BEFORE THE BOARD OF ETHICAL CONDUCT OF THE METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY TENNESSEE

Murray J. Philip,) Complainant) v.) Jonathan Hall, Member of the Metropolitan Council) Respondent)

FINAL ORDER

The Board of Ethical Conduct ("Board") of the Metropolitan Government of Nashville and Davidson County conducted a hearing in this matter on March 7, 2022. As set forth below, the Board: (1) concluded that the Respondent, Councilmember Jonathan Hall violated the Standards of Conduct set forth in Chapter 2.222 of the Metropolitan Code (the "Standards of Conduct"), and (2) referred this matter to the Metropolitan Council with a recommendation that the Council censure Mr. Hall.

On October 25, 2021, the Complainant Murray J. Philip filed an ethics complaint against Respondent Jonathan Hall, pursuant to the procedures set out in Metropolitan Code § 2.222.040. The complaint set forth allegations against Mr. Hall numbered 1 through 7. Mr. Philip alleged that Mr. Hall violated the Standards of Conduct by failing to:

- i. file an annual disclosure statement for 2018 (allegation no. 1);
- ii. file a timely annual disclosure statement for 2019 (allegation no. 2);
- iii. file a timely 2019 annual benefits disclosure statement that was required by virtue of receiving campaign contributions that were not reported in compliance with Tennessee election laws (allegation no. 3);
- iv. file an annual disclosure statement for 2020 (allegation no. 4);

- v. file an annual disclosure statement for 2021 (allegation no. 5); and
- vi. file amended annual disclosure statements for 2020 to report two debts (allegations nos. 6 and 7).

Pursuant to the provisions of Metropolitan Code § 2.222.040(C)(1)(e), the Department of Law evaluated the allegations in the complaint for the purpose of determining whether the facts as alleged, if proven true, would give rise to a violation of the Standards of Conduct. Upon completing its evaluation, the Department of Law issued a November 8, 2021 Report, concluding that the allegations in the complaint numbered 1, 2, 3, 4, 6, and 7, if proven true, could constitute a violation of the Standards of Conduct. Accordingly, the Department of Law recommended that the Board hold a hearing on the allegations in the complaint numbered 1, 2, 3, 4, 6, and 7. The Department of Law further recommended that the Board dismiss the allegation in the complaint numbered 5, pertaining to failure to file an annual disclosure statement for 2021, since the deadline to file such disclosure is January 31, 2022.

The Board, after receiving the recommendations of the Department of Law, in an open meeting, considered the allegations against Mr. Hall. The Board unanimously voted to adopt the recommendations of the Department of Law that: (i) a hearing be held on the allegations in the complaint numbered 1, 2, 3, 4, 6, and 7; and (ii) the allegation in the complaint numbered 5, be dismissed.

On March 7, 2022, the Board conducted an evidentiary hearing. Both Mr. Philip and Mr. Hall were present at the hearing. Mr. Philip testified as a witness at the hearing and offered various exhibits. Mr. Hall testified as a witness at the hearing and was cross-examined by Mr. Philip.

At the hearing, Mr. Hall stipulated to the facts that he failed to file: (1) an annual disclosure statement for 2018; (2) a timely annual disclosure statement for 2019; (3) a timely 2019 annual benefits disclosure statement; (4) an annual disclosure statement for 2020; and (5) an amended annual disclosure statement for 2020 to report two debts.

After the presentation of evidence by both parties, and closing arguments, the Board deliberated on the matters presented, taking into account the stipulations, evidence, arguments, and relevant provisions of the Metropolitan Code.

The Board then proceeded to determine, through a series of unanimous votes, as follows:

- (1) Mr. Hall violated § 2.222.020(r) of the Standards of Conduct by failing to file an annual disclosure statement for 2018 and 2020.
- (2) Mr. Hall violated § 2.222.020(r) of the Standards of Conduct by failing to file a timely annual disclosure statement for 2019.
- (3) Mr. Hall violated § 2.222.020(r) of the Standards of Conduct by failing to file a timely 2019 annual benefits disclosure statement.
- (4) Mr. Hall violated § 2.222.020(r) of the Standards of Conduct by failing to file an amended annual disclosure statement for 2020 to report the default judgment entered against him on September 25, 2020 in General Sessions Court.
- (5) The evidence presented did not establish that under § 2.222.030(B)(4) of the Standards of Conduct, Mr. Hall was required to report the debt that was the subject of the default judgment entered against him in General Sessions Court on September 2, 2020. The evidence thus did not support a finding of a violation of the Standards of Conduct by failing to file an amended annual disclosure statement for 2020 to report such debt or judgment.

Upon the Board's conclusion that Mr. Hall violated the Standards of Conduct, the Board voted unanimously to refer this matter to the Metropolitan Council with a recommendation that the Council censure Mr. Hall. Based on the evidence presented, IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED BY THE BOARD OF ETHICAL CONDUCT, that:

- 1. Mr. Hall violated § 2.222.020(r) of the Standards of Conduct, set forth in the Metropolitan Code; and
- 2. Pursuant to Metropolitan Code § 2.222.040(C)(3)(a), this matter is hereby referred to the Metropolitan Council with a recommendation that the Council censure Mr. Hall.

Entered, this the 1° day of March, 2022.

Diane Dilanni, Chairperson Metropolitan Board of Ethical Conduct

cc: Mr. Murray J. Philip Councilmember Jonathan Hall