

MEGAN BARRY
MAYOR



METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission
Sunnyside in Sevier Park
3000 Granny White Pike
Nashville, Tennessee 37204
Telephone: (615) 862-7970
Fax: (615) 862-7974

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

**1621 Forrest Avenue
September 20, 2017**

Application: Demolition
District: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Council District: 06
Map and Parcel Number: 08310016300
Applicant: Todd Austin, owner
Project Lead: robin.zeigler@nashville.gov

Description of Project: Applicant requests to demolish house based on a recent fire.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval finding the request does not meet section III.B.1 for inappropriate demolition nor section III.B.2.a for appropriate demolition.

Attachments
A: Photographs
B: Site Plan
C: Elevations

Vicinity Map:



Aerial Map:



Applicable Design Guidelines:

III.B. Demolition

1. Demolition is not appropriate

- a. if a building, or major portion of a building, is of such architectural or historical interest and value that its removal would be detrimental to the public interest; or
- b. if a building, or major portion of a building, is of such old or unusual or uncommon design and materials that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced without great difficulty and expense.

2. Demolition is appropriate

- a. if a building, or major portion of a building, has irretrievably lost its architectural and historical integrity and significance and its removal will result in a more historically appropriate visual effect on the district;
- b. if a building, or major portion of a building, does not contribute to the historical and architectural character and significance of the district and its removal will result in a more historically appropriate visual effect on the district; or
- c. if the denial of the demolition will result in an economic hardship on the applicant as determined by the MHZC in accordance with section 17.40.420 (Historic Zoning Regulations), Metropolitan Comprehensive Zoning Ordinance.

Background: 1621 Forrest Avenue is a contributing building (c.1925) in the Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.



There was a fire originating in the basement and back of the house. According to the property owner, the fire took place in June of 2017. The applicant applied for a building permit to reconstruct the entire house with the Codes Department on August 7, 2017; however, it was rejected due to lack of plans. A demolition permit was requested the same day. At that time, there was a request of MHZC staff to sign-off on the demolition permit; however, we had not yet received an application for demo.

On August 30, Bluechip Restoration sent an application with plans for reconstruction but no information with which to review the demolition request. Demolition must be approved before reconstruction can be contemplated. The applicant was informed that, at a minimum, an engineer's report would be needed in order to apply for demolition. The applicant was told that an interior-only demo could be obtained from the Codes Department, as that action does not also require a Preservation Permit. Tim Walker,

director, and other staff members visited the property on September 1 and September 5th to observe the interior and exterior and found the front half of the home to be sound but again requested an engineer's report in order to conduct a proper analysis. In an attempt to further assist the property owner, the Director spoke with the owner's insurance company and the engineer hired by the owner to conduct the report. Via phone, the engineer confirmed that the front half of the building is sound.

Although not requested, but in an attempt to assist the property owner, MHZC staff issued a permit to demolish the rear of the home where the fire damage was evident and the reconstruction of the rear of the home. Legal representation for the applicant stated that they would still like to request full demolition.

As of September 14, 2017, MHZC staff has not received a complete application for demolition; therefore, the report is based on visits by staff.

Analysis and Findings:

Demolition:

The building is a contributing building to the Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay; therefore its removal would be "detrimental to the public interest." Full demolition does not meet section III.B. for appropriate demolition. Observation by staff showed the front half of the building, the section that provides a primary contribution to the character of the district, to be structurally sound. Removal of the rear of the portion does meet the design guidelines and so a permit for partial-demolition was issued administratively.

The building has suffered damage from a fire but staff finds that the damage is not extensive enough to meet section III.B.2.a for demolition. The fire was concentrated at the rear of the building and does not appear to be to have irretrievably damaged the integrity and significance of this historic building.

Recommendation:

Staff recommends disapproval finding the request does not meet section III.B.1 for inappropriate demolition nor section III.B.2.a for appropriate demolition.

APPENDIX I: PHOTOGRAPHS



Front of the house after fire damage.



Left side of house after fire damage



Right side, seen from the rear, after fire damage.



Right side of house seen after fire damage.



Images of home prior to fire damage.



Front room (with chimney) and middle room of the house showing smoke damage but no evidence of fire or structural damage.