



METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission
Sunnyside in Sevier Park
3000 Granny White Pike
Nashville, Tennessee 37204
Telephone: (615) 862-7970
Fax: (615) 862-7974

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Park & Elkins (Sylvan Park) Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Expansion June 18, 2014

Application: Park & Elkins Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay expansion and renaming of the district to the Sylvan Park Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Map and Parcel Numbers: 103-8 032; 091-15 221-226, 230-240, 283-326, 348-366, 370-71, & 386-389; 091-16 87-118, 120-129, 131-138, 140-151, 215-226, 242-248, 250-257, 259-263, 273-280, 282, 376, 382-383, & 389-391; 091-16B 1-3CO; 091-16C 1-3CO; 091-16F 1-2 & 900CO; 103-03 097-98, 100-140, 142-176, 178-180, 182-218, 220-21, 223-232, 232.01-232.02, 233-235, 237-269, 271-72, 274-275, 278, 292-295, 300-301; 103-3B 1-2; 103-3D 1-2, 900CO; 103-04 001-030, 032, 034, 037-050, 052-070, 072-086, 088-092, 094-100, 102-128, 130-31, 133-138, 140-159, 161-204, 206-215, 217-262, 431, 438, 440-444, 446, 454-55, 460-61, 467, 469-476, 478; 103-4A 1-3CO; 103-4B 1-4CO; 103-4E 1-3CO; 103-4F 1-3CO; 103-4G 1-3CO; 103-4H 1-3CO; 103-4J 1-2, 900CO; 103-4K 1,4, 900CO; 103-4M 1,2, 900CO; 103-4N 1, 2,900CO; 103-4O 1,2,900CO

Council Districts: 24

Applicant: Council Member Jason Holleman

Project Lead: Robin Zeigler, robin.zeigler@nashville.gov, 615-862-7970

<p>Description of Project: Councilmember Jason Holleman is requesting the extension of the existing Park & Elkins Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay and the renaming of the district to the Sylvan Park Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.</p> <p>Recommendation Summary: Finding that district meets the standards of the ordinance, Staff suggests the Commission recommend to City Council that the Park & Elkins Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay be expanded and renamed to Sylvan Park Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.</p> <p>Staff recommends that the Commission adopt the current design guidelines for Park & Elkins to also apply to the expanded area and rename the design guidelines to Sylvan Park Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Design Guidelines.</p>	<p>Attachments A: Architectural Examples B: Public Comment</p>
---	---

Area to be expanded:



Applicable Ordinance:

Article III. Historic Overlay Districts

17.36.120.A. Historic Districts Defined. Historic Preservation and Neighborhood Conservation Districts. These districts are defined as geographical areas which possess a significant concentration, linkage or continuity of sites, buildings, structures or objects which are united by past events or aesthetically by plan or physical development, and that meet one or more of the following criteria:

1. The district is associated with an event that has made a significant contribution to local, state or national history; or
2. It includes structures associated with the lives of persons significant in local, state or national history; or
3. It contains structures or groups of structures that embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction, or that represents the work of a master, or that possesses high artistic value, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction; or
4. It has yielded or may be likely to yield archaeological information important in history or prehistory; or
5. It is listed or is eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places.

Background:

The neighborhood has discussed the possibility of neighborhood conservation zoning (NCZO) since 1997. An attempt for an overlay, significantly larger than what is now being proposed, failed in 2005 due to lack of support. In 2013 Metro Council adopted the Park & Elkins NCZO, which primarily includes the properties between 42nd Avenue and 51st Avenue on Park and Elkins. The Councilmember now requests an extension to the existing overlay and the renaming of the overlay from Park & Elkins to the Sylvan Park NCZO. Multiple public meetings have been held over the years. Most recently, the neighborhood hosted general information meetings on October 14, 2013 and April 3, 2014 both at the Cohn School. A “windshield” architectural resource survey is currently being conducted by the MHZC and volunteers meeting the Secretary of Interior’s Professional Qualifications.

Analysis and Findings:

The area proposed to be included comprises of buildings constructed at the turn-of-the-century and helps to tell the story of the Sylvan Park neighborhood. The majority of the homes were constructed between the 1890s and the 1940s, as were many of the historic homes in the current boundaries. The extension of the overlay continues the architectural diversity of the rest of the neighborhood with primarily bungalow, Queen Anne and Tudor revival styles. The inclusion of these areas helps to match the neighborhood boundaries with the overlay boundaries.

The purpose of the overlay is to guide growth rather than “freeze” the area in any particular time. Since the adoption of the Park & Elkins Overlay in 2011, the Commission has approved 6 additions, 3 out buildings, and 1 infill with associated outbuilding. There have been no denials.

The properties meet standard 3 of section 17.26.120.A. of the design guidelines as embodying the distinctive characteristics of their individual types and the overall period of the neighborhood.

Finding that district meets the standards of the ordinance, Staff suggests the Commission recommend to City Council that the Park & Elkins Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay be expanded and renamed to Sylvan Park Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Staff recommends that the Commission adopt the current design guidelines for Park & Elkins to also apply to the expanded area and rename the design guidelines to Sylvan Park Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Design Guidelines.

EXAMPLES OF ARCHITECTURE IN THE NEIGHBORHOOD



4409 Nevada Avenue



4310 Utah Avenue



4502 Colorado Avenue



4205 Nebraska Avenue



4607 Utah Avenue



46703 Utah Avenue



4711 Idaho Avenue



4505 Nevada Avenue



4501 Nebraska



146 51st Avenue North



303 50th Avenue North

PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR THE EXPANSION OF PARK & ELKINS AS OF 6/11/2014, 3:30 PM. (17 in favor and 1 in opposition)

IN FAVOR

6/10/2014

Hello Robin ,
I live at 149 46th N in sylvan park and am in favor of the overlay. I cannot attend the meeting at 2pm Wednesday June 18th. Please call or email for any questions you may have.

Thank you,
John Wetzel, 615-289-8667

6/10/ 2014

Dear Ms. Zeigler,
Please add my name and that of my wife, Whitney Kemp, to the list of supporters of the Conservation Overlay for Sylvan Park. I have owned my home at 5011 Idaho Ave. since 1994 and have seen much change in my neighborhood and Nashville overall.
Whitney and I believe that the Conservation Overlay for our neighborhood is the best vehicle to protect our home value and those of our neighbors.
Thank you for your time.
David Duren
davidjduren@gmail.com, 615-498-6006 cell

6/10/2014

Good morning Robbin,

I live at 128 43rd Avenue North and support the Overlay. If you need to reach me for questions, please don't hesitate.

Sincerely,
Larry Gann , 615-336-2200, Larryjakesarah@bellsouth.net

6/10/2014

Dear Robin Zeigler,

I strongly support the overlay. Thank you.

Peter Brush, 4907 Wyoming Ave, Sylvan Park

6/10/2014

Robin, I just want to restate my support for extending the Park-Elkins Overlay in Sylvan Park. I think it is a necessity for protecting the historic character of the neighborhood. Houses are being torn down SO frequently ---- two or three just in the last couple of weeks. I appreciate your help in this endeavor very much!!!

Pat Williams, 4301 Elkins Avenue, Nashville, TN 37209

6/10/2014

Hi Robin,

I attended the meeting that you had regarding the Historic Overlay for Sylvan Park that was held several months back. I am very much in favor of preserving the historic homes in the neighborhood.

Thanks,
Pat Lynch, 5002 Wyoming Ave

6/10/2014
Ms. Zeigler,
We support the extension of the overlay in Sylvan Park.
Thanks,
Jeff and Cindy Pennig, 147 50th Ave North

6/10/2014
I just wanted to express my support for the Sylvan Park Conservation Overlay. I have lived in Sylvan Park for 35 years and have seen many changes and would like to see this overlay come to fruition.
Thanks!

Melissa Hardaway, 4510 Nevada Ave, Nashville, TN 37209, 615-269-8883

6/10/2014
Hi Robin,

Thank you for coming to speak to us about the differences between a historic and conservation overlay. My vote is in support of preserving historic Sylvan Park.

Annie Sellick Bergeson, 4504 Utah Ave
Chalice Music Inc. & anniesellick.com
info@anniesellick.com, (615) 289-0208

6/10/2014
Robin

Thank you for your leadership in our overlay journey. I just saw another beautiful historic home bite the dust the other day and was so saddened by the loss. If we don't get this done soon we will lose the historic charm of our neighborhood.

Thanks again,
Louise Hardaway

6/10/2014

Robin, I own property at 4208 Colorado in Sylvan Park. I don't believe the house would be included in the preservation. However, I do support the overlay in Sylvan Park to prevent the entire fabric of the neighborhood from being destroyed. I would like you to put me down as supporting the overlay. Thank you!

Ann Walker-king, 3701 Central Avenue

6/10/2014

Ms. Zeigler,

As a 20-plus year home owner in the proposed expansion area for the Sylvan Park (Park-Elkins) conservation overlay, I would like to express my wholehearted support for the expansion proposal.

This area was previously approved for an overlay by the Metro Historic Zoning Commission in 2005. The neighborhood still contains many fine examples of architecture from the 1920's and 1930's and even older. Our home was built in 1890.

We appreciate Councilman Holleman sponsoring and supporting this expansion.

Please include my message as part of the record to the members of the Commission. I urge them to support this overlay expansion.

Thank you for your time and consideration.

John Summers

6/10/2014

Robin,

I wanted to voice my support for the Neighborhood Conservation Overlay being considered for Sylvan Park.

Thanks for your work on this!

Monette Rebecc, 320 54th Ave N, Nashville, TN 37209

6/10/2014

Robin,

My name is Shirley Hunt Greer, my husband John and I support protecting and preserving the Historic homes in Sylvan Park. All homes are so important to the character of our neighborhood. They are the ones like the Victorian circa 1898, we own on Park Avenue or the 1920s,30s or 40s that make our neighborhood unique.

When I look at the Historic Bronze Plaque that hangs near my front door, it is with pride to know we saved a piece of history. Thanks to the Metro Historical Commission.

Sincerely,
Shirley Hunt Greer

6/11/2014

Hi, I am in favor of the conservation overlay over for Sylvan Park. Thank you very much for your efforts to help save neighborhoods in Nashville.

Charles Gonce 4200 Wyoming ave.

6/11/2014

Ms. Zeigler,

As home owners in the proposed expansion area for the Sylvan Park (Park-Elkins) conservation overlay, we would like to express our support for the expansion proposal.

The neighborhood still contains many fine examples of architecture from the 1920's and 1930's and even older. Our home was built in 1940 and we purchased it about four years ago. We knew, prior to closing on our house, we would **not** knock it down, much to the delight of the original owners, whom we bought it from and whom we now consider friends. My husband is a contractor and works on many homes in the Belmont area. He saw the value of preserving our Sylvan Park home, yet had a vision of an addition. We kept the original house, yet added a

second floor and a front porch. We looked at three other original two story homes with porches near us and tried to maintain the appropriate look for the neighborhood. We believe we did and have had many compliments since doing so. We live on a double lot and could have knocked down this old home and added two homes back on the lot, but we never considered that. Neighbors were happy and pleased with our choices above.

We appreciate Councilman Holleman sponsoring and supporting this expansion. Please include my message as part of the record to the members of the Commission. I urge them to support this overlay expansion.

Thank you for your time and consideration.

Michael and Laurie Brown

6/11/2014

I am writing to express my support for the overlay currently being put forth to the metro council.

Trigg
615-400-9612

OPPOSED

6/10/2014
I am AGAINST the overlay!!!!
Crnewlon@comcast.net