



METROPOLITAN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
Sunnyside in Sevier Park, 1113 Kirkwood Avenue Nashville, TN 37204
615-862-7970, historicalcommission@nashville.gov

**METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC)
MINUTES**

August 16, 2023 **Sonny West Conference Center/ Fulton Campus** **2:00 p.m.**

Commissioner Attendance: Vice-Chair Stewart, Commissioners Cashion, Cotton, Johnson, Mayhall, Price, Williams

Staff Attendance: Historic Zoning Administrator Zeigler, Legal Counsel Mikkelsen, and staff members Melissa Baldock, Kelli Mitchell, Joseph Rose, Melissa Sajid and Jenny Warren.

1. PRESENTATION OF LEADERSHIP RECOGNITION

Removed from agenda.

2. ADOPTION OF ADOPTION OF JULY 11 AND 19, 2023, MINUTES

**Motion: Commissioner Johnson moved to approve the agendas as presented.
Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

3. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

1. Presentation of Leadership Recognition
9. 1431 Shelton Ave—Remove from consent
11. 1013 Montrose Ave—Notification requirements not met
12. 1504 Dallas Ave—Notification requirements not met
13. 1710 Primrose Ave—Revised for administrative approval
18. 2410 9th Ave S— Revised for administrative approval
23. 2217 Lindell Ave—Request to defer
24. 4406 Nebraska Ave—Notification requirements not met
25. 2500 C W. Linden Ave—Notification requirements not met

**Motion: Commissioner Cotton moved to approve the revised agenda.
Commissioner Williams seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

4. COUNCILMEMBER PRESENTATIONS

Councilmember Benedict spoke to 1431 Shelton Avenue.

CONSENT

5. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH

6. 1800 ORDWAY PL

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023051364

7. 1206 GARTLAND AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding; Setback determination

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, melissa.baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023051450

8. 200 S 11TH ST

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren jenny.warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023051607 and T2023051615

9. 1431 SHELTON AVE

Application: Demolition—Outbuilding; New Construction—Outbuilding

Council District: 07

Overlay: Landmark

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, melissa.baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023051266

10. 901 BRADFORD AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding

Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023020942 and T2023020944

11. 1013 MONTROSE AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding

Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren jenny.warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023051240 and T2023051253

12. 1504 DALLAS AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren jenny.warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023040941 and T2023045462

13. 1710 PRIMROSE AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding (Revision to previously approved plan)

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:2023021144

14. 411 BROADWAY

Application: Signage

Council District: 19

Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, melissa.baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023051269

15. 3504 RICHLAND AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition; Setback Determination

Council District: 24

Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023051356

16. 100 LAUDERDALE RD

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 24

Overlay: Cherokee Park Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023051359

Public Comment: Public comment in favor of the following projects was received via email: 200 S 11th, 1504 Dallas, 3504 Richland.

Motion: Commissioner Mayhall moved to approve all consent items with their applicable conditions, with the exception of 1013 Montrose Ave, 1504 Dallas Ave, 1710 Primrose Ave and 1431 Shelton Ave; finding that with the conditions, the projects meet the design guidelines. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

VIOLATIONS/ SHOW CAUSE

17. 2623 ASHWOOD AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition/Violation
Council District: 18
Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell, kelli.mitchell@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2022081904

Applicants: Present but did not wish to speak.

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: The applicant requests Commission approval for corrective plans for permit #2022081904 for a rear addition. The addition was permitted to be no taller than the building but was constructed four feet, five and a half inches (4’ 5.5”) taller than the building. The corrective plans would reduce the height of the addition so that it is no more than two feet (2’) taller than the existing structure.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed corrective plan for the addition at 2623 Ashwood Ave, finding that it meets Sections II(B)(1)(a and b) and II(B)(2)(f) for Height and Scale, II(B)(1)(c) and II(B)(2)(f) for Setback and Rhythm of Spacing, II(B)(2)(a) for Location, II(B)(2)(d) for Design, II(B)(1)(e) and II(B)(2)(f) for Roof Shape, and II(B)(1)(g) and II(B)(2)(f) for Proportion and Rhythm of Openings.

Motion: Commissioner Johnson moved to approve the proposed corrective plan for the addition at 2623 Ashwood Ave, finding that it meets Sections II(B)(1)(a and b) and II(B)(2)(f) for Height and Scale, II(B)(1)(c) and II(B)(2)(f) for Setback and Rhythm of Spacing, II(B)(2)(a) for Location, II(B)(2)(d) for Design, II(B)(1)(e) and II(B)(2)(f) for Roof Shape, and II(B)(1)(g) and II(B)(2)(f) for Proportion and Rhythm of Openings. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

18. 2410 9th AVE S.

Application: New Construction—Addition/Violation
Council District: 17
Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell, kelli.mitchell@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2021069982

Removed from agenda.

MHZC ACTIONS

19. 818 S DOUGLAS AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose joseph.rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023051770

Applicants: Ruth Hillis, owner and Eric Malo, architect

Public: Wayne Morris, 1603 Linden Ave

Description of Project: Application is to construct a new attached garage rear addition that extends wider than the historic house.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. The addition shall not extend wider than the historic house;
2. The inset from the Beech Avenue side rear corner of the historic house shall extend back at least two feet (2') before stepping back out;
3. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,
4. MHZC shall approve all material selections for roofing, windows, doors, porch elements, and site elements prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition meets sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), and VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Waverly-Belmont chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Johnson moved to approve the project based on its location at the edge of the district next to a different development pattern and the shape of the lot, with the following conditions:

1. **The inset from the Beech Avenue side rear corner of the historic house shall extend back at least two feet (2') before stepping back out;**
2. **The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,**
3. **MHZC shall approve all material selections for roofing, windows, doors, porch elements, and site elements prior to purchase and installation;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition meets sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), and VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Waverly-Belmont chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Williams seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

20. 128 2ND AVE N

Application: Signage

Council District: 19

Overlay: Second Avenue Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose joseph.rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023051355

Applicants: Dave Zelman, representative of business owner

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application for a projecting sign and a shingle sign on the Second Avenue elevation, and a painted sign on the First Avenue elevation.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. The projecting sign shall be reduced in size to meet the maximum area allocation;
2. The projecting sign shall be reduced in height to meet the maximum allowable height;
3. The projecting sign shall be reduced in width to meet the maximum allowable projection width;
4. The projecting sign shall have a minimum spacing of one foot (1') from the building façade;
5. The projecting sign shall be located below the windowsills of the third story;
6. The projecting sign shall not cover any architectural detailing on the building;
7. The edges of the projecting sign shall not be illuminated;
8. The projecting and shingle signs shall be inspected prior to installation;
9. Any associated painted signage illumination must be reviewed and permitted prior to installation; and,
10. Metallic, fluorescent, or day-glow paints shall not be used.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed signage can meet Section IV. (Signage) of the design guidelines for the Second Avenue Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Commission Johnson moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

- 1. The projecting sign shall be reduced in size to meet the maximum area allocation;**
- 2. The projecting sign shall be reduced in height to meet the maximum allowable height;**
- 3. The projecting sign shall be reduced in width to meet the maximum allowable projection width;**
- 4. The projecting sign shall have a minimum spacing of one foot (1') from the building façade;**
- 5. The projecting sign shall be located below the windowsills of the third story;**
- 6. The projecting sign shall not cover any architectural detailing on the building;**
- 7. The edges of the projecting sign shall not be illuminated;**
- 8. The projecting and shingle signs shall be inspected prior to installation;**
- 9. Any associated painted signage illumination must be reviewed and permitted prior to installation; and,**

10. Metallic, fluorescent, or day-glow paints shall not be used; finding that with these conditions, the proposed signage can meet Section IV. (Signage) of the design guidelines for the Second Avenue Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Williams seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

21. 1520 MCKENNIE AVE

Application: New Construction—Infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023028719

Applicants: Applicant was present but did not speak.

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Applicant proposes a duplex infill.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the infill with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. At least one walkway be added from the street to the front porch;
3. All paired window and doors have a four to six inch (4"-6") mullion between windows, and all windows and doors have nominal four inch (4") wood or cement fiberboard trim around them;
4. MHZC approve all windows and doors, the roof shingle color, the foundation material, and the materials of the driveway and walkway prior to purchase and installation; and
5. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill meets section V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Mayhall moved to approve the infill with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;**
- 2. At least one walkway be added from the street to the front porch;**
- 3. All paired window and doors have a four to six inch (4"-6") mullion between windows, and all windows and doors have nominal four inch (4") wood or cement fiberboard trim around them;**
- 4. MHZC approve all windows and doors, the roof shingle color, the foundation material, and the materials of the driveway and walkway prior to purchase and installation; and**

5. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill meets section V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

22. 3130 MCGAVOCK PIKE

Application: New Construction—Two Rivers Mansion Park Pavilion
Council District: 15
Overlay: Landmark
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, melissa.baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2023051152

Applicants: Brittany Hodge, architect

Public: Phil Claiborne, 2911 Western Hills Drive

Description of Project: The applicants propose the construction of an events pavilion behind the Two Rivers Mansion site.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the events pavilion with the following conditions:

- 1. MHZC approve all windows and doors, masonry samples, the metal panels, and all other materials prior to purchase and installation; and
- 2. Additional archeological subsurface excavation and monitoring be conducted, as determined in conjunction with MHZC’s archeologist.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed construction meets Sections V. and VI. of the design guidelines for historic landmarks.

Motion: Commissioner Johnson moved to approve the events pavilion with the following conditions:

- 1. MHZC approve all windows and doors, masonry samples, the metal panels, and all other materials prior to purchase and installation; and**
- 2. Additional archeological subsurface excavation and monitoring be conducted, as determined in conjunction with MHZC’s archeologist;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed construction meets Sections V. and VI. of the design guidelines for historic landmarks. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed with Commissioner Price recused.

23. 2217 LINDELL AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding

Council District: 17

Overlay: Woodland-in-Waverly Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose joseph.rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022074362

Removed from the agenda.

24. 4406 NEBRASKA AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding

Council District: 24

Overlay: Bowling House District Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023051369

Removed from the agenda.

25. 2500 C W LINDEN AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding (Addition to Existing Outbuilding)

Council District: 18

Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023051374

Removed from the agenda.

9. 1431 SHELTON AVE

Application: Demolition—Outbuilding; New Construction—Outbuilding

Council District: 07

Overlay: Landmark

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, melissa.baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023051266

Applicants: Rachel McCann and Josh Gray, owners and Ben Chandler, architect

Public: Dan Bennengfield, 1426 Shelton Ave, Jose Carrillo, 1428 Shelton
(Councilmember Benedict spoke at the beginning of the meeting.)

Description of Project: The applicant proposes to demolish and existing outbuilding and to construct a new outbuilding.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. MHZC approve all masonry samples, the permeable pavers, all windows and doors, and the roof selection prior to purchase and installation; and
2. MHZC approve any additional site changes or permanent landscape features prior to construction.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed outbuilding meets the Historic Landmark design guidelines and Sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials) and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Inglewood Place chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Cotton moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

- 1. MHZC approve all masonry samples, the permeable pavers, all windows and doors, and the roof selection prior to purchase and installation; and**
- 2. MHZC approve any additional site changes or permanent landscape features prior to construction;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed outbuilding meets the Historic Landmark design guidelines and Sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials) and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Inglewood Place chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

OLD BUSINESS

10. SECOND AVENUE DESIGN GUIDELINE REVISION

Public: Dave Johnston, architect (Public comment also received via email.)

Description of Project: Staff suggests the consideration of revising the design guidelines to meet contemporary needs and as a way to assist with the revitalization of Second Avenue North after the 2020 bomb.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed revision for the Second Avenue Design Guidelines, finding that the revision is consistent with the existing design guidelines and the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, specifically rooftop additions.

Motion: Commissioner Price moved to approve the proposed revision for the Second Avenue Design Guidelines with the conditions that the total number of stories shall not exceed base zoning, the number of the stories of the additions shall not exceed two stories, and that the requirement for a physical mock up be changed to a digital rendering , finding that the revision is consistent with the existing design guidelines and the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, specifically rooftop additions. Commissioner Williams seconded and the motion passed unanimous.

11. MHZC TRAINING: MIDDLE HOUSING PRESENTATION FROM THE PLANNING DEPT

Presented by Olivia Ranseen, Planning Department