

METROPOLITAN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Sunnyside in Sevier Park, 1113 Kirkwood Avenue Nashville, TN 37204 615-862-7970, historicalcommission@nashville.gov

METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC) MINUTES

March 19, 2025

Sonny West Conference Center/ Fulton Campus 2:00 p.m.

Commissioner Attendance: Chair Bell, Vice Chair Stewart and Commissioners Cotton Mayhall, and Price

Staff Attendance: Legal Counsel Tara Ladd, Historic Zoning Administrator Robin Zeigler and staff members Melissa Baldock, Scott Keckley, Joseph Rose, Melissa Sajid, Stephanie Gittins (intern)

1. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Requested Agenda Revisions

8. 1141 Shelton Ave – Notification requirements not met

18. 312 Broadway – Revised for Administrative Permit

19. 1401 4th Ave N – Notification requirements not met

Motion:

Commissioner Price moved to approve the revised agenda. Commissioner Cotton seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

2. ADOPTION OF FEBRUARY 21 AND 26, 2025, MINUTES

Motion: Commissioner Cotton moved to approve the minutes as presented. Vice Chair Stewart seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

3. COUNCILMEMBER PRESENTATIONS

None present.

CONSENT

4. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH (see list in monthly meeting packet)

5. 1001 W EASTLAND AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition

Council District: 5

Overlay: Maxwell Heights Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren, jenny.warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2025017506

6. 400 LOCKLAND DR

Application: New Construction – Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2025009699

7. 404 RUDOLPH AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2025009046

8. 1141 SHELTON AVE

Application: New Construction – Outbuilding; Setback Determination

Council District: 07

Overlay: Inglewood Place Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2025018158

9. 2712 SUNSET PL

Application: New Construction – Addition; Setback Determination

Council District: 18

Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2025018024

10.1015 S DOUGLAS AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition and Outbuilding

Council District: 18

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2025018195 and T2025018503

11.3806 PRINCETON AVE

Application: New Construction – Outbuilding

Council District: 24

Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2025008568

12.4207 ABERDEEN RD

Application: New Construction – Addition

Council District: 24

Overlay: Cherokee Park Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny. Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2025017451

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve all cases on consent with their applicable conditions, with the exception of 1141 Shelton Ave, which was removed from the agenda. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

DESIGNATION/ DESIGN GUIDELINES

13.REVISION TO LOCKELAND SPRINGS-EAST END DESIGN GUIDELINES

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Robin Zeigler robin.zeigler@nashville.gov

Applicant: Councilmember Capp

Public: James Guthrie, Malina Springer [Public comment received via email.]

Description of Project: Councilmember Capp requests revisions to the Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay chapter in Part II of the consolidated design guidelines for Turn-of-the-20th-Century.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the revisions to the Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay chapter in Part II of the consolidated design guidelines for Turn-of-the-20th-Century. Staff finds the proposal to meet section 17.40.410 (B) as the guidelines are consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards that are a part of the Historic Preservation Act.

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to approve the revisions to the Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay chapter in Part II of the consolidated design guidelines for Turn-of-the-20th-Century; finding the proposal to meet section 17.40.410 (B) as the guidelines are consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards that are a part of the Historic Preservation Act. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

ITEMS TO BE CONSIDERED

14.1706 EASTLAND AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition and Outbuilding

Council District: 6

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024106485 and T2024106488

Applicant: Mike Marchetti, architect

Public: Cameron Armbruster, 1708 Eastland

Description of Project: Applicant proposes new infill and outbuilding on a vacant lot.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
- 2. MHZC approve the masonry sample, the window and door selections, and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation; and
- 3. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill and outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Mayall moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
- 2. MHZC approve the masonry sample, the window and door selections, and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation; and
- 3. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;

finding with these conditions, the proposed infill and outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20^{th-}Century Districts. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

15.122 S 12th ST

Application: New Construction – Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny. Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024106067

Applicant: Will Guidara, owner

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application for the new construction of an outbuilding. [Public comment received via email.]

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed outbuilding, with the following conditions:

- 1. The depth of the projecting porch shall be reduced to a maximum depth of six feet (6'); and,
- 2. MHZC shall review materials prior to purchase and installation including foundation material, cladding, trim, windows, doors and garage doors.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials) and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Price moved to approve the proposed outbuilding based on the size of the lot, with the conditions that MHZC shall review materials prior to purchase and installation including foundation material, cladding, trim, windows, doors and garage doors; finding with these conditions, the proposed outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials) and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Vice Chair Stewart seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

16.1524 FERGUSON AVE

Application: New Construction – Infill and Outbuilding

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2025017987 and T2025018118

Applicant: The applicant was not present.

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application is to demolish a non-contributing house and to construct infill and an outbuilding.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed demolition, infill, and outbuilding with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
- 2. The project shall not include a front yard parking pad;
- 3. All siding and trim shall have a smooth finish;
- 4. The final selections of the windows, doors, shingle color, all porch components, and brick for the infill shall be approved prior to purchase and installation;
- 5. The siding reveal shall not exceed five inches (5") on the outbuilding;
- 6. The final selections of the windows, doors, shingle color, trim, and a brick sample for the outbuilding shall be approved prior to purchase and installation; and
- 7. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building. With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed demolition, infill, and outbuilding

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed demolition, infill, and outbuilding meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to approve the proposed demolition, infill, and outbuilding with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
- 2. The project shall not include a front yard parking pad;
- 3. All siding and trim shall have a smooth finish;
- 4. The final selections of the windows, doors, shingle color, all porch components, and brick for the infill shall be approved prior to purchase and installation;
- 5. The siding reveal shall not exceed five inches (5") on the outbuilding;
- 6. The final selections of the windows, doors, shingle color, trim, and a brick sample for the outbuilding shall be approved prior to purchase and installation; and
- 7. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;

finding with these conditions, the proposed demolition, infill, and outbuilding meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

17.1814 4TH **AVENUE NORTH**

Application: New Construction – Infill and Outbuilding

Council District: 19

Overlay: Salemtown Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2025016200 and T2025016210

Applicant: Ian Lee

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Applicant proposes a duplex infill and an outbuilding.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the infill and outbuilding with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
- 2.MHZC approve masonry samples/selections, all windows and doors, the roof shingle color and the walkway material; and
- 3. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill and outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Salemtown chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Cotton moved to approve the infill and outbuilding with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
- 2. MHZC approve masonry samples/selections, all windows and doors, the roof shingle color and the walkway material; and
- 3. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;

finding with these conditions, the proposed infill and outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Salemtown chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

18.312 BROADWAY

Application: New Construction – Addition; Alterations

Council District: 19

Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2025017970

19.1401 4TH **AVENUE NORTH**

Application: New Construction – Addition; Alterations

Council District: 19

Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2025017499

OTHER BUSINESS

20. COMMISSIONER TRAINING

Deferred

21. RULES OF ORDER REVISION

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to revise the MHZC's Rules of Order and Procedure, specifically the section dealing with who can instigate design guideline revisions. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

22. REPORT FROM FEBRUARY COMMITTEE

Presented by David Price.

23. CREATION OF TRANSITION COMMITTEE

DECISION: Chair Bell appointed Commissioners Price and Cashion to a committee to participate in the creation of an MOU between the Metro Historical Commission and the Planning Department.

NEW BUSINESS

- July meeting will be at MNPS
- Submit applications for Leadership Award prior to or during the next meeting
- New general email account established: historiczoning@nashville.gov