



METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

STAFF RECOMMENDATION
110 Pembroke Avenue
October 15, 2014

Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission
Sunnyside in Sevier Park
3000 Granny White Pike
Nashville, Tennessee 37204
Telephone: (615) 862-7970
Fax: (615) 862-7974

Application: New construction-addition; Ridge raise
District: Belle Meade Links Triangle Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Council District: 23
Map and Parcel Number: 13002006900
Applicant: Scott Baker, Shapiro & Company Architects
Project Lead: Paul Hoffman, paul.hoffman@nashville.gov

<p>Description of Project: The application is for an addition to the rear and side of the home, onto existing additions.</p> <p>Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval with the conditions:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Materials for the new construction be added to drawings and subject to staff approval;2. Existing window openings be retained;3. Staff approve the final details, dimensions and materials of windows and doors prior to purchase and installation; and,4. Staff approve the roof color and masonry color, dimensions and texture. <p>Staff finds that the project meets II.B.2 of the design guidelines for the Belle Meade Links Triangle Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.</p>	<p>Attachments</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">A: PhotographsB: Site PlanC: Elevations
--	--

Vicinity Map:



Aerial Map:



Applicable Design Guidelines:

II. B. GUIDELINES

a. Height

The height of the foundation wall, porch roof(s), and main roof(s) of a new building shall be compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with those of surrounding historic buildings.

b. Scale

The size of a new building and its mass in relation to open spaces shall be compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with surrounding historic buildings.

Foundation lines should be visually distinct from the predominant exterior wall material. This is typically accomplished with a change in material.

c. Setback and Rhythm of Spacing

The setback from front and side yard property lines established by adjacent historic buildings should be maintained. Generally, a dominant rhythm along a street is established by uniform lot and building width. Infill buildings should maintain that rhythm.

d. Materials, Texture, Details, and Material Color

The materials, texture, details, and material color of a new building's public facades shall be visually compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with surrounding historic buildings. Vinyl and aluminum siding are not appropriate.

T-1-11- type building panels, "permastone", E.F.I.S. and other artificial siding materials are generally not appropriate. However, pre-cast stone and cement fiberboard siding are approvable cladding materials for new construction; but pre-cast stone should be of a compatible color and texture to existing historic stone clad structures in the district; and cement fiberboard siding, when used for lapped siding, should be smooth and not stamped or embossed and have a maximum of a 5" reveal.

Shingle siding should exhibit a straight-line course pattern and exhibit a maximum exposure of seven inches (7").

Four inch (4") nominal corner boards are required at the face of each exposed corner.

Stud wall lumber and embossed wood grain are prohibited.

Belt courses or a change in materials from one story to another are often encouraged for large two-story buildings to break up the massing.

When different materials are used, it is most appropriate to have the change happen at floor lines.

Clapboard sided chimneys are generally not appropriate. Masonry or stucco is appropriate.

Texture and tooling of mortar on new construction should be similar to historic examples.

Asphalt shingle is an appropriate roof material for most buildings. Generally, roofing should not have strong simulated shadows in the granule colors which results in a rough, pitted appearance; faux shadow lines; strongly variegated colors; colors that are too light (e.g.: tan, white, light green); wavy or deep color/texture used to simulate split shake shingles or slate; excessive flared form in the shingle tabs; uneven or sculpted bottom edges that emphasize tab width or edges, unless matching the original roof.

e. Roof Shape

The roof(s) of a new building shall be visually compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with the roof shape, orientation, and pitch of surrounding historic buildings.

Roof pitches should be similar to the pitches found in the district. Historic roofs are generally between 6/12

and 12/12.

Roof pitches for porch roofs are typically less steep, approximately in the 3-4/12 range.

Generally, two-story residential buildings have hipped roofs.

Generally, dormers should be located on the roof. Wall dormers are not typical in the historic context and accentuate height so they should be used minimally and generally only on secondary facades. When they are appropriate they should be no wider than the typical window openings and should not project beyond the main wall.

f. Orientation

The orientation of a new building's front facade shall be visually consistent with surrounding historic buildings.

New buildings should incorporate at least one front street-related porch that is accessible from the front street.

Side porches or porte cocheres may also be appropriate as a secondary entrance, but the primary entrance should address the front.

Front porches generally should be a minimum of 6' deep, have porch racks that are 1'-3' tall and have posts that include bases and capitals.

Generally, curb cuts should not be added.

Where a new driveway is appropriate it should be two concrete strips with a central grassy median.

Shared driveways should be a single lane, not just two driveways next to each other. Sometimes this may be accomplished with a single lane curb cut that widens to a double lane deeper into the lot.

g. Proportion and Rhythm of Openings

The relationship of width to height of windows and doors, and the rhythm of solids (walls) to voids (door and window openings) in a new building shall be compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with surrounding historic buildings.

Window openings on the primary street-related or front façade of new construction should be representative of the window patterns of similarly massed historic structures within the district.

In most cases, every 8-13 horizontal feet of flat wall surface should have an opening (window or door) of at least 4 square feet. More leniencies can be given to minimally visible side or rear walls.

Double-hung windows should exhibit a height to width ratio of at least 2:1.

Windows on upper floors should not be taller than windows on the main floor since historically first floors have higher ceilings than upper floors and so windows were typically taller on the first floor.

Single-light sashes are appropriate for new construction. If using multi-light sashes, muntins should be fully simulated and bonded to the glass, and exhibit an interior bar, exterior bar, as well as a spacer between glass panes.

Four inch (nominal) casings are required around doors, windows and vents on non-masonry buildings.

Trim should be thick enough to extend beyond the clapboard. Double or triple windows should have a 4" to 6" mullion in between.

Brick molding is required around doors, windows and vents within masonry walls but is not appropriate on non-masonry buildings.

i. Utilities

Utility connections such as gas meters, electric meters, phone, cable, and HVAC condenser units should be located so as to minimize their visibility from the street.

Generally, utility connections should be placed no closer to the street than the mid point of the structure.

Power lines should be placed underground if they are carried from the street and not from the rear or an alley.

j. Public Spaces

Landscaping, sidewalks, signage, lighting, street furniture and other work undertaken in public spaces by any individual, group or agency shall be presented to the MHZC for review of compatibility with the character of the district.

2. ADDITIONS

- a. Generally, an addition should be situated at the rear of a building in such a way that it will not disturb either front or side facades.

Placement

Additions should be located at the rear of an existing structure.

Connections to additions should, as much as possible, use existing window and door openings rather than remove significant amounts of rear wall material.

Generally, one-story rear additions should inset one foot, for each story, from the side wall.

Additions should be physically distinguished from the historic building and generally fit within the shadow line of the existing building.

In order to assure that an addition has achieved proper scale, the addition should generally be shorter and thinner than the existing building. Exceptions may be made when unusual constraints make these parameters unreasonable, such as:

- An extreme grade change*
- Atypical lot parcel shape or size*

In these cases, an addition may rise above or extend wider than the existing building; however, generally the addition should not higher and extend wider.

When an addition needs to be wider:

Rear additions that are wider than an existing historic building may be appropriate when the building is narrower than 30' or shifted to one side of the lot. In these instances, a structural alcove or channel must separate the existing building from the new addition. The structural alcove should sit in a minimum of 1' and be at least twice as long as it is deep.

In addition, a rear addition that is wider should not wrap the rear corner.

Ridge raises

Ridge raises are most appropriate for one-story, side-gable buildings, (without clipped gables) and that require more finished height in the attic. The purpose of a ridge raise is to allow for conditioned space in the attic and to discourage large rear or side additions. The raised portion must sit in a minimum of 2' from each side wall and can be raised no more than 2' of total vertical height within the same plane as the front roof slope.

Foundation

Foundation walls should set in from the existing foundation at the back edge of the existing structure by one foot for each story or half story. Exception: When an addition is a small one-room deep (12' deep or less) addition that spans the width of the structure, and the existing structure is masonry with the addition to be wood (or appropriate substitute siding). The change in material from masonry to wood allows for a minimum of a four inch (4") inset.

Foundation height should match or be lower than the existing structure.

Foundation lines should be visually distinct from the predominant exterior wall material. This is generally accomplished with a change in materials.

Roof

The height of the addition's roof and eaves must be less than or equal to the existing structure. Visually evident roof slopes should match the roof slopes of the existing structure, and roof planes should set in accordingly for rear additions.

Skylights should not be located on the front-facing slope of the roof. Skylights should be flat (no bubble lenses) with a low profile (no more than six inches tall) and only be installed behind the midpoint of the building).

Rear & Side Dormers

Dormer additions are appropriate for some historic buildings as they are a traditional way of adding ventilation and light to upper stories.

The addition of a dormer that would require the removal of historic features such as an existing dormer, chimneys, cupolas or decorative feature is not appropriate.

Rear dormers should be inset from the side walls of the building by a minimum of two feet. The top of a rear dormer may attach just below the ridge of the main roof or lower.

Side Additions

When a lot width exceeds 60' or the standard lot width on the block, it may be appropriate to add a side addition to a historic structure. The addition should set back from the face of the historic structure (at or beyond the midpoint of the building) and should be subservient in height, width and massing to the historic structure.

Side additions should be narrower than half of the historic building width and exhibit a height of at least 2' shorter than the historic building.

To deemphasize a side addition, the roofing form should generally be a hip or side-gable roof form.

- b. The creation of an addition through enclosure of a front porch is not appropriate.

Side porch additions may be appropriate for corner building lots or lots more than 60' wide.

- c. Contemporary designs for additions to existing properties are not discouraged when such additions do not destroy significant historical, architectural, or cultural material; and when such design is compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the property, neighborhood, or environment.

- d. A new addition should be constructed in such a manner that if the addition were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the original structure would be unimpaired.

Connections should, as much as possible, use existing window and door openings rather than remove significant amounts of rear wall material.

- e. Additions should follow the guidelines for new construction.

III.B.1 Demolition is Not Appropriate

- a. if a building, or major portion of a building, is of such architectural or historical interest and value that its removal would be detrimental to the public interest; or
- b. if a building, or major portion of a building, is of such old or unusual or uncommon design and materials that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced without great difficulty and expense.

III.B.2 Demolition is Appropriate

- a. if a building, or major portion of a building, has irretrievably lost its architectural and historical integrity and significance and its removal will result in a more historically appropriate visual effect on the district;
 - b. if a building, or major portion of a building, does not contribute to the historical and architectural character and significance of the district and its removal will result in a more historically appropriate visual effect on the district; or

c. if the denial of the demolition will result in an economic hardship on the applicant as determined by the MHZC in accordance with section 17.40.420 of the historic zoning ordinance.

Background: 110 Pembroke Avenue is a one-story Craftsman-style brick home built circa 1925 and is a contributing building to the Belle Meade Links Triangle district. An existing addition to the rear was added in 1993, and a left-side addition and a right-side porte-cochere at an unknown date prior to that.



Figure 1. 110 Pembroke Avenue

Analysis and Findings: The scope of work proposed is a redesign of the left addition, adding a new rear addition, alterations to the right-side porte-cochere, and a ridge raise.



Figure 2. Current additions, viewed from the rear yard

Demolition: The project calls for demolition of the left-side and rear additions, which are not original to the house. Staff finds that these portions do not contribute to the architectural and historical character and significance of the district, and that the proposed demolition meets section III.B.2 for appropriate demolition and does not meet section III.B.1 for inappropriate demolition.

Height & Scale: The ridge raise will add two feet (2') to the ridge of the house, adding a functional second story. The raised portion will sit in two feet (2') from the existing side walls.

The foundation and eave height of the rear and left-side additions will match the existing. The width of the left-side addition will be no wider than the existing one. A total of six hundred and sixty square feet (660 sq. ft.) will be added to the footprint of the house. As the project is adding onto existing non-contributing additions, Staff did not request the proposed rear addition be differentiated by insets from the house.

The porte-cochere will have deteriorated elements and the railing replaced.

The project meets section II.B.1.a and b.

Design, Location & Removability:

The new construction will be at the rear of the historic house and the left side. Generally side additions are inappropriate unless the width of the lot is wider than the standard lot or the house is unusually narrow. In this case, the lot is ninety feet wide (90') compared to a wide range of lot widths in the immediate vicinity (50'-90'). In addition, the left-side addition will be an improvement on an inappropriate lateral addition; therefore, staff finds the left-side addition to be an appropriate location.

The left-side addition will be one foot (1') lower than the current ridge of the house, and three feet (3') lower than the raised ridge. The side addition reaches its maximum height at a distance of fifty-one feet (51') from the front wall of the house. It will be appropriately subordinate to the house. The roof form, window pattern, and overall design are distinguished from and compatible with the historic building.

The project meets section II.B.2.

Setback & Rhythm of Spacing: The new left-side addition will be the same width as the current addition. The side setbacks will be fourteen feet (14') and thirty feet (30') from the left and right side property lines, respectively. The rear wall of the addition will be seventy-six feet (76') from the rear property line. The project meets section II.B.1.c for setbacks and rhythm of spacing.

Materials: Materials for the new construction were not specified in the drawings submitted. Staff requests that a condition of approval be that the materials be added to the drawings, and that staff have final approval of the materials, windows, doors, masonry and color of roofing.

Roof form: The gabled roof of the existing rear addition will be replaced with a shed roof running to the rear. The side addition will have a side-facing gable. A brick-veneer chimney will be built on the addition's left side. The project meets section II.B.1.e.

Orientation: The project does not change the existing orientation of the house. Staff finds its orientation meets section II.B.1.f.

Proportion and Rhythm of Openings: The drawings indicate the intent to widen the existing second-story windows on each side for egress. Staff requests that the window openings remain.

The windows on the proposed addition are all generally twice as tall as they are wide, meeting the historic proportions of openings. There are no large expanses of wall space without a window or door opening. Staff finds the project's proportion and rhythm of openings to meet Section II.B.1.g.

Recommendation:

Staff recommends approval with the conditions:

1. Materials be added to drawings, and subject to Staff approval;
2. Existing window openings be retained;
3. Staff approve the final details, dimensions and materials of windows and doors prior to purchase and installation; and,
4. Staff approve the roof color and masonry color, dimensions and texture.

Staff finds that the project meets section II.B.2 of the design guidelines for the Belle Meade Links Triangle Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.