



METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission
Sunnyside in Sevier Park
3000 Granny White Pike
Nashville, Tennessee 37204
Telephone: (615) 862-7970
Fax: (615) 862-7974

METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION SUMMARY MEETING MINUTES February 15, 2012

Present were Commissioners: Ann Nielson, Vice Chair; Menié Bell; Barri Bernstein; Richard Fletcher; Ben Mosley; and Judy Turner

Zoning Staff: Robin Zeigler (Historic Zoning Administrator), Sean Alexander, Melissa Baldock, Fred Zahn

Applicants: Brett McFadyen, John Root, Michael Ward

Vice Chair Nielson called the meeting to order at 2:05p.m. and read aloud the process for appealing the decisions of the Metro Historic Zoning Commission.

I. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Vice Chair Nielson asked the Commissioners if they had read the minutes for the January 18, 2012 meeting, and Commissioner Bell requested the correction of a name of one of the attendees.

Motion:

Commissioner Mosley moved to approve the corrected minutes. Commissioner Bernstein seconded the motion and it was approved without objection.

II. CONSENT AGENDA

Mr. Zahn presented three cases that Staff determined eligible to be heard together as a consent item:

809 Russell Street

New construction—addition, accessory structure and setback reduction

3630 Richland Avenue

New construction—addition, accessory structure and setback reduction

1206 Woodland Avenue

New construction—addition to accessory structure

Mr. Zahn noted that all of the items on the consent agenda, with their respective conditions, meet the design guidelines for their districts and that staff recommended approval of the consent agenda.

Commissioner Bernstein moved to approve the consent agenda, and Commissioner Bell seconded the motion. The Commission approved the motion unanimously.

II. NEW BUSINESS

2216 White Avenue

Application: New construction—Addition

Mr. Alexander presented an application to construct a rear addition to a contributing structure in the Woodland-in-Waverly Historic Preservation Overlay. He explained the composition, scale, and materials of the addition as being compatible, and he described a shed-roofed dormer as being appropriate but that a rear gable addition was not sufficiently set in from the original roof, which would disturb the original roof form and would not meet the guidelines. Staff recommended that the Commission approve the rear addition, with the condition that the rear gabled dormer be set in from the outer edge of the existing roof by at least one foot.

The architect, John Root, was present to address the Commission. He explained that he was trying to avoid creating a valley that might cause maintenance issues so the roof of the addition was minimally set in from the original roof.

Commissioner Mosley expressed concern that while the addition was clear on the drawing, in practice the difference in roof pitch would not be sufficient and would look unintentional. Commissioner Fletcher asked what Staff suggested as an ideal remedy.

Motion

Commissioner Fletcher moved to approve the additions with staff's recommendation that the addition set in at least one foot from the ridge of the existing house. The addition was seconded by Commissioner Mosley and approved by a unanimous vote.

2114 19th Avenue South

Application: Infill

Mrs. Baldock presented an application to construct a new dwelling on a vacant property where a non-contributing structure had recently been demolished. She explained the proposal and described that the application met the bulk zoning requirements, but stated that the proposed front setback of twenty-one feet (21') was significantly shorter than the setback of the adjacent historic house to the left. She recommended that the Commission approve the infill with the conditions that the front setback be in line with the house to the left, that staff review and approve the colors of the roofing material, the windows and doors, and that the utilities be at or behind the midpoint of the structure.

Michael Ward, the architect of the project, was present to address the Commission. He explained that he was cognizant of the size of the footprint of the structure in order to preserve open space, and that he was trying to be compatible with other houses on the block, not just the adjacent house which is on a double lot.

Brett Sheriff, owner of the property, added that he currently lives at 2008 19th Avenue South, and he wishes to have the advantages of the shorter setbacks he enjoys currently.

The Commissioners discussed the importance of setbacks and structure size in maintaining the rhythm of a street. Commissioner Fletcher said he felt the applicant was disadvantaged by having a double lot to the left, and that he was inclined to have the new house have a front setback more in line with the rest of the block than the adjacent house.

Motion

Commissioner Mosley moved to approve the proposal, with the conditions that the roof colors and windows be approved by Staff and with a thirty-two foot front setback from the curb in order to balance the height of the structure and the average depth of the existing structures on the block. Commissioner Fletcher seconded the motion and it then passed unanimously.

1515 Beechwood Avenue

Application: Infill and accessory structure

Mrs. Baldock presented an application to demolish a non-contributing house, and to construct a new dwelling and new detached accessory structure. She described the scale, massing, and materials of the proposal, and explained that it would be compatible in the context of neighborhood. She recommended that the Commission approve the proposal with the conditions that staff review the color of the roof material and the location of the utilities.

The applicants, Daniel Green and architect Preston Quirk were present, but did not speak.

Motion

Commissioner Mosley made a motion to approve the application with the conditions that Staff review the color of the roof material and the location of the utilities. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bernstein and passed unanimously.

702 Shelby Avenue

Application: Infill

Mr. Alexander presented an application to construct a new dwelling on a vacant lot. He described the new house as being a one and one-half story bungalow with cement-fiber siding and an asphalt shingle roof. He recommended that the Commission approve the application with the conditions that staff review and approve the roof color and any fences or other appurtenances.

The applicant, Peggy Newman was present but did not speak.

Motion

Commissioner Fletcher made a motion to approve the application with the conditions that staff review and approve the roof color and any fences or other appurtenances. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Mosley and approved unanimously.

1006, 1008 and 1012 Fatherland Street

Application: Infill

Ms. Zeigler presented an application to construct and install fourteen semi-permanent commercial structures on a large vacant lot, in a section of the district lacking in strong historical context. She explained that the three

structures at the front of the lot along Fatherland Street would be compatible with the orientation, setback, and scale of a historic structure at the corner of Fatherland and 11th Streets, and that the structures toward the interior of the lot would also be appropriate in scale largely because of a drop in grade. She explained that the materials would include cement-fiber panel siding and trim, galvanized metal awnings, and aluminum storefront-type windows and doors, which are appropriate for commercial buildings in this context. The only revision staff requested, she continued, was that the two-story building fronting on Fatherland Street have a bulkhead or panel below the front windows to be more in keeping with the appearance of historic commercial buildings, which the applicant had agreed to. She recommended that the Commission approve the proposal with the conditions that staff review and approve the final design of windows and doors, roof color, lighting and signage, and with the addition of a bulkhead on the building fronting on Fatherland Street.

The applicant, Brett McFadyen, introduced himself as the owner of a property on Woodland Street on which a similar project had been approved by the Commissioner in 2010. He described the process by which he had arrived at the concept of the development, using the historic structure at the corner as a reference for selecting modern and organic materials.

Motion

Commissioner Bell made a motion to approve the proposal with the conditions that staff review and approve the final design of windows and doors, roof color, lighting and signage, and with the addition of a bulkhead on the building fronting on Fatherland Street. Commissioner Fletcher seconded the motion, which was then passed unanimously.

1413 Russell Street

Application: Infill

Mr. Alexander presented an application to construct a new dwelling on a vacant lot in the Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. He described the proposal as being a one and one-half story house with clipped gables, and a projecting front porch. The materials, he explained, would be cement-fiber siding and shingles, asphalt shingle roof, and a concrete block foundation, all of which are compatible. He explained that the rhythm of windows on the new house would be appropriate, but that the first story windows on the front were smaller than the upperstory windows, which is not compatible with historic houses in the area. Staff recommended approval of the proposed infill with the conditions that staff review and approve the roof color, railings and appurtenances, and that the lower story windows be taller than the upperstory windows.

The applicant, Brent Craig, was present and informed the Commission that he was willing to meet the conditions suggested by Staff.

Motion

Commissioner Fletcher moved to approve the proposed infill with the conditions that staff review and approve the roof color, railings and appurtenances, and that the lower story windows be taller than the upperstory windows. Commissioner Bernstein seconded the motion and it was approved by unanimous vote.

307 West End Place

Application: New construction—accessory building

Mr. Alexander presented an application to demolish a non-contributing accessory structure and build a new one-story accessory structure. He described the structure as meeting the design guidelines, but that it could not be approved administratively because of its size. He explained that the materials and scale were compatible, and that a pedestrian door on the submitted drawings would be omitted. The existing driveway would be removed from the location of the non-contributing garage to the front of the house, leaving a parking pad in the front. Mr. Alexander explained that it would not be appropriate to keep a front parking pad, as driveways typically continue to at least the mid-point of a structure. He recommended that the Commission approve the demolition and new construction with the condition that the existing driveway be either eliminated completely or retained from the mid-point of the house to the street.

Commissioner Mosley mentioned that as it was an existing driveway, it could be removed from its current location leaving the portion from the front edge of the house to the street, providing the applicants with more green-space.

Motion

Commissioner Mosley made a motion to approve the demolition and new construction with the condition that the existing driveway be either eliminated completely or retained from the front of the porch to the street. Commissioner Fletcher seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

V. OTHER BUSINESS

Mrs. Zeigler informed the Commission that nominations were being accepted for the 2012 Preservation Awards.

Commissioner Mosley made a motion to adjourn the meeting, and Commissioner Bernstein seconded the motion. The Commissioners unanimously approved the motion to adjourn the meeting at 3:32 pm.

RATIFIED BY COMMISSION MARCH 21, 2012