



METROPOLITAN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
Sunnyside in Sevier Park, 1113 Kirkwood Avenue Nashville, TN 37204
615-862-7970, historicalcommission@nashville.gov

METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC) MINUTES

June 18, 2025

**Sonny West Conference Center/
Fulton Campus**

2:00 p.m.

Commissioner Attendance: Chair Bell, Vice-Chair Stewart and Commissioners Cashion, Cotton, Mayhall, and Smith

Staff Attendance: Legal Counsel Lora Fox, Historic Zoning Administrator Robin Zeigler and staff members Melissa Baldock, Stephanie Gittins (intern), Scott Keckley, Joseph Rose, Jenny Warren, Joni Williams (Planning Dept)

1. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Requested Agenda Revisions (Additional revisions may be made at the beginning of the meeting.)

- 14. 900 BRADFORD—Request to move to consent
- 20. 1513 GARTLAND AVENUE—Request for deferral
- 21. 105 3rd AVENUE SOUTH—Notification requirements not met
- 22. 625 WESTOVER DR—Request for deferral
- 23. 1214 ORDWAY PL—Revised for an administrative permit
- 25. RULES OF ORDER—Request for deferral

Motion:

Commissioner Cotton moved to approve the revised agenda. Vice-Chair Stewart seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

2. ADOPTION OF MAY 21, 2025, MINUTES

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve the minutes as presented. Commissioner Cotton seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

3. COUNCIL MEMBER PRESENTATIONS

No council members were present.

CONSENT

4. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH (see list in monthly meeting packet)

5. 1141 SHELTON AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding
Council District: 07
Overlay: Inglewood Place Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose
PermitID#:T2025018158

6. 1402 17TH AVE S

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 17
Overlay: South Music Row Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, melissa.baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2025046522

7. 926 HALCYON AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition; Setback Determination
Council District: 17
Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2025042377

8. 1108 PARIS AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 18
Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2025040957

9. 1517 ELMWOOD AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2025046598

10. 1210 5TH AVE N

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 19
Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren jenny.warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2025045401

11. 1013 PARIS

Application: Violation; New Construction—Addition

Council District: 18

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Robin Zeigler, robin.zeigler@nashville.gov

[Comment sent via email for 1013 Paris (in favor) and 1210 5th Ave N (in opposition).]

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve all items on consent including 900 Bradford Avenue and with all their applicable conditions. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

VIOLATIONS

12. 201 MANCHESTER AVE

Application: Violation; New Construction—Addition; Demolition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Scott Keckley Alan.Keckley@nashville.gov

PermitID#:20250043920

Applicant: Nick and Michelle Bates, owners

Public: Matt Nathanson, 198 Manchester

Description of Project: Owners converted the historic hip roof form on the rear of the house into a gable form and added three side dormers and a side gable with no permits.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the skylights, finding they meet section VI(E)(8) and disapproval of the revised roof form and dormers finding that they do not meet section III for demolition and VI for roof additions. Staff recommends reconstruction of the original roof form and removal of the added dormers be completed within ninety (90) days of the Commission's decision.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve the skylights, finding they meet section VI(E)(8) and to disapprove the revised roof form and dormers finding that they do not meet section III for demolition and VI for roof additions. Reconstruction of the original roof form and removal of the added dormers shall be completed within one-hundred and eighty (180) days of the Commission's decision. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

13. 931 S DOUGLAS AVE

Application: Violation; New Construction—Material

Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Scott Keckley Scott.Keckley@nashville.gov

PermitID#:2023028210

Applicant: David Romagna, contractor

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the rear chimney, as constructed, and disapproval of the lap siding on the side chimney, with the condition that the side chimney is clad in brick, stone, or stucco within sixty days (60) days of the Commission's decision; finding that the solution would meet section IV of the design guidelines for materials. If the brick, previously approved for this project, is not the material used for the side chimney, staff recommends a final review of the material prior to purchase and installation.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve the rear chimney, as constructed, and to disapprove the lap siding on the side chimney, with the condition that the side chimney is clad in brick, stone, or stucco within sixty days (60) days of the Commission's decision; finding that the solution would meet section IV of the design guidelines for materials. If the brick, previously approved for this project, is not the material used for the side chimney, staff recommends a final review of the material prior to purchase and installation. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

ITEMS TO BE CONSIDERED

14. 900 BRADFORD AVE

Application: 20New Construction—Addition; Partial Demolition

Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:2024094484

Approved on consent.

15. 305 S 10TH ST

Application: New Construction—Infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose

PermitID#:T2025037176

Applicant: Chris Wright

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak. [Comment sent via email.]

Description of Project: The application is to construct new infill on a vacant lot.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed infill with the following conditions:

- 1.The rooftop patios shall be removed from the proposal and revised drawings shall be submitted showing that the rooftop patios have been removed;
- 2.The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
- 3.Utility meters shall be located on the side of the building;
- 4.The reveal of lap siding with corner boards shall not exceed seven inches (7”) and shall be smooth, without an embossed grain;
- 5.Paired windows shall have a four inch to six inch (4”-6”) mullion between; and,
- 6.The final material selections for brick, windows, doors, and site elements shall be reviewed and approved by the MHZC prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve the proposed infill with the following conditions:

1. The rooftop patios shall be removed from the proposal and revised drawings shall be submitted showing that the rooftop patios have been removed;
2. The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
3. Utility meters shall be located on the side of the building;
4. The reveal of lap siding with corner boards shall not exceed seven inches (7”) and shall be smooth, without an embossed grain;
5. Paired windows shall have a four inch to six inch (4”-6”) mullion between; and,
6. The final material selections for brick, windows, doors, and site elements shall be reviewed and approved by the MHZC prior to purchase and installation;

finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

16. 3518 RICHLAND AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 24

Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren jenny.warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2025045993

Applicant: Andrew Heideman, designer

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application for the new construction of a rear porch and a covered side deck, that steps wider than the historic house.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed additions with

the following conditions:

- 1.The covered portion of the side deck shall not extend wider than it currently does (one foot, six inches 1'6" wider than the historic house);
- 2.If a new unit is required, the HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,
- 3.Materials are reviewed prior to purchase and installation, including siding, trim and porch materials.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed additions meet sections IV. (Materials), VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Richland-West End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Smith moved to approve the proposed additions with the following conditions:

- 1.If a new unit is required, the HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,**
- 2.Materials are reviewed prior to purchase and installation, including siding, trim and porch materials;**

finding that with the size of the home compared to the block face, the placement of the addition and with these conditions, the proposed additions meet sections IV. (Materials), VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Richland-West End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Vice-Chair Stewart seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

17. 3605 CENTRAL AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding

Council District: 24

Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2025038066

Applicant: Nick Dryden, designer

Public: Michelle Ganon, 3512 Central Ave; Elizabeth Roseman, 3607 Central Av; Hal Roseman, 3607 Central Ave [Comment sent via email.]

Description of Project: Application is to construct a rear addition that extends wider than the historic house on the right side and also includes a detached, 1.5 story outbuilding. No changes to the openings or materials on the historic house are proposed with this application.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed addition and outbuilding with the following conditions:

- 1.The addition shall not extend wider than the historic house;
- 2.The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;
- 3.The siding on the outbuilding shall have a smooth finish with a maximum reveal of seven inches (7");
4. For the outbuilding, there shall be four-inch (4") corner boards at the face of each exposed corner or the corners shall be mitered; and
- 5.The final selections of the windows, doors, and a stone sample be approved prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition and outbuilding can meet sections III. IV. (Materials), VI. (New Construction-Additions), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Richland-West End Annex chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Mayhall moved to approve the proposed addition and outbuilding with the following conditions:

- 1.The addition shall not extend wider than the historic house;**
- 2.The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**
- 3.The siding on the outbuilding shall have a smooth finish with a maximum reveal of seven inches (7");**
- 4. For the outbuilding, there shall be four-inch (4") corner boards at the face of each exposed corner or the corners shall be mitered; and**
- 5.The final selections of the windows, doors, and a stone sample be approved prior to purchase and installation;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition and outbuilding can meet sections III. IV. (Materials), VI. (New Construction-Additions), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Richland-West End Annex chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th Century Districts. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed with Vice-Chair Stewart recused.

18. 2009 SEVIER ST (AKA 1515 DAVIDSON ST, NAVAL BUILDING IN SHELBY PARK)

Application: Alteration; New Construction—Infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, melissa.baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2025046935 & T2025046938

Applicant: Gina Emmanuel, Centric Architecture

Public: [Comment sent via email.]

Description of Project: Applicant proposes to renovate the Naval Building in Shelby

Park and construct a new detached structure.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

- 1.MHZC approve the final specifications for all windows and doors prior to manufacture and installation;
- 2.MHZC approve the roof color prior to manufacture and installation.
- 3.MHZC approve the location of all utilities not indicated on these plans; and
- 4.MHZC approve all permanent landscape features and lighting prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed project meets the design guidelines for historic landmarks.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

- 1.MHZC approve the final specifications for all windows and doors prior to manufacture and installation;
- 2.MHZC approve the roof color prior to manufacture and installation.
- 3.MHZC approve the location of all utilities not indicated on these plans; and
- 4.MHZC approve all permanent landscape features and lighting prior to purchase and installation;

finding with these conditions, the proposed project meets the design guidelines for historic landmarks. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

19. 1425 FRANKLIN AVE

Application: New Construction—Infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren jenny.waren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2025044249

Applicant: Cheyenne Smith

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application for the new construction of infill.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed infill with the following conditions:

- 1.The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
- 2.The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;

3. Materials shall be reviewed prior to purchase and installation, including all doors and windows, the walkway material and a stone sample; and
4. A walkway shall be added from the front door to the sidewalk;

finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials), and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Cotton moved to approve the proposed infill with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;
3. Materials shall be reviewed prior to purchase and installation, including all doors and windows, the walkway material and a stone sample; and
4. A walkway shall be added from the front door to the sidewalk;

finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials), and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Smith seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

20. 1513 GARTLAND AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose

PermitID#: T2025033868

Deferred at the request of the applicant.

21. 105 3RD AVE S

Application: Rehabilitation—Storefront Replacement

Council District: 19

Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2025046924

Notification requirements not met.

22. 625 WESTOVER AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 23

Overlay: Belle Meade Links Triangle Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2025047057

Deferred at the request of the applicant.

23. 1214 ORDWAY PL

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren jenny.warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2025046417

Revised for administrative permit.

OTHER BUSINESS

24. OFFICER ELECTIONS

Commissioner Cotton moved to nominate Vice-Chair Stewart as Chair and Commissioner Cashion as Vice-Chair. Commissioner Mayhall seconded the motion unanimously.

25. REVISION OF RULES OF ORDER

Deferred

NEW BUSINESS

Chair Bell introduced Metro Historical Commissioner (MHC) James Hoobler as the new MHC representative.