



# METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission  
Sunnyside in Sevier Park

## METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION SUMMARY MEETING MINUTES

July 15, 2015

**Commissioners Present:** Chairman Brian Tibbs, Menié Bell, Rose Cantrell, Sam Champion, Richard Fletcher, Hunter Gee, Ben Mosley

**Zoning Staff:** Melissa Baldock, Paul Hoffman, Susan Staffenhagen (intern), Robin Zeigler (historic zoning administrator), Susan Jones (city attorney)

**Applicants:** John TeSelle, John Root

**Public:** None

Chairman Tibbs called the meeting to order at 2:02 p.m. and read aloud the process for appealing the decisions of the Metro Historic Zoning Commission and the time limits on presentations.

### I. RECOGNITION OF COUNCILMEMBERS

### II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

a. June 17, 2015

**Motion:**

**Commissioner Fletcher moved to approve the minutes as presented. Commissioner Bell seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

### III. OVERLAY RECOMMENDATIONS

Staff member Robin Zeigler presented the case for the Downtown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay that includes six properties. Four of the buildings are historic and identified as contributing properties to the National Register of Historic Places district, listed in 1982. Two are non-historic buildings and they will be removed.

One of the historic buildings is First National Bank, which was Nashville's first skyscraper in 1905. Just across the street is the Noel Hotel, built in 1929. It is a stripped-down 1920s modern adaptation of the Neo-classical style. It was designed by Nashville architects Marr and Holman.

The overlay also includes the Romanesque-style Utopia Hotel constructed in 1891. The Hotel was one of several establishments that made up the "men's quarter." along what was then named Cherry Street. In the Gay Nineties, men gathered in the quarter to eat, drink and gamble in the restaurants, saloons and the new Utopia Hotel. The lively social life centered there was for men only.

Climax Saloon built in 1887 was also a part of the men's quarter. The three-story solid masonry structure has an Italianate style galvanized iron façade that in all probability was chosen from a catalogue. This is the only such example known in Nashville.

The properties are listed in the National Register of Historic Places as contributing buildings to the Printer's Alley district. Staff recommends adopting the Downtown Design Guidelines if the properties should be designated as a

local overlay, and to recommend to Council designation of these properties as the Downtown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay.

**Motion:**

**Commissioner Fletcher moved to recommend the overlay to the Council and adopt the design guidelines. Commissioner Cantrell seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

**III. CONSENT AGENDA**

**NOTICE TO THE PUBLIC:** Items on the Consent Agenda will be voted on at a single time. No individual public hearing will be held, nor will the Commission debate these items unless a member of the audience or the Commission requests that the item be removed from the Consent Agenda.

**b. 1414 EASTLAND AVE**

Application: New construction-detached accessory dwelling unit; Setback determination  
Council District: 06  
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: MELISSA BALDOCK  
Permit ID #: 2054573

**c. 1206 CEDAR LN**

Application: New construction-outbuilding; Setback determination  
Council District: 18  
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: PAUL HOFFMAN  
Permit ID #: 2054153

**d. 800 SETLIFF PL**

Application: New construction-addition  
Council District: 06  
Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: PAUL HOFFMAN  
Permit ID #: 2054155

**e. 1507 LINDEN AVE**

Application: New construction--addition; Setback determination  
Council District: 18  
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: MELISSA BALDOCK  
Permit ID #: 2054565

**f. 2104 GRANTLAND AVE**

Application: New construction-detached accessory dwelling unit; Setback Determination  
Council District: 17  
Overlay: Woodland-in-Waverly Historic Preservation Overlay  
Project Lead: MELISSA BALDOCK  
Permit ID #: 2054571

**g. 308 BROADWAY**

Application: New construction-addition; Alterations  
Council District: 19  
Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: SEAN ALEXANDER  
Permit ID #: 2054962

**h. 1408 WOODLAND ST**

Application: New construction-addition to outbuilding for detached accessory dwelling unit

Council District: 06  
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: SEAN ALEXANDER  
Permit ID #: 2054952

Chairman Tibbs explained that the consent agenda items would be approved with one motion unless an item was requested for removal. Ms. Steffenhagen, intern, listed the consent items, noting that 308 Broadway was moved to “MHZC Actions” at the request of the applicant. There were no other requests to remove an item from the consent agenda.

**Motion:**

**Commissioner Champion moved to approve the consent agenda items with their applicable conditions, with the exception of 308 Broadway. Commissioner Gee seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

**IV. PREVIOUSLY DEFERRED ITEMS**

The items below were deferred from a previous MHZC meeting at the request of the applicant.

None

**V. MHZC ACTIONS**

**h. 308 BROADWAY**

Application: New construction-addition; Alterations  
Council District: 19  
Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: SEAN ALEXANDER  
Permit ID #: 2054962  
308 Broadway

Staff member, Sean Alexander presented the case for a rooftop addition and alterations at 308 Broadway.

Mr. John TeSelle, architect for the project, stated that he agreed with most of the recommendations, with the exception of the mullions between windows, use of roll up doors and the wood siding on the alley side. He said that on all these points there are some unique aspects to this property that should allow those elements and not set a precedent for other properties in the district. One is they are building on top of a new building and not modifying a historic building. 312 Broadway has large openings in the masonry. The windows they propose are something in between. Having the mullions will make the replacement windows too narrow. The side-façade is a dead-end alley that is used for service only and so those alterations are not very visible. There are some later buildings with more horizontal openings. It is a unit sitting on it and so to have garage doors on part of it and not all of it doesn't make visual sense.

There were no requests from the public to speak.

Commissioner Mosley admitted it was an unusual situation in that you have a new building that wants to look old and now you are trying to put something else on top of it. The applicant brings up a good point that the front windows would be too skinny with the mullion between and it might look more odd to have it.

Commissioner Gee agreed with all the comments of the architect. The 6” mullion would make the front windows out of proportion. He asked if there was a way to have a little more thickness to the interior casements. Switching materials between one side of a form and another would be odd.

Commissioner Cantrell stated a distinction can be made because it is a narrow alley.

Commissioner Bell noted that there are stricter design guidelines for this overlay because it is a historic overlay and not a conservation overlay.

Commissioner Mosley stated that the wood is an accent material and not a dominant material and therefore meets the design guidelines. The mullions on the front would disturb the historic rhythm of windows and therefore, not having the mullions meets the design guidelines. Commissioner Champion agreed.

**Motion:**

**Commissioner Fletcher moved to approve with the conditions that Staff approves the roof color and a brick sample; the new second-story windows have the appearance of double-hung windows, including off-set sashes; and the garage doors not be allowed on the alley-side elevation. Commissioner Bell seconded. Motion passed unanimously.**

Commissioner Mosley stated that the new windows used in place of the garage doors that were not approved, should not be fixed windows.

**1115 LILLIAN ST**

Application: Demolition; New construction-infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: MELISSA BALDOCK

Permit ID #: 2054553

Staff member Melissa Baldock presented 1115 Lillian Street, an application to demolish a non-contributing house and to construct new infill. The infill will be one-and-a-half stories in height and approximately thirty feet tall. The house meets all base zoning requirements. The house does include an attached carport at the rear, ground floor level. While the Commission does not typically approved attached carports, staff finds this carport to be acceptable because of the shallowness of the lot, the lack of an alley, and the lack of immediate historic context on this block. The Commission did approve a similar attached carport next door at 1113 Lillian Street in January 2015.

1115 Lillian Street will be similar in height, scale, orientation, and detailing to what was approved by the Commission in January 2015 for 1113 Lillian Street. Staff asks that the depth of the front porch at the front of the house be increased from five feet to six feet, to be in keeping with the Commission's past decisions regarding a usable porch depth. All the known materials have been approved by the Commission in the past.

Staff recommends approval of the demolition and infill with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;
2. The porch be a minimum of six feet (6') deep along the front façade;
3. Staff approve the final details, dimensions and materials of windows and doors prior to purchase and installation;
4. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house; and
5. Staff approve the roof color, dimensions and texture.

John Root, architect for the project agreed with all staff conditions but he cautioned against the 6' porch depth because of the grade change.

There were no requests from the public to speak.

Commissioner Gee asked if the grade was reflected in the drawings. Mr. Root was invited back to explain. They are pushing dirt back on the building so that there re only 3 blocks viewed. Commissioner Gee noted that there is room for the house to be pushed back a 1' or 2'. Ms. Baldock noted that either extending the porch by a 1' or pushing the entire house back by a foot to allow for an additional foot to the porch depth would meet the design guidelines as there is little historic context in this area.

**Motion:**

**Commissioner Gee moved to approve project with the conditions that the finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field; the**

**porch be a minimum of six feet (6') deep along the front façade; Staff approve the final details, dimensions and materials of windows and doors prior to purchase and installation; the HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house; and Staff approve the roof color, dimensions and texture. Commissioner Champion seconded and the motion passed unanioumsly.**

#### **IV. PRELIMINARY SP REVIEW**

There were no preliminary SPs to be reviewed.

#### **V. ADMINISTRATIVE ACTIONS**

There were no requests from Staff for review of administrative documents.

#### **VI. OTHER BUSINESS**

- a. Administrative Permits Issued for Prior month

Ms. Zeigler thanked intern Susan Steffenhagen for her service.

Meeting Adjourned.

RATIFIED BY COMMISSION ON AUGUST 19 2015