

DAVID BRILEY  
MAYOR



**METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY**

Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission  
Sunnyside in Sevier Park  
3000 Granny White Pike  
Nashville, Tennessee 37204  
Telephone: (615) 862-7970  
Fax: (615) 862-7974

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION**  
**1722 Villa Place (Lookofskey-Primm House)**  
**April 18, 2018**

**Application:** Historic Landmark Overlay for 1722 Villa Place  
**Map and Parcel Number:** 10412029800  
**Council Districts:** 17  
**Applicant:** Councilmember Colby Sledge  
**Project Lead:** Robin Zeigler, [robin.zeigler@nashville.gov](mailto:robin.zeigler@nashville.gov), 615-862-7970

<p><b>Description of Project:</b> Applicant requests a Historic Bed and Breakfast overlay for 1722 Villa Place, The Lookofskey-Primm House.</p> <p><b>Recommendation Summary:</b> Staff suggests that the MHZC recommend to Council approval of a Historic Bed and Breakfast overlay for 1722 Villa Place with the conditions that a site plan is provided to Staff so that the location of parking and signage may be reviewed, the sign shall only include the address or property owner's name, materials for the sign be provided for review, and that the applicant provide proof that Fire Marshall has approved the structure for safety, finding the building meets section C.1.b and c of ordinance 17.36.120.</p> <p>Staff recommends that the design guidelines for the South Music Row neighborhood conservation zoning overlay be used to guide future exterior alterations, to be replaced in the future if a neighborhood conservation overlay is established for the Edgehill neighborhood with Edgehill's design guidelines.</p>	<p><b>Attachments</b> <b>A:</b> Photographs <b>B:</b> History of House</p>
---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

## Vicinity Maps



## Aerials



## Applicable Ordinance:

### 17.36.120 Historic districts defined.

#### C. Historic Bed and Breakfast Homestay.

1. An historic bed and breakfast homestay is defined as a building or structure containing three or fewer furnished guest rooms for pay within a private, owner-occupied historically significant structure. Meals may be provided to overnight guests, and the maximum stay for any guest shall be fourteen consecutive days. An historic bed and breakfast homestay shall meet one or more of the following criteria:
  - a. The historic bed and breakfast homestay is associated with an event that has made a significant contribution to local, state or national history;
  - b. It is associated with the lives of persons significant in local, state or national history;
  - c. It embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction, or that represents the work of a master, or that possesses high artistic value; or
  - d. It is listed or is eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places.
2. In addition to the criteria listed in subsection C.1. of this section, the historic bed and breakfast homestay shall satisfy the following conditions:
  - a. Exterior work proposed to be done will be subject to design review guidelines adopted by the metropolitan historic zoning commission for determining the architectural compatibility and historical significance of such work. The design review guidelines for neighborhood conservation districts shall apply to historic bed and breakfast homestays. The metropolitan historic zoning commission's approval of work shall be granted in writing as a condition for issuance of a zoning permit.
  - b. Owner-occupied. The owner of the property must reside permanently in the historic home. Where there is more than one owner of the home, or where an estate, corporation, limited partnership or similar entity is the owner, a person with controlling interest, or possessing the largest number of outstanding shares owned by any single individual or corporation, shall reside permanently in the historic home. If two or more persons own equal shares that represent the largest ownership, at least one of the persons shall reside permanently in the historic home.
  - c. No more than one off-street parking space shall be provided for each guest room. The commission shall advise on the appropriate location and potential adverse impacts caused by the off-street parking of vehicles, and may recommend fencing, screening and landscaping to buffer and protect surrounding residential properties.
  - d. No signs shall be permitted for advertising. An accessory residential sign, not to exceed the dimensions of one square foot of area, displaying the name and/or address of the owner may be permitted.
  - e. The bulk regulations of the district for a residence shall apply. Overnight guest rooms may be located within historically significant accessory structures.
  - f. The owner shall maintain and make available to the zoning administrator a guest register for each calendar year.
  - g. Meal service shall be restricted to overnight guests only; no cooking facilities shall be permitted in any guest room.
  - h. The metropolitan fire marshal shall approve the structure for safety.

(Ord. BL2005-701 § 2, 2005; Ord. 96-555 § 9.3(C), 1997)

### Background:

The lot formerly had a bed-and-breakfast use through a residential special exception with the BZA. At that time (2003) MHZC identified the building as qualifying for a Special Exception by meeting criteria 1-3. That method of providing the use was discontinued with the creation the Historic Bed and Breakfast Zoning Overlay and there is now a new owner.

## **Analysis & Findings:**

In 1865, the O.B. Hayes Rokeby Plan laid out an area for development that included 71 lots situated between and along Madison, Jackson, Rokeby, Jefferson, Bellemont, and Washington streets. The plan was registered in June 1867. There were several owners of the property (originally 1724 Villa Place) before Mike and Anna Lookofskey purchased it in 1925. They likely constructed the dwelling as the house appears in real estate ads c.1927-1928.

The Masons purchased the home in 1930 staying there until 1942, and only briefly had other occupants living at this residence with them—Robert and LaVern West in 1933. In 1944 the Masons signed a 15-year restrictive covenant barring ownership or occupancy by African-Americans, though the Supreme Court ruled this to be an illegal practice in 1948.

Howard T. and Edythe Primm purchased the property in 1955 but it remained vacant in '55 and '56. The property remained in the Primm family (later under the estate of Charlotte Primm) until it was sold in 2003.

Howard T. Primm was licensed to preach in 1920, admitted to the TN Annual Conference in 1921, ordained deacon in 1922, and an elder by 1928. A Nashville native, Primm (who attended Pearl High) had been appointed as the pastor at Trinity A.M.E., South Nashville District, A.M.E. Church by Bishop R.C. Ransom in 1927 and served there until 1928. During this time, he also served as Secretary for Religious Work at the Nashville Y.M.C.A; later, he was a delegate in the First World Youth Conference in Amsterdam (1939), and a delegate to the World Methodist Conference in Oxford England (1951). He and Edythe also established a Harvest Center, the Sarah Allen Child Care Center, Well Baby Clinic, Teen-Junction and Sherman L. Green Four Freedoms Building in New Orleans, receiving a special commendation from the mayor for these contributions.

In 1956, Primm joined twelve others from the Council of Bishops of the African Methodist Church in appealing to President Eisenhower to act against the persecution of African-American leaders in the Montgomery, AL bus boycotts. An active member of the NAACP and Urban League, he spoke out against school segregation after a 1957 speech by Governor Frank Clements saying, “[the A.M.E. Church] was founded as a protest against segregation and continues to protest it in all its forms.” He challenged Clement’s comments as being misleading, that the African Methodist Church founding was not rooted in African-Americans wanting segregation. On Easter Sunday 1957, Bishop Primm baptized 1,700 persons in Texas; around this time, he was assigned as the new bishop of the 13th Episcopal Diocese in Nashville, where he presided over six conferences of the diocese in Tennessee and Kentucky. He had come from the A.M.E. Church’s Fourth Episcopal District, which included Indiana, Illinois and Michigan. He served as the national president of the Board of Education of the A.M.E. Church and chairman of the Publication Board of the church; he was also a trustee of Shorter College and Campbell College.

Edythe, who was also active with the NAACP, served as supervisor of the Womens' Missionary Society of the Fourth Episcopal District from 1968 until her death in 1975.

During the Primms' residency in Nashville, they spent most of it living in the house on Villa Place; from 1952 to 1972, Bishop Primm served Episcopal congregations in other states and was known as the A.M.E. Church's Senior Bishop (71st elected). He presided as Bishop over the A.M.E. Church's 4th, 5th, 10th and 13th Districts and retired in 1980, having been the only bishop elected president of the General Board for two successive terms.

The overall form of the building and its character defining features such as the front, exterior, chimney, paired windows, front porch and stone/stucco veneer remain intact. There was an outbuilding shown on the 1931 Sanborn maps that was gone by 1941. A porte cochere was added behind the original front/side porch sometime between 1957 and 1985.

### **Analysis of Eligibility:**

The property is significant for its architecture, meeting criterion c, and for its association with a couple who were important participants in Nashville's Civil Rights movement and the A.M.E. Church thereby meeting criterion b.

### **Analysis of Criteria:**

Exterior Work: Metro Legal determined that exterior work associated with a Special Exception Historic Bed and Breakfast still needs to follow the design requirements of a neighborhood conservation zoning overlay. Exterior work was done without obtaining a Preservation Permit; however, staff finds it to be appropriate and signed-off on the building permit. The work included a small rear addition and deck.



Figure 1: Work done without a Preservation Permit but that meets the design guidelines.

Owner-occupied: The applicant for the overlay states that the owner, Todd Baldree, is the primary resident, according to an email sent on 3/21/2018 by Kasey Hodges.

Parking: Ms. Hodges states that there will be five off-street parking spaces accessed from Wedgewood. The overlay allows for three parking spaces for each guest room. Assuming the other two are to be used by the owner, Staff finds the number of parking spaces to be appropriate. Staff requests a site plan so that the location of the parking space may be reviewed.

Signage: The applicant proposes a sign that meets the size requirements of the ordinance and includes a logo. The ordinance states that signage may include the name or address of the owner and shall not advertise. Staff finds that a logo is not a property owner name or an address and so recommends the condition that the signage only include the address or property owner's name.

Design Guidelines: The ordinance requires that properties designated as a Historic Bed and Breakfast follow the design guidelines for Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlays (NCZO); however, there are multiple NCZOs. Staff recommends use of the South Music Row NCZO design guidelines as it is geographically the closest NCZO and the architectural context is similar to 1722 Villa Place. The Edgehill neighborhood is in the process of exploring the possibility of an NCZO for their neighborhood. The study area includes 1722 Villa Place. If the overlay is established, whether or not the boundaries end up including 1722 Villa Place, staff recommends use of that set of design guidelines for future changes since that set of design guidelines will be what other nearby properties follow.

### **Recommendation:**

Staff suggests that the MHZC recommend to Council approval of a Historic Bed and Breakfast overlay for 1722 Villa Place with the conditions that a site plan is provided to Staff so that the location of parking and signage may be reviewed, the sign shall only include the address or property owner's name, materials for the sign be provided for review, and that the applicant provide proof that Fire Marshall has approved the structure for safety, finding the building meets section C.1.b and c of ordinance 17.36.120.

Staff recommends that the design guidelines for the South Music Row neighborhood conservation zoning overlay be used to guide future exterior alterations, to be replaced in the future if a neighborhood conservation overlay is established for the Edgehill neighborhood with Edgehill's design guidelines.

**ATTACHMENT A: PHOTOGRAPHS**



1975



1985



2018



2018