



METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

September 11, 2018

Ms. Angela Burke
RJ Young
809 Division Street
Nashville, TN 37203

Re: **RFQ # 1028714, Multifunction Copier/Printer Devices (MFDs) And Related Items**

Dear Ms. Burke:

The Metropolitan Government of Nashville and Davidson County (Metro) has completed the evaluation of submitted solicitation offer(s) to the above RFQ # 1028714 for Multifunction Copier/Printer Devices (MFDs) And Related Items. This letter hereby notifies you of Metro's intent to award to RJ Young, contingent upon successful contract negotiations. Please provide a certificate of Insurance indicating all applicable coverages within 15 business days of the receipt of this letter.

If the Procurement Nondiscrimination Program requirements were a part of this solicitation, the awardee must forward a signed copy of the "Letter of Intent to Perform as Subcontractor/Subconsultant/Supplier/Joint Venture" for any minority/women-owned business enterprises included in the response to the Business Assistance Office within two business days from this notification.

Additionally the awardee will be required to submit evidence of participation of and contractor's payment to all Small, Minority, and Women Owned Businesses participation in any resultant contract. This evidence shall be submitted monthly and include copies of subcontracts or purchase orders, the Prime Contractor's Application for Payment, or invoices, and cancelled checks or other supporting payment documents. Should you have any questions concerning this requirement, please contact Jerval Watson, BAO Representative, at 615-862-5461 or at Jerval.Watson@nashville.gov.

Depending on the file sizes, the responses to the procurement solicitation and supporting award documentation can be made available either by email, CD for pickup, or in person for inspection. If you desire to receive or review the documentation or have any questions, please contact Terri Troup by email at terri.troup@nashville.gov Monday through Friday between 8:30am and 3:30pm.

Thank you for participating in Metro's competitive procurement process.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Michelle A. Hernandez Lane".

Michelle A. Hernandez Lane
Purchasing Agent

Cc: Solicitation File, Other Offerors

Pursuant to M.C.L. 4.36.010 Authority to resolve protested solicitations and awards.

A. Right to Protest. Any actual or prospective bidder, offeror or contractor who is aggrieved in connection with the solicitation or award of a contract may protest to the Purchasing Agent. The protest shall be submitted in writing within ten (10) days after such aggrieved person knows or should have known of the facts giving rise thereto.

Procurement Division

730 Second Avenue South, Suite 112
P.O. Box 196300
Nashville, Tennessee 37219-6300

www.Nashville.gov
Phone: 615-862-6180
Fax: 615-862-6179

**RFQ # 1028714 - MULTIFUNCTION COPIER/PRINTER DEVICES (MFDS) AND RELATED ITEMS
SCORING AND JUSTIFICATION**

Criteria/Offeror	Berney Office Solutions	Konica Minolta Business Solutions	NOVATECH, INC	Ricoh USA	RJ Young Company	Xerox Corporation
Qualifications & Experience (25 Points)	23.00	23.00	24.00	20.00	25.00	25.00
Service Delivery (40 Points)	15.00	10.00	35.00	25.00	40.00	30.00
Cost (35 Points)	17.14	26.46	25.75	15.94	28.00	17.45
Total (100 Points)	55.14	59.46	84.75	60.94	93.00	72.45

Offeror's Name	Bids	SBE	Cost Evaluation (28 Pt Max)	SBE/SDV Evaluation (7 Pt Max)	Total Cost Points (35 Pt)
Berney Office Solutions	\$ 5,765,465.00	\$0	17.14	0.00	17.14
Konica Minolta Business Solutions	\$ 3,735,239.38	\$0	26.46	0.00	26.46
NOVATECH, INC.	\$ 5,272,309.40	\$7,800	18.75	7.00	25.75
RJ Young Company	\$ 3,529,992.40	\$0	28.00	0.00	28.00
Ricoh USA	\$ 6,200,492.44	\$0	15.94	0.00	15.94
Xerox Corporation	\$ 5,663,687.05	\$0	17.45	0.00	17.45

Berney Office Solutions

Strengths: Been in business for over 50 years. Proposed Xerox Brand Equipment.

Weaknesses: Overall proposal lacked detail related specifically to Metro. Examples of submitted reports and invoices difficult to read. Organization Chart listed more people than resumes submitted. No 30 day cancellation notice in contract.

Konica Minolta Business Solutions

Strengths: Been in business for over 50 years. Overall proposal was extremely detailed. Proposed Konica Minolta Brand proposed.

Weaknesses: "If a department wants to upgrade a machine, Konica Minolta reserves the right to install a slightly used machine after the first 6 months.....If you have 6 months remaining on the contract, it is too costly to put out a brand new machine if an upgrade is requested". "We will make a large investment in placing this large fleet at METRO. It would be financially hurtful to Konica Minolta if Metro started canceling rentals of any MFD when we are providing excellent service on the MFD..... Provided stipulations on cancellation fees in regards to cancelling rental machines even with 30 days' notice is given". Use national call center, not dedicated help desk. Has information listed on toner recycling and states all Konica toners can be recycled but doesn't specify if "all" includes toners that are not purchased from Konica.

**RFQ # 1028714 - MULTIFUNCTION COPIER/PRINTER DEVICES (MFDS) AND RELATED ITEMS
SCORING AND JUSTIFICATION**

Criteria/Offeror	Berney Office Solutions	Konica Minolta Business Solutions	NOVATECH, INC	Ricoh USA	RJ Young Company	Xerox Corporation
Qualifications & Experience (25 Points)	23.00	23.00	24.00	20.00	25.00	25.00
Service Delivery (40 Points)	15.00	10.00	35.00	25.00	40.00	30.00
Cost (35 Points)	17.14	26.46	25.75	15.94	28.00	17.45
Total (100 Points)	55.14	59.46	84.75	60.94	93.00	72.45

Offeror's Name	Bids	SBE	Cost Evaluation (28 Pt Max)	SBE/SDV Evaluation (7 Pt Max)	Total Cost Points (35 Pt)
Berney Office Solutions	\$ 5,765,465.00	\$0	17.14	0.00	17.14
Konica Minolta Business Solutions	\$ 3,735,239.38	\$0	26.46	0.00	26.46
NOVATECH, INC.	\$ 5,272,309.40	\$7,800	18.75	7.00	25.75
RJ Young Company	\$ 3,529,992.40	\$0	28.00	0.00	28.00
Ricoh USA	\$ 6,200,492.44	\$0	15.94	0.00	15.94
Xerox Corporation	\$ 5,663,687.05	\$0	17.45	0.00	17.45

NOVATECH

Strengths: Been in business for 19 years. Demonstrated experience with similar volumes. Proposed Konica Minolta brand. Has experience with city/local governments. Has experience with MTA. Listed power requirements for copiers that would be needed. Were able to quickly install copiers when their competitor pulled machines out of the city of Memphis.

Weaknesses: Formatting of proposal made it difficult to review. Limited government experience compared to other Offerors. Had extensive organizational chart but only listed resumes for 5 employees. No dedicated metro call center for copier issues.

Ricoh

Strengths: Been in business for over 80 years. Proposed Ricoh brand equipment. Had government experience. Has dedicated phone number for ordering supplies. Has some previous experience with government agencies listed under qualifications and experience. Listed how toners would be recycled.

Weaknesses: Brochure submitted with offer that provided more detail of proposed machines was just photos and lacked detail to properly evaluate the submitted response. Lots of staff turnover while Metro was under contract, problems with invoicing, and services call were not always turned in correctly or in a timely manner. Only saw 3 team members listed, no resumes were included for repair techs. Invoices & machines listed on invoices are never consistent and charges vary even on dedicated black and white machines.

**RFQ # 1028714 - MULTIFUNCTION COPIER/PRINTER DEVICES (MFDS) AND RELATED ITEMS
SCORING AND JUSTIFICATION**

Criteria/Offeror	Berney Office Solutions	Konica Minolta Business Solutions	NOVATECH, INC	Ricoh USA	RJ Young Company	Xerox Corporation
Qualifications & Experience (25 Points)	23.00	23.00	24.00	20.00	25.00	25.00
Service Delivery (40 Points)	15.00	10.00	35.00	25.00	40.00	30.00
Cost (35 Points)	17.14	26.46	25.75	15.94	28.00	17.45
Total (100 Points)	55.14	59.46	84.75	60.94	93.00	72.45

Offeror's Name	Bids	SBE	Cost Evaluation (28 Pt Max)	SBE/SDV Evaluation (7 Pt Max)	Total Cost Points (35 Pt)
Berney Office Solutions	\$ 5,765,465.00	\$0	17.14	0.00	17.14
Konica Minolta Business Solutions	\$ 3,735,239.38	\$0	26.46	0.00	26.46
NOVATECH, INC.	\$ 5,272,309.40	\$7,800	18.75	7.00	25.75
RJ Young Company	\$ 3,529,992.40	\$0	28.00	0.00	28.00
Ricoh USA	\$ 6,200,492.44	\$0	15.94	0.00	15.94
Xerox Corporation	\$ 5,663,687.05	\$0	17.45	0.00	17.45

RJ Young Company

Strengths: 63 years in business. Headquartered in Nashville since 1955. Help Desk will Remote into machines to troubleshoot issues. Extensive State & Local governmental experience. Proposed Canon Brand but also services currently Metro owned Ricoh Machines which can aid Metro in the transition process. MNPS current contract holder - will customize invoicing as required by Metro - Willing to provide minimum of 10 interchangeable devices with various capabilities. Has ePass software customer portal to give us access to initiate service calls, order supplies, pay invoices and submit meter reads easily. Also listed our proposed service team and their roles for regular copiers as well as production grade. Has detailed service delivery plan.

Weaknesses: N/A

Xerox Corporation

Strengths: Been in business for over 80 years either as Haloid Company or Xerox Business. Has experience with multiple large city/local governments and maintains a very extensive fleet of copiers. Proposing Xerox brand equipment.

Weaknesses: No dedicated Metro Help Desk or phone line for Metro to get assistance. Use national call centers handling more than 45,000 customer calls for service per day. Failed to demonstrate a clear understanding of Metro requests and requirements for the contract term. Proposal included denying Metro requirement for adjustments for invoices received 90 days or more following delivery of goods and services. Wants open access to metro premises (this is not possible in secure area's).

BAO SBE Assessment Sheet

BAO Specialist: Jerval Watson
Contract Specialist: Terri Troupe
Date: 07/30/2018

Department Name: General Services
RFP/ITB Number: 1028714

Project Name: Multifunction copier/printer devices (MFDs) and related Items

Primary Contractor*	Prime Bid Amount	Total Offered SBE (\$)	SBEs approved?	Total Approved SBE (\$)	SBE (%)	Comments
Berney Office Solutions	\$5,765,465.00	\$0.00	No	\$ -	0.00%	There is no SBE participation
Konica Minolta Business Solutions	\$3,735,239.38	\$0.00	No	\$ -	0.00%	There is no SBE participation
Novatech Inc.	\$5,272,309.40	\$7,800.00	YES	\$ 7,800.00	0.00%	There is a subcontractor (EGSE Holdings, LLC) that is Metro approved SBE
RJ Young Company	\$3,529,992.40	\$0.00	NO	\$ -	0.00%	There is no SBE participation
Ricoh USA	\$6,200,492.44	\$0.00	No	\$ -	0.00%	There is no SBE participation
Xerox Corporation	\$5,663,687.05	\$0.00	No	\$ -	0.00%	There is no SBE participation

*For ITBs, only apparent low bidder will be listed.