



METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission
Sunnyside in Sevier Park
3000 Granny White Pike
Nashville, Tennessee 37204
Telephone: (615) 862-7970
Fax: (615) 862-7974

STAFF RECOMMENDATION
Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Extension
Gale Lane and Clayton Avenue
June 21, 2017

Application: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Expansion
Map and Parcel Numbers: multiple
Council Districts: 17
Applicant: Council Member Colby Sledge
Project Lead: Robin Zeigler, robin.zeigler@nashville.gov, 615-862-7970

<p>Description of Project: Councilmember Colby Sledge is requesting that extension of the Belmont Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay to include portions of Gale Lane and Clayton Avenue. (The existing overlay is Councilmember Allen’s district.)</p> <p>Recommendation Summary: Staff suggests the Commission recommend to Metro Council that the Belmont Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay be expanded and recommends that the Commission adopt the current design guidelines for the additional properties; finding the properties to meet the criteria of section 17.36.120.A.3 of the ordinance.</p>	<p>Attachments A: Partial Architectural Resource Survey B: Photographs</p>
--	---

Area to be expanded



Background:

The properties considered for the Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay are zoned R8.

The MHZC first met with four interested property owners on January 12, 2017 to discuss procedure and possibilities. The neighborhood hosted two informational meetings on January 20, 2017 at the Sevier Park Community Center and April 26, 2017 at MHZC's office. The neighborhood informed property owners of the meetings via emails/texts and notes in doorways.

Applicable Ordinance:

Article III. Historic Overlay Districts

17.36.120.A. Historic Districts Defined. Historic Preservation and Neighborhood Conservation Districts. These districts are defined as geographical areas which possess a significant concentration, linkage or continuity of sites, buildings, structures or objects which are united by past events or aesthetically by plan or physical development, and that meet one or more of the following criteria:

1. The district is associated with an event that has made a significant contribution to local, state or national history; or
2. It includes structures associated with the lives of persons significant in local, state or national history; or
3. It contains structures or groups of structures that embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction, or that represents the work of a master, or that possesses high artistic value, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction; or
4. It has yielded or may be likely to yield archaeological information important in history or prehistory; or
5. It is listed or is eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places.

Analysis and Findings:

The area includes homes constructed in the same era and styles as those found in the Belmont-Hillsboro National Register of Historic Places and the neighborhood conservation zoning overlay. The Belmont-Hillsboro neighborhood was listed based on the significance of the neighborhood's architectural character. The period of significance is generally from the 1890s to the late 1940s. The portions of Gale and Clayton that are proposed to be included match the historic context found in the National Register district.

Contributing buildings on these two streets date from 1928 to 1945 and include styles and forms typical of the existing overlay such as English Tudor and Colonial Revival styles and bungalow and minimal traditional forms. Most of the homes fit into the three of the

“seven distinctive categories” of architecture noted in the National Register nomination for Belmont-Hillsboro. One category is for twentieth century buildings that are one and one-half stories tall with neoclassical decorative treatment and are typically brick or lap sided. Another category is a bungalow, which “helps to impart the middle-middle class ambiance the district has.” The third relative category is the “modestly scaled English Tudor revival house.” These are typically one and one-half story houses which vary widely in their adherence to historic architectural precedents.”

The two streets retain a high degree of historic integrity with 68% contributing properties. Because the context is the same as the Belmont Hillsboro neighborhood that is already listed in the National Register of Historic Places, staff finds the two streets are eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places and therefore meets criterion 5 of section 17.36.120.A.3 of the ordinance.

Since the context is similar to that governed by the Belmont-Hillsboro NCZO design guidelines, the existing design guidelines are appropriate to guide change for the historic context found in the proposed extension.

Staff suggests the Commission recommend to Metro Council that the Belmont Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay be expanded and recommends that the Commission adopt the current design guidelines for the additional properties; finding the properties to meet the criteria of section 17.36.120.A.3 of the ordinance.

PARTIAL ARCHITECTURAL RESOURCE SURVEY

This information may change as buildings age and as new information becomes available.

PropHouse	PropStreet	Construction Date	Contributory status	Style/Form
1001	CLAYTON AVE	1938	NC	
1003	CLAYTON AVE	1945	C	minimal traditional
1005	CLAYTON AVE	1935	C	English Tudor
1007	CLAYTON AVE	1941	C	minimal traditional
1009	CLAYTON AVE	1942	C	minimal traditional
1011	CLAYTON AVE	1996	NC	
1013	CLAYTON AVE	1996	NC	
1015	CLAYTON AVE	1996	NC	
1017	CLAYTON AVE	1996	NC	
1101	CLAYTON AVE	1941	C	minimal traditional
1103	CLAYTON AVE	1940	C	English Tudor
1105	CLAYTON AVE	1941	C	English Tudor
1107	CLAYTON AVE	1941	C	minimal traditional
1109	CLAYTON AVE	1941	C	English Tudor
1111	CLAYTON AVE	1940	C	English Tudor
1113	CLAYTON AVE	1935	C	bungalow
1000	GALE LN	1940	C	minimal traditional
1006	GALE LN	2005	NC	
1008	GALE LN	1963	NC	
1010	GALE LN	1928	C	English Tudor
1012	GALE LN	1935	C	English Tudor
1014	GALE LN	1935	C	English Tudor
1016	GALE LN	1937	C	minimal traditional
1020	GALE LN	1940	C	English Tudor
1100	GALE LN	1937	C	English Tudor
1102	GALE LN	1940	C	English Tudor
1106	GALE LN	1940	C	English Tudor
3101	LEALAND LN	1938	C	Colonial revival

SAMPLE HISTORIC HOMES FOUND IN THE DISTRICT



1100 Gale Lane



1010 Gale Lane



1020 Gale Lane



1107 Clayton



3101 Lealand Lane



1103 Clayton Avenue



1113 Clayton Lane



109 Clayton Avenue