



METROPOLITAN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
Sunnyside in Sevier Park, 1113 Kirkwood Avenue Nashville, TN 37204
615-862-7970, historicalcommission@nashville.gov

**METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC)
MINUTES**

January 15, 2025

**Sonny West Conference Center/
Fulton Campus**

2:00 p.m.

Commissioner Attendance: Chair Bell, Vice Chair Stewart and Commissioners Cashion, Mayhall, Mosley, and Smith

Staff Attendance: Legal Counsel Ann Mikkelsen, Historic Zoning Administrator Robin Zeigler and staff members Melissa Baldock, Scott Keckley, Joseph Rose, Melissa Sajid

1. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Requested Agenda Revisions

8. 200 4th Ave N – Revised for admin permit

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve the revised agenda. Commissioner Smith seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

2. ADOPTION OF DECEMBER 18, 2024 MINUTES

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve the minutes as presented. Commissioner Smith seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

3. COUNCILMEMBER PRESENTATIONS

Councilmember Benedict spoke to the Inglewood Place Design Guideline revision.

CONSENT

4. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH (see list in monthly meeting packet)

5. 317 S 11TH ST

Application: New Construction – Addition and Outbuilding; Setback Determination
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024113564 and T2024113919

6. 1407 STRATTON AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition; Demolition – Partial
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024113609

7. 1806 SWEETBRIAR AVE

Application: New Construction – Outbuilding
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024113233

8. 200 4th AVE N

Application: Signage
Council District: 19
Overlay: Downtown District Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024111667

9. 237 LAUDERDALE RD

Application: New Construction – Outbuilding
Council District: 24
Overlay: Cherokee Park Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024107531

10. 416 B BROADWAY

Application: New Construction – Addition
Council District: 19
Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024112302

11. 2112 W LINDEN AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition
Council District: 18
Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024113759

12. 2600 BELMONT BLVD

Application: New Construction – Addition

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren, Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024113561

Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to approve all cases on consent with their applicable conditions, with the exception of 200 4th Ave N, which was removed from the agenda. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

VIOLATION

13. 905 A N 12TH ST

Application: Reconstruction

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:2024078677

Applicant: Brent Atkinson

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Applicant seeks approval of the reconstruction of 905 North 12th Street.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the reconstruction with the following conditions:

1. A walkway be added from the sidewalk to the front porch;
2. The front door be at least half glass and all doors are approved prior to purchase and installation; and
3. MHZC approve all HVAC and utility locations.

With these conditions, staff finds that the reconstructed house matches what was approved under HCP 2024078677 and meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Mayhall moved to approve the reconstruction with the following conditions:

- 1. A walkway be added from the sidewalk to the front porch;**
- 2. The front door be at least half glass and all doors are approved prior to purchase and installation; and**
- 3. MHZC approve all HVAC and utility locations;**

finding that with these conditions, the reconstructed house matches what was approved under HCP 2024078677 and meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Smith seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

14. 1301 MCKENNIE AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition and Outbuilding; Violation

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#: 2024079467 and 2024079469

Applicant: Josh Hancock, contractor and John Root, architect

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: The applicant requests Commission approval of a proposal to correct a violation for work done differently than Preservation Permit #2024079467 for a rear addition and Preservation Permit #2024079469 for an outbuilding. Neither the constructed rear addition nor the constructed outbuilding match the permitted plans.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends denial of the addition and outbuilding as constructed and approval of the proposed correction with the following conditions:

1. The east side elevation of the addition is constructed to the original approved and permitted plans (HCP 2024079467);
2. The proposed two hundred and eighteen square foot (218SF) projecting balcony on the outbuilding is removed or revised to meet the design guidelines; and,
3. Revised drawings are submitted that reflect conditions 1 and 2 prior to permitting and prior to work.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition and outbuilding meets sections VI. (New Construction-Additions) and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to deny the addition and outbuilding as constructed and approval of the proposed correction for the addition with the following conditions:

1. The east side elevation of the addition is constructed to the original approved and permitted plans (HCP 2024079467);
2. The proposed two hundred and eighteen square foot (218SF) projecting balcony on the outbuilding is removed or revised to meet the design guidelines; and,
3. Revised drawings are submitted that reflect conditions 1 and 2 prior to permitting and prior to lifting stop work order;

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition and outbuilding meets sections VI. (New Construction-Additions) and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

DESIGNATION/ DESIGN GUIDELINES

15. INGLEWOOD PLACE DESIGN GUIDELINE REVISION

Council District: 07

Overlay: Inglewood Place Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Robin Zeigler, robin.zeigler@nashville.gov

Public: Becky Freeman and Matthew Bond [Public comment received via email.]

Description of Project: Councilmember Benedict requests a revision to the existing design guidelines regarding the removal and replacement of non-masonry sidings on existing buildings.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the revised design guidelines, as proposed, with the new revision to go into effect immediately.

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to approve the revision as presented. Commissioner Smith seconded and the motion failed without four concurring votes. Commissioners Smith, Vice-Chair Stewart, and Commissioner Mayhall voted in favor of the motion. Chair Bell and Commissioner Cashion voted against the motion and Commissioner Mosley recused.

MHZC ACTIONS

16. 2806 NATCHEZ TRCE

Application: New Construction – Addition

Council District: 18

Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024111471

Applicant: Lisa Minton

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak. [Public comment received via email.]

Description of Project: Application for the new construction of an attached garage which is connected to the historic house through a screen porch.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the proposed addition, finding that an attached garage does not meet section II(B)(1)(h)(2) of the design guidelines for the Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Commission Mosley moved to disapprove the proposed addition, finding that an attached garage does not meet section II(B)(1)(h)(2) of the design guidelines for the Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Mahyhall seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

17. 3609 WESTBROOK AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition; Demolition – Partial (Revision to Previously Approved Plan)

Council District: 24

Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:2024070810

Applicant: Brent Hunter with ArchiNerd

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application is to revise the preservation permit for an addition and partial demolition (HCP 2024070810) to include additional demolition including the foundation, siding, and window openings on the historic house and to revise the location of the dormer on the right-side elevation so that it is inset one foot (1') from the wall below and the side wall of the historic house.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the revised addition and partial demolition with the following conditions:

1. The building shall be shored on the interior and a shoring inspection shall be approved prior to removal of the siding and prior to the start of foundation work;
2. The mitered corner detail on the historic house shall remain;
3. The size of the paired window opening in the gable on the right-side elevation of the historic house shall remain unchanged;
4. Replacement foundation shall not increase in height from what it is now;
5. The dormer on the right-side elevation shall maintain two-foot (2') from the side gable on the historic house;
6. Any new or relocated utility meters shall be located on the side of the building;
7. The siding and trim shall have a smooth finish;
8. The shingle siding shall have a straight edge panel; and,
9. The final selections of the windows, pedestrian and garage doors, metal roofing, rear porch railing, walkway material, and a brick sample be approved prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition and partial demolition meets sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), and VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Richland-West End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to approve the revised addition and partial demolition with the following conditions:

1. **The building shall be shored on the interior and a shoring inspection shall be approved prior to removal of the siding and prior to the start of foundation work;**
2. **The mitered corner detail on the historic house shall remain;**
3. **Replacement foundation shall not increase in height from what it is now;**
4. **Any new or relocated utility meters shall be located on the side of the building;**
5. **The siding and trim shall have a smooth finish;**
6. **The shingle siding shall have a straight edge panel; and,**
7. **The final selections of the windows, pedestrian and garage doors, metal roofing, rear porch railing, walkway material, and a brick sample be approved prior to purchase and installation;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition and partial demolition meets sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), and VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Richland-West End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Smith seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

18. 50 VAUGHN RD

Application: New Construction - Infill

Council District: 34

Overlay: Landmark

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024107383

Applicant: Emilee Wilson Hamm, architect

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: The applicants propose the construction of a one-story building in Edwin Warner Park to serve as the offices of Friends of Warner Parks.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the building with the following conditions:

1. MHZC approve all windows and doors, masonry samples, the metal roof color and specifications, and all other materials prior to purchase and installation; and
2. Archaeological excavation be conducted across the project area based on consultation with the MHC archaeologist, beginning with a Phase I archaeological survey.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed construction meets Sections V. and VI. of the design guidelines for historic landmarks.

Motion: Commissioner Cashion moved to approve the building with the following conditions:

- 1. MHZC approve all windows and doors, masonry samples, the metal roof color and specifications, and all other materials prior to purchase and installation; and**
- 2. Archaeological excavation be conducted across the project area based on consultation with the MHC archaeologist, beginning with a Phase I archaeological survey;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed construction meets Sections V. and VI. of the design guidelines for historic landmarks. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

NEW BUSINESS

19. RULES OF ORDER REVISION

Description of Project: Staff proposes revisions to MHZC's Rules of Order and Procedure, specifically the section dealing with member terms and excessive absences, to be consistent with MCL 2.64.070.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval as presented.

Motion: Commissioner Mayhall moved to approve the revision as presented. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.