



METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

July 17, 2018

Mark Michelin
California Environmental Associates
423 Washington St., 3rd Floor
San Francisco, California 94111

Re: **RFQ # 1033797, Scenario Planning and Greenhouse Gas Mitigation Wedges**

Dear Mr. Michelin:

The Metropolitan Government of Nashville and Davidson County (Metro) has completed the evaluation of submitted solicitation offer(s) to the above RFQ # 1033797 for Scenario Planning and Greenhouse Gas Mitigation Wedges. This letter hereby notifies you of Metro's intent to award to California Environmental Associates, contingent upon successful contract negotiations.

Depending on the file sizes, the responses to the procurement solicitation and supporting award documentation can be made available either by email, CD for pickup, or in person for inspection. If you desire to receive or review the documentation or have any questions, please contact Scott Ghee by email at scott.ghee@nashville.gov Monday through Friday between 8:30am and 3:30pm.

If the Procurement Nondiscrimination Program requirements were a part of this solicitation, the awardee must forward a signed copy of the "Letter of Intent to Perform as Subcontractor/Subconsultant/Supplier/Joint Venture" for any minority/women-owned business enterprises included in the response to the Business Assistance Office within two business days from this notification. Should you have any questions concerning this requirement, please contact Jerval Watson, BAO Representative, at 615-862-5461 or at jerval.watson@nashville.gov.

Thank you for participating in Metro's competitive procurement process.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, reading "Michelle A. Hernandez Lane".

Michelle A. Hernandez Lane
Purchasing Agent

Cc: Solicitation File
Other Offerors

Pursuant to M.C.L. 4.36.010 Authority to resolve protested solicitations and awards.

A. Right to Protest. Any actual or prospective bidder, offeror or contractor who is aggrieved in connection with the solicitation or award of a contract may protest to the Purchasing Agent. The protest shall be submitted in writing within ten (10) days after such aggrieved person knows or should have known of the facts giving rise thereto.

Award Justification for RFQ 1033797 - Scenario Planning and Greenhouse Gas Mitigation Wedges

Solicitation Title & Number			RFP Cost Points	RFP SBE/SDV Points	Total Cost Points
RFQ 1033797 - Scenario Planning and Greenhouse Gas Mitigation Wedges			28	7	35
Offeror's Name	Total Bid Amount	SBE/SDV Participation Amount	RFP Cost Points	RFP SBE/SDV Points	Total Cost Points
California Environmental Associates	\$55,040.00	\$0.00	28.00	0.00	28.00
ICF Incorporated, LLC	\$194,539.00	\$57,680.00	7.92	7.00	14.92
Integral Group	\$95,000.00	\$40,000.00	16.22	4.85	21.07
Milepost Consulting	\$93,600.00	\$46,410.00	16.46	5.63	22.09
NRG Energy, Inc.	\$80,000.00	\$25,000.00	19.26	3.03	22.29
Cooperative	\$216,000.00	\$0.00	7.13	0.00	7.13

	California Environmental Associates	ICF Incorporated	Integral Group	Milepost Consulting	NRG Energy, Inc.	Sustainability Solutions Group Workers Cooperative
Cost (35 points)	28	14.92	21.07	22.09	22.29	7.13
Experience and Qualifications (30 points)	20	25	20	15	15	12
Project Approach and Process (35 points)	25	28	25	10	20	25
Total	73	67.92	66.07	47.09	57.29	44.13

California Environmental Associates
Strengths – Firm demonstrated past projects of similar size, scope, and complexity. Firm demonstrated that their firm has at least 3 years’ of experience with climate change projects and climate changed mitigation modeling including this type of work with government agencies. Firm provided a detailed example of how their firm will create a BAU scenario that will help Nashville reach its 2020 and 2050 emission targets. Firm provided a sample BAU scenario of similar size, scope, and complexity provided to a past client. Firm attached a chart illustrating the project schedule in calendar days and listed assumptions that are being made to successfully achieve this schedule. Weaknesses -The overview of their company understanding of the project lacked specific detail. Firm did not clearly demonstrate their process for reviewing and analyzing data found in the 2014 inventory.

ICF Incorporated
Strengths – Firm demonstrated past projects of similar size, scope, and complexity. Firm demonstrated team members past performances on recent projects of similar scope and complexity. Firm demonstrated that their firm has at least 3 years’ of experience with climate change projects and climate changed mitigation modeling including this type of work with government agencies. Firm provided a detailed example of how their firm will create a BAU scenario that will help Nashville reach its 2020 and 2050 emission targets. Firm provided a sample BAU scenario of similar size, scope, and complexity provided to a past client. Firm demonstrate their process for reviewing and analyzing data found in the 2014 inventory. Weaknesses – The proposed project schedule was longer than that of the other firms. Firm stated that only 10 strategies would be quantitatively analyzed.

Integral Group
Strengths – Firm demonstrated that their firm has at least 3 years’ of experience with climate change projects and climate changed mitigation modeling including this type of work with government agencies. Firm provided a detailed example of how their firm will create a BAU scenario that will help Nashville reach its 2020 and 2050 emission targets. Firm attached a chart illustrating the project schedule in calendar days and listed assumptions that are being made to successfully achieve this schedule. Weaknesses – The overview of the company and understanding of the project lacked specific detail. Team members past performances on recent projects of similar size, scope, and complexity lacked specific detail. Firm failed to demonstrate experience with wedge analysis. Sample BAU scenario was building focused and not community.

Milepost Consulting

Strengths – Firm provided a detailed example of how their firm will create a BAU scenario that will help Nashville reach its 2020 and 2050 emission targets. Firm demonstrate their process for reviewing and analyzing data found in the 2014 inventory. Firm attached a chart illustrating the project schedule in calendar days and listed assumptions that are being made to successfully achieve this schedule.

Weaknesses – The overview of the company and understanding of the project lacked detail. Projects listed were not of similar size and scope. Firm failed to provide a sample BAU scenario of similar size, scope and complexity.

NRG Energy, Inc.

Strengths – Firm provided a detailed overview of the company and their understanding of the project. Firm provided a detailed example of how their firm will create a BAU scenario that will help Nashville reach its 2020 and 2050 emission targets. Firm demonstrated how they will ensure that the climate mitigation strategies and their mitigation potential and estimated cost, data sources, and a description of barriers and opportunities were accurate. Firm attached a chart illustrating the project schedule in calendar days and listed assumptions that are being made to successfully achieve this schedule.

Weaknesses – The sample BAU scenario was not of similar size, scope, and complexity. Firm failed to demonstrate experience of similar size and scope. Proposal was not clear on which firm worked on specific parts of the project. Firm stated that they would rely on publicly available data which may or may not have correct information rather than relying on the data found in the 2014 inventory.

Sustainability Solutions Group Workers Cooperative

Strengths – Firm provided a detailed overview of the company. Firm provided a detailed example of how their firm will create a BAU scenario that will help Nashville reach its 2020 and 2050 emission targets. Firm provided a sample BAU scenario of similar size, scope, and complexity provided to a past client. Firm demonstrate their process for reviewing and analyzing data found in the 2014 inventory. Firm attached a chart illustrating the project schedule in calendar days and listed assumptions that are being made to successfully achieve this schedule.

Weaknesses – Firm did have a clear understanding of this project. Experience listed was not of similar size and scope. Firm failed to provide a description of past projects.

Ghee, Scott (Finance - Procurement)

From: Watson, Jerval (Finance - Contract Compliance)
Sent: Tuesday, June 26, 2018 3:30 PM
To: Ghee, Scott (Finance - Procurement)
Subject: RE: Award Justification for RFQ 1033797 - Scenario Planning and Greenhouse Gas Mitigation Wedges

Good Afternoon Scott -

I have reviewed the bid for RFQ# 1033797 Scenario Planning and Greenhouse Gas Mitigation Wedges and I have confirmed that the bidder, has no SBE participation on this solicitation. Please let me know if you need anything additional. – JW

Jerval Watson
Business Development Officer
Department of Finance
Office of Minority and Women Business Assistance (BAO)
Metropolitan Nashville Davidson County Government
730 2nd Avenue South, 1st Floor; PO Box 196300
Nashville, TN 37219-6300
(P)615-862-5461; (F)615-862-6175



From: Ghee, Scott (Finance - Procurement)
Sent: Tuesday, June 26, 2018 11:38 AM
To: Watson, Jerval (Finance - Contract Compliance)
Subject: RE: Award Justification for RFQ 1033797 - Scenario Planning and Greenhouse Gas Mitigation Wedges

Jerval,

The department is recommending that an award be made to California Environmental Associates and they did not propose any SBE/SDV usage. Let me know if you agree with this assessment.

Thanks,

Scott Ghee

Procurement Officer
Department of Finance
Procurement Division
Metropolitan Nashville Davidson County
730 2nd Avenue South, Ste. 101
Nashville, TN 37210
Office- 615.880.3130

From: Ghee, Scott (Finance - Procurement)
Sent: Wednesday, June 20, 2018 11:04 AM
To: Creech, Laurel (General Services); Finke, John (Health); Hafkenschiel, Erin (Mayor's Office); Claxton, Gregory (Planning)
Cc: Watson, Jerval (Finance - Contract Compliance)
Subject: Award Justification for RFQ 1033797 - Scenario Planning and Greenhouse Gas Mitigation Wedges
Importance: High

All,

Please see the attached award justification and let me know if you approve. In order to continue moving along with this procurement I would appreciate if you could respond with your approval within the next 24 hours.

Thanks,

Scott Ghee
Procurement Officer
Department of Finance
Procurement Division
Metropolitan Nashville Davidson County
730 2nd Avenue South, Ste. 101
Nashville, TN 37210
Office- 615.880.3130