WOODLAWN WEST NCZO

Comparison of existing design guidelines to consolidated draft from September MHZC public hearing.

Pg #	*Existing Language*	Pg #	Proposed Language	Reason for Change
5	10 Secretary of Interior Standards	5	**I. Introduction** D. Secretary of Interior standards [Added revised language.]	In recent years the National Park Service has made minor alterations to the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation. The revision is captured in this document. If the document is not approved, this section will still be revised as it is italicized and therefore not an official part of the design guidelines.
8	*Italicized sections of the guidelines contain interpretive information that is meant to make the guidelines easier to understand; they are not part of the guidelines themselves. Illustrations are intended only to provide example buildings and circumstances. It is important to remember that every building is different and what may be appropriate for one building or site may not be appropriate for another.*	6	**II.Design Guideline Principles** A. Italicized sections of the guidelines contain interpretive information that is meant to make the guidelines easier to understand; they are not part of the guidelines themselves. Illustrations are intended only to provide example buildings and circumstances. It is important to remember that every building and site is different and what may be appropriate for one building or site may not be appropriate for another.	Text is the same. Changed from italicized to non-italicized to make the information a part of the design guidelines.
n/a		6	**II. Design Guideline Principles** B. The design guidelines for neighborhood conservation zoning overlays consists of at least two parts. Part I includes basic design guidelines that apply to all neighborhood conservation zoning overlays. Part II includes chapters specific to each district, as well as maps and short histories. Both parts should be considered when planning a project. When Part I of the design guidelines conflicts with a district-specific design guideline in Part II, the district-specific design guidelines shall prevail. When designing a new outbuilding, applicants have the option of following direction in Part I or a specific form in Part III.	This is new language to explain the three different parts of the consolidated design guidelines.
8	**II. New Construction and Additions** A.1. These guidelines shall apply only to the exteriors of buildings and to portions of proposed structures that would be visible from public rights-of-way. *New free-standing buildings less than 100 square feet in area and that do not have a foundation and are located at the rear of a property, are not required to comply with the design guidelines.* [Also removed the drawing showing where additions could be constructed without a permit.]	6	**II. Design Guideline Principles** C. These guidelines shall apply to the exteriors of buildings, new construction in-whole or in-part, demolition in-whole or in-part, and moving a building. D. The following actions that do not require the removal of a historic feature(s) may not require a Preservation Permit. (These actions may still require a Building Permit. Please check with Codes Department before proceeding with work.) **Site** Fences and walls that are not attached to a structure. (See Building a Fence in Davidson County) Structures without a roof such as some playground equipment Uncovered patios that are flush with existing grade and do not extend into setbacks Yard art (structure without a roof or foundation) All plants, including trees, bushes, flowers, etc. (Structures to accommodate living elements may require review.) In-ground pools that do not include above-ground decking or structures Resurfacing existing driveways, walkways, or parking pads Uncovered accessibility ramps **Buildings**	The drawing currently in this section of the design guidelines shows an area where if an addition fits into that area, it would not need to be reviewed. A related concern is that the text portion of the design guidelines, which attempts to state what is reviewed, is confusing in that one section states that the design guidelines only apply to areas that are visible from the public right-of-way and the next section states that public facades are more carefully reviewed than others, insinuating that all facades are reviewed. Since the establishment of the first overlay, the Commission has interpreted these sections as a review of all sides of any new construction but applying a less stringent review of those facades that are not publicly visible. The proposed solution is to replace the image with a list of actions that would not require review. Removing the image is not likely to cause a hardship for applicants as the Commission only receives 1 or 2 requests a year for additions that would meet the conditions of Figure 1. By the time staff gathers enough information to determine a review is not needed, staff has enough information to just go ahead and issue the permit. Permits for small additions typically have been issued, and will continue to be issued, within a couple of days.

			New free-standing buildings and structures that are less than 100 square feet, do not have a permanent foundation, and are located to the rear of the property. Garden or play structures that do not have a permanent foundation, do not have sides, and are less than 200 square feet. Screening in of porches, when the screening does not require the removal of porch posts and does not require additional framing. Uncovered rear and side decks that are close to grade (does not create usable space underneath) and do not extend into setbacks. Replacement of window sashes and doors that maintains historic casings and the opening's dimensions and locations. Hoods over entrances that do not require posts and, do not extend wider than two feet beyond each side of the door trim, and do not extend more than three feet deep. Installation of fabric window and door awnings that do not extend wider than two feet beyond each side of the window or door trim, and do not extend more than three feet deep. Solar panels that are parallel with the existing roof slope Skylights that are parallel with the existing roof slope and have a combined square footage no larger than 15 square feet on any given roof plane. Replacement roofing materials (not including roof framing) Paint color Replacement railings or posts on existing porches Roof color	This list of actions that do not require review follow the policy of several decades with several new items: solar panels, skylights and roof color. In the past, those three actions have required review. We also recommend clarifying the text to meet the interpretation of the last several decades.
9	**II. New Construction and Additions** A.2. The public facades -- front- and street-related sides -- of proposals for new buildings shall be more carefully reviewed than other facades. For through lots (lots which adjoin two streets which are opposite and parallel to one another) review of rear additions shall be given the same consideration as for all other lots in the district. *Specifically for corner lots, because they are visible from a public street, a secondary elevation and outbuilding is reviewed similarly to a primary elevation.*	7	**II. Design Guideline Principles** E. The public facades—front- and street-facing sides—of proposals for new buildings shall be more carefully reviewed than other facades.	Simplified language with the same result.
9	**II. New Construction and Additions** A.3. New buildings should not imitate past architectural styles; they should reflect the era of their own construction. For an exception to this principle, see number 4. *This principle precludes the "theme park effect." Fake old buildings are not appropriate. New buildings inspired by historic styles, but identifiable as new construction, can be appropriate.*	6	**II. Design Guideline Principles** F. New buildings do not need to imitate past architectural styles but should be similar to historic forms and massings found in the district. New buildings inspired by historic styles and forms, but identifiable as new construction, are appropriate.	Language revised to provide clarity.
10	**II. New Construction and Additions** A.4. Reconstruction may be appropriate when it accurately reproduces a no-longer existing building on its original site, if the building (1) would have contributed to the historic and architectural character of the area; (2) will be compatible in terms of style, height, scale, massing, and materials with the buildings immediately surrounding it; and (3) is accurately based on documentary, physical, or pictorial	7	**II. Design Guideline Principles** H. Reconstruction may be appropriate when it accurately reproduces a no-longer existing building on its original site, if the building (1) would have contributed to the historic and architectural character of the area; (2) will be compatible in terms of style, height, scale, massing, and materials with the buildings immediately surrounding it; and (3) is accurately based on documentary, physical, or pictorial	No change to this section.

	evidence.		evidence.	
10	**II. New Construction and Additions** A. 5. Continuous construction in Woodlawn West during the early and mid 20th century resulted in a variety of building types and styles that illustrate the evolution of architectural styles and technology over the years. New buildings should continue this tradition while complementing and being visually compatible with surrounding historic buildings. . 6. New construction should respect, and not disrupt, the established pattern and rhythm of existing historic buildings on the same and opposite sides of a street.	9	**II. Design Guideline Principles** I. Some districts have had continuous construction over a wide period of time that has resulted in a variety of building types and styles, while others have a more consistent development pattern. New buildings should continue the tradition of the individual neighborhood while complementing and being visually compatible with surrounding historic buildings.	Added the word "Some" as this language now applies to all NCZOs and not all have a variety of building types and styles.
11	**II. New Construction and Additions** **B.a. Height** The height of the foundation wall, porch roof(s), and main roof(s) of a new building shall be compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with those of surrounding historic buildings.	18	**V. New Construction-Infill** **A. Massing & Scale** 1. The height of the foundation wall, porch roof(s), walls, and ridges, and the width of a new building should be compatible with surrounding historic buildings on the block face of the same building type. Where there are block faces with little historic context, the adjoining blocks may be used.	Rather than saying "by not contrasting greatly" the revised language states that the massing and scale should be appropriate for the context. This language is more in keeping with the Secretary of Interior Standards. The draft adds clarity for how "context" will usually be determined, which is the "block face." Using context far away from a proposed project has been a concern voiced by numerous neighborhoods over multiple years. The commission will retain the ability to define "block face" in situations where that is unclear or expand the context beyond the block face where the immediate context is not considered relevant.
11	**II. New Construction and Additions** **B.b. Scale** The size of a new building and its mass in relation to open spaces shall be compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with surrounding historic buildings. *Foundation lines should be visually distinct from the predominant exterior wall material. This is typically accomplished with a change in material.*	7	**II. Design Guideline Principles** G. The size of a new building and its mass in relation to open spaces shall be compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with surrounding historic buildings.	No change but reorganized. The italicized information from this section was moved to the material section.
11	**II. New Construction and Additions** **B.c. Setback and Rhythm of Spacing** The setback from front and side yard property lines established by adjacent historic buildings should be maintained. Generally, a dominant rhythm along a street is established by uniform lot and building width. Infill buildings should maintain that rhythm. *The Commission has the ability to determine appropriate building setbacks and extend height limitations of the required underlying base zoning for new construction, additions and accessory structures (ordinance no. 17.40.410).* *Appropriate setbacks will be determined based on:* *The existing setback of the contributing primary buildings and accessory structures found in the immediate vicinity;* *Setbacks of like structures historically found on the site as determined by historic maps, site plans or photographs;* *Shape of lot;* *Alley access or lack thereof;*	21	**V. New Construction-Infill** **C. Siting, Setback, Orientation and Rhythm of Spacing** 1. In most residential districts, lots had a primary building facing the street. Any additional buildings on the lot were typically secondary structures that were subordinate in size to the primary building and located in the rear yard. New development should follow this pattern. 2. The setback from front- and side-yard property lines established by adjacent historic buildings should be maintained. 3. There should be a minimum of 20' between primary buildings and outbuildings. 4. The Commission has the ability to determine appropriate building setbacks of the required underlying base zoning for new construction, additions, and accessory structures (ordinance no. 17.40.410). a. Front setbacks generally should be the average between the historic front setbacks established on either side of the proposed infill.	Provided additional clarity on precedents set over the years for interpretation of this design guideline. New language provides specificity regarding front setbacks. The 20' feet between buildings was a requirement developed several years ago to interpret the existing design guidelines for maintaining open space and was a reaction to ongoing public comment that the "open space" design guideline was being ignored and that infill and additions were getting too large, taking up the entirety of rear yards.

	Proximity of adjoining structures; and *Property lines.* *Appropriate height limitations will be based on:* *Heights of historic buildings in the immediate vicinity* *Existing or planned slope and grade*		b. Side setbacks should maintain the dominant rhythm along a street established by building widths and spaces between buildings. Infill buildings should maintain that rhythm even when lots are subdivided. c. Rear setbacks are determined based on a combination of bulk standards and an appropriately-scaled building for the district. d. When a building is unable to meet bulk standard setback requirements, appropriate setbacks will be determined based on: The existing setback of the contributing primary buildings and accessory structures found in the immediate vicinity; Setbacks of like structures historically found on the site as determined by historic maps, site plans, or photographs; Shape of lot; Alley access or lack thereof; Proximity of adjoining structures; Property lines; and, Easements.	
11	**II New Construction and Additions** **B.c Setback and Rhythm of Spacing** *In most cases, an infill duplex should be one building, as seen historically in order to maintain the rhythm of the street. Detached infill duplexes may be appropriate in the following instances:* *There is not enough square footage to legally subdivide the lot but there is enough frontage and width to the lot to accommodate two single-family dwellings in a manner that meets the design guidelines;* *The second unit follows the requirements of a Detached Accessory Dwelling Unit; or* *An existing non-historic building sits so far back on the lot that a building may be constructed in front of it in a manner that meets the rhythm of the street and the established setbacks.*	n/a	[Moved.]	Reorganized. This information can be found in section V.B. New Construction
12	**II. New Construction and Additions** **d. Materials, Texture, Details, and Material Color** The materials, texture, details, and material color of a new building's public facades shall be visually compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with surrounding historic buildings. Vinyl and aluminum siding are not appropriate. *T-1-11- type building panels, "permastone", E.F.I.S. and other artificial siding materials are generally not appropriate. However, pre-cast stone and cement fiberboard siding are approvable cladding materials for new construction; but pre-cast stone should be of a compatible color and texture to existing historic stone clad structures in the district; and cement fiberboard siding, when used for lapped siding, should be smooth and not stamped or embossed and have a maximum of a 5" reveal. The reveal for lap siding should not exceed 5". Larger reveals may be possible but should not exceed 8" and shall have mitered corners.* *Shingle siding should exhibit a straight-line course pattern and exhibit a maximum exposure of seven inches (7").*	14	**IV. MATERIALS, TEXTURE, DETAILS AND MATERIAL COLOR** Please see "Partial Demolition" for replacement siding. A. The texture, details, and dimensions of new materials for replacement or new construction shall be visually compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with surrounding historic buildings. Historic materials are appropriate and replacement materials should mimic historic materials in texture, dimensions, and workability. Materials that create a false version of a historic material are not appropriate. For instance, a "wood-grain" fiber-cement lap siding creates a texture that did not exist historically, as wood cladding historically had a smooth finish. 1. Paint color and roof color are not reviewed. The inherent color, texture and dimensions of masonry is reviewed. *It is recommended that if multiple colors are used for a roof that they be used to create a pattern, as seen historically, rather than creating a "speckled" or random design.*	The material section has been pulled out of "new construction" as its own section and been revised to provide a longer list of appropriate and inappropriate materials. Most of it remains italicized so that the Commission can easily address whatever new materials might become available in the future. It is not best-practices to include such a list as formal design guidelines but providing it as italicized information will allow the Commission flexibility in review while also providing guidance to applicants. Staff is proposing that roofing color no longer be reviewed. No one has asked for a color that has been disapproved, to staff's memory. Historically asphalt shingle came in a multitude of colors. In addition, roofing materials are not a permanent change to a building.

	Four inch (4”) nominal corner boards are required at the face of each exposed corner. *Stud wall lumber and embossed wood grain are prohibited.* *Belt courses or a change in materials from one story to another are often encouraged for large two-story buildings to break up the massing.* *When different materials are used, it is most appropriate to have the change happen at floor lines.* *Clapboard sided chimneys are generally not appropriate. Masonry or stucco is appropriate.* *Texture and tooling of mortar on new construction should be similar to historic examples.* *Asphalt shingle is an appropriate roof material for most buildings. Generally, roofing should not have strong simulated shadows in the granule colors which results in a rough, pitted appearance; faux shadow lines; strongly variegated colors; colors that are too light (e.g.: tan, white, light green); wavy or deep color/texture used to simulate split shake shingles or slate; excessive flared form in the shingle tabs; uneven or sculpted bottom edges that emphasize tab width or edges, unless matching the original roof.* *Generally front doors should be 1/2 to full-light. Faux leaded glass is inappropriate.*		*2. Inappropriate materials include:* *<u>Foundations</u>* *Stone veneer without mortar* *Concrete block without a parge coating* *<u>Cladding</u>* *Synthetic sidings such as vinyl, aluminum, permastone and E.F.IS.* *T-1-11- type building panels* *stud wall lumber* *embossed wood grain.* *<u>Chimneys</u>* *Fiber cement panels* *Lap siding* *<u>Roofing</u>* *Corrugated metal* *Snap-lock standing seam metal with big seams* *Metal made to look like a traditional materials such as wood shingles, slate or clay/terra cotta* *<u>Windows</u>* *Brass cames on leaded or stained glass windows.* *3. Appropriate materials include:* *<u>Foundations</u>* *Continuous or piers of pre-cast stone, split-face concrete block , parge coated concrete block, or brick as long as the primary cladding is not the same material as the foundation* *Foundation lines should be visually distinct from the predominant exterior wall material. This is typically accomplished with a change in material at the floor line.* *<u>Cladding</u>* *Smooth-finished cement fiberboard or smooth-finished wood lap siding are both appropriate. The siding should be not be stamped or embossed.* *Shingle siding is only appropriate for an upper level or a feature such as a bay.* *Fiber-cement or wood panels, board-and-batten, and half-timbering are only appropriate as accent materials.* *When different cladding materials are used on one building, it is most appropriate to have the change happen at floor lines.* *Masonry cladding should have the color, dimensions, textures, and mortar tooling of like historic examples.* *Four inch (4”) nominal corner boards are required at the face of each exposed corner of a frame building, unless the lap siding is mitered.* *All wood, or materials to substitute for wood, should be milled and painted, with the exception of shingles which could be painted or stained.* *<u>Chimneys</u>* *Masonry or stucco is appropriate for chimneys.* *<u>Roofing</u>* *Asphalt and architectural shingles, slate and slate substitutes, and metal*	Staff is proposing to no longer review siding reveal. The current practice is for all lap siding to have a reveal with a maximum of 5”. There is no record as to how the requirement was initially determined but it may have been considered an average or a typical reveal. Since historic siding comes in a variety of reveals, Staff recommends no longer reviewing the reveal for new construction. This is in reaction to ongoing comments from applicants and a councilmember.

			are appropriate roofing materials. Clay tile, or clay tile substitutes may be appropriate in areas where this a common historic roofing material. *Clay tile ridges are appropriate.* *Types of appropriate metal roofing include 5-V, low-profile snap-lock ,rolled standing seam* <u>*Trim & Architectural Features*</u> *All wood or materials to substitute for wood should be milled and painted.* *Composite materials are appropriate for trim and decking* B. Windows with single-light sashes are appropriate for new construction. If using multi-light sashes, muntins should be fully simulated and bonded to the glass, and exhibit an interior bar, exterior bar, as well as a spacer between glass panes. C. Four inch (nominal) casings are required around doors, windows, and vents on non-masonry buildings. Trim should be thick enough to extend beyond the clapboard. Paired and ribbons of multiple single– or double-hung windows should have a four inch to six inch (4" to 6") mullion in between each. D. Brick molding is required around doors, windows, and vents within masonry walls but is not appropriate on non-masonry buildings.	
12	**II. New Construction and Additions** **B. e. Roof Shape** The roof(s) of a new building shall be visually compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with the roof shape, orientation, and pitch of surrounding historic buildings. *Roof pitches should be similar to the pitches found in the district. Historic roofs are generally between 6/12 and 12/12.* *Roof pitches for porch roofs are typically less steep, approximately in the 3-4/12 range.* *Generally, two-story residential buildings have hipped roofs.* *Generally, dormers should be located on the roof. Wall dormers are not typical in the historic context and accentuate height so they should be used minimally and generally only on secondary facades. When they are appropriate they should be no wider than the typical window openings and should not project beyond the main wall.*	19	**V. New Construction-Infill** **B. Form** 1. The most appropriate building and roof forms for new construction are ones that are similar to historic buildings on the block face and buildings that are typical for the overall district. Considerations are the general form and orientation of the main massing of the building and roof pitches, shape, and orientation. 2. In most areas, residential roof pitches of the main form of a building are between 6/12 -12/12. Porches generally had lower pitches or were flat. 3. Dormers should be fully located on the roof; wall dormers and recessed dormers are generally not appropriate on the front and side facades, as they are not common or not found historically in most districts. The dimensions and forms of dormers visible from the street should be compatible with dormers found historically in the district. Generally, this can be accomplished with the following: a. The number of dormers and their location and size should be appropriate to the style and design of the building. Often the width of roof dormers relate to the openings below. The symmetry, or lack of symmetry within a building's design, should be used as a guide when placing dormers. b. Dormers should not be located on secondary roof planes. c. Eave depth on a dormer should match main roof form's eave depth or be less. d. The roof form of the dormer should match the main roof form of the building or be appropriate for the style. e. The roof pitch of the dormer should generally match the pitch of historic	Clarified that it is not just the roof form that is reviewed but the overall form. Provides guidance for dormers that have been followed for several years.

			dormers on the building or the roof pitch of the main roof form of the building. f. The side walls of the dormer should be inset at least two feet (2') from the side walls of the building or adjacent valley. g. The front wall of the dormer should be setback a minimum of two feet (2') from the wall below. (These minimum insets will likely be greater than two feet (2') when following the guidelines for appropriate scale.) h. Dormers should generally be fully glazed and aprons below the window should be minimal. i. The exterior material cladding of side dormers should match the primary or secondary material of the main building.	
13	**II. New Construction and Additions** **f. Orientation** The orientation of a new building's front facade shall be visually consistent with surrounding historic buildings. *Porches* *New buildings should incorporate at least one front street-related porch that is accessible from the front street.* *Side porches or Porte cocheres may also be appropriate as a secondary entrance, but the primary entrance should address the front.* *Front porches generally should be a minimum of 6' deep, have porch racks that are 1'-3' tall and have posts that include bases and capitals.*	20	**V. New Construction-Infill** **B. Form** 4. New buildings should have a primary entrance oriented towards (facing) the street. In most districts, a primary entrance is defined by a projecting or recessed porch. If the historic context supports such, decorative entrances, hoods above entrances, covered stoops, and vestibule entrances could be appropriate substitutions for a porch. a. Generally, porches should be a minimum of six feet deep (6') with a visible porch beam that is 18"-36" in height and with posts that include bases and capitals.	Change from italicized—not a part of the design guidelines--to actually be part of the design guidelines in order to follow precedent and interpretation of the design guidelines over the years.
13	**II. New Construction and Additions** **f. Orientation** *Parking areas and Driveways* *Generally, curb cuts should not be added.* *Where a new driveway is appropriate it should be two concrete strips with a central grassy median.* *Shared driveways should be a single lane, not just two driveways next to each other. Sometimes this may be accomplished with a single lane curb cut that widens to a double lane deeper into the lot.*	20 and 22	**V. New Construction-Infill** **B. Form** 5. Porte-cocheres are only appropriate where they are typical of historic forms found in the district and should only be added to new buildings that have a similar form to those that historically had porte-cocheres. **C. Siting, Setback, Orientation, and Rhythm of Spacing** 5. Parking pads and outbuildings should be located at the rear of the lot. 6. Vehicular storage shall not be a part of a new primary building with a residential form unless lot constraints prevent a detached outbuilding or unless the attached garage can be fully located at the basement level and accessed from the rear or side, inset a minimum of four feet from the main side wall of the house. 7. Driveways from the street are appropriate if there is an existing curb-cut or if the lot lacks an alley. When a driveway is appropriate, it should not exceed twelve feet in width and should extend to at least the rear of the building. 8. New buildings should be connected to the street with a walkway from the porch/entrance to the street/sidewalk/curb. 9. New infill buildings should be oriented to (facing) the shortest street-facing side	Added language to follow precedent and interpretation of the design guidelines over the years.

			of a lot.	
13	**II. New Construction and Additions** **f. Orientation** *Duplexes* *Infill duplexes shall have one or two doors facing the street, as seen on historic duplexes. In the case of corner lots, an entrance facing the side street is possible as long as it is designed to look like a secondary entrance.* *In the case of duplexes, vehicular access for both units should be from the alley, where an alley exists. A new shared curb cut may be added, if no alley and no driveway exists, but the driveway should be no more than 12' wide from the street to the rear of the home. Driveways should use concrete strips where they are typical of the historic context. Front yard parking or driveways which end at the front of the house are not consistent with the character of the historic neighborhoods.*	20 and 22	**V. New Construction-Infill** **B. Form** 6. Some properties are zoned for two residential units on one lot. On such lots that meet all the qualifications for two units, the two units should be fully attached, with a single mass (in what looks like one building) with one or two front doors and meet all the requirements for infill. Detached infill duplexes may be appropriate in the following instances: a. The second unit follows the design guidelines for an outbuilding. b. There is not enough square footage to legally subdivide the lot, but there is enough frontage and depth to the lot to accommodate two single-family dwellings in a manner that meets the design guidelines and historic context and is more appropriate for the context than a single building. c. The lot has double frontage and is deep enough to accommodate two buildings and associated parking in a manner that meets the design guidelines and historic context. d. An existing, non-contributing building sits so far back on the lot that a building may be constructed in front of it in a manner that better meets the design guidelines than existing conditions. It is not appropriate to add a new house in front a contributing house. **C. Siting, Setback, Orientation, and Rhythm of Spacing** 10. In the case of duplexes on a corner lot, entrances or porches that face the rear or sides should look like secondary entrances and porches, even if the entry/porch serves as the primary entrance to one of the units.	Change from italicized—not a part of the design guidelines--to actually be part of the design guidelines in order to follow precedent and interpretation of the design guidelines over the years. In addition, the design guidelines state that a house should not be constructed in front of a historic primary dwelling, an interpretation of the design guidelines for decades.
n/a		21	**V. New Construction-Infill** **B. Form** 7. Building types generally should be consistent with the types in the immediate vicinity, no matter the actual use of the building. For instance, a lot zoned commercially but located within an area of residential building types should be similar in form to the residential building types in the immediate vicinity. 8. Roof decks are not appropriate on the front or side of infill but may be appropriate on the rear if the deck is surrounded on all sides by an appropriately-pitched roof.	Added language regarding issues and features that were not contemplated at the time the design guidelines were first written. The draft provides clarity on how building types relate to zoning. The building types should be consistent with the types in the immediate vicinity, no matter how the lot might be zoned. For instance, a new building on a commercially zoned property in a neighborhood of residential building types should follow a residential building type.
13	**II. New Construction and Additions** **f. Orientation** *Multi-unit Developments* *For multi-unit developments, interior dwellings should be subordinate to those that front the street.* *Subordinate generally means the width and height of the buildings are less than*	n/a	[Removed]	The draft does not include the italicized guidance for multi-unit developments as staff found that, in most cases, multi-unit developments result in: encouragement of demolition of historic buildings; alterations and additions that are not appropriate for the historic building; or require infill that is not appropriate for the district. Therefor they should be a rare occurrence and having the design guidelines seemed to suggest that they would be approved anywhere. In addition, where multi-unit developments are appropriate, the site is usually so unique that the italicized design

	the primary building(s) that faces the street. *For multi-unit developments, direct pedestrian connections should be made between the street and any interior units. The entrances to those pedestrian connections generally should be wider than the typical spacing between buildings along the street.*			guidelines are of little use. Staff recommends addressing each of these requests on a case-by-case basis.
14	**II. New Construction and Additions** **B. g. Proportion and Rhythm of Openings** The relationship of width to height of windows and doors, and the rhythm of solids (walls) to voids (door and window openings) in a new building shall be compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with surrounding historic buildings. *Window openings on the primary street-related or front façade of new construction should be representative of the window patterns of similarly massed historic structures within the district.* *In most cases, every 8-13 horizontal feet of flat wall surface should have an opening (window or door) of at least 4 square feet. More leniencies can be given to minimally visible side or rear walls.* *Double-hung windows should exhibit a height to width ratio of at least 2:1.* *Windows on upper floors should not be taller than windows on the main floor since historically first floors have higher ceilings than upper floors and so windows were typically taller on the first floor.* *Single-light sashes are appropriate for new construction. If using multi-light sashes, muntins should be fully simulated and bonded to the glass, and exhibit an interior bar, exterior bar, as well as a spacer between glass panes.* *Four inch (nominal) casings are required around doors, windows and vents on non-masonry buildings. Trim should be thick enough to extend beyond the clapboard. Double or triple windows should have a 4" to 6" mullion in between.* *Brick molding is required around doors, windows and vents within masonry walls but is not appropriate on non-masonry buildings.*	23	**V. New Construction-Infill** **D. Proportion and Rhythm of Spacing** 1. The relationship of width to height of windows and doors, and the rhythm of solids (walls) to voids (door and window openings) in a new building shall be compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with surrounding historic buildings. 2. Window openings on the primary street-related or front façade of new construction should be representative of the window patterns of similarly massed historic structures within the district. In most cases, every eight to thirteen horizontal feet of flat wall surface should have an opening (window or door) of at least four square feet. More leniency can be given to minimally visible side or rear walls. Wide openings for sliding glass doors or roll-up doors are not appropriate on front or side elevations. 3. Double-hung windows should exhibit a height to width ratio of at least 2:1, where double-hung windows are a typical feature of the neighborhood. Generally, windows on upper floors should not be taller than windows on the main floor since historically first floors have higher ceilings than upper floors and so windows were typically taller on the first floor, if not the same height.	Change from italicized—not a part of the design guidelines--to actually be part of the design guidelines in order to follow precedent and interpretation of the design guidelines over the years and moved some information to the materials section. Also provided more flexibility for new historic districts that might not follow the same type of window ratios and patterns that are prevalent in the turn-of-the-20th century districts that existed at the time the language was first written.
14	**II. New Construction and Additions** *(Although the MHZC does not review use itself there are additional ordinance requirements for buildings that are or have a Detached Accessory Dwelling Unit (DADU) required by ordinance 17.16.030 that are reviewed by the MHZC. This information is provided for informational purposes only and does not replace ordinance 17.16.030.)* B.h.1. A new garage or storage building should reflect the character of the period of the house to which the outbuilding will be related. The outbuilding should be compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with surrounding historic outbuildings in terms of height, scale, roof shape, materials, texture, and details. *This guidelines references detached outbuildings. Please see h.2. for information about attached garages.* *Outbuildings: Height & Scale* *On lots less than 10,000 square feet, the footprint of a DADU or outbuilding shall not exceed 750 square feet or fifty percent of the first floor area of the principal structure, whichever is less.* *On lots 10,000 square feet or greater, the footprint of a DADU or outbuilding*	32	**VII. New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures** **A. General Principles** 1. In 2019, the Commission approved an outbuilding form book. (See Part III.). Most projects matching one of the "pre-approved" plans may receive an administrative permit. The following guidelines are for projects that do not follow one of the options in Part III. 2. Alterations to existing outbuildings should not exceed the parameters of the Plan Book or these design guidelines. 3. New free-standing buildings and structures that are less than 100 square feet, do not have a permanent foundation, and are located to the rear of the property, do not require a preservation permit. 4. Garden or play structures that do not have a permanent foundation, do not have sides, and are less than 200 square feet do not require a preservation permit. 5. Parameters provided by the Plan Book or these design guidelines is per lot and should not be considered as a maximum per unit, in cases where zoning allows for	Made italicized information unitalicized and incorporated guidance that has been used by the Commission for years. Reference Part III-Form Options book Simplified the "formula" for outbuildings since there is also the option of forms in Part III. Added that garden structure under 200 square feet also do not need to be reviewed. This is a repeat from earlier in the design guidelines. Revised language provides maximum heights and square footage but no longer ties them to the same on the principal building to be more in keeping with the concept of the form options in Part III. The revised language provides a maximum for wall heights rather than eave heights as the real concern is with wall heights which can increase the perception of height or massing.

	shall not exceed 1000 square feet. *The DADU or outbuilding shall maintain a proportional mass, size, and height to ensure it is not taller or wider than the principal structure on the lot. The DADU or outbuilding height shall not exceed the height of the principal structure, with a maximum eave height of 10' for one-story DADU's or outbuildings and 17' for two-story DADUs or outbuildings. The roof ridge height of the DADU or outbuilding must be less than the principal building and shall not exceed 25' feet in height.*		more than one unit. 6. The Commission recognizes that new outbuildings cannot meet the scale and massing of historic outbuildings and still allow for modern uses so has created base dimensional requirements to ensure that new outbuildings and revisions to existing outbuildings still take into consideration the historic context. 7. How an outbuilding can be used is reviewed by the Metro Department of Codes & Building Safety. **B. Massing & Form** 1. The footprint of an outbuilding should not exceed 750 square feet, except in the case of lots that exceed 10,000 square feet. In those cases, the footprint shall not exceed 1000 square feet. 2. Ridge heights shall not exceed 25' from existing grade. 3. Maximum foundation shall not exceed one foot from existing grade on the corner of the building that sits on the highest area of existing grade. (Grade may need to be adjusted for water runoff but should not be built up for the sole purpose of increasing building height.) 4. On outbuildings behind primary buildings that are one and one-half stories, wall heights shall not exceed eleven feet as measured from top of finished floor/slab . On outbuildings behind primary buildings that are two or more stories, wall heights shall not exceed 17' from existing grade as measured from top of finished floor/slab. Walls shall be measured where the sidewall and the roof intersect, regardless of whether the soffits are of an open or closed design. 7. Eaves should not extend more than two feet.	
15	**II. New Construction and Additions** *B.h.1. Outbuildings: Character, Materials and Details* *Historically, outbuildings were either very utilitarian in character, or (particularly with more extravagant houses) they repeated the roof forms and architectural details of the houses to which they related. Generally, either approach is appropriate for new outbuildings. DADUs or out buildings located on corner lots should have similar architectural characteristics, including roof form and pitch, to the existing principal structure.*	n/a	**VII. New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures** [Removed.]	Created a new section for materials that cover material guidance for all types of new construction. Removed that outbuildings should have "similar characteristics" to the primary building because historically, outbuildings were not always designed to match the primary building.
15	**II. New Construction and Outbuildings** B.h.1. *DADUs or outbuildings with a second story shall enclose the stairs interior to the structure and properly fire rate them per the applicable life safety standards found in the code editions adopted by the Metropolitan Government of Nashville.*	33	**VII. New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures** **B. Massing & Form** 5. Stairs to another level, not counting stairs to access a porch or stoop, should be interior.	New language to provide clarity.
15	**II. New Construction and Additions** ***B.h.1. Outbuildings: Roof*** *Roof slopes on simple, utilitarian buildings do not have to match the roof slopes of the main structure, but generally should maintain at least a 4/12 pitch.*		**VII. New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures** **B. Massing & Form** 4. Roof slope of the outbuilding shall be at least 4/12.	Simplified the measurement for dormers. Previously dormer widths were measured by comparing the width of the dormer from wall-to-wall to the width of the building from eave-to-eave. Now both elements will be measured in the same way.

	The DADU or outbuilding may have dormers that relate to the style and proportion of windows on the DADU and shall be subordinate to the roof slope by covering no more than fifty percent of the roof plane and should sit back from the exterior wall by 2'. (The width of the dormer shall be measured from side wall to side wall and the roof plane from eave to eave.)		6. Dormers shall be subordinate to the roof by covering no more than fifty percent of the linear measurement of the roof plane as measured from wall to wall of both the outbuilding and the dormer. Dormers should step back from the wall below by at least two feet.	
15	**II. New Construction and Additions** ***B.h.1. Outbuildings: Windows and Doors*** *Publicly visible windows should be appropriate to the style of the house.* *Double-hung windows are generally twice as tall as they are wide and of the single-light sash variety.* *Publicly visible pedestrian doors must either be appropriate for the style of house to which the outbuilding relates or be flat with no panels.* *Metal overhead doors are acceptable on garages when they are simple and devoid of overly decorative elements typical on high-style wooden doors. Decorative raised panels on publicly visible garage doors are generally not appropriate.* *For street-facing facades, garages with more than one-bay should have multiple single doors rather than one large door to accommodate more than one bay.*	n/a	[Removed.]	Removed section about windows and doors as outbuildings are not required to have either, or even required to have walls. Because the structure is an outbuilding, windows, if present, should not need to match the primary building.
16	**II. New Construction and Additions** ***B.h.1. Outbuildings: Siding and Trim*** *Brick, weatherboard, and board-and-batten are typical siding materials.* *Exterior siding may match the existing contributing building's original siding; otherwise, siding should be wood or smooth cement-fiberboard lap siding with a maximum exposure of five inches (5"), wood or smooth cement-fiberboard board-and-batten or masonry.* *Four-inch (4" nominal) corner-boards are required at the face of each exposed corner.* *Stud wall lumber and embossed wood grain are prohibited.* *Four-inch (4" nominal) casings are required around doors, windows, and vents within clapboard walls. Trim should be thick enough to extend beyond the clapboard. Double or triple windows should have a 4" to 6" mullion in between. Brick molding is required around doors, windows, and vents within masonry walls but is not appropriate on non-masonry clad buildings.*	n/a	[Removed.]	Removed information about materials as there is a separate "material" section that provides information for all types of new construction.
16	**II. New Construction and Additions** B.h.2.. Outbuildings should be situated on a lot as is historically typical for surrounding historic buildings. ***Setbacks & Site Requirements*** *Setbacks & Site Requirements.* *Generally new outbuildings should be placed in rear yards, close to the rear property line. Outbuilding may be as close as 3' to the rear property line. (Appropriate setbacks approved by Commission on 6/21/17 and notes in Rules of Order and Procedure.)* *Generally, an attached garage is not appropriate on Kimpalong Avenue or Wilson Boulevard; however, it could be appropriate on those two streets,*	33	**VII. New Construction-Outbuildings & Garden Structures** **C. SITING AND SETBACKS** 1. Generally new outbuildings should be placed in rear yards, close to the rear property line, or in the original location of an historic accessory structure. Outbuildings may be as close as 5' to a rear or side property line, with the exception of corner lot which should be a minimum of 10' from the street-side property line or 20' if the garage doors face the side street.	Removed information regarding "attached garages" as that is dealt with in the "additions" section. Simplified setback requirements. Previously, outbuildings less than 700 square feet in footprint could be 3' from the side property line. We are now recommending that an outbuilding be at least 5' from any property line because outbuildings have gotten larger than they were when the 3' minimum was first established. District specific information was moved to Part II.WW.A.1 and 2.

	if the grade drops enough to allow the garage to be fully at the basement level and the garage doors face the rear of the lot. *Attached garages are appropriate on Ensworth Avenue. If attached, non-basement level garages should not exceed one-story. Street-facing elevations should have openings similar to the rest of the house and the historic context. Rollup doors should face the rear or the side of the lot. Garage doors facing Ensworth and Woodlawn are not appropriate, but garage doors facing Montgomery Bell Avenue could be appropriate since there are no houses fronting Montgomery Bell. If facing the side of the lot, the wall with the doors should stepback from the side wall of the house by at least ten feet (10'). (See April 2019 outbuilding policy approved for this neighborhood as part of review for 200 Ensworth Avenue for background on attached garages.)* *· For corner lots, the DADU or outbuilding should match the context of homes on the street. If there is no context, the street setback should be a minimum of 10'.* *· There should be a minimum separation of 20' between the principal structure and the DADU or outbuilding.*			
17	**II. New Construction and Additions** ***B.h.2.Driveway Access.*** *On lots with no alley access, the lot shall have no more than one curb-cut from any public street for driveway access to the principal structure as well as the detached accessory dwelling or outbuilding.* *On lots with alley access, any additional access shall be from the alley and no new curb cuts shall be provided from public streets.* *Parking accessed from any public street shall be limited to one driveway for the lot with a maximum width of twelve feet.*	33	**VII.New Construction-Outbuildings & Garden Structures** **C.Siting & Setbacks** 2. On lots with no alley access, the lot shall have no more than one curb-cut from any public street for driveway access to the primary structure as well as outbuilding. On lots with alley access, any additional access shall be from the alley and no new curb cuts shall be provided from public streets. Parking accessed from any public street shall be limited to one driveway for the lot with a maximum width of twelve feet.	No change in guidelines, just simplified language.
17	**II. New Construction and Additions** ***B.h.2.Additional Requirements for DADUs from Ordinance 17.16.030. See requirements for outbuildings for additional requirements.*** *The lot area on which a DADU is placed shall comply with Table 17.12.020A.* *The DADU may not exceed the maximums outlined previously for outbuildings.* *No additional accessory structure shall exceed two hundred square feet when there is a* *DADU on the lot.* *Density.* *A DADU is not allowed if the maximum number of dwelling units permitted for the lot has been met or if the lot has been subdivided since August 15, 1984.* *Ownership.* *a. No more than one DADU shall be permitted on a single lot in conjunction with the principal structure.* *b. The DADU cannot be divided from the property ownership of the principal dwelling.* *The DADU shall be owned by the same person as the principal structure and one of the two dwellings shall be owner-occupied.* *Prior to the issuance of a permit, an instrument shall be prepared and recorded with the register's office covenanting that the DADU is being established accessory to a principal structure and may only be used under the conditions*	n/a	**VII.New Construction-Outbuildings & Garden Structures** [Removed.]	Codes has made a commitment to review DADU requirements that are not associated with bulk standards and exterior design and with determining what is a DADU and what is a detached duplex; therefore, all references to DADUs has been removed.

	listed here. *Bulk and Massing.* *The living space of a DADU shall not exceed seven hundred square feet.*			
17	**II. New Construction and Additions** ***i. Utilities*** *Utility connections such as gas meters, electric meters, phone, cable, and HVAC condenser units should be located so as to minimize their visibility from the street.* *Generally, utility connections should be placed no closer to the street than the midpoint of the structure. Power lines should be placed underground if they are carried from the street and not from the rear or an alley.*	22	**V. New Construction-Infill** **C.Siting, Setback, Orientation and Rhythm of Spacing** 11. Utility connections such as gas meters, electric meters, phone, cable, and HVAC condenser units should be located so as to minimize their visibility from the street. Generally, utility connections should be placed no closer to the street than the mid-point of the structure. Power lines should be placed underground, if they are carried from the street and not from the rear or an alley.	Change from italicized—not a part of the design guidelines--to actually be part of the design guidelines in order to follow precedent and interpretation of the design guidelines over the years.
17	**II. New Construction and Additions** ***j. Public Spaces*** *Landscaping, sidewalks, signage, lighting, street furniture and other work undertaken in public spaces by any individual, group or agency shall be presented to the MHZC for review of compatibility with the character of the district.* *Generally, mailboxes should be attached to the front wall of the house or a porch post. In most cases, street-side mailboxes are inappropriate.*	22	**V. New Construction-Infill** **C.Siting, Setback, Orientation and Rhythm of Spacing** 12. Where sidewalk-accessed mailboxes are rare, new mailboxes should be placed on the front wall or a porch post. 13. Landscaping, sidewalks, signage, lighting, street furniture, and other work undertaken in public spaces (Metro owned and public right-of-way) by any individual, group or agency, shall be presented to the MHZC for review of compatibility with the historic character of the district.	Change from italicized—not a part of the design guidelines--to actually be part of the design guidelines in order to follow precedent and interpretation of the design guidelines over the years.
20	**II. New Construction and Additions** 2.a. Generally, an addition should be situated at the rear of a building in such a way that it will not disturb either front or side facades.	24	**VI. New Construction-Additions** **A. General Principles** 1. Additions to historic buildings should be compatible with the historic buildings to which they are attached. 2. Additions to non-contributing buildings should be considered in terms of new construction-infill, taking into account existing conditions and historic context. Existing conditions do not need to be altered to meet the design guidelines; however, if they are to be altered, the result must meet the design guidelines.	Wording changed to provide guidance on whether or not existing conditions might not need to be changed, matching decades of policy.
18	**II. New Construction and Additions** *2.a.Placement* *Placement* *Additions should be located at the rear of an existing structure.* *Connections to additions should, as much as possible, use existing window and door openings rather than remove significant amounts of rear wall material.* *Generally, one-story rear additions should inset one foot, for each story, from the side wall.* *Additions should be physically distinguished from the historic building and generally fit within the shadow line of the existing building.*	29 and 27	**VI. New Construction-Additions** B. **Mass Scale & Connection** 15. Vehicular storage such as garages, carports, and porte-cocheres should not be added to buildings where there is no historic evidence of such. An exception may be when a garage, that is part of an addition, is fully located at the basement level and accessed from the rear or accessed from the side and inset at least four feet from the back corner of the house. 16. When an addition includes a garage or roll up door/window, the door(s) should be located on the rear. (See outbuildings for guidance on attached garages.) Garage, roll up, or sliding glass doors on the side of an addition may be	Previously, much of this information was a reference to a different section. For clarity, we divided up new construction into different sections and repeated information rather than referencing a different section. It's this repetition that makes the new guidelines appear to be so much lengthier than the existing design guidelines.

appropriate if the wall that includes the door is stepped back from the primary side wall of the historic building by at least 4 feet.

C. Siting & Setback

1. The setback from front- and side-yard property lines established by the historic buildings should be maintained.

2. There should be a minimum of 20' between primary buildings and outbuildings.

3. The Commission has the ability to determine appropriate building setbacks of the required underlying base zoning for new construction, additions, and accessory structures (ordinance no. 17.40.410).

a. Front additions are rarely appropriate. When they are, such as a porch for a non-historic building, the new front setback generally should be the average between the historic front setbacks established on either side of the building.

b. Side setbacks for rear additions may maintain the existing side setback, if the primary building is historic.

c. Rear setbacks are determined based on a combination of bulk standards and an appropriately scaled building for the district.

d. When a building is unable to meet bulk standard setback requirements, appropriate setbacks will be determined based on:

- The existing setback of the contributing primary buildings and accessory structures found in the immediate vicinity;
- Setbacks of like structures historically found on the site as determined by historic maps, site plans, or photographs;
- Shape of lot;
- Alley access or lack thereof;
- Proximity of adjoining structures;
- Property lines; and,
- Easements.

4. New parking pads should be located at the rear of the lot.

5. New driveways from the street are appropriate if there is an existing curb-cut or if the lot lacks an alley. When a driveway is appropriate, it should not exceed twelve feet in width and should extend to at least the rear of the building.

6. In the case of duplexes on a corner lot, entrances or porches that face the rear or sides should look like secondary entrances and porches, even if the entry/porch serves as the primary entrance to one of the units.

7. Utility connections such as gas meters, electric meters, phone, cable and HVAC condenser units should be located so as to minimize their visibility from the street. Generally, utility connections should be placed no closer to the street than the mid-point of the structure. Power lines should be placed underground, if they are carried from the street and not from the rear or an alley.

8. Where sidewalk-accessed mailboxes are rare, new mailboxes should be placed on the front wall or a porch post.

9. Landscaping, sidewalks, signage, lighting, street furniture, and other work undertaken in public spaces (Metro owned and public right-of-way) by any

			individual, group or agency, shall be presented to the MHZC for review of compatibility with the historic character of the district. **D. Proportion and Rhythm of Openings** 1. The relationship of width to height of windows and doors, and the rhythm of solids (walls) to voids (door and window openings) in an addition shall be compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with the historic building, or in the case of additions to non-historic buildings, with historic buildings in the vicinity. 2. Window openings should be representative of the window patterns of the historic building or in the case of additions to non-historic buildings, with historic buildings in the vicinity. Wide openings for sliding glass doors or roll-up doors are not appropriate on side elevations, unless stepped back from the primary side wall of the historic building by at least 4 feet. 3. Double-hung windows should exhibit a height to width ratio of at least 2:1, where double-hung windows are a typical feature of the neighborhood. Generally, windows on upper floors should not be taller than windows on the main floor since historically first floors have higher ceilings than upper floors and so windows were typically taller on the first floor, if not the same height.	
19	*In order to assure than an addition has achieved proper scale, the addition should:* *· No matter its use, an addition should not be larger than the existing house, not including non-historic additions, in order to achieve compatibility in scale. This will allow for the retention of small and medium size homes in the neighborhood. The diversity of housing type and size is a character defining feature of the historic districts.*	26	**VI. New Construction-Additions** **B. Mass, Scale & Connection** 10. In order to achieve compatibility in scale, an addition should not be larger than the existing building. The diversity of housing type and size are character-defining features of the historic districts; therefore, it is not the goal of the overlay to ensure that all buildings can become the same size. Generally, the addition's footprint should not more than double the footprint of the historic building.	New language provides clarity on how the Commission has interpreted this design guideline.
19	**II. New Construction and Additions** *· Additions which are essentially a house-behind-a-house with a long narrow connector are not appropriate, as the form does not exist historically. Short or minimal connections that do not require the removal of the entire back wall of a historic building are preferred.* *· For additions that tie into the existing roof, the addition should be a minimum of 6" below the existing ridge.*	26	**VI. New Construction-Additions** **B. Mass, Scale & Connection** 11. Additions which are essentially a house-behind-a-house with a long narrow connector are not appropriate, as the form does not exist historically.	Existing italicized information is now not italicized. Removed the language that minimal amount of the rear wall should be removed for an addition. Although this would best meet the Secretary of Interior Standards, it is not realistic for modern needs and has not been required by the Commission.
19	**II. New Construction and Additions** **2.** *· Additions should generally be shorter and thinner than the existing building. Exceptions may be made when unusual constraints make these parameters unreasonable, such as:* *· An extreme grade change* *· Atypical lot parcel shape or size* *In these cases, an addition may rise above or extend wider than the existing*	25	**VI. New Construction-Additions** **B. Mass, Scale & Connection** 4. Rear additions that extend to be wider than the historic building may be possible when the applicant has exhausted other options and in the following conditions: The lot is unusually shallow for the historic context. The lot is wider than typical lots in the immediate vicinity. The historic building is narrower than 30 feet on a standard lot size.	Existing italicized information is now not italicized. When the Commission first allowed for additions to be taller and wider, it was supposed to be in rare conditions but has been considered an option for every addition; therefore new language has been added to explain the conditions where taller and wider additions might be possible.

	building; however, generally the addition should not be taller <u>and</u> extend wider. *When an addition needs to be taller:* *Whenever possible, additions should not be taller than the historic building; however, when a taller addition is the only option, additions to single story structures may rise as high as 4' above the shadow line of the existing building at a distance of 40' from the front edge of the existing building. In this instance, the side walls and roof of the addition must set in as is typical for all additions. The portion of the roof that can be seen should have a hipped, side gable or clipped gable roof to help decrease the visual mass of the addition.* *When an addition needs to be wider:* *Rear additions that are wider than an existing historic building may be appropriate when the building is narrower than 30' or shifted to one side of the lot. In these instances, a structural alcove or channel must separate the existing building from the new addition. The structural alcove should sit in a minimum of 1' and be at least twice as long as it is deep.* *In addition, a rear addition that is wider should not wrap the rear corner.*		The historic building is shifted greatly to one side of the lot on a typical lot size. The addition is designed to leave the corners of the building visible and intact and does not wrap around a corner. The rear addition does not also include an addition on the side of the historic building. Eaves and ridges of addition do not exceed the main corresponding elements of the historic building. The portion that extends beyond the side wall does not exceed one-story. The addition does not create a front parking pad by preventing a driveway from extending to the rear of the addition. 5. Rear additions that are taller than the historic building may be possible when the applicant has exhausted other options and in the following conditions: The grade rises steeply towards the rear of the lot The historic building is one or one and one-half stories tall and one to two-feet of additional height will allow for usable second-story space that otherwise is unavailable. Additions that are taller than the historic building are not appropriate on buildings that are two-stories or more. The proposed addition does not extend more than two-feet above the main roof form of the historic building. The portion of the proposed addition that extends taller than the historic building is all roof, as seen from the street No portion of the proposal increases the height of the historic building itself, only the addition, with the exception of "ridge raises."	
19	**II. New Construction and Additions** *2.Ridge raises* *Ridge raises are most appropriate for one-story, side-gable buildings, (without clipped gables) and that require more finished height in the attic. The purpose of a ridge raise is to allow for conditioned space in the attic and to discourage large rear or side additions. The raised portion must sit in a minimum of 2' from each side wall and can be raised no more than 2' of total vertical height within the same plane as the front roof slope.*	26	**VI. New Construction-Additions** **B. Mass, Scale & Connection** 6. Some one and one and one-half story, side-gabled, historic buildings may increase in height with a "ridge raise." The purpose of a ridge raise is to allow for conditioned space in the attic and to discourage large rear or side additions. As such, a ridge raise is inappropriate for a proposal that also adds more than 50% of the original footprint; adds additional stories; that includes an addition that is wider than the historic house; that includes a side addition; that includes a rooftop deck or that is proposed to be on a building that is two or more stories. Ridge raises may be used in the following ways and in the following conditions: The historic building is one or one and one-half stories The historic building has a side-gable roof form without clipped gables The raised portion sits in a minimum of two feet (2') from each side wall and is raised no more than two feet (2') of total vertical height within the same plane as the front roof slope.	Existing italicized information is now not italicized. Added information that an addition should not utilize a ridge raise AND a large addition. When ridge raises were first conceived of by the Commission, they were meant to be a way of adding usable space without adding to the footprint. It is not an action that staff has been able to find any other city in the country allows in their historic districts. The new language is an attempt to prevent too much alteration and new construction, to the extent that the project does not meet the Secretary of Interior Standards.
19	**II. New Construction and Additions** *2.Sunrooms* *Metal framed sunrooms, as a modern interpretation of early green houses, are appropriate if they are mostly glass or use appropriate cladding material for the district, are located at the rear in a minimally visible location, are minimally attached to the existing structure, and follow all other design guidelines for additions.*		**VI. New Construction-Additions** [Removed.]	Removed as "sunrooms" can be handled with the general design guidelines for new construction-additions.

19	**II. New Construction and Additions** *2. Foundation* *Foundation walls should set in from the existing foundation at the back edge of the existing structure by one foot for each story or half story. Exception: When an addition is a small one-room deep (12' deep or less) addition that spans the width of the structure, and the existing structure is masonry with the addition to be wood (or appropriate substitute siding). The change in material from masonry to wood allows for a minimum of a four inch (4") inset.* *Foundation height should match or be lower than the existing structure.* *Foundation lines should be visually distinct from the predominant exterior wall material. This is generally accomplished with a change in materials.*	25	**VI. New Construction-Additions** **B. Mass, Scale & Connection** 2. In order to assure that an addition has achieved proper scale, the addition should be shorter and narrower than the existing building. One story additions should set in at least 1' from the rear corner and two-story additions should set in at least 2' from the rear corner.	Changed italicized language to non-italicized. Removed the language that foundation lines should match up as that is not always feasible, depending on the grade. Removed the line that foundation lines should be visually distinct as that is dealt with in the "materials" section.
19	**II. New Construction and Additions** ***2.****Roof* *The height of the addition's roof and eaves must be less than or equal to the existing structure.* *Visually evident roof slopes should match the roof slopes of the existing structure, and roof planes should set in accordingly for rear additions.* *Skylights should not be located on the front-facing slope of the roof. Skylights should be flat (no bubble lenses) with a low profile (no more than six inches tall) and only be installed behind the midpoint of the building).*	25	**VI. New Construction-Additions** **B. Mass, Scale & Connection** 3. Generally, additions should not exceed the number of stories of the historic building to which it is attached. Exceptions to an addition not being narrower and shorter than the historic building follows in sections 4 and 5; however, an addition may not be both taller and wider. 7. Where an addition attaches to a historic roof form, it shall sit below the ridge of the roof, except in the case of "ridge raises." 8. The height of the addition's roof, eaves, and foundation should be less than or equal to the existing structure. 9. Visually evident roof slopes should match the roof slopes of the existing structure, and roof planes should set in accordingly for rear additions.	Italicized information is now not italicized and reworded to follow guidance given by the Commission in recent years. The review of skylights has been removed as the draft has skylights added to the section of actions that would not require review.
20	**II. New Construction and Additions** *2.Rear & Side Dormers* *Dormer additions are appropriate for some historic buildings as they are a traditional way of adding ventilation and light to upper stories.* *The addition of a dormer that would require the removal of historic features such as an existing dormer, chimneys, cupolas or decorative feature is not appropriate.* *Rear dormers should be inset from the side walls of the building by a minimum of two feet. The top of a rear dormer may attach just below the ridge of the main roof or lower.* *Side dormers should be compatible with the scale and design of the building. Generally, this can be accomplished with the following:* *New dormers should be similar in design and scale to an existing dormer on the building.* *New dormers should be similar in design and scale to an existing dormer on another historic building that is similar in style and massing.* *The number of dormers and their location and size should be appropriate to the style and design of the building. Sometimes dormer locations relate to the openings below. The symmetry or lack of symmetry within a building design should be used as a guide when placing dormers.* *Dormers should not be added to secondary roof planes.*	29	**VI. New Construction-Additions** **E. Roof Additions: Dormers & Decks** 1. Rooftop additions, other than dormers, are not appropriate for buildings with pitched roofs or for buildings with flat/parapet roofs that are less than four-stories. 2. Dormer additions are appropriate for some historic buildings as they are a traditional way of adding ventilation and light to upper stories. The addition of a dormer that would require the removal of historic features such as an existing dormer, chimneys, cupolas, or decorative features is not appropriate. 3. Front dormers should only be added to historic buildings when there is physical or pictorial evidence to show the building had a dormer, unless the specific district allows otherwise. 4. Rear dormers should be inset from the side walls of the building by a minimum of two feet (2'). 5. Side dormers should be compatible with the scale and design of the building. Generally, this can be accomplished with the following: a. New dormers should be similar in design and scale to an existing dormer on the building. If there are no existing dormers, new dormers should be similar in	Previously, much of this information was a reference to a different section. For clarity, we divided up new construction into different sections and repeated information rather than referencing a different section. Added guidance on rooftop decks, an action not contemplated at the time the design guidelines were first written.

	Eave depth on a dormer should not exceed the eave depth on the main roof. *The roof form of the dormer should match the roof form of the building or be appropriate for the style.* *The roof pitch of the dormer should generally match the roof pitch of the building.* *The ridge of a side dormer should be at least 2' below the ridge of the existing building; the cheeks should be inset at least 2' from the wall below or adjacent valley; and the front wall of the gable should setback a minimum of 2' from the wall below. (These minimum insets will likely be greater than 2' when following the guidelines for appropriate scale.)* *Dormers should generally be fully glazed and aprons below the window should be minimal.* *The exterior material cladding of side dormers should match the primary or secondary material of the main building.*		design and scale to an existing historic dormer or another historic building is similar in style and massing. b. The number of dormers and their location and size should be appropriate to the style and design of the building. Often the width of roof dormers relates to the openings below. The symmetry or lack of symmetry within a building's design, should be used as a guide when placing dormers. c. Dormers should not be added to secondary roof planes. d. Eave depth on a dormer should match a historic dormer on the building or the eave depth of the main roof. e. The roof form of the dormer should match the main roof form of the building or be appropriate for the style. f. The roof pitch of the dormer should generally match the pitch of historic dormers or the roof pitch of main roof form. g. The ridge of a side dormer should be at least two feet (2') below the ridge of the existing building; the sidewalls of the dormer should be inset at least two feet (2') from the wall below or adjacent valley; and the front wall of the dormer should setback a minimum of two feet (2') from the wall below. (These minimum insets will likely be greater than two feet (2') when following the guidelines for appropriate scale.) h. Dormers should generally be fully glazed and aprons below the window should be minimal. i. The exterior material cladding of side dormers should match the primary or secondary material of the main building. 6. Rooftop decks shall not be added to existing roof forms as they can dramatically change a historic roof form and are not typical of historic building forms. Rooftop decks are not appropriate on side additions or the side of rear additions but may be appropriate on the back or a rear addition if the deck is surrounded on all sides by an appropriately pitched roof, and if the addition does include a ridge raise and is no taller than the historic house.	
20	**II. New Construction and Additions** *Side Additions* b. The creation of an addition through enclosure of a front porch is not appropriate. The creation of an addition through the enclosure of a side porch may be appropriate if the addition is constructed in such a way that original form and openings on the porch remain visible and undisturbed. *The addition should set back from the face of the historic structure (at or beyond the midpoint of the building) and should be subservient in height, width and massing to the historic structure.* *Side additions should be narrower than half of the historic building width and exhibit a height of at least 2' shorter than the historic building.* *To deemphasize a side addition, the roofing form should generally be a hip or*	24	**VI. New Construction-Additions** **B. Mass, Scale & Connection** 1. An addition should be situated at the rear of a building in such a way that it will not disturb either front or side facades. Additions should be physically distinguished from the historic building and generally fit within the shadowline of the existing building. A side addition may be possible if all these conditions are met: a. The lot width exceeds 60 feet or the standard lot width on the block. b. The addition sits back from the face of the historic structure (at or beyond the midpoint of the building).	Changed italicized information to non-italicized and added guidance the Commission has developed in recent years.

	side-gable roof form		c. The addition is at least two feet (2') shorter than the primary massing of the historic building and one-story in height. d. The width of the side addition is approximately half the width or less of the primary massing of the historic building. e. The foundation is at or below the existing building's foundation. f. The roof form is hipped or side-gable roof form. g. The addition does not create a front parking pad by preventing a driveway from extending to the rear of the addition.	
n/a		27	**VI. New Construction-Additions** **B. Mass, Scale & Connection** 12. The creation of an addition through enclosure of a front porch is not appropriate. The creation of an addition through the enclosure of a side porch may be appropriate if the enclosure is constructed in such a way that the historic form, openings, and features of the porch remain visible and prominent. "Enclosure" does not include screening-in porches that do not require the removal of porch posts or the addition of substantial new framing. This type of screening is not reviewed. 14. Adding front porches to contributing houses that did not have a front porch historically is not appropriate. Additions of front porches to non-historic buildings may be possible if the resulting building has an appropriate front-setback.	Provided guidance regarding porch enclosures which is included in most other design guidelines.
21	**II. New Construction and Additions** 2. c. Contemporary designs for additions to existing properties are not discouraged when such additions do not destroy significant historical, architectural, or cultural material; and when such design is compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the property, neighborhood, or environment. *Side porch additions may be appropriate for corner building lots or lots more than 60' wide.*	24	**VI. New Construction-Additions** **A. General Principles** 3. Contemporary designs for additions to existing properties are not discouraged when such additions do not destroy significant historical, architectural, or cultural material; and when such design is compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with the size, scale, material, and character of the property, neighborhood, or environment.	Reorganized. Italicized information about side-porch additions is reflected in the guidelines for "side additions."
21	**II. New Construction and Additions** 2. d. A new addition should be constructed in such a manner that if the addition were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the original structure would be unimpaired. *Connections should, as much as possible, use existing window and door openings rather than remove significant amounts of rear wall material.*	27	**VI. New Construction-Additions** B. Mass, Scale & Connection 13. A new addition should be constructed in such a manner that if the addition were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic structure would be unimpaired.	No change-reorganized.

21	**II. New Construction and Additions** 2.e. Additions should follow the guidelines for new construction.		**VI. New Construction-Additions** **[Removed]**	Created separate sections for new construction-infill and new construction-additions and duplicated information in the two sections rather than referencing back to a different section.
23	**III.Demolition** **A. PRINCIPLE** The demolition of a building, or major portion of a building, which contributes historically or architecturally to the character and significance of the district is not appropriate and should be avoided.	10	**III.Demolition** A. **Principle** 1. The primary purpose of neighborhood conservation zoning overlays is to prevent demolition of historic buildings and their character-defining features. 2. The demolition of a building or major portion of a building, which contributes historically, culturally, or architecturally to the character and significance of the district, is not appropriate. 3. The historic character-defining features of a historic building should not be altered, removed, or destroyed. 4. Replacement windows and doors that do not change the dimensions and location of the openings is not considered partial-demolition and so is not reviewed. Replacement of historic casings for openings is not appropriate when the cladding is being replaced. 5. Replacement roofing material that does not require the removal of framing material and roofing details such as trim or roofing features such as chimneys is not considered partial-demolition and so is not reviewed. 6. The removal of a building's primary cladding material is considered partial-demolition because removal can weaken the structural integrity of most buildings. Replacement of secondary cladding material such as siding in a gable field or on dormer is not reviewed.	The section for demolition was moved to the beginning of the document to emphasize that the review of demolition is the most important role of the Commission. This section is currently unclear about demolition regarding non-historic buildings and demolition of features or "partial-demolition," so language was added to address those issues. Included in the proposed sections for "partial-demolition" is removal of siding. In a neighborhood conservation zoning overlay, replacement siding, windows, doors and roofing are generally not reviewed; however, if more than two are being replaced, they have been considered "partial-demolition." However, when all those features or even just the siding and windows are removed, the result is the actual demolition of the building. Siding on historic buildings also often contributes to the structure of a building. There have been cases where the building has collapsed once the siding has been removed; therefore, staff proposes to add removal of siding as an action that is reviewed. Replacement siding will still be appropriate where the siding is beyond repair.
		11	**III. Demolition** **B. 1. Partial-demolition of a structure** a. Character-defining features of historic buildings shall be retained. Partial-demolition of historic buildings is appropriate if the feature to be removed is not a character-defining feature. Examples of non-character-defining features are features that have lost historic integrity or that were added in recent years. b. Replacement of historic materials or features may be necessary in the case of extreme deterioration. In those cases, replacement materials and features should match the historic material and feature in terms of design, location, and dimensions. If the original is not known, it shall be similar to common historic examples on buildings of a similar style and form found in the neighborhood. Substitute materials may be appropriate if the material has the same dimensions, texture, design, and workability as the historic material. For instance, smooth-faced fiber-cement lap siding is a common substitute material for wood lap siding. c. Historic cladding shall be retained. It is appropriate to remove cladding installed over historic cladding material and repair the historic cladding. Lap	See previous.

			siding installed over or to replace historic masonry, or a masonry veneer installed over or to replace historic lap siding is not appropriate. When it is appropriate to replace siding, the casings of openings should be retained. And the new siding shall replicate the reveal and dimensions of the historic siding. d. Historic window and door dimensions and locations shall be retained. Limited changes to window and door openings may be appropriate on the rear or side facades, beyond the midpoint of the house, so long as the new window and door pattern meets the design guidelines for "proportion and rhythm of openings." e. Historic building wall dimensions, exterior cladding, and locations shall be retained. Generally, removal of the rear wall for an addition may be appropriate if the two rear corners are maintained. f. Partial-demolition of non-contributing buildings is appropriate if demolition does not result in a form or condition that would not meet the design guidelines for "new construction" or if partial-demolition brings the existing building closer to into compliance with the design guidelines for new construction.	
23	**III.B. Demolition** **Demolition is not appropriate** a. if a building, or major portion of a building, is of such architectural or historical interest and value that its removal would be detrimental to the public interest; or b. if a building, or major portion of a building, is of such old or unusual or uncommon design and materials that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced without great difficulty and expense. **Demolition is inappropriate** a. if a building, or major portion of a building, has irretrievably lost its architectural and historical integrity and significance and its removal will result in a more historically appropriate visual effect on the district; b. if a building, or major portion of a building, does not contribute to the historical and architectural character and significance of the district and its removal will result in a more historically appropriate visual effect on the district; or c. if the denial of the demolition will result in an economic hardship on the applicant as determined by the MHZC in accordance with section 17.40.420 (Historic Zoning Regulations), Metropolitan Comprehensive Zoning Ordinance.	12	**III. Demolition** **B. 2. Full-demolition of a structure** a. Historic buildings shall be retained unless the denial of the demolition will result in an economic hardship, as determined by the MHZC in accordance with section 17.40.420 (Historic Zoning Regulations), Metropolitan Comprehensive Zoning Ordinance. b. Full-demolition of non-contributing buildings is appropriate as they do not contribute to the historic character of the district.	Simplified to provide clarity.
24	**IV. Relocation**		[No changes to this section.]	n/a

25	**V. Definitions** ***Addition:*** *1. New construction that increases the habitable space of an existing structure, and is capable of being heated or cooled. 2. An alteration that changes the exterior height of any portion of an existing building, such as skylights, covered porches, covered decks, carports and Porte cocheres.*	37	**IX. Definitions** ***Addition:*** *New construction that increases the square footage or height of an existing structure. Common forms of additions that are reviewed are dormers, covered porches, carports, Porte cocheres and the addition of conditioned spaced.*	Changed definition to be more in keeping with how the Commission has defined the term for several years.
n/a		37	**IX. Definitions** ***Adjacent:*** *Close proximity, surrounding* ***Block Face:*** *One side of a street block.* ***Boxed entrance:*** *A vestibule that is primarily enclosed. Common feature of English cottage and Tudor style buildings. Also known as an "enclosed entrance" or "enclosed portico or vestibule."* ***Character-defining Features:*** *Character-defining features include the overall shape of the building, its materials, craftsmanship, decorative details, features, as well as the various aspects of its site and environment.* ***Clerestory Window:*** *A portion of an interior rising above the roof and having windows admitting daylight to the interior.*	Added terms found in at least one of the 3 parts, where a definition was thought to be useful.
25	**V. Definitions** ***Contributory Status:*** *Buildings constructed during the period of significance for the district and that have physical integrity are considered as "contributing" to the historic character of the district. They may or may not be significant. Buildings that do not contribute to the historic character of the district are called non-contributing. Contributory status can change over time as new information becomes available and as districts age. The first factor to consider is the building's age. Was the building constructed during the period of significance of the district? Is that period of significance still valid? The second consideration is an analysis of the changes that have taken place over time. Does the building retain the majority of its character defining features and form? If the building retains its original form, despite numerous changes, it is likely still considered contributing.*	37	**IX. Definitions** ***Contributory Status:*** *Contributing buildings are those that contribute to the historic character of the district, and non-contributing buildings do not contribute to the overlay's historic character. Contributory status is determined based on the historic integrity of the building, the history and development of the district, and the date of construction. Generally, contributory status for each building is evaluated at the time the overlay is adopted; however, contributory status can change over time as new information becomes available and as districts age.*	Rewrote to match National Park Service definition.
n/a		37	**IX. Definitions** ***Deck:*** *A floor that is flush with the ground, or slightly above, exposed to the elements and does not have a roof over it.* ***Dormer:*** *A vertical window projecting from, or recessed into the slope of a roof; usually provided with its own roof. There are three basic types:* *Roof dormer: All walls (side and front) project out from the roof but not from the wall below* *Wall dormer: Front of dormer is flush with the wall below* *Recessed (or inset) dormer: Has both side walls set into the roof rather than projecting from the roof.* ***Double frontage lot:*** *A lot, other than a corner lot, that has frontage on two or more streets that do not intersect at a point abutting the property.*	Added terms found in at least one of the 3 parts, where a definition was thought to be useful.

25	**V. Definitions** ***Economic Hardship:*** *A condition that warrants the demolition of a contributing structure where the cost of a structure plus the cost of repairs to the structure to make it habitable are greater than the market value of the structure. Economic hardship may be caused by, but not limited to structural damage, termite damage, and fire damage. This exception shall not apply to any property owner who creates a hardship condition or situation as a consequence of their own neglect or negligence. Refer to Section 17.40.420 D of the Metro Code of Nashville and Davidson County.*		[Removed]	Defined in ordinance so no need to repeat in the definitions.
25	**V. Definitions** ***Elevation:*** *A scaled drawing that illustrates the view of a face of a building.*	38	**IX. Definitions** ***Elevation:*** *A scaled drawing that illustrates the view of a face of a building. Also used as a synonym for façade.*	Added additional language for clarity.
n/a	**V. Definitions**	38	**IX. Definitions** ***Half Story:*** *Usable space fully under the roof, often identified by dormers, skylights or windows in a gable field. The primary wall and eave heights are consistent with single-story building.* ***Muntin:*** *A secondary framing member to hold panes within a window or glazed door.* ***Mullion:*** *A vertical member separating (and often supporting) window, doors or panels set in series.*	Added terms found in at least one of the 3 parts, where a definition was thought to be useful.
25	**V. Definitions** ***Immediate Vicinity:*** *The "immediate vicinity" includes historic buildings on both sides of the block face on which new construction is proposed. This area is generally the first area that is used to define the "historic context" that should be used to guide the construction of new principal buildings. The overall character of the district is also used.*		[Removed.]	Removed in favor of guidelines that define how context is determined.
26	**V. Definitions** ***New Construction:*** *Any building, addition, structure or appurtenance constructed on a lot after the designation of the historic preservation, neighborhood conservation, or historic landmark zoning overlays.*	38	**IX. Definitions** ***New Construction:*** *Any building, addition, structure, or appurtenance constructed on a lot after the establishment of a historic overlay.*	Three different types of overlays are listed but there are now more so changed the list to a general term that encompasses all existing types of historic overlays and any potential new types of historic overlays.
26	**V. Definitions** ***Non-Historic:*** *A structure or site, usually constructed within the last fifty years, which does not possess historical or architectural significance, based on the criteria for listing in the National Register of Historic Places.*		[Removed]	Used the word "contributory status" instead.
n/a		39	**IX. Definitions** ***Outbuilding:*** *An additional structure on a lot where the primary building has a*	Added terms found in at least one of the 3 parts, where a definition was thought to be useful.

			residential form. Form, rather than current or potential use or zoning, is the factor which determines what is a primary building and what is an outbuilding. Some examples of outbuildings are carports, garages, sheds, studios, accessory dwellings, pool houses, play houses, and garden structures, such as pergolas and green houses. The Metro Department of Codes & Building Safety determines how an outbuilding can be used.	
26	**V. Definitions** ***Period of Significance:*** *The time frame in which a neighborhood developed or was platted into building lots and substantially built out with structures, based on the criteria for listing in the National Register of Historic Places.*	39	**IX. Definitions** ***Period of Significance:*** *The span of time during which significant events and activities occurred. Events and associations with historic properties are finite; most properties have a clearly definable period of significance.*	Revised language to match that of the National Park Service.
26	**V. Definitions** ***Port Cochere:*** *A carriage porch or portico-like structure generally located at a secondary entrance to a building.*	39	**IX. Definitions** ***Port Cochere:*** *A carriage porch or portico-like structure generally located at a secondary entrance to a building and attached to the primary building.*	Added additional language for clarity
n/a		39	**IX. Definitions** ***Shadowline:*** *The two-dimensional outline of a building's mass as viewed on a front elevation. This typically incudes the primary walls and roof, but excludes chimneys and bays*	Added terms found in at least one of the 3 parts, where a definition was thought to be useful.