

JOHN COOPER  
MAYOR



**METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY**

Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission  
Sunnyside in Sevier Park  
3000 Granny White Pike  
Nashville, Tennessee 37204  
Telephone: (615) 862-7970  
Fax: (615) 862-7974

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION**  
**1501 Fatherland Street**  
**February 19, 2020**

**Application:** Demolition

**District:** Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

**Council District:** 06

**Base Zoning:** R6

**Map and Parcel Number:** 08313041400

**Applicant:** Laura Magliochetti

**Project Lead:** Paul Hoffman; paul.hoffman@nashville.gov

<b>Description of Project:</b> This report serves as a supplement to the January 2020 recommendation.	<b>Attachments</b> <b>A:</b> Minutes <b>B:</b> Photographs <b>C:</b> Consultant's Report
---	---

**Background:** At the January 2020 meeting, the applicant chose to defer to allow time for Commissioners to walk-thru the house and to gain the opinion of a consultant. Attached are minutes from the walk-thru, photographs from the walk-thru and the consultant's report.

**JOHN COOPER  
MAYOR**

**METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY**



Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission  
Sunnyside in Sevier Park

**METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC)  
MINUTES  
January 22, 2020**

**Commissioners Present:** Chairperson Menie Bell, Vice Chair Cyril Stewart, Kaitlyn Jones  
**Zoning Staff:** Tim Walker, Robin Zeigler, Sean Alexander, Melissa Baldock, Paul Hoffman, Melissa Sajid, Jenny Warren  
**Applicants:** Joshua Duckworth (part-owner), Brandon Knox (realtor), Matt Hagerty (engineer)  
**Public:** None in attendance

The meeting began at 10 a.m. at 1501 Fatherland Street. The purpose of the special call meeting was to review a historic home that has submitted an application for demolition due to economic hardship. The meeting was led by consultant, Pierre Howell, whose services were paid for by the Lockeland Springs Neighborhood Association and Metro Historical Commission Foundation.

The house was in the following condition, preventing viewing of all aspects of the building. The presumably plaster walls were covered with faux paneling, wood paneling and wall board. Floors were covered with wall-to-wall carpeting and vinyl. The attic was not accessible. The front of the house was not viewable from the basement, because the front of the house has very little space between the framing and the ground.

Mr. Howell noted that in the front-right room there is a hole in the floor beneath a window and the flooring around the hole was spongy. At that point, the foundation is below grade. Mr. Howell surmised that the wall was being held in place by compression but that the foundation could be repaired by scabbing onto an existing joist and with some exterior excavation to gain access. He agreed that the grade on the right side was causing an issue but could easily be addressed.

The bathroom and kitchen, Mr. Howell found to be in good condition despite the fall in the floor system. He indicated that the floor seemed to be somewhat solid.

In answer to a question from a Commissioner, Mr. Duckworth said that the house has been empty and without heat for two and a half years.

Mr. Howell found no issues in the back-left room which is a later addition with a concrete block foundation.

Mr. Hagerty, the applicant's engineer, explained the moisture issues have caused settling but there was no way to know when that settling took place. The brick foundation has crumbled and is not serviceable. Mr. Hagerty has lifted and leveled approximately fifty houses in seven years that had falls of between one inch and three inches. He said that settlement of this amount is a normal range and is repairable. Three inches to five inches might also be possible but this house has up to ten inches of fall from the front of the house to the original rear wall of the house. (The addition was not included since it could be removed.) He has only seen two houses this bad out of the thousands he has reviewed. Mr. Howell said that he has seen homes in

a similar or worse state be rehabbed. In Mr. Hagerty's experience the house would have to be temporarily lifted, leveled and a new foundation added. Due to the extreme amount of settling, leveling the house to an acceptable level, as he acknowledged that old houses did not need to be perfectly level, would break every connection, and all connections would have to be reconnected or replaced. Every feature and construction element would have to be replaced or reconfigured. He also noted that most engineers will not warranty their work.

Mr. Howell said that he has seen homes banded and lifted with hydraulics and a new central girder added, but he could not say whether or not that was a feasible action since he is not familiar with the real estate values or current costs.

Chairperson Bell asked about contractors who have looked at the house. Mr. Duckworth responded that he has not found anyone who will do the work and provide a warranty, which is important to him since he will be reselling the house.

Mr. Knox said that there is probably lead paint in the house and that will be an added expense. Mr. Howell said that hazardous materials can often be addressed with abatement measurements without any special needs, and the health department provides for some exceptions to rules for residential buildings. For instance, lead paint can be primed and painted without having to be sanded and asbestos that is not broken can be covered.

Mr. Howell and Mr. Hagerty observed that the left side wall of the house near the front was bowed out. Mr. Hagerty explained that the brick foundation was rotating outward, pulling the sill and the bottom of the wall with it.

Mr. Duckworth explained that he was concerned about all the unknown factors of the building. Mr. Hagerty indicated with a level how the center north-south wall is no longer plumb and said that the entire house has twisted. Mr. Howell noted that this was likely due to the different foundations and he agreed that leveling would likely require wall repair or replacement. While inspecting the basement, Mr. Howell and commissioners observed the central girder has twisted and crushed.

After the meeting, Mr. Howell said to Ms. Zeigler that his recommendation would be to remove all the interior elements to lighten the load on the house in preparation for releveling and to allow access for repairing of the flooring system, especially on the front of the house since it was not accessible from below.

The meeting adjourned just after 11 a.m. and was followed by a walk-thru for several neighborhood association board members; however, commissioners were not present for that meeting. Ms. Zeigler and Mr. Howell did attend the majority of the meeting with the neighborhood representatives. The information provided for Commissioners was reiterated for the board members. Board members stressed that the goal of the neighborhood is to preserve the historic character and they noted the many homeowners have tackled major foundation and other types of structural issues but have preserved their homes. Mr. Duckworth explained that the project is a resale and that he does not plan to live in the home. The board members asked that if the home is approved for demolition, that the applicant work with them on the design of the new building.

Following are photographs taken by Chairperson Bell and commissioner Jones during the walk-thru of the building.

















**Pierre Howell**  
**P H Residential Structural Services**  
**(615) 490 5563**

INSPECTION REHABILITATION COMMENTARY FOR  
1501 FATHERLAND NASHVILLE, TN 37206

Background

This report was created to highlight some of the noted and obvious deficiencies viewed during an onsite walk through on January 2, 2020 with members of the Metro Historic Zoning Commission. Other concerned parties also attended for Q and A, regarding this structure.

The issues observed are typical of buildings of this age. All buildings can be rehabilitated, the question for the Commission will be to determine if the amount or type of repairs needed to bring the building up to code is a reasonable action.

I am not an estimator and so have not reviewed the provided rehab estimates in order to assess their reasonableness. I was unable to access the attic space and therefore cannot comment on the condition or potential needed repairs of the roofing materials or roofing system. I did not inspect the plumbing and electrical systems.

Recommendation

Most of the concerns for stabilizing the house and replacing defective material are with the load bearing wall, girder, right-front room, and front-entry room.

The walls could be braced temporarily with a board band across the top plate area where roof loads transfer. The bracing would have to go through existing floor surface material to solid material on stable soil in the crawl space. This would relieve pressure off the wall and floor structure so that proper repairs can be made. Wall surface material should be removed in these areas to properly address the deformation and to maintain structural integrity. Once structurally secured new interior walls and floors could be added any other areas could be shimmed out while preserving the exterior facade.

Full removal of all the walls and floors is not necessary. It would be quite normal for a house of this age to have some flooring and walls a little out of plumb. French drains and other measures could be installed to prevent future water intrusion on the right side.

These solutions are common for a house with these issues. A reasonably sound living structure can be had with the right technicians and materials.

**About Pierre Howell:**

Pierre Howell provides residential structural services and is certified by International Code Congress. He has more than 30 years of experience. Mr. Howell served as zoning examiner with Metro from 2013-2016 and a building inspector from 1992-2013. As a structural inspector he inspected New Residential One and Two structures, as well as the Renovations of existing Historical and Traditional Housing. Inspections performed, but not limited to, are as follows: Footing and Foundations, Structural Framing Integrity, Energy Code Compliance and Final Inspections for Use and Occupancy. From 1985-1992 he enforced the correction of substandard housing violations and environmental issues with the Metro's Property Standard's division. Mr. Howell has personally renovated more than a dozen homes in which he and his family lived, some of which were more than 80 years of age. From 2016 to present he has been a Site Project Manager for a Development Firm, Private Residential Consultant, Plans Reviewer/ Inspector in Montgomery, AL. and a Certified Combination Inspector in Gallatin, TN. that included Electrical, Plumbing, Mechanical and Building Inspections. A graduate of Nashville State Technical Institute. His national international certifications include:  
ICC BUILDING CODE INSPECTOR, ICC RESIDENTIAL COMBINATION INSPECTOR, ICC CERTIFIED HOUSING CODE OFFICIAL, ICC PROPERTY MAINTENANCE & HOUSING INSPECTOR, CABO ONE & TWO FAMILY INSPECTOR, CABO BUILDING INSPECTOR, ICC LEGAL and MANAGEMENT Certified, STATE OF TENNESSEE BUILDING INSPECTOR LICENSE, CONTINUING EDUCATION HOURS FOR STATE AND NATIONAL REQUIREMENTS, QUALIFIED CREDENTIALLED INSPECTOR for EROSION CONTROL.