



METROPOLITAN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
Sunnyside in Sevier Park, 1113 Kirkwood Avenue Nashville, TN 37204
615-862-7970, historicalcommission@nashville.gov

**METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC)
MINUTES**

November 15, 2023 Sonny West Conference Center/ Fulton Campus 2:00 p.m.

Commissioner Attendance: Chair Bell, Vice-Chair Stewart, Commissioners Cashion, Mayhall, Mosley, Price

Staff Attendance: Legal Counsel Ann Mikkelsen, Historic Zoning Administrator Robin Zeigler and staff members Melissa Baldock, Joseph Rose, Melissa Sajid, and Jenny Warren

Commissioner Johnson's service was recognized prior to calling the meeting to order.

1. ADOPTION OF ADOPTION OF NOVEMBER 15, 2023, MINUTES

Motion: Commissioner Price moved to approve the agenda as presented. Commissioner Cashion seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

2. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Requested Agenda Revisions:

- 5. 519 Fatherland St—Request to defer
- 13. 3612 Central Ave—Agreement to resolve violation met
- 18. 1224 Howard Ave—Request to defer.

Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve the revised agenda. Commissioner Mayhall seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

3. COUNCILMEMBER PRESENTATIONS

None present.

CONSENT

4. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH (46 permits issued)

5. 519 FATHERLAND ST

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023094890

6. 2017 BENJAMIN ST

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren, jenny.warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023094254

7. 1521 FOREST AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023095767

8. 1301 CLAYTON AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023095482

9. 1212 5TH AVE N

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding

Council District: 19

Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, melissa.baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID# T2023095463

10. 315 WILSON BLVD

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 24

Overlay: Cherokee Park Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023084228

11. 3622 MEADOWBROOK AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding; Setback Determination

Council District: 24

Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2023095658

(Public comment received via email for 3622 Meadowbrook Ave)

Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve all consent items with their applicable conditions, with the exception of 529 Fatherland, which was deferred. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

VIOLATIONS

12. 1807 BEECHWOOD AVE

Application: New Construction-Addition/ Violation

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, melissa.baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: 20230093983

Applicants: Sadhna Williams, applicant representative

Public: Bob Daniel, 1808 Beechwood Ave [Public comment received via email.]

Description of Project: Applicant enclosed a side porch without a preservation permit and is applying to keep the existing conditions.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. The side porch enclosure be redesigned so that there are visible porch posts that match the earlier design, the front and side walls are primarily glazing, and any minimal wall space be filled with panels or trim rather than siding; and,
2. MHZC approve the windows and trim material prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Commissioner Mayhall moved to approve the project with the conditions that:

- 1. The side porch enclosure be redesigned so that there are visible porch posts that match the earlier design, the front and side walls are primarily glazing, and any minimal wall space be filled with panels or trim rather than siding; and,**
- 2. MHZC approve the windows and trim material prior to purchase and installation;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

13. 3612 CENTRAL AVE

Application: New Construction—Violation

Council District: 24

Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, melissa.baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: 20230067991

Removed from the agenda.

MHZC ACTIONS

14. 1228 6TH AVE N

Application: Repairs, Replacement & Alterations—Masonry

Council District: 19

Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, melissa.baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID# 2021049033

Applicants: Andrew Heideman, Four Square Design Studio

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak. [Public comment received via email.]

Description of Project: The applicant proposes to apply a mineral masonry paint to both the historic brick and mortar and to the brick and mortar on the addition.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the request to paint the historic brick, finding that it does not meet Section II.C.1. of the design guidelines. Staff does recommend approval of the request to paint the non-historic brick on the addition with the proposed paint, finding it meets Section II.C.1. of the design guidelines.

Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve the request to paint the house with a product that is pre-approved prior to purchase and installation and that is a color that matches the existing finish of the historic brick finding it meets Section II.C.1. of the design guidelines. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed with Commissioner Mosley in opposition.

15. 2023 BENJAMIN ST

Application: New Construction—Addition; Partial Demolition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2023084140

Applicants: Brady Whicker, designer

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application is to construct a rear one-story addition. The request includes partial demolition of a window opening on the right-side elevation and replacing the existing metal porch roof on the front elevation with a pergola.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions of approval:

1. The front chimney shall remain;
2. The window opening that is to be altered on the right-side elevation shall either be vertically oriented or square with 1' between openings;
3. The final selections of the windows and trim shall be approved prior to purchase and installation;
4. Siding shall have a smooth finish and maximum reveal of 7"; and
5. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition meets sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), and VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to approve the project with the conditions that:

1. The front chimney shall remain;
2. One of the two windows, the one closest to the corner, currently proposed to be removed on the right-side shall be kept in place;
3. New drawings showing the window configuration shall be submitted prior to issuance of a permit;
4. The final selections of the windows and trim shall be approved prior to purchase and installation;
5. Siding shall have a smooth finish and maximum reveal of 7"; and
6. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition meets sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), and VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

16. 600 A FATHERLAND ST

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2023086325

Applicants: Tryg Littlefield, MLS Construction

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: The proposal is to construct a 1.5 story outbuilding next to an existing 1.5 story outbuilding. The application includes demolition of an existing outbuilding and a setback determination to reduce the street setback along South 6th Street from ten feet (10') to five feet (5').

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of demolition of the existing outbuilding as well as approval of the new outbuilding with the following conditions:

1. The total footprint of outbuildings on the lot shall not exceed one thousand square feet (1000 SF); and
2. The final details of the windows, pedestrian door, and garage doors are approved prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed outbuilding meets section III of the Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning design guidelines.

Motion: Commissioner Price moved to approve the demolition of the existing outbuilding as well as approve the new outbuilding with the conditions that:

1. **The total footprint of outbuildings on the lot shall not exceed one thousand square feet (1000 SF); and,**
2. **The final details of the windows, pedestrian door, and garage doors are approved prior to purchase and installation;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed outbuilding meets section III of the Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning design guidelines. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

17. 1004 15TH AVE S

Application: New Construction—Infill and Outbuilding

Council District: 17

Overlay: Edgehill Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2023074697 and T2023087873

Applicants: Barry Greer, RK Junior

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak. [Public comment received via email.]

Description of Project: Application to construct infill and an outbuilding on the vacant lot at 1004 15th Avenue South.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed infill and outbuilding with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;

2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,
3. MHZC review and approve all final material selections for foundation, cladding, roofing, trim, windows, doors, porch elements, and site elements prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill and outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Edgehill chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Price moved to approve the proposed infill and outbuilding with the conditions that:

1. **The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;**
2. **The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,**
3. **MHZC review and approve all final material selections for foundation, cladding, roofing, trim, windows, doors, porch elements, and site elements prior to purchase and installation;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill and outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Edgehill chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

18. 1224 HOWARD AVE

Application: New Construction—Infill

Council District: 07

Overlay: Inglewood Place Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023053711

Applicant requested deferral.

19. 1504 HOLLY ST

Application: New Construction—Infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023063387

Applicants: Preston Quirk

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application for new infill on the vacant lot at 1504 Holly Street.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed infill with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,
3. The MHZC review the final material selections for foundation, trim, porch elements, windows, doors, and site elements prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill), of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Mayhall moved to approve the proposed infill with the conditions that:

1. **The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;**
2. **The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,**
3. **The MHZC review the final material selections for foundation, trim, porch elements, windows, doors, and site elements prior to purchase and installation; finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill), of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

20. 1414 FRANKLIN AVE

Application: New Construction—Infill and Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2023087164 and T2023089246

Applicants: David Morgan, owner and contractor

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application for construction of infill and an outbuilding on the vacant lot at 1414 Franklin Avenue.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed infill and outbuilding with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,

3. MHZC review and approve the final material selections for foundation, cladding, roofing, trim, porch elements, windows, doors, and site elements prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill and outbuilding meet sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve the proposed infill and outbuilding with the following conditions:

1. **The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;**
2. **The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,**
3. **MHZC review and approve the final material selections for foundation, cladding, roofing, trim, porch elements, windows, doors, and site elements prior to purchase and installation;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill and outbuilding meet sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

21. 2109 10TH AVE S

Application: New Construction—Infill

Council District: 18

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren, jenny.warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2023095451

Applicants: The applicant was not present.

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application for the new construction of infill.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed infill with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,
3. Materials shall be reviewed and approved by staff, prior to purchase and installation, including: porch materials, all windows and doors and the walkway material.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill meets sections V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Waverly-Belmont chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts

Motion: Commissioner Cashion moved to approve the proposed infill with the conditions that:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;**
- 2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,**
- 3. Materials shall be reviewed and approved by staff, prior to purchase and installation, including: porch materials, all windows and doors and the walkway material;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill meets sections V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Waverly-Belmont chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

22. 1203 GREENFIELD AVE

Application: New Construction—Infill and Outbuilding

Council District: 07

Overlay: Inglewood Place Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023084126

Applicants: Ken Knuckles

Public: Tim and Brianna Gehring, 1201 Greenfield Ave; Matthew Bond, 3519 Golf Street; Kymberly Gerlock, 1205 Greenfield Ave; Andrew Vickers 1120 Howard [Public comment received via email.]

Description of Project: Application for the new construction of infill and a detached outbuilding.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;
3. Materials are reviewed prior to purchase and installation, including front porch materials, connector materials and the driveway material; and
4. The outbuilding shall be a minimum of twenty feet (20') from the rear of the primary structure.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Inglewood Place chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Price moved to approve with the conditions that:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;**

2. **The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**
3. **Materials are reviewed prior to purchase and installation, including front porch materials, connector materials and the driveway material; and**
4. **The outbuilding shall be a minimum of twenty feet (20') from the rear of the primary structure;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Inglewood Place chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Mosley seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

23. 3506 KATHERINE ST

Application: New Construction—Infill

Council District: 07

Overlay: Inglewood Place Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023084131

Applicants: Ken Knuckles

Public: Brianna Gehring, 1201 Greenfield Ave

Description of Project: Application for the new construction of infill, including an attached garage.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed infill with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,
3. Materials are reviewed prior to purchase and installation, including brick and stone samples, the front porch materials, the front door and the driveway material.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Inglewood Place chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve the proposed infill with the following conditions:

1. **The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;**
2. **The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,**

3. Materials are reviewed prior to purchase and installation, including brick and stone samples, the front porch materials, the front door and the driveway material.

finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Inglewood Place chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

OLD BUSINESS

24. 3806 CENTRAL AVE

Application: Request for Rehearing

Council District: 24

Overlay: Richland-West End Addition Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Robin Zeigler, robin.zeigler@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023019665

Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to rehear the case and Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.