



METROPOLITAN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
Sunnyside in Sevier Park, 1113 Kirkwood Avenue Nashville, TN 37204
615-862-7970, historicalcommission@nashville.gov

**METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC)
MINUTES**

July 19, 2023 2601 Bransford Ave, (entrance off Berry Road) 2:00 p.m.

Commissioner Attendance: Chair Bell, Commissioners Cashion, Cotton, Johnson, Mayhall, Mosley

Staff Attendance: Historic Zoning Administrator Zeigler, Legal Counsel Mikkelsen, and staff members Kelli Mitchell, Joseph Rose, Melissa Sajid and Jenny Warren.

1. ADOPTION OF JUNE 21, 2023, MINUTES

Motion: Commissioner Cotton moved to approve the agendas as presented. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

2. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

- 15. 905 Villa Pl – Administrative Permit Issued
- 22. 1520 McKennie Ave – Notification Requirements Not Met
- 25. Middle Housing presentation—Postponed

Motion: Commissioner Cotton moved to approve the revised agenda. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

3. COUNCILMEMBER PRESENTATION

CONSENT

4. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH

5. 1908 BEECHWOOD AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023043022

6. 1912 CEDAR LN

Application: New Construction – Addition
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023042919

7. 101 CHURCH ST

Application: Rehabilitation
Council District: 19
Overlay: Second Avenue Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Robin Zeigler, robin.zeigler@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023043107

8. 101 CHURCH ST

Application: New Construction – Addition
Council District: 19
Overlay: Second Avenue Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Robin Zeigler, robin.zeigler@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023043107

9. 1411 GALE LN

Application: New Construction – Outbuilding
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023043492

10. 922 N 14TH ST

Application: New Construction – Addition and Outbuilding
Council District: 06
Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023039810 and T2023039832

11. 1702 RUSSELL ST

Application: New Construction – Addition
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023043525

12. 2800 WESTWOOD AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition; Setback Determination
Council District: 18
Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023043485

13. 901 MONTROSE AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition and Setback Determination
Council District: 17
Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023043810

14. 2014 SWEETBRIAR AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren, jenny.warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2023021088

15. 905 VILLA PL

Application: New Construction – Addition
Council District: 19
Overlay: Edgehill Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose, joseph.rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023043699

Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to approve all items on consent with their applicable conditions. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

DESIGNATION

16. EXPANSION OF DOWNTOWN OVERLAY

Description of Project: Councilmember O’Connell requests an expansion of the Downtown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay with a revision to the existing design guidelines.

Recommendation Summary: Staff suggests that the Commission recommend approval of the expansion of the overlay for these eligible properties to the Council, finding that the properties meet 17.36.120(A)(5); and to adopt the existing design guidelines, finding that they meet the Secretary of Interior Standards.

Public Comment: Doug Sloan (representing multiple property owners); Mark Morrison 323-325 Union Street; Kaveh Balouch 327-329 Union Street; Patrick Pocklington, 421 Union Street; Tom Padauk, 419 Union Street

Motion: Commissioner Johnson moved to recommend approval of the expansion of the overlay for these eligible properties to the Council, finding that the properties meet 17.36.120(A)(5); and to adopt the existing design guidelines, finding that they meet the Secretary of Interior Standards. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed with Commissioner Mayhall recused.

VIOLATION

17. 2009 CEDAR LN

Application: New Construction – Addition/Violation
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell, kelli.mitchell@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2022079692

Description of Project: The applicant requests to retain work done differently than permit #2022079692 for enclosing a left-side porch and constructing a right-side screened porch. Windows with interior grids and siding with faux graining were installed without staff review or approval.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the new windows and siding installed at 2009 Cedar Lane, finding that they do not meet Section II(B)(1)(d) and II(B)(1)(g) of the guidelines. Staff recommends that the existing windows and siding be removed and replaced with compatible materials within ninety (90) days of the Commission’s decision.

Applicant: Samuel House

Public Comment: Michael Hudson, 1910 Cedar Lane; Thomas Meyer, 2007 Cedar Lane. (Public comment was received via email.)

Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to disapprove the new windows and siding installed at 2009 Cedar Lane, finding that they do not meet Section II(B)(1)(d) and II(B)(1)(g) of the guidelines and required that the existing windows and siding be removed and replaced with compatible materials within ninety (90) days of the Commission’s decision. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

MHZA ACTION

18. 4606 ELKINS AVE

Application: Demolition – Economic Hardship
Council District: 24
Overlay: Park and Elkins Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose, joseph.rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2023043655

Description of Project: The applicant requests demolition of a contributing building, arguing for economic hardship.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends denial of demolition of 4606 Elkins Avenue finding that the project does not meet Section III(B)(2)(a) nor 17.40.420 E of the zoning ordinance for economic hardship and does not meet Section III(B)(2)(b) as the building is contributing.

Applicant: Christie Wilson, owner and Marshall Bassett, engineer

Public Comment: Nick Bailey, 4700 Elkins (Public comment was received via email.)

Motion: Commissioner Mayhall moved to deny demolition of 4606 Elkins Avenue finding that the project does not meet Section III(B)(2)(a) nor 17.40.420 E of the zoning ordinance for economic hardship and does not meet Section III(B)(2)(b) as the building is contributing. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

19. 1013 MONTROSE AVE

Application: Demolition – Economic Hardship
Council District: 17
Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023044057

Description of Project: The applicant requests demolition of a contributing building, arguing for economic hardship.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends denial of demolition of 1013 Montrose Avenue finding that the project does not meet Section III(B)(2)(a) nor 17.40.420(E) of the zoning ordinance for economic hardship and does not meet Section III(B)(2)(b) as the building is contributing.

Applicant: John Duke and Curtis Duke, contractor

Public Comment: There were no requests from the public to speak. (Public comment was received via email.)

Motion: Commissioner Mayhall moved to deny demolition of 1013 Montrose Avenue finding that the project does not meet Section III(B)(2)(a) nor 17.40.420(E) of the zoning ordinance for economic hardship and does not meet Section III(B)(2)(b) as the building is contributing. Commissioner Mosley seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

20. 210 S 10TH ST

Application: New Construction – Infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2023036903

Description of Project: Applicant proposes a multi-unit residential development at the northwest corner of Fatherland and South 10th Streets.

Recommendation Summary:

Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor heights be similar to the finished floor heights of adjacent structures, to be confirmed by MHZC in the field;
2. MHZC approve the final selection of all windows and doors, masonry samples, windows and doors, metal roof color and specification, the front stoop materials, the materials of all driveways and walkways, and any other materials prior to purchase and installation; and
3. MHZC approve all appurtenances, including fencing, location of HVAC and electrical meters, walkways, and other permanent landscape features prior to installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill development meets Section III of the Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay.

Applicant: Scott Morton, architect

Public Comment: Alice Forester, president of Historic Edgefield; Carol Norton, 801 Boscobel St; John Guider, 606 Fatherland St; Councilmember Withers; Jenna Phillip, 927 Fatherland St (Public comment was received via email.)

Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

1. **The finished floor heights be similar to the finished floor heights of adjacent structures, to be confirmed by MHZC in the field;**
2. **MHZC approve the final selection of all windows and doors, masonry samples, windows and doors, metal roof color and specification, the front stoop materials, the materials of all driveways and walkways, and any other materials prior to purchase and installation; and**
3. **MHZC approve all appurtenances, including fencing, location of HVAC and electrical meters, walkways, and other permanent landscape features prior to installation;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill development meets Section III of the Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

21. 1005 BATE AVE

Application: New Construction – Infill and Outbuilding

Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2023028165 and T2023043503

Description of Project: Application is to construct one and one-half story infill and outbuilding.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;
3. The siding shall have a smooth finish and maximum reveal of seven inches (7"); and
4. The final selections of all windows, doors, all porch elements, and walkway/driveway material shall be approved prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill and outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Waverly-Belmont chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Applicant: Not present

Public Comment: There were no requests from the public to speak. (Public comment was received via email.)

Motion: Commissioner Cotton moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;
3. The siding shall have a smooth finish and maximum reveal of seven inches (7"); and,
4. The final selections of all windows, doors, all porch elements, and walkway/driveway material shall be approved prior to purchase and installation;

finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill and outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Waverly-Belmont chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

22. 1520 MCKENNIE AVE

Application: New Construction – Infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023028719

Notification requirements not met.

NEW BUSINESS

23. TAX ABATEMENT REVIEW

Description of Project: One application for the tax abatement program was received for the annual \$20 million cap. The request is for 1926 10th Avenue North, which has applied for a Historic Landmark. One application was received for the Second Avenue North \$40 million, on-going, tax abatement cap for 2020 bomb-related projects. The request is for 101 Church Street, located in the Second Avenue HPZO.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of both projects, finding that both properties qualify, that the proposed projects meet the design guidelines, and that the buildings are either in the Second Avenue HPZO or have applied for a Historic Landmark overlay. Staff further recommends attributing the full annual \$20 million cap to both projects and attributing the remaining of the Second Avenue proposal to the on-going \$40 million cap for properties damaged in the Second Avenue 2020 bomb. If approved with the proposed calculation, \$26,110,498 will remain from the on-going \$40 million cap for bomb damaged buildings.

Public Comment: Kristen Carson and Ron Linn, owners

Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to approve both projects, finding that both properties qualify, the proposed projects meet the design guidelines, and that the buildings are either in the Second Avenue HPZO or have applied for a Historic Landmark overlay with the condition that the full annual \$20 million cap be used by both projects, attributing the remaining of the Second Avenue proposal to the on-going \$40 million cap for properties damaged in the Second Avenue 2020 bomb, leaving \$26,110,498 in the on-going \$40 million cap. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

24. SECOND AVENUE DESIGN GUIDELINE REVISION

Description of Project: Staff suggests the consideration of revising the design guidelines to meet contemporary needs and as a way to assist with the revitalization of Second Avenue North after the 2020 bomb.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed revision for the Second Avenue Design Guidelines, finding that the revision is consistent with the existing design guidelines and the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation,

specifically rooftop additions.

Public Comment: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Motion: Commissioner Cotton moved to defer until the August meeting. Commissioner Mayhall seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

25. MHZC TRAINING: MIDDLE HOUSING PRESENTATION FROM THE PLANNING DEPT

Deferred