



## METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

July 2, 2018

Brian Williams  
SunTrust Bank  
401 Commerce Street  
Nashville, TN 37219

Re: **RFQ # 1025684, Banking Services-Commercial Credit Card Only**

Dear Mr. Williams:

The Metropolitan Government of Nashville and Davidson County (Metro) has completed the evaluation of submitted solicitation offer(s) to the above RFQ # 1025684 for Banking Services. This letter hereby notifies you of Metro's intent to award to Suntrust Bank-Commercial Card Only, contingent upon successful contract negotiations.

Depending on the file sizes, the responses to the procurement solicitation and supporting award documentation can be made available either by email, CD for pickup, or in person for inspection. If you desire to receive or review the documentation or have any questions, please contact Sandra Walker by email at [sandra.walker@nashville.gov](mailto:sandra.walker@nashville.gov) Monday through Friday between 8:30am and 3:30pm.

If the Procurement Nondiscrimination Program requirements were a part of this solicitation, the awardee must forward a signed copy of the "Letter of Intent to Perform as Subcontractor/Subconsultant/Supplier/Joint Venture" for any minority/women-owned business enterprises included in the response to the Business Assistance Office within two business days from this notification. Should you have any questions concerning this requirement, please contact Bryan Gleason, BAO Representative, at (615) 862-6710 or at [bryan.gleason@nashville.gov](mailto:bryan.gleason@nashville.gov).

Thank you for participating in Metro's competitive procurement process.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Michelle A. Hernandez Lane".

Michelle A. Hernandez Lane  
Purchasing Agent

Cc: Solicitation File  
Other Offerors

**Pursuant to M.C.L. 4.36.010 Authority to resolve protested solicitations and awards.**

**A. Right to Protest.** Any actual or prospective bidder, offeror or contractor who is aggrieved in connection with the solicitation or award of a contract may protest to the Purchasing Agent. The protest shall be submitted in writing within ten (10) days after such aggrieved person knows or should have known of the facts giving rise thereto.



## METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

June 28, 2018

Emily Gotcher  
First Tennessee Bank  
511 Union Street, Floor 3  
Nashville, TN 37219

Re: **RFQ # 1025684, Banking Services**

Dear Ms. Gotcher:

The Metropolitan Government of Nashville and Davidson County (Metro) has completed the evaluation of submitted solicitation offer(s) to the above RFQ # 1025684 for Banking Services. This letter hereby notifies you of Metro's intent to award to First Tennessee Bank, contingent upon successful contract negotiations.

Depending on the file sizes, the responses to the procurement solicitation and supporting award documentation can be made available either by email, CD for pickup, or in person for inspection. If you desire to receive or review the documentation or have any questions, please contact Sandra Walker by email at [sandra.walker@nashville.gov](mailto:sandra.walker@nashville.gov) Monday through Friday between 8:30am and 3:30pm.

If the Procurement Nondiscrimination Program requirements were a part of this solicitation, the awardee must forward a signed copy of the "Letter of Intent to Perform as Subcontractor/Subconsultant/Supplier/Joint Venture" for any minority/women-owned business enterprises included in the response to the Business Assistance Office within two business days from this notification. Should you have any questions concerning this requirement, please contact Bryan Gleason, BAO Representative, at (615) 862-6710 or at [bryan.gleason@nashville.gov](mailto:bryan.gleason@nashville.gov).

Thank you for participating in Metro's competitive procurement process.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Michelle A. Hernandez Lane".

Michelle A. Hernandez Lane  
Purchasing Agent

Cc: Solicitation File  
Other Offerors

**Pursuant to M.C.L. 4.36.010 Authority to resolve protested solicitations and awards.**

**A. Right to Protest.** Any actual or prospective bidder, offeror or contractor who is aggrieved in connection with the solicitation or award of a contract may protest to the Purchasing Agent. The protest shall be submitted in writing within ten (10) days after such aggrieved person knows or should have known of the facts giving rise thereto.

## RFQ # 1025684- Banking Services

Offeror	Fifth Third Bank	First Tennessee Bank	Regions Bank	SunTrust Bank	Wells Fargo Bank, N.A.
Cost Criteria (25 Points)	10.97	19.10	15.16	25.00	12.97
Scope of Work Banking Services Requirements (30 Points)	5.00	22.00	5.00	5.00	5.00
Metro Nashville Banking Services Requirements Matrix (25 Points)	21.74	23.41	22.47	22.91	22.24
Qualifications Requirements Banking Services (15 Points)	14.00	13.00	12.00	12.00	9.00
MWS Banking Services Lockbox Requirements (5 Points)	5.00	5.00	5.00	5.00	4.00
<b>Total Evaluation Scores Banking Services Requirements Round</b>	<b>56.71</b>	<b>82.51</b>	<b>59.63</b>	<b>69.91</b>	<b>53.21</b>
<b>System Demonstration Round</b>	Did not advance	<b>100.00</b>	Did not advance	Did not advance	Did not advance
<b>Overall Total Scores</b>		<b>182.51</b>			

### Evaluation Comments

#### Fifth Third Bank

**Strengths** - Good overall MWS banking services lockbox requirements. Good overall qualifications requirements.

**Weaknesses** - Did not provide number of accounts each customer service representative handles. Cannot provide monthly Account Analysis statements online by the 5th day of the following month. Indicated Metro would be direct debited for fees, though billing options can be negotiated at contract execution. The solicitation stated that Metro does not allow direct debit of its analysis fees from its accounts. Limited time for which historical data is available online. All transaction documents and statements are not available online - adjustments are still sent via paper statements. On the Requirements Matrix, this solicitation listed online access to account adjustment or research adjustment backup as a must have item. Did not indicate whether Metro will be able to utilize RDC to deposit contractor retainage payments into the escrow accounts. The proposed solution for lockbox services results in a delay of availability of funds to Metro. Cannot use Metro's credit card processor in the lockbox. On the Requirements Matrix, this solicitation specified that it is a must have item that credit card payments sent through the lockbox are to be entered by lockbox personnel on Metro's payment processor's virtual terminal site. Will not accept property tax payments at branch locations. Ability to provide electronic lockbox is unclear. On the Requirements Matrix, this solicitation listed electronic lockbox services as a must have item. Online images of checks only available for six months. Did not provide a response on whether or not Metro can set up wire templates. High cost.

#### **First Tennessee Bank**

**Strengths** - Good overall MWS banking services lockbox requirements. Good qualifications requirements. Can meet all must have requirements on the Metro Nashville Banking Services Requirements Matrix. Good overall Scope of Work Banking Services Requirements. Low cost. Good overall system demonstration.

**Weaknesses** - Did not provide future capital investments planned for all services. Did not provide number of accounts each customer service representative handles. Description of controls in place to insure integrity of funds transfer system lacked specific detail. Does not have systemic segregation of Metro Accounts from personal accounts of Metro signatories. Did not provide a response on whether dual authorization can be put in place for some admin functionality with single admin authorization in place for other admin functionality. Did not answer whether all copies of transaction documents and statements are available online. Failed to provide specific information on how HIPPA information is protected internally. The process for handling non-conforming images on positive pay accounts is not acceptable to Metro.

#### **Regions Bank**

**Strengths** - Good overall MWS banking services lockbox requirements. Good qualifications requirements.

**Weaknesses** - Did not provide the customer service hours of operation. Did not provide future capital investments planned for all services. Description of controls in place to insure integrity of funds transfer system lacked specific detail. Did not confirm all data and backups of data are stored within the jurisdiction of the United States. Did not describe offsite operational and storage capabilities and locations across all services listed in this solicitation. Did not provide a response on ability to provide monthly Account Analysis statements and monthly account statements online by the 5th of the following month. Requires direct debit of Metro account for payment of supplies invoices. On the Requirements Matrix, this solicitation listed electronic/online invoice for payment of all monthly fees (including but not limited to account analysis & supplies) as a must have item. Limited time for which historical data is available online. All transaction documents and statements are not available online - adjustments with supporting documentation are sent via paper through USPS. On the Requirements Matrix, this solicitation listed online access to account adjustment or research adjustment backup as a must have item. Did not provide a timeline for lockbox operation process from pickup to deposit into Metro's accounts. Cannot use Metro's credit card processor in the lockbox. On the Requirements Matrix, this solicitation specified that it is a must have item that credit card payments sent through the lockbox are to be entered by lockbox personnel on Metro's payment processor's virtual terminal site. Will not accept property tax payments at branch locations. The response provided for the process for handling non-conforming images on positive pay accounts was vague. There is functionality for Metro users to set up wire templates, but those wires are treated as non-repetitive wires. High cost.

#### **SunTrust Bank**

**Strengths** - Good overall MWS banking services lockbox requirements. Good qualifications requirements. Low cost.

**Weaknesses** - Did not list all current state and/or local agencies where services are currently in use. Did not confirm all data and backups of data are stored within the jurisdiction of the United States. Did not provide number of accounts each customer service representative handles. Response as to when monthly account analysis statements are available online is unclear. Limited time for which historical data is available online. Does not currently provide a single sign-on system. Closed account statement information is not available online. Cash deposit discrepancies resolution turnaround takes too long. Cannot utilize RDC to deposit contractor retainage payments into the escrow accounts. Cannot use Metro's credit card processor in the lockbox. On the Requirements Matrix, this solicitation specified that it is a must have item that credit card payments sent through the lockbox are to be entered by lockbox personnel on Metro's payment processor's virtual terminal site. Will not use Metro's P. O. boxes for retail lockbox. On the Requirements Matrix, this solicitation specified that it is a must have item that for retail lockbox services, Metro's local lockbox address will be utilized for all payments. Will not accept property tax payments at branch locations. Did not provide a response on whether there is a difference in the process for handling duplicate presentment of checks for standard DDA accounts. The process for handling non-conforming images on positive pay accounts is not acceptable to Metro. Any authorized account signer can submit ACH reversals. This is not acceptable to Metro. Stop payments are only valid for 6 months. This is too limited.

**Wells Fargo Bank, N.A.**

**Strengths** - Good overall MWS banking services lockbox requirements.

**Weaknesses** - Placed limitations on the MWS banking services lockbox requirements. Response to customer service functions did not address the specific questions asked. Did not list all current state and/or local agencies where services are currently in use. Did not provide time period for services provided to clients of similar size and scope. Ratings downgraded in the past 5 years. Response to bank's financial strength did not address the specific questions asked. Did not confirm all data and backups of data are stored within the jurisdiction of the United States. Insufficient number of full service branch locations in Nashville area. Cannot provide monthly Account Analysis statements online by the 5th day of the following month. Limited time for which historical data is available online. Dual authorization is required to make user changes - this is not acceptable to Metro. Closed account statement information is not available online. Retainage process described will not work for Metro. Limits branch deposits by volume and dollar amounts - this is unacceptable to Metro. Did not provide a response on the process for handling cash deposit discrepancies. Does not accept declared value of checks for all deposits at the teller. The proposed solution for lockbox services results in a delay of availability of funds to Metro. Cannot use Metro's credit card processor in the lockbox. On the Requirements Matrix, this solicitation specified that it is a must have item that credit card payments sent through the lockbox are to be entered by lockbox personnel on Metro's payment processor's virtual terminal site. Did not provide a response as to whether they will accept property tax payments from Davidson county citizens via the teller at branch locations. All controlled disbursement accounts must be positive pay - this is unacceptable to Metro. Did not provide a response as to whether positive pay issue files (in whole or in part) can be reversed/deleted after submission, corrected and resubmitted. Did not provide a response for duplicate check presentment process on positive pay accounts. The response to the process for handling non-conforming images on positive pay accounts was unclear. Did not provide a response as to whether ACH credit files can be uploaded via your online system. Will accept all emailed or faxed ACH reversal forms as long as they are signed - this is unacceptable to Metro. High cost.

Solicitation Title & Number			RFP Cost Points	RFP SBE/SDV Points	Total Cost Points
RFQ# 1025684- Banking Services			25	0	25
Offeror's Name	Total Bid Amount	SBE/SDV Participation Amount	RFP Cost Points	RFP SBE/SDV Points	Total Cost Points
Fifth Third Bank	\$3,119,251.67	\$0.00	10.97	0.00	10.97
First Tennessee Bank	\$1,792,512.30	\$0.00	19.10	0.00	19.10
Regions Bank	\$2,257,575.21	\$0.00	15.16	0.00	15.16
SunTrust Bank	\$1,369,293.18	\$0.00	25.00	0.00	25.00
Wells Fargo Bank, N.A.	\$2,639,232.18	\$0.00	12.97	0.00	12.97

**RFQ # 1025684- Banking Services-Commercial Credit Card**

Offeror	Fifth Third Bank	Regions Bank	SunTrust Bank	Wells Fargo Bank, N.A.
Scope of Work Banking Services Requirements <u>Commercial Credit Card Section Only-(60 Points)</u>	53.00	40.00	57.00	20.00
Metro Nashville Banking Services RFP Requirements Matrix <u>Commercial Credit Card Section Only (25 Points)</u>	25.00	25.00	25.00	25.00
Qualifications Requirements Commercial Credit Card Services (15 Points)	14.00	12.00	12.00	9.00
<b>Commercial Credit Card Round Totals</b>	<b>92.00</b>	<b>77.00</b>	<b>94.00</b>	<b>54.00</b>
<b>System Demonstration Round Totals</b>	90.00	Did not advance	95.00	Did not advance
<b>Total Points for Both Rounds</b>	<b>182.00</b>		<b>189.00</b>	

**Evaluation Comments**

**Fifth Third Bank**

**Strengths** - Good overall commercial credit card qualifications and requirements. Monthly statements are available in multiple output formats.

**Weaknesses** - No notification/alert on expired cards that are inactive & won't be reissued. Does not have a single sign on system for card admin and cardholder reporting. Rebate program requires auto debit. During the demo round, failed to demonstrate the following: (1) password parameters under the Administrative sections of both the Credit Card Maintenance System & the Reporting System; (2) how to generate a monthly (Metro level) corporate credit card statement, showing the available output options for statements under the Inquiry & Reporting section of the Credit Card Maintenance system; (3) how to generate a monthly individual cardholder credit card statement showing the available output options for statements under the Inquiry & Reporting section of the Credit Card Maintenance system; (4) hierarchies available for grouping cardholders under the Administrative section of the Reporting System; (5) how to set up reports to run automatically at a defined frequency and how a user would access the completed report if it is not emailed under the Reporting section of the Reporting System. Aside from monthly COA upload, monthly GL default and annual calendar maintenance must be performed. There is a limitation to the number of future months for which reports can be scheduled to run automatically.

#### Regions Bank

**Strengths** - Good overall commercial credit card qualifications.

**Weaknesses** - No notification/alert on expired cards that are inactive & won't be reissued. Credit cards become inactive after six months of no use. PINS not utilized for point of sale transactions. Rebate program requires payment in fifteen days in order to participate.

#### SunTrust Bank

**Strengths** - Good overall commercial credit card qualifications and requirements. Has single sign on system for card admin and cardholder reporting. Aside from monthly COA upload, no other system maintenance must be performed. Can access the dispute form directly from the transaction listing. Certain fields on the dispute form auto populate. There is no limitation to the number of future months for which reports can be scheduled to run automatically.

**Weaknesses** - Did not provide a timeframe for processing new credit card request. Login process to the system is cumbersome as email address, user ID and password must all be entered. Monthly statements are only available in PDF, though other reports are available in both PDF and Excel. During the demo round, failed to demonstrate the following: (1) whether items can be assigned a priority such as critical or low and if there was any reporting available specific to notifications and alerts under the Notifications & Alerts section of the Credit Card Maintenance System; (2) how to generate a monthly (Metro level) corporate credit card statement, showing the available output options for statements under the Inquiry & Reporting section of the Credit Card Maintenance system; (3) how to generate a monthly individual cardholder credit card statement showing the available output options for statements under the Inquiry & Reporting section of the Credit Card Maintenance system; (4) how to create a file of cardholder transaction information, including GL codes assigned by the cardholders, for import into Metro's financial system under the Chart of Account (COA) and Company Maintenance section of the Reporting System; (5) if transaction information can be edited after marked as reviewed and/or approved under the General Ledger Coding of Cardholder Transactions section of the Reporting System.

#### Wells Fargo Bank, N.A.

**Weaknesses** - Conflicting information on whether or not annual fees are applicable to this program. Requires direct debit of Metro's bank account for payment of invoices even though the solicitation stated that Metro does not allow automatic direct debit of its bank accounts for payment of invoices. Reporting process for lost or stolen cards is cumbersome. Updates to cardholder information cannot be performed directly by Metro administrator. GL allocation levels are not flexible enough for Metro's chart of accounts structure. The overall card system does not meet Metro's needs.