



METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

March 20, 2018

Mr. Harold Brewer
American Constructors, Inc.
P.O. Box 120129
Nashville, TN 37212

Re: **RFQ # 1027682, Bellevue Community Center and Ice Facility Design Build**

Dear Mr. Brewer:

The Metropolitan Government of Nashville and Davidson County (Metro) has completed the evaluation of submitted solicitation offer(s) to the above RFQ # 1027682 for Bellevue Community Center and Ice Facility Design Build. This letter hereby notifies you of Metro's intent to award to American Constructors, Inc., contingent upon successful contract negotiations.

Depending on the file sizes, the responses to the procurement solicitation and supporting award documentation can be made available either by email, CD for pickup, or in person for inspection. If you desire to receive or review the documentation or have any questions, please contact Terri Troup by email at terri.troup@nashville.gov Monday through Friday between 8:30am and 3:30pm.

If the Procurement Nondiscrimination Program requirements were a part of this solicitation, the awardee must forward a signed copy of the "Letter of Intent to Perform as Subcontractor/Subconsultant/Supplier/Joint Venture" for any minority/women-owned business enterprises included in the response to the Business Assistance Office within two business days from this notification. Should you have any questions concerning this requirement, please contact Jeremy Frye, BAO Representative, at 615-862-6638 or at jeremy.frye@nashville.gov.

Thank you for participating in Metro's competitive procurement process.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Michelle A. Hernandez Lane".

Michelle A. Hernandez Lane
Purchasing Agent

Cc: Solicitation File
Other Offerors

Pursuant to M.C.L. 4.36.010 Authority to resolve protested solicitations and awards.

A. Right to Protest. Any actual or prospective bidder, offeror or contractor who is aggrieved in connection with the solicitation or award of a contract may protest to the Purchasing Agent. The protest shall be submitted in writing within ten (10) days after such aggrieved person knows or should have known of the facts giving rise thereto.

RFQ #1027682 - Bellevue Community Center and Ice Facility Design Build

Scoring and Justifications

	American Constructors, Inc.	Barton Malow Company	Batten & Shaw, Inc.	Bell & Associates Construction	Generator Studio	Messer Construction Co.
Proposal Letter and Narrative (5 Points)	5	5	5	5	5	5
Prime Firm Qualifications (35 Points)	30	32	20	24	27	25
Proposed Team Qualifications (30 Points)	27	27	18	21	24	25
General Management Plan (20 Points)	16	12	10	15	5	15
Small Business/Service Disabled Veteran Plan (10 Points)	7.5	8	6.75	7.5	3.5	9.5
Round 1 Total	85.5	84	59.75	72.5	64.5	79.5
Project Approach (50 Points)	40	40		38		42
Cost (50 Points)	43.53	42.95		50		38.24
Round 2 Total	83.53	82.95		88		80.24
Totals for Round 1 & Round 2	169.03	166.95	59.75	160.5	64.5	159.74

Max. RFP Cost Points		50
Offeror's Name	Bids	RFP Cost Point Distribution
American Constructors, Inc.	\$ 2,483,489.60	43.53
Barton Malow Company	\$ 2,517,261.68	42.95
Bell & Associates Construction	\$ 2,162,150.00	50.00
Messer Construction Co.	\$ 2,826,916.00	38.24

American Constructors, Inc.

Strengths – Strong Prime Firm Qualifications due to experience with 2 Ice Rinks, 2 Community Centers, and Recreational Facility. Ice Facility Consultant and several proposed subcontractors similar to team that worked on Ford Ice Facility. Provided good detail related to public meetings. 2nd best proposed schedule. Proposal expressed commitment to SBE/SDV participation, detailed strategic approach, commitment to prompt payment and reporting of SBE/SDV participation.

Weaknesses – Team Qualifications fails to provide information on signage consultant. General Management plan lacked detail surrounding to bidding process. Sustainability was detailed but lacked a holistic approach. Project approach was architecturally bland. Project approach lacked detailed related to utility and developer coordination. SBE/SDV Plan lacked detail related to past performance.

Barton Malow

Strengths – Strong Prime Firm Qualifications that demonstrated experience with numerous Ice Rinks, Recreational Facilities, and a Community Center Facility. Proposed team has ice Rink and sports related facility experience. Best proposed schedule. Proposal included a recommendation for zero waste goals for construction site. Project approach was in-depth in terms of design and constructability. Specific key drivers and ideas submitted as part of project approach was good idea. Proposal expressed commitment to SBE/SDV participation and detailed strategic approach to maximizing SBE/SDV.

RFQ #1027682 - Bellevue Community Center and Ice Facility Design Build

Scoring and Justifications

	American Constructors, Inc.	Barton Malow Company	Batten & Shaw, Inc.	Bell & Associates Construction	Generator Studio	Messer Construction Co.
Proposal Letter and Narrative (5 Points)	5	5	5	5	5	5
Prime Firm Qualifications (35 Points)	30	32	20	24	27	25
Proposed Team Qualifications (30 Points)	27	27	18	21	24	25
General Management Plan (20 Points)	16	12	10	15	5	15
Small Business/Service Disabled Veteran Plan (10 Points)	7.5	8	6.75	7.5	3.5	9.5
Round 1 Total	85.5	84	59.75	72.5	64.5	79.5
Project Approach (50 Points)	40	40		38		42
Cost (50 Points)	43.53	42.95		50		38.24
Round 2 Total	83.53	82.95		88		80.24
Totals for Round 1 & Round 2	169.03	166.95	59.75	160.5	64.5	159.74

Max. RFP Cost Points		50
Offeror's Name	Bids	RFP Cost Point Distribution
American Constructors, Inc.	\$ 2,483,489.60	43.53
Barton Malow Company	\$ 2,517,261.68	42.95
Bell & Associates Construction	\$ 2,162,150.00	50.00
Messer Construction Co.	\$ 2,826,916.00	38.24

Weaknesses – Proposed M&P Consultant smaller than other proposed M&P Consultants. General Management Plan was generic and not project specific. Project approach demonstrated a lack of understanding of public engagement. Sustainability lacked project specific details. SBE/SDV Plan failed to include efforts to ensure prompt payments, monitoring and reporting not included.

Batten & Shaw

Strengths – Proposal Expressed commitment to SBE/SDV participation, detailed past performance information.

Weaknesses – Prime Firm Qualifications project experience was not of similar scope and complexity. General Management Plan was boiler plate and not project specific. Proposed Team lacks experience of similar scope and complexity. SBE/SDV Plan lacked detailed related to approach to maximizing SBE/SDV. Payment of SBE/SDV lacking in details.

Bell & Associates Construction

Strengths – General Management plan demonstrated an understanding of Metro Projects. 3rd Best proposed schedule. Strong detailed LEED and sustainability approach specifically as it relates to ice rink refrigeration system. Concrete vs. sand rink floor submitted as part of project approach. Proposal expressed commitment to SBE/SDV participation, commitment to prompt payment and reporting of SBE/SDV participation.

RFQ #1027682 - Bellevue Community Center and Ice Facility Design Build

Scoring and Justifications

	American Constructors, Inc.	Barton Malow Company	Batten & Shaw, Inc.	Bell & Associates Construction	Generator Studio	Messer Construction Co.
Proposal Letter and Narrative (5 Points)	5	5	5	5	5	5
Prime Firm Qualifications (35 Points)	30	32	20	24	27	25
Proposed Team Qualifications (30 Points)	27	27	18	21	24	25
General Management Plan (20 Points)	16	12	10	15	5	15
Small Business/Service Disabled Veteran Plan (10 Points)	7.5	8	6.75	7.5	3.5	9.5
Round 1 Total	85.5	84	59.75	72.5	64.5	79.5
Project Approach (50 Points)	40	40		38		42
Cost (50 Points)	43.53	42.95		50		38.24
Round 2 Total	83.53	82.95		88		80.24
Totals for Round 1 & Round 2	169.03	166.95	59.75	160.5	64.5	159.74

Max. RFP Cost Points		50
Offeror's Name	Bids	RFP Cost Point Distribution
American Constructors, Inc.	\$ 2,483,489.60	43.53
Barton Malow Company	\$ 2,517,261.68	42.95
Bell & Associates Construction	\$ 2,162,150.00	50.00
Messer Construction Co.	\$ 2,826,916.00	38.24

Weaknesses – Prime Firm Qualifications project experience submitted was primarily subcontractor/subconsultant work. Prime Firm Qualifications failed to provide project experience of similar scope and complexity for the prime firm. Proposed team qualifications proposed only has one individual with ice rink experience on a single project. General Management Plan lacked detailed related to ice rink and recreational center facilities. Proposal lacked information pertaining to coordination with utilities and developer. SBE/SDV Plan lacked detailed related to approach to maximizing SBE/SDV.

Generator Studio

Strengths – Prime firm demonstrated ice Rink facility experience. Proposed subcontractors demonstrated Metro Experience. Proposed team qualifications demonstrated large sized sports facility experience.

Weaknesses – Contractor’s License does not match name that response submission provided under within iSupplier. Prime Firm Qualifications demonstrated limited experience with public facilities. General Management Plan was boiler plate and not project specific while demonstrating a lack of understanding of Metro’s design/build process. SBE/SDV Plan did not express commitment to SBE/SDV participation, Payment of SBE/SDV not clear on specific time, and approach to maximizing SBE/SDV lacked detail.

Messer Construction Co.

Strengths – Prime Firm Qualifications demonstrated the prime’s experience with public facilities. General Management plan demonstrated an understanding of Metro Projects. Strong detailed design approach and site analysis. Provided detailed related to coordination with developer. Proposal expressed commitment to SBE/SDV participation, detailed strategic approach, commitment to prompt payment and reporting of SBE/SDV participation.

RFQ #1027682 - Bellevue Community Center and Ice Facility Design Build

Scoring and Justifications

	American Constructors, Inc.	Barton Malow Company	Batten & Shaw, Inc.	Bell & Associates Construction	Generator Studio	Messer Construction Co.
Proposal Letter and Narrative (5 Points)	5	5	5	5	5	5
Prime Firm Qualifications (35 Points)	30	32	20	24	27	25
Proposed Team Qualifications (30 Points)	27	27	18	21	24	25
General Management Plan (20 Points)	16	12	10	15	5	15
Small Business/Service Disabled Veteran Plan (10 Points)	7.5	8	6.75	7.5	3.5	9.5
Round 1 Total	85.5	84	59.75	72.5	64.5	79.5
Project Approach (50 Points)	40	40		38		42
Cost (50 Points)	43.53	42.95		50		38.24
Round 2 Total	83.53	82.95		88		80.24
Totals for Round 1 & Round 2	169.03	166.95	59.75	160.5	64.5	159.74

Max. RFP Cost Points		50
Offeror's Name	Bids	RFP Cost Point Distribution
American Constructors, Inc.	\$ 2,483,489.60	43.53
Barton Malow Company	\$ 2,517,261.68	42.95
Bell & Associates Construction	\$ 2,162,150.00	50.00
Messer Construction Co.	\$ 2,826,916.00	38.24

Weaknesses – Prime Firm has limited experience with community centers and ice rink facilities. Proposed team qualifications proposed only two individuals with ice Rink experience on a single project. Proposed Superintendent and Project Manager have limited experience. General Management Plan lacked detailed related to ice Rink facility. Proposed schedule was the longest of all submitted. Approach to public engagement lack detail compared to other submissions.

	Proposer	American Constructors	Barton Malow Company	Bell & Associates Construction	Messer Construction Co.	Batten Shaw Construction	Generator Studio
Commitment to SMWBE Participation on the project (4pts)	Expressed Commitment (2)	2	2	2	2	2	0
	Information on past performance (2)	1	2	2	2	2	0.5
	Total	3	4	4	4	4	0.5
Strategic Approach to maximizing SMWBE (4pts)							
Strategic Approach to maximizing SMWBE (4pts)	Outreach (1)	1	1	1	1	1	1
	Subcontractor technical assistance (1)	1	1	1	1	0	0
	Unbundling (1)	1	1	0	1	1	1
	Mentoring (1)	0	1	0	1	0	0.5
	Total	3	4	2	4	2	2.5
Efforts ensure prompt payment (1 pts)							
Efforts ensure prompt payment (1 pts)	Commit to Prompt Payment (.50)	0.5	0	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5
	Specified Number of Days within 15 (.50)	0	0	0.5	0	0	0
	Total	0.5	0	1	0.5	0.5	0.5
Monitoring and Reporting of SMWBE participation (1 pts)							
Monitoring and Reporting of SMWBE participation (1 pts)	Total	1	0	0.5	1	0.25	0
	TOTAL	7.5	8	7.5	9.5	6.75	3.5
	Strengths	0					
	Weakness	0					

BAO Small Business Assessment Sheet

BAO Specialist: Jeremy Frye
Contract Specialist: Terri Troup
Date: 03/13/2018

Department Name: Parks
RFP/ITB Number: 1027682
Project Name: Bellevue Community Center and Ice Facility Design Build

Primary Contractor*	Prime Bid Amount	Total Proposed SBE (\$)	SBE Subs approved?	SBE (%)	Comments
American Constructors	\$ 2,483,489.60	\$ -	Yes	20% Requirement	Proposer acknowledged 20% participation requirement of SBE/SDV over life of the project as required by the solicitation. Proposed the engagement of SBE subcontractors: Ashworth Environmental Design, Latta Structural Engineers, Parsons Engineering and Collier Roofing Co.
	\$ -	\$ -			
	\$ -	\$ -			
	\$ -	\$ -			
	\$ -	\$ -			

Column Headings
 Shaded cells in columns E and G are formula driven and should not be changed
 White cells with text are fields that you can edit.
Gray cells with bold text contain formulas that can not be changed.



PNP Compliance Results Form

Department Name: Parks RFP/ITB Number: 1027682 Procurement Name: Bellevue Community Center and Ice Facility Design Build		
Primary Contractor	PNP Compliant (Yes/No)	Determination Comments/% of Participation Proposed or Bid
American Constructors	Yes	American Constructors is compliant with the Procurement Nondiscrimination Program requirements having reached out to three certified MWBE firms: Logan Patri Engineering (MBE) accepted \$10,000 (.04%), Ashworth Design Engineering (WBE) accepted \$7,500 (.03%), and Collier Roofing (WBE) accepted \$1,088,000 (4.7%)

*Denotes Contractor with whom follow up was required
 Date: 03/13/2018
 Metro Buyer : Terri Troup
 BAO Rep: Jeremy Frye