

# **BLUE RIBBON COMMISSION**

## **INITIAL REPORT TO THE METROPOLITAN COUNCIL AND THE MAYOR'S OFFICE**

**APRIL 2019**

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

- Introductory Observations**..... 3
  - Next Steps..... 4
  - Methodology..... 4
- Recommendations –**
- Immediate (FY2020)**..... 5
  - Revenue Enhancements..... 5
  - Cost Avoidance..... 6
  - Cost Savings..... 8
- Intermediate to Long Term (FY2021-2027)**..... 9
  - Revenue Enhancements..... 9
  - Cost Avoidance..... 9
  - Cost Savings..... 10
- Conclusion**..... 10
- Appendices** ..... 12

# INTRODUCTORY OBSERVATIONS

---

The Blue Ribbon Commission has been charged by the Metro Council through BL2018-1184 to “identify government inefficiencies, practices, transfer payments, third party payments and subsidies with the targeted goal of achieving budgetary cost savings of \$20 million in annual savings” in FY2020

We are pleased to submit this report fulfilling that charge and making suggestions for next steps.

Through field work, information submitted as part of annual budget request, and presentations to the Blue Ribbon Commission (the “Commission”), it was readily apparent that the citizens of Nashville are served by dedicated, thoughtful and ethical public servants who understand their responsibility to be good stewards of taxpayer dollars.

Throughout our work, several themes emerged that will be helpful guides to the Mayor and the Metro Council as they consider how the Metro Government can continue to serve the public well while protecting taxpayer resources. These themes include:

- ◇ The Metro Government has put in place several data collection tools that can be expanded and leveraged to assist with evidence-based decision-making for a variety of purposes including efficient allocation of resources, program evaluation and budgetary priorities.
- ◇ A number of budget practices should be reconsidered, such as routine evaluation of cost recovery tools like fees; performance budgeting focused on specific and limited priorities for improvement; and allocation of internal costs such as finance, across all departments.
- ◇ Tax resources allocated to tourism should be re-examined in light of services rendered, legal and debt restrictions and other needs.
- ◇ The labor market is tight, and some departments have a difficult time hiring and retaining qualified employees. This will only worsen and should lead to a multi-year view of hiring and retention strategies.
- ◇ Investments in technology and automation are welcomed and can greatly improve efficiency of operations.
- ◇ Deferred capital expenditures and other investments in all forms of infrastructure cost the taxpayers money and should be highlighted and discussed as part of the annual budget process.
- ◇ Certain fee collections such as that required of tattoo parlors, are quite low, may not cover the cost of collection and should be considered for repeal. Others that impose burdens that are barriers to citizens trying to improve their circumstances should also be examined.

The Commission also recognizes that some of our recommendations may affect the terms and conditions of employment of Metro employees represented by employee organizations. The Commission strongly

recommends that any assessment or implementation of those recommendations should be undertaken with input from and negotiation with the appropriate employee organizations in accordance with Chapter 3.56 of the Metro Code of Ordinances.

Finally, the Commission believes that some of budget controversies can be avoided if the Metro Government would consider a practice of adjusting the tax levy to correspond with the multi-year cycle of reappraisal to support a multi-year pay plan and other long term planning needs.

## Next Steps

---

The Commission recommends the following next steps:

- ◇ Present the findings of this initial report to members of the Metro Council Budget and Finance Committee.
- ◇ Suggest the Chairman of the Budget and Finance Committee request department heads include in their budget presentations responses to Commission recommendations.
- ◇ Ask the incoming Budget & Finance Committee chairman to consider including members of the Blue Ribbon Commission in a budget retreat for new members.
- ◇ Continue work on additional recommendations that were not considered due to time constraints. A list of these additional recommendations can be found in Appendix C.

## METHODOLOGY

---

Having begun work in January to prepare a report for delivery April 1, the Commission determined that it should pursue two tracks for recommendations: those that could be implemented immediately and those that are more suitable for intermediate or long-term deployment.

Due to the short time between formation of the Commission and the April 2019 due date for submission of an initial report to the Mayor and the Metro Council, deliberations were focused primarily on recommendations that could be implemented immediately. Some consideration was given to intermediate and long-term recommendations which are discussed below in general terms. Subsequent reports will provide deeper analysis of these recommendations.

For field work, each Commission member was assigned a group of departments using the same taxonomy in the budget ordinance. The Commission members then posed a series of questions (Appendix A) verbally or in writing. In the interests of time, not every department was assessed as the focus was on the largest appropriations.

Additionally, the Finance Department asked department heads to include in their Budget request a response to the Commission's charge of identifying cost savings, cost avoidance and revenue increases.

Finally, the Information Technology department posted a public survey to collect suggestions from the public. (Appendix B)

The Commission also invited several department heads to present to the Commission. The departments

included ITS, General Services and Internal Audit.

Pulling from the body of information created by these sources, each Commission member assembled a list of suggestion by department and identified several items for immediate implementation or for consideration as an intermediate or long-term option. Other suggestions were compiled for consideration in the next report (Appendix C).

For consideration of major revenue enhancements, a subcommittee to the Commission examined all of Metro's revenue sources and evaluated them as options for enhancement based on state and federal legal constraints.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS – IMMEDIATE (FY2020)**

---

### **Revenue Enhancements**

**A. Restore Use of Budgeted Savings to Budget Ordinance.** Approximately two to three percent of funds appropriated to Metro Departments is not spent in that budget year, often due to employee attrition. The unexpended monies are returned to the general fund and normally accrue to the fund balance. While this approach can often have the effect of increasing fund balances, it also can lead to spending reductions in the budget ordinance that are not appropriate or effective.

Recognizing the historical spending patterns of Metro agencies as part of the budget ordinance allows the Mayor and the Metro Council to make appropriations accurately and without undue harm to service to the public or employees. An effective way to look at this is in the aggregate, as it is often difficult to identify which department or agency may be under or over its target. There are also expenses, particularly procurements, that may be delayed from one year to the next and should not be put into fund balances or reduced from the budget. It is good practice to identify those funds that can be accrued and used for non-recurring purposes the next year. Assuming there is normal revenue growth, those funds also reappear as recurring funds in the next budget, and can be used for ongoing purposes.

The Commission estimates that approximately \$7 to \$10 million could be recorded as budgeted savings in FY2020. However, the Commission further recommends that the Finance Department review historical patterns to estimate conservatively the appropriate amount of budgeted savings to be used in the FY2020 budget. We encourage the Mayor and the Metro Council to make permanent this budget tool as it is consistent with practices at the State of Tennessee and peer cities. As noted above, this can become part of longer term planning and contribute to more accurate four-year planning around reappraisal cycles.

**B. Recover Cost Associated with Safety and Sanitation in Tourism areas from MCC.** The popularity of Nashville's many tourist attractions, especially the Lower Broad area, has strained the resources of police, fire, public works and the Metropolitan Transit Authority's Downtown Circulator. Absent the debt obligations to the Music City Center, the growth in Metro's portion of sales taxes from the increasing number of visitors each year would be available for appropriations to these and other departments that may be identified by the Finance Director.

Since it is in the best interest of the Convention Center Authority (the "CCA"), the Music City Center,

their bond holders and the city at large to ensure that Nashville’s tourism destinations remain a family-friendly environment with clean safe streets, the Commission recommends that the Finance Department undertake an accurate and ongoing annual assessment of these costs, including a review of state law as to the permissibility of reimbursement by the CCA.

The Commission recommends that the Metropolitan Government enter into a Memorandum of Understanding (the “MOU”) with the CCA whereby the CCA would allocate a portion of its eligible revenue to the general government annually in support of services that preserve and enhance the attractiveness of tourism in Nashville.

As discussions between the Finance Department and the CCA have yielded \$10 million to support services for FY2020 on a non-recurring basis, the Commission recommends a similar amount for FY2020. To ensure these funds are available on a recurring basis, the Commission recommends that the MOU be in effect for an extended period of time as determined by the Finance Director.

**C. Review approach to payment of tourism promotion through CVC to consider economies of scale and actual costs.** Under contract with the Convention and Visitors Corporation, Metro allocates two percent of the six percent it collects in hotel occupancy taxes. Since 2007, the value of that two percent has risen from approximately \$10 million to \$27 million.

With the contract set to expire at the end of FY 2021, Metro should undertake a comprehensive review of the contract and the efficiency and effectiveness of allocating the entirety of the hotel occupancy tax revenue earmarked for promotion of tourism to a single entity. Such review should consider other all factors of maintaining Nashville’s place as a premier destination such as preserving its family-friendly environment, and promoting and providing access to a wide range of attractions.

Based on its findings, Metro should consider if it should request changes to state law that controls use of this portion of the hotel occupancy taxes.

**D. Recover Costs Associated with Short Term Rental Enforcement.** Owners of short-term rentals such as those facilitated by platforms like AirBnB, VRBO and others, are required to pay all hotel occupancy taxes. Under Metro ordinance, a portion of these taxes are directed to the Barnes Fund for Affordable Housing. The remainder is retained by the Convention Center Authority pursuant to state law.

However, at significant expense, the Codes department is tasked with enforcing the short-term permit rental system. This enforcement has placed an enormous burden on the Codes department, straining resources needed to attend to other needs of Nashville’s residents.

The Commission recommends that the cost of enforcing short-term rental permits be recovered. The Commission also support the recommendation made by the Finance and Fire Departments to increase the Short-term rental permit fee from \$50 to \$313 to support enforcement and inspection. If other agencies incur similar costs, the Commission recommends incorporating and recovering those as part of the fees and taxes paid.

## **Cost Avoidance**

**A. Conduct a comprehensive evaluation of overtime, with a special emphasis on police department.** Submissions from the public, included those sent anonymously, expressed concern about use of overtime. Specifically, the public is concerned about the use of police overtime for special events like

parades and festivals as well as mass events like Predators hockey games.

Our field work indicated that Police Department leadership is also concerned about use of overtime. They indicated an effective comp time program might address the issue. The Fire Department suggested that increasing FTE count would reduce overtime expense.

We recognize that police overtime may be a result of labor market realities that make recruitment and retention increasingly difficult. For that reason, any study should determine if overtime costs can be avoided through salary increases and other incentives.

**B. Evaluate an assessment against courts for police time over a certain threshold.** It has been a longstanding problem in Metro that police officers are called to testify in court but are not given a time certain at which to appear. The court's system results in police time being used inefficiently. Given labor market constraints, this arrangement is becoming increasingly untenable.

We suggest that such an evaluation determine a reasonable amount of time an officer should wait to testify and whether time beyond that threshold should be assessed at cost to the courts. An intergovernmental fee should be imposed as soon thereafter as practical to encourage efficient operations of the courts.

**C. Purchase automated redaction software for criminal courts and other purposes.** The Criminal Court Clerk reports that they receive approximately 300 requests a day for affidavits that require redaction. Automated software would eliminate FTEs dedicated to this task and permit online access.

In purchasing redaction software, Finance should evaluate if it would be useful to other departments.

**D. OPEB Liability Reduction.** Metro faces a significant unfunded liability for Other Post Employment Benefits (OPEB), which consists of health and other benefits in addition to those obligations of the Metro pension system. Continue ongoing program to offer the approximately 3,000 former vested employees who left before retirement age, a lump sum payout equivalent to expected future value of pension benefits. In exchange for the payout, former employees waive their right to future Metro benefits, including OPEB. This study recommendation was previously approved by Benefit Board.

**E. Evaluate Metro's real estate footprint for efficiency and divestiture.** Metro General Service has done a great deal to reduce total cost of ownership of its buildings through efficient use of energy and water and sound planning and construction practices. Metro should consider expanding these practices to as many Metro owned buildings as possible, including those under the control of MNPS and other agencies.

The real estate footprint should be further evaluated for divestiture through competitive process. The Metro Code should be amended to permit sale of back tax property through resolution instead of ordinance to accelerate the process.

**F. Centralize copier contracts and software purchases.** Several departments indicated that they were asking for inclusion in Metro-wide contracts for lease and maintenance of office equipment and software. Centralization results in better price negotiation by Metro and provides expertise in the purchases that other departments may not have.

However, the Commission would like to see Metro Finance and Procurement include a mechanism for evaluating the effectiveness of the contracts to ensure departments are receiving the same level of service from the vendor as would be the case if they had made the purchase themselves. Procurements should establish commonly used commercial Service Level Agreements, enforced through the use of Liquidated Damages.

## **Cost Savings**

### **A. Return to centralization of internal operations such as Human Resources and Finance.**

Several departments reported that they hired their own HR and Finance staff. When appropriate those FTEs can be reduced or replaced with client facing FTEs to improve service.

The Commission is very mindful of the fact that Metro abandoned certain centralized services because of dissatisfaction among departments heads regarding the level of service provided. For that reason, Metro should establish certain performance and response measures to ensure the highest level of satisfaction among department leadership. The use of Service Level Agreements between agencies can establish accountability for setting and meeting reasonable expectations.

The Commission notes that certain elected officers must comply with state and federal mandates and for that reason this recommendation may not be applicable to all departments. To the extent appropriate and in conjunction with any centralization efforts, Human Resources should also study and consider a position control program across Metro.

### **B. Begin implementation of data analytics around 311 data, household survey and other datasets.**

Metro has begun a very important effort of collecting data across a wide variety of services. This data can be used to identify redundancies, efficiencies and cost savings.

Metro should consider including historical data and predictive analysis in a performance-based budgeting approach (see intermediate – long term recommendations.)

### **C. Transfer civil enforcement from MNPD to Davidson County Sheriff's Office.**

Both the Sheriff's office and MNPD indicated that civil enforcement of traffic incidents or more broadly, all civil disputes, could be enforced using Sheriff's department employees who are paid at a lower rate than MNPD.

The transfer of civil enforcement would result in savings but would also relieve wait times and mitigate labor market constraints.

Metro Legal should review this recommendation and make suggestions on necessary changes to state law or the Metro Charter.

### **D. Develop work mobility program in coordination with fleet to limit commutes and real estate needs.**

The State of Tennessee has implemented a work mobility program to reduce commute times, increase productivity and more efficiently managed fleet. Work mobility programs can also be effective in reducing real estate footprint.

### **E. Evaluate mowing and right of way maintenance programs throughout Metro.**

A number of state's Departments of Transportation have abandoned routine mowing and replaced it with natural grass and ground cover that requires less attention.

Similarly public open spaces that do not support regular activity should be reviewed for ground covers that could serve as alternatives to a standard fescue.

# RECOMMENDATIONS – INTERMEDIATE TO LONG TERM (FY2021 TO FY 2027)

---

## Revenue Enhancement

**A. Consider a practice of adopting a multi-year pay plan to correspond with the property re-appraisal cycle and the setting of the certified tax rate with an increase to the tax levy.** In recent years Metro departed from an occasional policy of synchronizing the property reappraisal process with a change in the tax levy above the certified tax rate and adoption of a multi-year pay plan.

In addition to a reduction in services, this departure has created a certain amount of annual budgetary controversy that can be avoided. Most importantly, the absence of a multi-year approach has created an uncertain employment environment for the very people the Metropolitan Government relies on to provide high value services to citizens.

To accomplish a return to this four year appraisal-levy cycle, the Commission encourages the Mayor and the Metro Council to use revenue sources identified as immediate to bridge the budgetary gap. To inspire the confidence of taxpayers, the Commission urges the Mayor and the Metro Council to vigorously implement all cost avoidance and cost savings strategies and implement performance budgeting supported by data analytics.

**B. Payment in Lieu of Taxes.** While certain departments like Metro Water Services make PILOT payments to the general government, a requirement to do so is not uniformly or equitably applied across the appropriate departments. The Commission recommends that the Finance Department review current payment structures and consider changes, as appropriate.

**C. Cost recovery.** Multiple departments indicated that fees they charge were based on studies that were sometimes more than a decade old. Metro should implement routine review of fees, fines and other non-tax sources either by ordinance or policy.

Additionally, a number of Metro departments noted that fee rates were often fixed by state statute. The Mayor should evaluate these rates and determine if a change should be submitted to the General Assembly for consideration.

## Cost Avoidance

**A. Performance Audits.** In recent years, Metro has abandoned routine use of performance (non-financial) audits to evaluate the efficacy and efficiency of programs and services. The Commission encourages the finance department to develop a function dedicated to routine performance evaluations using data collected through open data sources and surveys, formal performance audits and any information it deems helpful.

**B. Performance Budgeting.** For FY 2021 and beyond, the Commission encourages the Finance Department to reconsider and improve the use of performance budgeting. Each year an agency can propose a limited number of improvement initiatives that tie directly to more effective and efficient services. These Key Performance Indicators can also be the result of Performance Audits and designed to make improvements or correct practices as identified through that process. Performance Budgeting should be a

focused process that provides meaningful direction to the agency and to the Mayor and Council, avoiding any past issues where it was not relevant to current issues.

**C. Procurement Practices.** The Commission recommends that the Finance Department undertake a complete review of procurement to ensure it is adhering to best practices, including those that may be applicable from the private sector. In the event a study finds changes in state law or the Metro Code desirable, Metro legal should consider such changes and make appropriate recommendations.

## Cost Savings

**A. Automation and other technology supported savings.** A number of departments noted that they still relied on hard copies to serve the public. To the extent feasible and appropriate, the Commission urges the Metro Government to adopt as many paper-less communications strategies as practical.

Investments in self-serve automated technologies can further reduce costs especially for departments that directly serve a large number of citizens.

Deployment of data-based analysis. As the data collection and analytics function matures, the Commission anticipates that it will serve the purpose of identifying inefficiencies and opportunities for cost reduction.

**B. Comprehensive Review of Direct and Indirect Appropriations to Non-Profits.** While the annual Budget Ordinance includes direct appropriations made to a number of non-profit organizations, there are reportedly appropriations made indirectly by departments. As this use of funds is not transparent to the taxpayers and the Metro Council, the Commission recommends that Metro Finance undertake a comprehensive review of payments to non-profit organization and consider the payments in the context of the efficacy and value of the services provided.

## CONCLUSION

---

This Blue Ribbon Commission was created pursuant to Substitute Ordinance No. BL2018-1314 with the purpose of identifying cost savings, increased revenues and cost avoidance (including one-time and on-going savings), with the targeted goal of achieving budgetary cost savings, increased revenues, and cost avoidance collectively totaling \$20 million. This report is the initial report required by the Ordinance to be focused on identifying cost savings, cost avoidance, and revenue enhancements that can be realized in the Fiscal Year 2020 operating budget. This report also endeavors to take a first look at subsequent fiscal years detailing (1) a listing of budget savings proposals, providing a ranking based upon value and feasibility, and further including an evaluation of "recommended", "not recommended", or "neutral" for each such proposal; and (2) revenue generation proposals as may be practicable for the efficient administration of the Metropolitan Government.

### Blue Ribbon Commission Members

Emily Evans, Chair  
Vice Mayor Jim Shulman  
Council Member Tanaka Vercher  
Council Member John Cooper  
Dave Goetz

## Blue Ribbon Commission Members

Patrick Green

Tracy Kane

Gracie Porter

Brad Rayson

D. J. Wootson

Margaret Darby, Department of Law

Brian Kelsey, Mayor's Office

Stan Romine, Department of Finance

# APPENDIX A—FIELD WORK QUESTIONS

---

## QUESTION

How is performance of your department measured today?

What metrics, measures or other standards do you think should be included that are not currently?

How and how often do you evaluate the efficacy of programs and services

Are you having difficulty filling positions and if so, why? (i.e. wage rates, required skills etc.)

What cost recovery mechanisms like fees are available to you and when was the last time they were evaluated for an increase/decrease?

What services or activities do you support that could be improved through IT investments?

Describe deferred capital investments and how you establish priorities in making capital requests.

Provide any other information you feel would be helpful to the Blue Ribbon Commission in making its report to the Mayor and Council.

---

## APPENDIX B—PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS

---

- 2 Look into a compost trash facility like that of Sevier county. <https://www.yesmagazine.org/planet/sevier-county-composting> This could cut down on landfill cost. Also installing power turbines in new water pipes so the water flow creates the power. <https://www.citylab.com/environment/2018/01/portlands-drinking-water-is-powering-the-grid/550721/>
- 3 Metro General doesn't need to buy movie tickets for employees' birthdays. Metro General should reduce pay to the highly compensated individuals who can't manage a budget. Instead, fully fund the schools! Don't ask Metro employees to donate school supplies - instead FULLY FUND THE SCHOOLS.
- 4 Put on your big boy pants, take a hard vote, and raise property taxes. Fund things properly, and STILL have historically low tax rates!
- 5 Office Supplies Transfer to Public Schools and non profits: Establish a volunteer team to pack unused office supplies for delivery to public schools or non profit organizations. When workers transfer to other office locations, unused office products are often left behind for the dumpster. Having a team box the items would be a significant boost for the teachers who spend their own money for supplies. (I recently have done this in a state office building and delivered excellent products to an elementary school.)
- 6 The city can create a free monthly revenue stream through a 100% review of all traffic accidents to identify where damages to public property occur. By law, the city can file claims with the responsible driver and their insurance carrier to recover the funds to make the repairs. By law, the city has 3 years to make these claims. Of course, this requires review of over 100,000 traffic accidents. The city does not have the resources (currently 2 people) to review all of these. Our company performs this service at no cost to the city, no use of city personnel and no use of your resources. There are no startup costs and you can cancel at any time without penalty. We support many cities and counties, such as the city of Atlanta. We have clients you can contact to confirm the benefits of this service. This is not an idea. It's a tried and true service that is currently sending money to many cities and counties. Regards, Todd Rhoad [todd.rhoad@peachtreers.com](mailto:todd.rhoad@peachtreers.com) Peachtree Recovery Services, Inc. [www.peachtreers.com](http://www.peachtreers.com) (m) 678-230-7594
- 7 Reform and simplify zoning regulations to more easily allow denser development and decrease sprawl. Metro has over thirty (30) distinct zoning categories just for residential construction, which is unnecessary, complicated, and indirectly increases the cost of living.
- 8 Pursue a less ambitious transit improvement plan referendum that would eliminate Metro's general fund disbursements to WeGo/MTA/RTA while increasing/improving levels of service.
- 9 Make a recommendation to the Davidson County Delegation of the Tennessee General Assembly to revise the Hotel/Motel tax laws in order to allow a greater share of revenue to go towards the general fund as long as revenues are sufficient to cover capital/operating costs of the Convention Center and Tourism. If not for hotels, at least for Short Term Rentals.
- 10 Increase STR permitting fees for new applications (and possibly renewals) to recover expenses made by the Codes Department and the Police Department to regulate STRs. Increase staffing at Codes (and possibly hire an Administrative Hearing Officer) to improve enforcement. Review fee study for details.

11 Conduct a review of best uses for MNPS properties to determine whether portions of those properties might be candidates for sale and/or use by other departments or for affordable housing. Example, the Wilburn Street side of Glenn Elementary may be a candidate for development as the land previously contained housing and is separated from the school by fencing. Possible opportunity for teacher housing.

12 Cut all travel from the budget. Stop hiring outside agencies to make studies or surveys on how we can do certain things--it's a waste of money that could go towards raises. If teachers, the police and fire department can not get a raise then offices like the mayors office should not get a raise. Moral is down and we are at an all time low for hiring teachers.

13 We should not be building another stadium at this time. Delay this soccer stadium until we are in better shape financially and do not take away raises from Metro employees. We owe our promises to them to be more important than a sport stadium. We already have football, baseball and hockey. Let the people who want another sport raise the money.

14 We should not be building another stadium at this time. Delay this soccer stadium until we are in better shape financially. We already have football, baseball and hockey. Let the people who want another sport raise the money if they cannot wait.

15 How about MAKING money? Metro would have made a ton of money if BZA would enforce the Short Term Rental fines for infractions instead of letting everybody off the hook and issuing permits even when the applicant is clearly violated the ordinances. Often flagrantly.

16 1) For new general employee hires, allow only a defined contribution pension plan and no longer offer a defined benefit plan 2) Metropolitan Clerk, 3 primary duties: Records Management: Could the document management services provided by the Clerk be provided by a private document service company at lower costs? Alarm Registration: Transfer the functions and personnel of the Alarm registration unit to some other Metro department like the County Clerk Legislative: Transfer the functions and personnel to the Library Archives unit or to the Council staff These are the three primary functions of the Metro Clerk, as listed in the Metro budget. With all its functions either privatized or removed to another department, the Metro Clerk's office could be eliminated. 3) Automobile purchases: Other than sworn police officers, no other employees of Metro should have "take home" cars. and the city should consider some general employees using their personal cars instead of city cars, and paying them mileage. 4) Overtime: stronger limits ought to be placed on the use and abuse of overtime. Supervisors need to have more authority to curtail such abuses (example: 3 officers arrest 1 person on several charges, each officer charges the defendant with 1 or more charges so each officer receives a subpoena to appear in court even though all 3 officers were present and saw the same things and only 1 was needed for court testimony) 5) Combine the General Sessions (civil) Court Clerk, Circuit Court Clerk into a single Civil Court Clerk's office serving all the civil courts. Combine the General Sessions (criminal) Court Clerk and Criminal Court Clerk into one Criminal Court Clerk's office 6) Look at the functions of the Metro Action Commission and Metro Social Services for overlap and redundancy and consider combining the two separate offices into a single office performing the combined services of both. More specifically, according to the services provided: Metro Action Commission: Adult Ed., Career Dev. & Supp: This program appears to be performing the same or similar function as the Board of Education's Community Career Centers. Could the two functions be merged under the direction of the Board of Education and removed from MAC? Health Improvement: Could this function be better provided by the Department of Health? Child Health & Wellness: Could this function be better provided by the Department of Health? 7) Mayor out of

county travel for the city: The mayor ought to be required to submit a report to either a specific Council committee or a special committee, perhaps made up of all the at-large council members. The report must contain the reason for the travel and be approved by the committee. At the end of the travel, the mayor must submit a follow-up report citing what actions the mayor took to accomplish the reason(s) for the travel. 8) Eliminate the stipend retired Council members receive for health insurance for AFTER they have served their terms 9) Incentive packages including tax increment financing meant to entice businesses to move to Nashville ought to be eliminated. I refer you to the Beacon Center of Tennessee's informative video on this subject which rightly points out that these incentives come at a cost to existing businesses which must compete against newcomers who are the beneficiaries of lower taxes and the return on the investment has yet to be proven, financially. This corporate welfare is coming at the expense of the taxpayers who are now facing the possibility of another tax increase. 10) Parks & Recreation Arts & History: The functions and some personnel of this unit could be removed from P&R and turned over to the Metro Arts Commission and the Metro Historical Commission, then eliminate the unit from Parks & Recreation altogether. 11) Police: Create a civilian traffic crash investigation unit while not filling sworn vacancies as quickly. Sworn officers will have a reduced or eliminated crash investigation workload allowing officers more time for proactive enforcement. I believe these civilians could issue traffic citations as parking tickets are issued by civilian parking enforcement personnel. The civilian traffic crash investigation unit could be under the supervision of the traffic lieutenant. Just as the Department has civilianized its crime scene units, the same could be done for the investigation of traffic crashes. 12) Register of Deeds: The Index Book Scanning project was completed by the FY '09-'10 budget. With the completion of that project, could the staff be reduced?

17 To the members of the BRC: Thank you for your work. I plan to submit money-saving ideas in the coming weeks, but my first ideas are process suggestions. I believe that this form should be emailed to all Metro Employees including MNPS. On-the-ground experience often provides different insights than examining expenditures on paper. Not enough people know about the BRC and/or this portal. To incentivize employee participation, I suggest offering comp time for ideas that the BRC ends up recommending. For many salaried employees, comp time would be a revenue neutral reward system. Since this suggestion portal requires entries for name, address and Metro Department if applicable, I think you should include a checkbox that would allow Metro Employee participants to remain anonymous from their Department Head. Something like "Check this box if you would like your participation to be kept anonymous. The BRC will contact you personally if your idea is recommended, but the BRC will not reveal your identity to your employer." Some money-saving ideas may not be internally popular, so this would provide peace of mind. Thanks for your consideration and best of luck with this process.

18 Offer a buyout to almost retired employees. Can hire new employees at a smaller salary

19 I don't mean to be critical but I thought we were going to be able to find agendas and materials for the meetings on the website. I thought we were going to use the same model as the TIF review committee uses. I see no materials and no real agenda for the meeting on 1/25 online. My suggestion to save some money is stop the contribution of \$350,000 to the Chamber of Commerce and the \$1 million to nonprofits in and around the city. The Chamber collects dues from member businesses and non profits should be appealing and raising money on their own. I give regularly to the Nashville Food Bank and the Resue Mission along with the Symphony, the Frist , the Humane Society, the Country Music Hall of Fame, as well as my Church. My tax money should not be given away to non profits I myself might not support without my permission. It is too easy for government to give away other people's money.

Thanks for your time and effort in this endeavor.

20 you dont have a revenue problem, you have a spending problem

21 MTA - quit using million dollar buses during hours (weekends) on routes when 5 or less are riding on a bus. In general - are some departments able to lease equipment/vehicles - in some cases it each cheaper - may be for Public works Schools - warehouse - quit buying items not actually needed - see their items on eBid way too often (including the Convention center wasting money on excessive purchases) Quit allowing the sports authority to give so much to the arenas/stadium - these sports venues can operate on less Overall, quit buying land/equipment and buildings that are so expensive (want vs. need). Metro does not need to spend \$10 million on a new fire station (ex. new Hermitage location about to be built). Have engineers/architects/General Contractors on Metro staff to save up to 40% when building/remodeling buildings (outsourced companies make more money when buildings cost more = they design the buildings to cost a lot more). Buildings should be purchased for need (a taxpayer funded building does not have to be/need to be the most modern/fancy building in the community) Events - use more lower paid officers getting overtime (possibly even use deputies) - too many events I notice what seems the higher paid/higher ranked officers year after year. Get rid of electric car parking permits - they use the same parking space as someone else - they do not need this benefit Increase DUI and drug fines Reduce arts/parks and recreation spending (just like a family - when money gets tight, budget and take out spending that is not a necessity). For sure no additional land is needed for parks at this time with the budget issue. Convention center needs to focus on getting more conventions instead of focusing on events that can be held elsewhere like the fairgrounds (bridal show, boat/rv show, car show). Reduce sidewalks and bikeways yearly budget (very few use the bikeways and sidewalks are sometimes replaced before it is needed (why would the sidewalk budget be the same as the allotted budget for streets?) Vehicles - possibly lease or at a minimum purchase vehicles that are 1 - 2 years old to reduce the expense of the vehicle (getting vehicles with 30-40k miles on them are fine when Metro employees are driving them short distances around town. Since the police department has issues with their vehicles - would recommend them being pulled sooner from their dept and remove the equipment and allow another department to drive them until they quit. This way emergency crews would have better equipment. Metro should consider having public safety officers (similar to the airport). Due to Metro having officer hiring issues and short staff with Fire, would recommend officers being trained in police, fire, and EMS). This way they can respond to any and all calls to assist. Of course this would cost Metro more money in training and their salaries. However, this would be very beneficial when a certain department is having a back log of calls on a shift. Metro should fix their system by not requiring a Fire Engine to respond to all calls when an Ambulance is needed. Municipal auditorium - needs more events yearly - this facility is old but should be in private business terms "a cash cow" milking every event they possibly can get into the facility. Some Metro employees are rolling around in trucks instead of cars. If having a large budget issue - in the past library hours were cut - may need to do it again if needed Work to reduce MDHA and Metro General Hospital budgets Paving - if a street is not really needing to be re-paved, hold off and do another street that is actually needed. If a height is not an issue - do not mill the asphalt on the street. I would also suggest lower ranked employees being asked in departments what expenses can be reduced. Usually higher ranked department managers don't know or really don't care. Also, would change the rules if Metro has rules such as if a department doesn't use the money then they lose the money (this is where big time waste usually occurs).

22 BZA can fine the illegal STR purveyors instead of letting them off the hook. If Metro PD can no

longer write "warning" tickets, than BZA can start collecting tons of money if they put their foot down. Have someone compute how much has been lost. There are several Short term rentals each meeting. If HOST had more help, there would be even more slackerds that could be caught.

23 IF Metro PD can stop writing "warning" tickets, then BZA can stop letting STR scofflaws off the hook. Each meeting there are at least a handful who are asking forgiveness for operating a Short Term Rental illegally. How much money could have gone into Metro coffers if BZA had done their job? Have someone tally it up. And while you're at it, give HOST more help so they can catch even more.

24 Fine electric scooter owner companies for dropping off scooters and blocking sidewalks and ADA corner curbs. Y'all could make tons of money in East Nashville alone (and other neighborhoods, too I expect.) Check out Woodland, Main/Gallatin, and Five Points, for starters.

25 It seems the city should benefit financially from the operation of flynashville.com. It is operated like a business, \$1 Billion in assets, vast land holdings, \$150 million a year in revenue. "The Authority is exempt from payment of federal and state income, property, and certain other taxes." Page 49 of FY 2018 Financial Report Perhaps property tax or sales tax could be paid to the city by the Nashville Airport.

26 Metro government needs to take over the distribution of uniforms for the police dept. Now all has to be purchased through Green Military. They are taking advantage of metro as their prices are outrageous!

27 Please put a time limit on when construction will be completed for all Metro Schools. McMurray Middle School has been "under construction" for 4 years! Tusculum Elem was completely built in a lot less time. Also would someone please go onsite and investigate as why it is taking so long?

28 Our Mayor says we don't have money in our budget for various things and reasons. If our city would just allow our policemen patrol our school zones more frequently to issue tickets for speeding and talking on their cell phones that would take care of his budget issues.

29 Cut out the driver for the Director of the Board of Education. Cut out Resolutions by the City Council. It is wasteful and meaningless.

30 A priority based budgeting tool, like Resource X could help reallocate resources where they achieve the greatest results working towards the city's strategic vision. <https://www.resourcex.net/>

31 Stop trying to revoke all short term rental properties of non investor owned rentals and enjoy the revenue our taxes bring in to the city.

32 Don't spend \$500000 to move the salt bin to East saying it is more convenient and then propose spending money to put one in Bellevue which is even further away from the current location.

33 Examine methods for reducing court time for police officers. Examine methods for reducing misdemeanor convictions. Examine methods for reducing arrests. Spend savings on enhancing community policing, providing better court functioning. Invest in solar energy on government buildings, including schools. Examine methods for reducing food waste, increasing food diversion in MNPS and in other govt. operations.

34 I believe that Metro has duplicate processes and costs related to some information technology functions. For example, I know that there are multiple email servers -- like the executive branch and JIS -- that just duplicate expense.

35 Stop committing future dollars until debt service is relatively low; for example committing future dollars for deals like Amazon and Alliance Bernstein. I can't believe this city is considering such.

36 I would like to see a public facility tax that is applicable to new construction, and additions to existing buildings, that can be used to fund capital facility costs such as fire stations, police precincts, and other general public buildings. Occupancy classifications for the tax would include single family residential; multi-family residential (apartments, condos, townhomes, duplexes, etc.) and non-residential. New developments would fund the projects for public infrastructure, allowing the city to provide additional needed demand for services. Public agencies are greatly impacted by the growth and the increased demand for service to the point we are not able to stay ahead of the demand; this could reduce some of the burden on current property owners and taxpayers. The City of Franklin uses funds from its Adequate Facilities tax (attached is the link to the ordinance - [https://library.municode.com/tn/franklin/codes/code\\_of\\_ordinances?nodeId=PTIICOOR\\_TIT5MUFITA\\_CH4ADFATA](https://library.municode.com/tn/franklin/codes/code_of_ordinances?nodeId=PTIICOOR_TIT5MUFITA_CH4ADFATA)) to pay for new fire stations, the associated fire apparatus and equipment, parks and playground equipment, police facilities, etc. The fee schedule for the Franklin tax is \$0.89 / gross sf(heated and unheated) for single family residential, \$0.71 / gross square foot for multi-family residential, and \$1.18 for non-residential. An example would be for a new development of 200 single family homes with an average of 2,500 square feet each, the total revenue towards the capital improvement funds would be \$445,000. Franklin built a new fire station approximately 2 years ago in the Westhaven community using funds from this tax, and it assisted in their ISO Public Protection Classification of a 1, the best PPC. This provides lower insurance rates for property owners as a direct result.

37 My suggestion is the Privatization of Metro Animal Care and Control. Many of the same services are provided at the Nashville Humane Society, such as adoption, spay/neuter, education and shelter.

38 Retirement incentive. A retirement incentive has not been offered since 2007. Most long term employees are currently paid at the maximum of their pay grade. The pay plan for step grades vary approximately \$10,000 to \$15,000 from minimum to maximum. The pay plan for open ranges vary from approximately \$11,500 from minimum to maximum for an OR1 whereas the variation is significant for the upper range of the pay scale. For example, the variance between minimum and maximum for an OR13 is \$76,000. The cost savings could be significant with the replacement at a lower salary."

39 While this suggestion may only provide a small amount of savings, I want to suggest that Metro consider eliminating dumpster pickup for the small fire stations. For example, the Holly Street Fire Hall may not need a dumpster since there are only 3 to 5 people at the station. I use to live nearby and noticed the dumpster was mostly empty but received a pickup weekly. Based on a rough estimate of commercial rates for weekly pickup (\$140), it could save roughly \$7,280 a year. If there are 10 other stations like it, the amount could add up. Of course, there may be a requirement for a dumpster or other obstacles to implementing this suggestion. Thank you for your service and for providing citizens the opportunity to give input.

40 Lots of suggestions: Eliminate the Chief Diversity Officer position and everything related to it. In order for people to like each other and good race relations to exist, there have to be standards of DECENCY and respect and basic honor within communities. Chief Diversity Officer will only ensure that certain groups are valued over others at certain times or that values aren't more important than melanin level. This could save between \$200K and \$500K each year. Make sure Public Works isn't wasting money on campaigning for transit in the future. We have lots of potholes including on Donelson Pike near

where I live and these need to be repaired. Savings could be \$50K. Cut all grants to the Chambers of Commerce, \$25K for four (Black, Hispanic, Asian, LGBT) are savings of \$100K, this money can all be donated privately and Metro needs to use the money for more road paving or hiring new police officers. Require all future government employees participate in 401(k) style defined contribution plans instead of defined benefit plans, to avoid becoming like Illinois/California/Kentucky/New Jersey - aka huge pension crisis. The state cannot always be there for a bailout and they have needs from Memphis to Mountain City they have to address. My savings should be a minimum of \$350K each year. If I had to cut my own budget, I would take more Kroger surveys to save extra at the gas pump (\$1-\$2), I would get a new cable package (\$30-\$40 reduction), and also eat out less (\$10 in savings). That would mean I'd save a minimum of \$41 each month, \$492 a year. Thanks!

41 Combine the Knowles Assisted Living facility and Metro General hospital. This would fill the beds, put patients in a more accessible part of town, and be an income stream for the hospital by building in a patient base, as well as add a new teaching component to the Meharry program. Both of these are a drain on Metro resources but combining them could potentially benefit both facilities, as well as patients of both.

42 Combine the Knowles Assisted Living facility and Metro General hospital. This would fill the beds, put patients in a more accessible part of town, and be an income stream for the hospital by building in a patient base, as well as add a new teaching component to the Meharry program. Both of these are a drain on Metro resources but combining them could potentially benefit both facilities, as well as patients of both.

43 Require parking companies who manage parking on Metro property to provide a certain amount of parking validations - either a particular number or a set annual amount. Paying to park at the courthouse when required to attend meetings there is ridiculous and creates work for a number of people...to park on Metro property. I had to send my receipt to someone in reimbursements, they process it and send it to their supervisor for approval. It was then sent to my department where two different people had to approve the reimbursement, then someone had to cut and mail the check. Sometimes this amount was as little as \$6 but over 5 people had to touch that in order for it to process. It's a huge waste of time and resources.

44 Don't take on any more big public works projects such as the Music City Center, First Tennessee Park, or Ascend Ampitheatre! These are projects we pay for in the long haul. We can have sports here most certainly, and these bring in revenue, but there has to be a budgetary limit on how much can be done.

45 Enforce Handicap parking zones. This would increase revenue and most of all help people like myself that care for an elderly parent in a wheelchair. So frustrating when taking my Mother out and have to walk long distances while pushing a wheel chair and running out of Oxygen while doing so. If these laws are not enforced, why have them?

46 Stop sending metro vehicle to firestone

47 When rebuilding metro owned structures in congested areas (downtown, Midtown) where there is no parking, consider building the metro facility on the bottom several levels of a multilevel structure. The top levels could be built as parking decks and leased out to companies that will insure and maintain the parking areas. Metro would gain money with the lease and percent of the parking space rental. Of course there would be an initial cost of the structure but with all downtown areas being swallowed up parking is a huge problem. This could be a great solution.

# APPENDIX C—RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER STUDY

---

## Revenue Suggestions—Near Term

- Collect \$1 for entry to the New Year's Eve celebration
- Raise the fees for repeat inspections for recurring violations
- Increase amount of cost of parking tickets
- Increase Rabies Tag Fee by \$1 to support dog parks and dog watering stations
- Enclose farm sheds and launch small business incubation program in FY20 (requires capital funding); revenues would double in FY21
- Asset management fee on real estate sales at .005%. Compensate for maintenance costs of property. Fee to be included in closing stmt.
- Increase STR permit fee from \$50 to \$313 based on a recent study. The increase in STR activities has directly impacted Metro departments such as Codes, Fire, Law, ITS and Finance's Treasury office with increased demand on resources and departmental costs.
- Charge printing fees to the public.
- When for profit entities utilize Metro Police for their event security, they should pay a comparable market rate for that service.
- Rate change to be more reflective of actual cost incurred.
- Increase the charge for commercial construction permits.
- Implementing an online payment option for juvenile court cost and fees should help to increase the percentage of accounts payable that are collected, resulting in an increase in revenue. We are expecting to switch over to the Metro-wide contract with MSB for credit card processing, that would include the option to add an online payment method for our customers. We have already confirmed and discussed this with MSB. We are in the process of waiting on the MSB roll out.
- Revenue Increase Proposal: Propose to increase the lobbyist registration fee from \$50 to \$75. An ordinance from the Council would be needed to amend the Code. Metro Code section 2.196.040 was last amended in 2011 by Ordinance BL2010-821, raising the fee from \$25 to \$50.
- These positions will allow for opening the Parthenon on Mondays as well as, extending hours Monday-Thursday. In order to open the Parthenon 7 days per week, these positions are required and will allow us to meet the tourism demand and also extend normal operating hours on Monday-Thursday to 7pm. The Parthenon is one of the top tourist attractions in our city and easily the busiest facility we currently operate. It is also the only top tourist attraction in the city that isn't currently open seven days a week, or with limited hours.
- In 2018 we took in permit fees of \$141,980 in the downtown parks. If we added 25% to the event fees this would bring in additional revenue of approximately \$35,495. This is not precise as we don't know if we will have the same number of events with the same amount of event fees each year. Downtown Parks are heavily used and generally used by larger organizations.
- Big opportunity to collect revenue for Parking in various parks
- Increase fees if a study concludes the amounts are not adequate to cover the cost of processing.

- Provide Planning recommendations to Metro Finance for a more efficient use of publicly owned properties which should result in enhanced revenue streams or cost savings
- Increase fee charged to customers associated with Back Door Trash collection to \$30 per month to cover existing costs
- Explore rate increases on service of civil processes.
- Explore rate increase
- Request amendment to state statute to permit an increase in beer board permit fees
- Evaluate rates for secondary employment and establish an administrative fee

## Revenue Suggestions—Intermediate-Long Term

- Train convenience store managers, court ordered attendance for those caught selling to minors, potential new beer establishment owners (if interested), members of the public (if interested), and those looking to obtain their ABC certification (if we can attain our own certification). Tennessee law allows the county to require those individuals who do not have ABC server certification to attend an annual class or certification. Metro Nashville has over 500 convenient stores with a beer permit. This would bring in additional revenue of at least \$50,000 annually.
- Enclose farm sheds and launch small business incubation program in FY20 (requires capital funding); revenues would double in FY21
- NFD is a training center for the American Heart Association CPR program. Currently, we provide cards at cost. A fee study would allow us to fully identify the total cost to operate this program, and enable the department to assess and collect fees to cover the cost.
- The last EMS fee study began in 2014. An updated fee study would allow the department to review costs and potentially increase revenue.
- Require non-Metro agencies which occupy space in Metro-owned facilities to pay market rent/lease rates in addition to operating expenses. The projected revenue increase, for General Services managed facilities, is approximately \$2.8M. This revenue projection assumes a fairly conservative \$11 per square foot rate; includes only General Services managed facilities; and, that the non-Metro entities currently pay all operating expenses.
- Exploratory Collaboration with MNPS on providing National Safety Council's Alive @ 25 for High School Students. General Sessions Court is still reviewing to determine the total revenue impact.
- This is a coded sticker program under the Davidson County Clerk. Create stickers with serial or QR codes on them that connect to a simple database containing non-sensitive family information and emergency contacts. In the aftermath of a wreck or other emergency involving a vehicle, emergency personnel can scan the sticker to find information about the family and reach out to the emergency contacts. Just first names of family members and a couple of phone numbers would suffice. The residents would be advised about where to place the stickers (such as in the glove box or center console), so EMT's would know where to look. The Clerk's Office could charge per sticker. So, if a family had 3 vehicles, and each sticker was \$7.50, then the resident would pay \$22.50. This would give peace of mind to the family, and provide necessary information to emergency personnel.
- Create a grant investment program in which creative folks such as musicians, filmmakers, photographers etc. can apply for funding assistance, and if awarded, Metro will get a percentage of rights to the content created. That way through equity or royalties, Metro can profit while also supporting the arts.
- Develop a concerted campaign among the Mayors Office, WeGo and the business community to gain outside business sponsorship packages, employee/customer farecard underwriting (EasyRide), and/or naming rights for specific products/services

such as the Music City Circuit or a major bus corridor.

- Construct a permanent wall in a shared building to separate WeGo Maintenance Department from Metro General Services which is currently separated by chain link fencing. This would help make HVAC more efficient for both WeGo and General Services and avoid higher utilities cost.
- Additional court fees/fines – for example divorce filing; Increased rent for Department of Children Services – consistent with their other Family Safety Center co-located offices; Office of Family Safety staff being paid to train at National conferences; Apply for additional federal grants (although capacity to manage is limited)
- Provide Planning recommendations to Metro Finance for a more efficient use of publicly owned properties which should result in enhanced revenue streams or cost savings
- Advertising & Promotion. We would like to reach out to other ethnicities group to see if we can gain more customer

## Cost Avoidance—Near Term

- Limit out-of-town travel
- Decrease overtime for non essential employees
- Beer Board utilizes ITS repurposed tablets (no longer in use for ITS), which avoids cost of buying new ones
- Do not mail the 1095-C but hand out with the W-2's
- Use Metro Council resolution instead of ordinance to authorize sale of buildable back-tax lots, and remove appraisal requirement. This would speed up process, saving maintenance costs. Also save on appraisal cost by instead authorizing sales based on assessed value. Would not apply to large parcels
- Committee meeting preparation materials for Metro wide Committees (Benefit Board, Civil Service Commission, etc.) be provided to committee members in electronic format only.
- Consolidate the procurement and tracking of all Metro's software licenses to ensure that Metro is properly licensed (avoiding penalty) while striving for cost savings from economies of scale.
- To continue svc & maint. for current system. Funds currently in ITS budget. Requesting transfer to OEM per OMB. Request will cover year 2. This will be a recurring expense. Not having an agreement could cost us more in the long run for any necessary repairs.
- We have 3 cams to monitor and mitigate in real time flooding on or near local "trouble" creeks. Not having funding for maintenance could lead to a greater expense down the road.
- Amend the process for creating Urban Design Overlays to streamline the requirements resulting in a reduced need for additional staff time to process future requests.
- Field inspecting and administrative duties pertaining to permits issued for private construction and capital improvements. PW is currently hiring contractors to supplement our employees to keep up with inspection demands. We could avoid the higher capital cost of contractors by hiring our own employees.

- Staffing to more effectively manage the increased volume of new sidewalk projects and repairs. PW is currently hiring contractors to supplement our employees managing sidewalk projects. We could avoid the higher capital cost of contractors by hiring our own employees.
- Winter snow and summer mowing operations and right-of-way maintenance. (Proper vegetation removal and snow removal reduces accidents and accompanying lawsuits against Metro.)
- Review of development permit plans and construction review. PW is currently hiring contractors to supplement our employees for plan reviews. We could avoid the higher capital cost of contractors by hiring our own employees.
- Staffing and expenses to further progress on traffic signal design needs. PW is currently hiring contractors to supplement our employees for signal design. We could avoid the higher capital cost of contractors by hiring our own employees.
- Initiate STEP metro wide, where an eligible person can retire and return to work as a part time employee.
- Discontinue mailing Courtesy Reminders each year in January.
- Reduce participation in Belmont Leadership Training Program

## Cost Avoidance—Intermediate to Long Term

- Decrease overtime for non essential employees
- Review street lighting with the intent of reducing street lights at certain times of the day (i.e. 3 am to 5 am each morning) - traffic lights are off from 11 pm until 6 am now
- Test Metro provided services by "mystery shoppers" - to determine which services might be cut and/or improved through suggestions from the public
- Non-deployment of the proposed BWC implementation will eliminate the need for budget modification #7 and capital requests of \$8.7M (initial year) including new 49 positions to handle the projected workload of video footage processing. Furthermore, there would be an estimated savings of \$55M over the next ten years by the BWC non-deployment.
- Create a development director who works with all Metro departments to find outside sources of funding that meet their needs. Not all departments have development staff. So, one or more people who understand the needs of various departments can be on the lookout for grants and other opportunities that will substantively support their work. This way Metro won't be asked to fund the gaps in programming or services.
- Allow third parties to fund professional development and educational opportunities for Metro employees. This way employees can get the necessary training and development without Metro having to foot the bill.
- Absorption of expense increases in existing budget allocations for Parkway Tower Increase \$1,100, Software (ACL/Teammate) Increase \$600, Professional Dues Increase \$150)

- A FY18 grant funded extensive review of Juvenile Court probation system and practices resulted in recommendations which included the use of a validated Risk-Needs-Responsivity Assessment Tool. Almost all of these are proprietary proprietary products with an average initial product and training cost of approximately \$10,000. Juvenile Court leveraged relationships with the Vanderbilt Center of Excellence to obtain use of an alternative no-cost instrument with free training and technical assistance, which avoids approximately \$10,000 FY20 cost.
- Opportunity Now (funds raised outside Metro from various organizations)
- Nashville GRAD (funds raised outside Metro from various corporate sponsors)
- Construct a permanent wall in a shared building to separate WeGo Maintenance Department from Metro General Services which is currently separated by chain link fencing. This would help make HVAC more efficient for both WeGo and General Services and avoid higher utilities cost.
- Cease HR salaries of approximately 10 employees being paid from the pension fund in order to retain the money for pension benefits
- More Office of Family Safety staff being qualified to give trainings at national conferences so travel costs are covered by the conference.
- As an agency that provides legal service to low income Nashville-Davidson County families we cannot suggest changes in our maintenance schedules for any critical equipment, and we don't utilize vendors for services where a price increase is anticipated and can be reduced.
- Staffing to more effectively manage the increased volume of new sidewalk projects and repairs. PW is currently hiring contractors to supplement our employees managing sidewalk projects. We could avoid the higher capital cost of contractors by hiring our own employees.
- Initiate STEP metro wide, where an eligible person can retire and return to work as a part time employee.
- Discontinue mailing Courtesy Reminders each year in January.

## Cost Reduction—Near Term

- Metro could start a green initiative to save on printing costs, paper and plastic that is used in the workplace and at Metro events.
- Metro could create a catering contracts for meetings and events. Currently, staff spend a great deal of time on procuring bids and making event arrangements for meetings and events.
- Reduce the number of vehicles for departments with excess fleet and re-allocate to departments with fleet shortages
- Provide inspectors with procurement cards for simple vehicle repairs - purchase of oil changes, batteries, windshield wipers, etc.
- Reduce amount in tuition

- All Departments review their phone billing for accuracy. We found several numbers that had been disconnected or not in use.
- Utilizing Online Learning Content for Training purposes. (Delivery Only)
- Once JCC is online for e-filing services and petitioners start using it, then we should see a reduction in paper cost. If Judicial Officers begin to rely more on the electronic file, then we could see a very significant reduction in office supply cost. Electronic files will have to prove to be a dependable, reliable source for court documents to see a significant cost savings.
- Cost Saving Proposal: Preservation of our historical Minute Books and other large books can be very expensive and we typically only send approximately 4 books every 3 or 4 years when there is enough funds remaining in our budget for this maintenance. In 2015, the cost was about \$6,000 to restore and preserve 4 books. Currently, none of the books in our possession are in dire need of restoration, so I would propose to delay future restorations until a more appropriate time, which will result in a saving of approximately \$1,500 per fiscal year until we resume this maintenance.
- Transit Policing and Security is currently handled through a combination of "normal" MNPd response to security incidents, contracted third party security firms paid for by WeGo and employment of off duty Metro Police Officers through the Department's Secondary Employment Unit (SEU). WeGo annual expenses on policing and security currently approach \$2 million. A coordinated study of transit policing may identify other approaches that are more cost effective and/or provide for an enhanced security environment. In addition to current arrangements, these could include the creation of a separate "Transit Policing Unit" within MNPd and/or creation of a wholly separate Transit Police Force.
- Automation of processes and staff report production by transitioning to electronic transmission, review, and distribution of documents and reports.
- Assess GIS licensing structure and service model to determine if savings can be achieved through a conversion to an enterprise GIS.
- Additional operators and equipment needed to service 12,000 additional trash customers currently handled by outside contractor. The annual cost savings will be between \$300K - \$400K after the existing contract expires on 12/31/2019. Only half a year's savings is reflected in the current numbers.
- Printing and binding books for plats. Since we no longer bind our plats, we can save on the printing/binding category
- Cost now \$1,535/per plot which include( land, open/close grave, and head stone). If Metro could allot some land for the indigent burial, estimate saving  $\$300 \times 300 = \$90,000/\text{year}$ .
- Hire a contractor to coordinate the activities for the extreme weather conditions instead of paying the overtime and the time of the Executive Director and the MHID Director. Estimate saving of \$20,000/year.
- Utilize the workflow approval and DocuSign for journal entries, grant application, grant acceptance, grant amendment. Saving on paper, time and labor. Estimate \$1000/year/department.

## Cost Reduction—Intermediate to Long-term

- Decrease office & admin supplies
- Data tracking and Outcomes/Impact Measurements could help Metro as a whole be more efficient, locate potential cost savings, and better serve the public.
- An aggressive Work Mobility Program, similar to the State, could create potential for more efficient work-spaces. If employees can work remotely, at least part of the time, this would reduce the amount of office space needed and reduce traffic congestion.
- Metro could create a catering contracts for meetings and events. Currently, staff spend a great deal of time on procuring bids and making event arrangements for meetings and events.
- Reduce the number of vehicles for departments with excess fleet and re-allocate to departments with fleet shortages
- Provide inspectors with procurement cards for simple vehicle repairs - purchase of oil changes, batteries, windshield wipers, etc.
- Reduce amount in tuition
- All Departments review their phone billing for accuracy. We found several numbers that had been disconnected or not in use.
- Funding for an additional 20 firefighters would be a cost savings. This would reduce the number of pieces of equipment required to achieve 2in/2out on scene
- Funding for 4 additional Paramedics and 4 EMTs to add 1 of each per shift would be a cost savings. It would reduce some overtime associated with use of accrued leave and attrition. It would also potentially reduce IOD as we are not overtaxing our existing staff.
- Funding overtime to utilize existing UTVs allows quicker first response downtown and reduces the reliance on heavy fire apparatus responding.
- For the 18-month period from July 2017 through December 2018, MPHD employees using Paid Family Leave were paid \$200,000 in salaries alone. Not covered in the \$200,000 were benefits paid, sick and vacation time the employees continued to accrue while on Paid Family Leave, or the overtime, compensatory time, and temporary labor MPHD incurred in order to cover the job duties of the employees who were in direct-service positions whose work needed to be done while the employee was out on Paid Family Leave. The Paid Family Leave order puts a strain on MPHD's staff in covering the work of the absent employees and at the same time places a significant financial strain on the department as there is nothing added to MPHD's budget to cover these expenditures.
- Committee meeting preparation materials for Metro wide Committees (Benefit Board, Civil Service Commission, etc.) be provided to committee members in electronic format only.
- Automation of processes and staff report production by transitioning to electronic transmission, review, and distribution of documents and reports.
- Assess GIS licensing structure and service model to determine if savings can be achieved through a

conversion to an enterprise GIS.

- Cost now \$1,535/per plot which include( land, open/close grave, and head stone). If Metro could allot some land for the indigent burial, estimate saving  $\$300 \times 300 = \$90,000/\text{year}$ .
- Hire a contractor to coordinate the activities for the extreme weather conditions instead of paying the overtime and the time of the Executive Director and the MHID Director. Estimate saving of \$20,000/year.