should be made to preserve or enhance their present condition and major alterations should not occur without prior review. The alteration of original doors, rooflines, windows and other defining features should not occur and their original construction should be respected. These structures were well constructed and if maintained will last indefinitely.

were generally built at the same time as the residences themselves. This
In the Bungalow and Colonial Revival neighborhoods of West Nashville garages

structures which would last a limited amount of time.
available and most garages built in the 1920s and 1930s were simple frame
class composition of the neighborhoods only a certain amount of money would be
a new building had to be constructed to house and shelter it. Given the working
homes were built prior to the coming of the automobile. When one was acquired,
and period of development. For many of the residents in East Nashville, their
especially garages, exist. The answer to this appears to be one of economics
Richland-West End and Hillsboro-West End a higher percentage of outbuildings,
other sections of the city. In the Bungalow districts of Belmont-Hillsboro,
The attrition rate in East Nashville also appears to be high when compared with

site of former garages.

East Nashville and many concrete foundations remain next to alleys marking the
remain intact and unaltered. This pattern is repeated throughout the rest of
garages and other buildings listed on the 1951 Sanborn map. Of these only two
between Holly and Russell Streets in the 1600 block has thirty-eight frame
attrition rate for frame outbuildings is quite high. For example the alley
materials stored and used for automobiles. Because of these factors the
is simply razed. Fires are also common in frame garages due to the combustible
Siding replacement is common and often after forty to fifty years the building
is drawn into the frame sills and siding resulting in deterioration over time.
materials have a limited life span. Often foundations are minimal and moisture
However, most frame outbuildings by their very nature of construction and

Frame garages built prior to 1950 are an important defining characteristic of the East Nashville area and efforts should be made for their preservation and protection. Garages which are in need of repair and require only new roofs or replacement of 50% or less of the exterior siding should be retained and property owners should be required to make the necessary repairs. The demolition of frame garages should be discouraged but allowed for those which have deteriorated internal framework and/or over 50% of the siding requiring replacement and/or the roof is beyond repair. Many of the frame garages in the

year old frame structure should go.

However, realistic limits have to be placed on how far replacement of a sixty should be encouraged to repair these garages and associated outbuildings. the next few years if repair and maintenance is not performed. Property owners and internal structure. It appears that a number of these will be razed in number are in poor condition with extensive deterioration of the siding, roof deterioration, especially siding close to the ground level and roofs. A smaller condition. The majority surveyed are in fair condition with some areas of The frame garages which remain in East Nashville are in varying states of

streets to the south.

1920s. These homes along Eastland were built on land developed later than adjacent to large Colonial Revival and Bungalow designs during the 1910s and reinforced by the many substantial garages which were built on Eastland Avenue survived intact in these areas than in East Nashville. This conclusion is shingle exteriors were also popular. As a result many more outbuildings have hollow core concrete block and tile. Large frame garages with stucco and resulted in many more substantial garages built of brick and stone veneer and

neighborhoods appear to be reaching the end of their natural life span. Costly repairs to these structures cannot be justified economically and contradict the natural evolution of outbuildings.

Summary

* Outbuildings are an important defining feature of the East Nashville neighborhoods of Lockeland Spring and East End.

* Repair and retention of pre-1950 outbuildings should be encouraged by the Metro Historical Commission and neighborhood groups. Low interest loan programs or assistance grants should be considered for selected outbuildings in need of repair.

* Brick veneer, stone veneer and hollow core concrete and tile outbuildings in the area are rare and every effort should be made for their preservation. Demolition permits for these structures should not be allowed nor should major alterations be allowed.

* Frame outbuildings which are in need of repair and require less than 50% of the exterior siding replaced, roof repairs of other minor work should be retained and demolition permits denied. However, the costs for repairs and economic hardship considerations should be considered in each case.

* Demolition permits should be issued for frame outbuildings which require 50% or more of the siding replaced, complete roof replacement or extensive structural rebuilding.

* Information on the importance of outbuilding maintenance and retention should be distributed to property owners of historic outbuildings in the neighborhoods.



1415 Eastland: Brick garage with a gable roof and added modern overhead garage doors.



1204 Stratton: Brick garage with pyramidal roof and original glass and frame double doors.



1309 Stratton: Servant's quarters building with a pyramidal roof.



1409 Forrest: Brick stable with a shed roof at rear of main residence.



1501 Eastland: Remodeled servant's quarters at rear of main residence.



125 S. 11th St.: Original servant's quarters at rear of main residence.



1500 Eastland: Hollow core concrete block garage with original doors and windows.



1403 Eastland: Stone veneer garage with a gable roof - is missing original doors.



1115-17 Forrest: Single bay brick garage with a flat roof and vertical board double doors.



1411 Eastland: Brick garage with a gable roof and added modern doors and enclosures.



1116 Ordway: Gable roof frame garage with original shed roof wing.



1403 Calvin: Gable roof frame two-bay garage with original glass and frame double doors.



612 S. 17th St.: Gable roof frame garage with original frame, diagonal braced double doors.



1109 Gartland: Frame garage with jerkinhead roof form variation and original vertical board double doors.