

MEGAN BARRY
MAYOR



METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission
Sunnyside in Sevier Park

METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC) MINUTES

October 19, 2016

Commissioners Present: Brian Tibbs (chairman), Rose Cantrell (vice-chair), Menié Bell, Samuel Champion, Ann Nielson, Aaron Kaalberg, Elizabeth Mayhall, Cyril Stewart

Zoning Staff: Melissa Baldock, Paul Hoffman, Melissa Sajid, Robin Zeigler (historic zoning administrator), Macy Forrest Amos (city attorney)

Applicants: Josh Hughes, Michael Carpenter, Clay Curtis, Ron Hoven, John Pirtle, Michael Ward and Brian Haas,

Public: Ms. Price, Sonja Link

Chairman Tibbs called the meeting to order at 2:02 p.m.

I. RECOGNITION OF COUNCILMEMBERS

II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

a. September 21, 2016

Motion:

Commissioner Stewart moved to approve the minutes as presented. Commissioner Cantrell seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

Chairman Tibbs read information regarding the meeting, consent and appeals.

III. OVERLAY RECOMMENDATIONS & DESIGN GUIDELINE ADOPTION

b. 2250 LEBANON ROAD

Application: Recommendation for Historic Landmark

Council District:

Overlay: Historic Landmark Overlay

Project Lead: ROBIN ZEIGLER

The owners of Belair at 2250 Lebanon Road are seeking a Historic Landmark overlay. The home was constructed in 1832 on a land grant of one thousand acres by John Harding of Belle Meade for his daughter, Elizabeth, who married Joseph Clay of Kentucky.

The architectural style of Belair is generally Federal, with some classic revival influence shown in the two-story portico with fluted Doric columns and a one-story deck roof. At the back of the large entrance hall is an elliptical stairway that is similar to the one at the Hermitage.

Belair is significant as an excellent example of its style of architecture and because of its association with the development of the general area of Nashville, now known as Donelson. The property is listed in the National Register of Historic places and therefore meets criterion 5 of section 17.36.120 of the ordinance.

Staff suggests the Commission recommend to City Council that Belair be adopted as a Historic Landmark and the existing design guidelines for Historic Landmarks be used to guide future changes. The site is listed in the National Register of Historic Places, and meets the standards of the Ordinance for a Historic Landmark Overlay.

The applicant was not present and there were no requests from the public to speak.

Motion:

Commissioner Stewart moved to recommend the Historic Landmark and adopt the existing design guidelines to guide future change. Commissioner Bell seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

IV. CONSENT AGENDA

c. 1531 DOUGLAS AVENUE

Application: New construction-addition
Council District: 06
Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: MELISSA BALDOCK

d. 1505 FORREST AVENUE

Application: Demolition-outbuilding; New construction-outbuilding (detached accessory dwelling unit)
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: MELISSA BALDOCK

e. 1822 ORDWAY PLACE

Application: New construction-addition; Setback determination
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: MELISSA BALDOCK

f. 412 RUDOLPH AVENUE

Application: Demolition—outbuilding; New construction-outbuilding (detached accessory dwelling unit)
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: MELISSA BALDOCK

g. 121 BLACKBURN AVENUE

Application: Demolition; New construction-outbuilding; Setback determination
Council District: 23
Overlay: Belle Meade Link Triangle Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: MELISSA SAJID

h. 1104 FATHERLAND STREET

Application: New construction-addition
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: MELISSA SAJID

i. 3603 KENNEDY AVENUE

Application: New construction - addition
Council District: 07
Overlay: Inglewood Place Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: MELISSA SAJID

j. 1021 PARIS AVENUE

Application: New Construction—addition to outbuilding, Setback determination

Council District: 17
Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: MELISSA BALDOCK

k. 1009 ACKLEN AVENUE

Application: New construction-outbuilding, Setback determination
Council District: 17
Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: SEAN ALEXANDER

l. 1915 BELMONT BOULEVARD

Application: New construction-outbuilding (detached accessory dwelling unit); Setback determination
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: MELISSA SAJID

m. 2715 BRIGHTWOOD AVENUE

Application: New construction-outbuilding, Setback determination
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: SEAN ALEXANDER

n. 2500 OAKLAND AVENUE

Application: New construction-outbuilding, Setback determination
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: SEAN ALEXANDER

o. 1310 SEVENTH AVENUE NORTH

Application: New construction-outbuilding (detached accessory dwelling unit)
Council District: 19
Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: PAUL HOFFMAN

p. 3725 CENTRAL AVENUE

Application: New construction-outbuilding
Council District: 24
Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: PAUL HOFFMAN

q. 910 CARUTHERS AVENUE

Application: New construction-addition
Council District: 17
Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: SEAN ALEXANDER

r. 1509 GARTLAND AVENUE

Application: New construction-addition
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: MELISSA BALDOCK

Paul Hoffman read the projects for the consent agenda.

1021 Paris Avenue was removed from the agenda.

Motion:

Commissioner Champion voted to approve the consent agenda items with their respective conditions, with the exception of 1021 Paris Avenue. Commissioner Cantrell seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

V. PREVIOUSLY DEFERRED ITEMS

s. 201 BROADWAY

Application: New construction

Council District: 19

Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: ROBIN ZEIGLER

Deferred at the request of the applicant.

VI. MHZC ACTIONS

t. 400 BROADWAY

Application: New construction-addition

Council District: 19

Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: MELISSA BALDOCK

Staff member Melissa Baldock presented the case for an addition at 400 Broadway. 400 Broadway is a c. 1870 brick commercial structure that contributes to the Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay. In July 2016, the Historic Zoning Commission approved alterations to the building's storefronts, new lighting, and a rooftop and rear addition. This application seeks to change the size of the previously approved rooftop and rear additions.

The stairwell that faces Broadway will encroach on the setback less, footprint wise, in the revised plan. However, you will see in a minute that it is taller than what previously was approved. The stairwell at the back of the building will encroach upon the setback approximately eight feet (8') under the current proposal, whereas it previously was approved to encroach just seven feet (7'). The bulkhead that faces Broadway will be about one foot (1') taller than was previously approved. The bulkhead at the back of the structure will be about three and a half feet (3'6") taller than what was previously approved.

The revised drawings show that the height of the rear addition has decreased from approximately fifty-two feet (52') to fifty-one feet (51'). The addition is also set in further from the edge of the historic building.

In July, the Commission approved a stairwell bulkhead that encroached approximately seven feet (7') into the step back area and had a height of about three feet (3') above the parapet. However, the portion of the stair bulkhead that intruded upon the step back area was lower in height than the parapet. The revised plans show an encroachment of eight feet (8') and a height of seven feet (7') above the parapet on Fourth Avenue North.

Staff finds that the revised changes to the bulkheads to be in keeping with previous Commission decisions to allow intrusions into the required rooftop addition step back area. The bulkheads are designed so that their tallest portions are furthest from the parapet wall, decreasing their visibility. Staff therefore finds that their encroachment to the required step back is appropriate.

The location of the railing has changed since the previous application in July. The railing will be stepped back eight feet (8') from the Broadway and the Fourth Avenue North facades, which meets the design guidelines.

Staff finds that the alterations to the previously approved rooftop stair bulkheads and rooftop railing meet Section III.H. of the Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay, design guidelines.

Josh Hughes, with Tuck-Hinton architects explained that the reasoning for the additional massing for the stair tower was to get the two exits further apart.

There were no requests from the public to speak.

Motion:

Commissioner Bell moved to approve the project with the condition that staff approves the final material choice for the rear addition, finding the project met Section III. of the *Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay: Handbook and Design Guidelines*. Commissioner Stewart seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

u. 1214, 1216, 1220 ROSA L. PARKS BLVD

Application: SIGNAGE

Council District: 19

Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: PAUL HOFFMAN

Paul Hoffman, staff member, presented the case for signage at 1214, 1216 and 1220 Rosa L. Parks Boulevard, a new commercial building the Commission approved in August. In total, four signs are proposed. The design guidelines permit the building three signs, one for each primary entrance, and an additional one for each public street on which the building has frontage.

The Germantown design guidelines specify that a projecting sign should be appropriately scaled to the building, and should not exceed 16 square feet. Because this is new construction on a major thoroughfare that is not typical of the interior of the district, Staff's review is that the projecting sign is appropriate to the building. The sign will have 53 square feet, which is less than half of the allotment allowed on the opposite side of Rosa L. Parks Boulevard, which is a Gateway Street Type in the Downtown Code. The guidelines prohibit flashing, blinking, revolving or racing lights and Staff recommends that as a condition of approval, as well as that the width of the projecting sign does not exceed one foot. The neon wall sign "wall sign #1" in our report, meets the design guidelines and is 26 square feet. The smaller wall sign, "wall sign #2" in our report, has a total of 11 and one-half square feet. The design guidelines specify that a wall-mounted sign should be located between the first and second stories; Staff finds that this sign is appropriate, due to its modest size, and that it is set back from the front of the building by 31 feet.

The last sign proposed is this painted sign, which wraps the corner of the building on the side. In general, painted signage on the ground level is not appropriate. In addition, this sign would take up 96 square feet, which exceeds the sign allotment in the DTC by more than 78 square feet. Staff recommends disapproval of this sign, due to the sign area, the location, and that it exceeds the number of signs allowed on the building.

In conclusion, Staff recommends approval of the projecting sign on Rosa L. Parks Boulevard, and wall signs 1 and 2, finding that they meet Section 8 of the Germantown design guidelines, with the condition that the signage does not flash, blank, rotate or race, and that the width of the projecting sign does not exceed one foot.

Staff recommends disapproval of the painted sign (wall sign #3) finding that it exceeds the allotted sign area, the number of signs, and is in an inappropriate location.

Commissioner Champion asked for clarification on the allotment for signage.

Michael Carpenter, branding expert representing the applicant, explained the collective signage design concept.

Commissioner Stewart asked why they should approve signage that exceeds the design guidelines. Mr. Carpenter said that they do not have the allotment to meet the needs of a large building. They chose a painted sign as it is a historic type of sign.

Commissioner Nielson arrived at 2:29 p.m.

There were no requests from the public to speak.

Commissioner Kaalberg stated that he agrees with staff recommendation and the arguments made for a larger projecting sign.

Commissioner Champion said that the signage was tastefully done, but the sign allotment must be met since they have required others to meet it.

Motion:

Commissioner Champion moved to approve the projecting sign facing Rosa L. Parks Blvd, and wall signs 1 and 2, finding that they meet section 8.0 of the Germantown design guidelines, with the condition that signage not flash, blink, revolve or race and that the projecting sign does not exceed one foot (1') in depth. Further, he moved to disapprove wall sign #3, the painted sign, finding that it will exceed the allotted sign area for the building and is in an inappropriate location. Commissioner Stewart seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

v. 170 FOURTH AVENUE NORTH

Application: Signage

Council District: 19

Overlay: Downtown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: MELISSA SAJID

Staff member, Melissa Sajid presented the case for 170 4th Avenue North.

The request is for signage at 170 4th Ave N, located in the Downtown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay. This request is to replace two wall signs and three skyline signs. In addition, a modification is requested to allow one skyline sign to exceed 50% of the façade to which it is attached.

The plan proposes two wall signs that are each approximately two square feet. The signs will be located at the corner of Church St and 4th Ave N with one sign on each façade. With the condition that the wall signs project no more than 2" from the wall, staff finds that the wall signs meet the design guidelines for the Downtown HPZO.

The request also includes the replacement of three skyline signs with one sign on the Church St façade, one on the 4th Ave N façade, and one on the Printer's Alley façade. Altogether, the area of the skyline signs total 596 sq. ft., which does not exceed the overall allotment for skylines signs for the site. The skyline signs on the Church St and 4th Ave N façades are each approximately 168 sq. ft. and both meet the design guidelines for allotment, size, location, illumination, and materials.

The skyline sign proposed on the Printer's Alley façade is approximately 260 sq. ft. and meets all of the design guidelines except for the provision that requires skyline signs not to exceed 50% of the length of the façade. As proposed, the width of this sign side encompasses approximately 62% of the width of that façade and does not meet this guideline. The applicant has requested a modification to permit the sign as proposed. In order to meet the guideline, the width of the sign must be reduced by approximately 6'9". The existing skyline sign on that façade that was permitted in 1998 is 18' x 7' and meets the guidelines that the sign not exceed 50% of the width of the façade.

While the Printer's Alley façade is narrower than the Church Street and 4th Ave N façades, staff finds that there is not a compelling reason to recommend approval of the requested modification. The applicant has requested the modification so that the sign will have increased visibility from the interstate and Nissan stadium, yet the existing sign that is being replaced meets this guideline. In addition, the building is located in the Capitol Mall Redevelopment District, and MDHA does not recommend approval of the sign modification. Therefore, staff recommends that the skyline sign not exceed 50% of the façade as required by the design guidelines.

In conclusion, staff recommends approval of the proposed wall and skyline signs with conditions, including the condition that no skyline signs exceed 50% of the width of the façade to which they are attached.

The applicant, Clay Curtis, asked for a modification for one of the signs because the resulting sign will not be visible or as big as the sign next door. This sign will be dark during the day and so will not be as noticeable. He made the argument that the building is actually wider than what staff claimed.

Chairman Tibbs asked staff about the dimensional difference. Ms. Sajid explained that there is a bump out on one

side that is stepped back from the façade. Because it is not part of the continuous plane of the façade, Staff did not include it in the width of the building.

Commissioner Champion stated that there was no reason not to follow the requirements of the design guidelines, and signage does not need to be visible from the stadium.

Motion:

Commissioner Champion moved to approve the proposed skyline signs and wall signs, with the conditions that:

- **All skyline signs not exceed fifty percent (50%) of the wall to which they are attached;**
- **Wall signs project no more than two inches (2") from the wall;**
- **Staff review and approve the materials for the wall signs prior to purchase and installation; and**
- **The new signs are inspected prior to the installation;**

finding the project meets Section IV of the design guidelines for signage in the Downtown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Cantrell seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

Commissioner Kaalberg thanked the applicant for the design as it is more aesthetically pleasing than what is there now.

w. 3910 KIMPALONG AVENUE

Application: New construction-infill

Council District: 24

Overlay: Woodlawn-West Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: PAUL HOFFMAN

Deferred at the request of the applicant.

x. 1227 FIFTH AVENUE NORTH

Application: New construction-outbuilding; Setback determination

Council District: 19

Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: MELISSA SAJID

Staff member, Melissa Sajid, presented the case for an outbuilding at 1227 5th Avenue North.

This request is to construct a new structure in the rear yard and includes a setback determination to reduce the rear setback from 20' to 5'. The property is zoned MUN, which allows for a second unit, which is not considered a DADU.

The proposed structure, outlined in red here, is located behind the historic house and has a footprint of 652 sq.ft. It meets the side setbacks for MUN, which is 0'. A setback determination has been requested to reduce the rear setback from 20' to 5'. Staff finds that the proposed setback determination is appropriate in this case since the 1914 Sanborn map shows that this property once had a rear outbuilding that was located on the rear property line. In addition, staff finds that other outbuildings in the area are located closer to the rear property line as well.

The proposed structure is two stories, but is shorter than the existing house at 22'6". Staff finds a two-story structure behind a one-story historic structure is appropriate in this case because the Germantown neighborhood is diverse, with many utilitarian and industrial structures of two or more stories. In addition, the 1914 Sanborn map shows that on this site there was a one-and-a-half story accessory structure, which although less than two stories, was still larger in terms of number of floors than the historic house. In addition, the two-story outbuilding is appropriate, as it is 2' 6" lower in height than the historic house.

The outbuilding will be clad in brick and will have a concrete foundation.

As proposed, the structure is neither taller nor wider than the historic house, and given the zoning and historic context, staff finds the massing of the proposed structure to be appropriate as it is subordinate to the historic home in

terms of height, width, and footprint. In addition, the structure meets the Germantown design guidelines for materials, roof and building form, and proportion and rhythm of openings. Therefore, staff recommends approval with conditions.

Ron Hoven explained that they have the smallest lot in the area and they are proposing a garage with an extra sleeping area for when his children visit and the proposal is similar to what is in the area.

In answer to Commissioner Kaalberg's question, Mr. Hoven said the roof would be accessible for mechanicals.

Ms. Price, 1229 5th Avenue North, said that she has lived in the neighborhood for 30 years. She objects because the site plan is not accurate and she wants to be sure that her property is not taken. The HVAC needs to be taken into account in determining the appropriate height.

Mr. Hoven explained that the mechanical will not increase the height because of the parapet wall. He has offered to have a true survey done in order to ensure it is constructed in the appropriate location.

Commissioners asked for clarification of zoning, setbacks and massing. Commissioner Kaalberg noted that it is subordinate to the principal structure and the design fits into the context of Germantown.

(Public comment was shared with the Commission via email.)

Motion:

Commissioner Kaalberg moved to approve the project with the following conditions that:

- **Staff approve the final roof, windows, doors, and garage door selections as well as the color and texture of the masonry prior to purchase and installation; and**
- **The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house;**

finding that the design, massing and siting of the outbuilding meet sections 2.9 of the *Germantown Historic Overlay Design Guidelines*. Commissioner Bell seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

y. 1115 GREENWOOD AVENUE

Application: New construction-infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Greenwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: MELISSA SAJID

Commissioner Bell left the room at 2:54 pm and returned at 2:58, prior to completion of the staff presentation.

Staff member, Melissa Sajid noted that public comment had been received via email and a hard copy of a recent email received from Councilman Withers was provided in hardcopy.

This is a request to construct a new single-family residence at 1115 Greenwood Ave. The request also includes a setback determination to reduce the setback on the side street from 10' to 9'. The lot is a corner lot that is narrower than the typical lot in the immediate area. Currently the site is vacant.

As proposed, the infill is oriented to Greenwood Ave with parking off the alley. The proposed front setback of 45' is inconsistent with the setback of the historic house to the left, which is set back 50' from the property line; however, it is consistent with the home to the right, across North Twelfth Street and with 1111 Greenwood Ave, which is one home over to the left. The proposed infill meets the bulk standards for the rear and left side setbacks; however, it does not meet the bulk standards for the right-side setback.

As the house is located on a corner lot, the minimum setback on the side street is 10'. The applicant has requested a right side setback determination to reduce the setback from 10' to 9'. Staff finds that reducing this side setback is appropriate. The lot is narrower than the typical lot in the immediate area, so reducing the right-side setback allows for a building footprint that is more appropriate for the context. In addition, there are other buildings along N. 12th St where the side of a building appears to be closer to the street-side property line than ten feet 10'.

The structure is one and one-half stories with a maximum height of 28' and an eave height of 12' at the front. The historic context in the surrounding area ranges from 20'-30' and includes 1 to 1.5 story historic homes. As proposed, the proposed infill will be no taller than the historic home located next door at 1113 Greenwood Ave. The new house will be clad in Hardie board with board and batten and Hardie staggered shakes accents. The foundation will be brick. The roof is a cross-gable and includes dormers on the front and side elevations. As proposed, the dormers will be set in 2' from the wall below.

Staff recommends that more detailed drawings be submitted prior to issuance of a permit so that the project is clearly communicated to the inspector. A true front elevation that is to-scale is needed. In addition, the plans are missing some details.

Staff finds that, with conditions, the plan before you can meet the design guidelines for height, scale, materials, roof shape, orientation, and rhythm and proportions of openings and Staff recommends approval of the infill and setback determination with the conditions set forth in the staff recommendation.

Chairman Tibbs agreed that new drawings are required, since the current drawings leave too much to the imagination. He asked Staff to explain the reason for the reduced side-setback. Ms. Sajid explained that the setback determination was a recommendation of staff so that the building can have a more appropriate width in terms of the historic context and there are other corners with similar side setbacks.

John Pirtle, designer and general contractor for the project, explained that there are measurements provided on the drawings. He apologized for the drawings and stated he agreed with staff's recommendations. The setback determination is to make the house more aesthetically pleasing. The height of the home to the immediate left is more than 22' tall so he requested that staff come out and measure the house with him. The house to the left has a high front porch and others are lower. He left the railing off, as he didn't know if a railing was required. If he has to have concrete steps, he would prefer to have a concrete block foundation. The floating column on the rear elevation is an error.

There were no requests from the public to speak.

Commissioner Champion reiterated that more complete drawings should be submitted before construction begins.

Commissioner Kaalberg said he understood the logic of the side setback but had concerns about the front setback. Commissioner Bell agreed. Ms. Zeigler explained that staff found the proposed setback to be appropriate because of the irregular setbacks established along the street and because historically, corner lots often had a home that was a bit closer to the street than the interior lots. Commissioner Stewart explained that the proposed setback may be more appropriate since the house with the deeper setback has a larger massing and agreed that the established pattern is irregular.

Motion:

Commissioner Champion moved to approve the infill and setback determination with the conditions that:

- **The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;**
- **The maximum height of the infill as measured from grade shall not exceed the height of the historic house at 1113 Greenwood Avenue;**
- **Staff approve the final trim, roof color, windows, doors, fence, and parking pad material selections prior to purchase and installation;**
- **The front porch steps shall be concrete;**
- **The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house;**
- **More detailed drawings shall be provided prior to issuance of permit;**
- **All paired windows have a four to six inch (4"-6") mullion between windows; and,**
- **Staff approves the masonry color, dimensions and texture prior to purchase and installation.**

Finding that the project meets II.B.1 of the *Greenwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Design Guidelines*. Commissioner Cantrell seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

z. 1329 SECOND AVENUE NORTH

Application: Demolition; New construction-infill

Council District: 19

Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: MELISSA BALDOCK

Staff member, Melissa Baldock presented the multi-family project. 1329 Second Avenue North is an application to construct multi-family townhouses. The site is located at the northwest corner of Second Avenue North and Taylor Street (outlined in blue). The site is located outside the Germantown National Register of Historic Places Historic District – marked in red on this map, but within the local Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay – marked in grey on the map. Part of the overall development includes a lot at 1401 Second Avenue North that is not within either the Germantown Historic Preservation Overlay or the Germantown National Register district. MHZC does not have any authority to review that part of the development.

On the site are a 1987 brick and metal structure. Staff finds it to be non-contributing and finds its demolition to meet the design guidelines. The project meets all base zoning setbacks. Vehicular access to the lot will be via the alley, and each townhouse unit will have parking spaces at its lower level, rear.

The southern part of the lot, also known as Building B, abuts a row of historic houses. For this reason, the townhouse closest to the historic houses is setback to match the setback of the historic house next door. It also has a lower height at the front with the setback third story. This will help the transition from the row of historic houses to the multifamily development.

With the exception of the one townhouse that abuts the historic house, the all of the townhouses in the development have heights ranging from thirty-eight feet to forty feet (38’-40’) from grade to the top of the parapet, varying because of grade. All of the units have stair bulkhead units that are an additional five feet, six inches (5’6”) above the parapet. These stair bulkheads are setback from the front of the townhouses by thirteen to seventeen feet (13’ – 17’), which will help reduce their visibility. Staff finds that the townhouses’ height and scale meet the design guidelines.

The primary cladding material will be brick, with metal panels, stucco, and tile inlay accents. The windows will be aluminum. Staff finds that the known materials are appropriate, with the condition that staff approve all final material selections prior to purchase and installation.

Staff recommends approval of the project with several conditions listed in the staff recommendation.

Commissioners Champion, Kaalberg and Bell asked for clarification of design details. Commissioner Stewart noted that the proposal will be much more in keeping with the neighborhood than the industrial buildings there now.

Michael Ward and Brian Haas, architects for the project, explained how the design transitions from the historic context to a more typical townhouse rhythm. The sidewalk will be brick and widened to meet Public Works’ requirements. The entrances are stoops with planters next to them to take care of water runoff. He has also worked with the neighborhood on the design.

Commissioners Bell, Kaalberg and Cantrell thanked the designers for working with the historic context.

Sonya Link, 1308 6th Ave N, explained that the developer and architects have incorporated requests of the neighborhood and they appreciate quality developments being built in Germantown.

Motion:

Commissioner Stewart moved to approve the project with several conditions:

- **The preservation permit be issued only after the site has been rezoned from IR to MUL-A;**
- **Staff approve a brick sample for the primary cladding material;**
- **Staff approve the final color, dimensions, and texture of the metal paneling;**
- **Staff approve all window and door selections prior to purchase and installation;**
- **Staff approve the final design and material of the roof railing;**

- Staff approve the final material choice for the tile or cedar accent material;
- Staff approve the sidewalk material and the driveway material;
- The HVAC and other utilities be located on the roof of the structures, or on the rear, in the interior of the lot; and
- Staff approve the design and materials of all appurtenances, including, but not limited to, permanent planters, railings, lighting fixtures, and fences;

finding the project meets Sections 3.0, 5.0, and 7.0 of the Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay design guidelines. Commissioner Kaalberg seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

aa. 208-210 BROADWAY

Application: New construction-addition, Alterations

Council District: 06

Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: ROBIN ZEIGLER

Deferred at the request of the applicant.

V. PRELIMINARY SP REVIEW

There are no requests for a preliminary SP review.

VI. OTHER BUSINESS

bb. CLG TRAINING

Robin Zeigler presented a portion of a 4-hour realtor course regarding local preservation, including a review of the Secretary of Interior Standards. (15 min)

cc. ADMINISTRATIVE ACTIONS

RATIFIED BY COMMISSION ON 12/21/16.