



**METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY**

**Request for Mayoral Selection of A&E Firm  
RFQ 946580, Neely's Bend Extension Design Services**

Metro received four (4) proposals for the A&E Review Board to consider. The Review Board submits for review and selection by the Mayor the top three (3) evaluated firms listed below in alphabetical order, accompanied by the Review Board's summary.

While it is acknowledged that the selection is solely that of the Mayor, it is the Review Board's recommendation that **DBS & Associates Engineering, Inc.** be considered for this project.

**A&E Firm:** **DBS & Associates Engineering, Inc.**

**Strengths:** Strong detailed business plan and methodology that included unique innovative approach such as reuse of existing storm systems, drone photography, and pervious pavement for bike track; and Inside Davidson County.

**Weaknesses:** Experience on similar project not urban; specialized expertise of prime is less than peers; gantt chart not in line with detailed schedule summary chart; smaller staff; and diversity plan lacked detail on strategic approach and methodologies taken to maximize usage of SMWBEs.

**MWBE Plan:** Proposed the engagement of Hawkins Partners for Landscape Architect; Booker Engineering, Inc. for Lighting/Signing/Utilities/ADA; and Varallo Public Relations for Public Relations.

**SBE/SDV Plan:** Pledged 15% SBE/SDV over life of the project. Proposed the engagement of Hawkins Partners for Landscape Architect; Booker Engineering, Inc. for Lighting/Signing/Utilities/ADA; RG Phillips Consulting, LLC for Traffic Support Team; and Varallo Public Relations for Public Relations. (Hawkins Partners, Booker Engineering, and Varallo Public Relations are also MWBEs).

**A&E Firm:** **Kimley-Horn and Associates**

**Strengths:** Organizational capacity; Inside Davidson County.

**Weaknesses:** Experience demonstrated on similar projects not within the same complexity as scope of work; resumes not in line with organizational chart; long schedule duration; and diversity plan lacked detail on strategic approach and methodologies taken to maximize usage of SMWBEs and to ensure prompt payments to SMWBEs.

**MWBE Plan:** Proposed the engagement of L. I. Smith and Associates, Inc. for Surveying and Right-of-Way/Easement Exhibits; Cannon & Cannon, Inc. for Utility, Electrical and

Lighting Design; K. S. Ware and Associates, LLC for Geotechnical Services; and Varallo Public Relations for Public Meetings, Public Relations/Website.

**SBE/SDV Plan:** Pledged 15% SBE/SDV over life of the project. Proposed the engagement of L. I. Smith and Associates, Inc. for Surveying and Right-of-Way/Easement Exhibits; K. S. Ware and Associates, LLC for Geotechnical Services Varallo Public Relations for Public Meetings, Public Relations/Website; and Centric Architecture for Historical Consultant and Architecture Master Planning (L. I. Smith and Associates, Inc, K.S. Ware & Associates, and Varallo Public Relations are also MWBEs).

**A&E Firm:** **Ragan-Smith Associates**

**Strengths:** Strong specialized expertise; organizational capacity; and Inside Davidson County.

**Weaknesses:** Business plan and methodology was generic and lacked the robust content as other submittals; smaller staff; and diversity plan lacked detail on strategic approach and methodologies taken to maximize usage of SMWBEs.

**MWBE Plan:** Proposed the engagement of K. S. Ware and Associates, LLC for Geotechnical and Environmental Engineers; Booker Engineering, Inc. for Street Lighting, Traffic Signals, and Electrical Engineering; and Varallo Public Relations for Public Relations and Stakeholder Outreach.

**SBE/SDV Plan:** Pledged 20% SBE/SDV over life of the project. K. S. Ware and Associates, LLC for Geotechnical and Environmental Engineers; Booker Engineering, Inc. for Street Lighting, Traffic Signals, Electrical Engineering; Varallo Public Relations for Public Relations and Stakeholder Outreach; and Ashworth Environmental Design, LLC for Wayfinding, Street Furniture, Public Art. (K.S. Ware & Associates, Booker Engineering, Inc., and Varallo Public Relations are also MWBEs).

## RFQ # 946580 - NEELY'S BEND ROAD EXTENSION DESIGN SERVICES

Offeror	DBS & Associates Engineering, Inc.	Kimley-Horn and Associates	Parsons Brinckerhoff, Inc	Ragan-Smith Assoc Inc.
Experience on Similar Projects (15 Points)	13.00	12.00	13.00	15.00
Specialized Expertise of Team Members (10 Points)	10.00	9.00	9.00	10.00
Business Plan and Methodology (60 Points)	58.00	55.00	51.00	50.00
Organizational Capacity (10 Points)	8.00	10.00	9.00	10.00
Diversity Plan (5 Points)	2.25	2.50	1.50	1.75
<b>Total Evaluation Scores</b>	<b>91.25</b>	<b>88.50</b>	<b>83.50</b>	<b>86.75</b>

### **DBS & Associates Engineering, Inc.**

**Strengths** – Strong detailed business plan and methodology that included unique innovative approach such as reuse of existing storm systems, drone photography, and pervious pavement for bike track; and Inside Davidson County.

**Weaknesses** – Experience on similar project not urban; specialized expertise of prime is less than peers; ghatt chart not in line with detailed schedule summary chart; smaller staff; and diversity plan lacked detail on strategic approach and methodologies taken to maximize usage of SMWBEs.

### **Kimley-Horn and Associates**

**Strengths** – Organizational capacity; Inside Davidson County.

**Weaknesses** – Experience demonstrated on similar projects not within the same complexity as scope of work; resumes not in line with organizational chart; long schedule duration; and diversity plan lacked detail on strategic approach and methodologies taken to maximize usage of SMWBEs and to ensure prompt payments to SMWBEs.

### **Parson Brinckerhoff**

**Strengths** – Inside Davidson County.

**Weaknesses** – Experience demonstrated on similar projects not within the same complexity as scope of work; specialized expertise of team members had limited retro-fit experience reflected on resumes; business plan and methodology was generic and lacked the robust content as other submittals; diversity plan provided acknowledgement but did not included details about the requested components.

### **Ragan-Smith Associates**

**Strengths** – Strong specialized expertise; organizational capacity; and Inside Davidson County.

**Weaknesses** - Business plan and methodology was generic and lacked the robust content as other submittals; smaller staff; and diversity plan lacked detail on strategic approach and methodologies taken to maximize usage of SMWBEs.

Proposer #	Commitment to SMWBE Participation on the project (2 pts)	Strategic Approach to maximizing SMWBE (2 pts)	Monitoring and Reporting of SMWBE participation (0.5 pts)	Efforts ensure prompt payment (0.5 pts)	Total	Strength	Weakness
<b>DBS</b>	1	0.25	0.5	0.5	2.25	Detailed information provided on ensuring prompt pay, utilization and reporting tactics and proposed subcontractors identification.	Plan lacked detail on strategic approach and methodologies taken to maximize usage of SMWBEs.
<b>Kimley-Horn</b>	2	0	0.5	0	2.5	Firm provided great details on past usage of SMWBEs.	Details lacking for strategic approach and methodologies taken to maximize usage of SMWBEs and to ensure prompt payments to SMWBEs.
<b>WSP-Parsons Brinckerhoff</b>	1	0.5	0	0	1.5	Plan expressed commitment and benefits of SMWBEs.	Firm did not address all components of the diversity plan and thus overall response lacked details.
<b>Ragan-Smith</b>	0.5	0.25	0.5	0.5	1.75	Detailed information provided for ensuring prompt payment, and utilization of reporting and monitoring tactics.	Plan lacked details on strategic approach and methodologies to ensure maximum participation by SMWBEs.

BAO SBE Assessment Sheet

<b>BAO Specialist:</b> Tina R. Burt
<b>Contract Specialist:</b> Terri Troup
<b>Date:</b> 10/25/16
<b>Department Name:</b> Public Works
<b>RFP/ITB Number:</b> 946580
<b>Project Name:</b> Neely's Bend Road Extension Design Services - A/E (15% SBE/SDV Requirement)

Primary Contractor	SBEs Approved?	Comments
DBS & Associates Engineering, Inc.	Yes	SBE/SDV Plan: Proposer acknowledged a 15% participation of SBE/SDV over life of the project as required by the solicitation. Proposed the engagement of SBE subcontractors Hawkins Partners for Landscape Architect, Booker Engineering, Inc. for Lighting/Signing/Utilities/ADA, RG Phillips Consulting, LLC for Traffic Support Team, and Varallo Public Relations for Public Relations.
Kimley-Horn and Associates, Inc.	Yes	SBE/SDV Plan: Proposer acknowledged a 15% participation of SBE/SDV over life of the project as required by the solicitation. Proposed the engagement of L. I. Smith and Associates, Inc. for Surveying and Right-of-Way/Easement Exhibits, K. S. Ware and Associates, LLC for Geotechnical Services Varallo Public Relations for Public Meetings, Public Relations/Website, and Centric Architecture for Historical Consultant and Architecture Master Planning.
Parsons Brinckerhoff, Inc.	Yes	SBE/SDV Plan: Proposer acknowledged a 15% participation of SBE/SDV over life of the project as required by the solicitation. Proposed the engagement of Varallo Public Relations for Public Engagement/Relations, Geotek Engineering for Geotechnical Engineering and CEI/Materials Testing, Hodgson Douglas for Landscape Architecture and Civil Infrastructure Associates for Survey Support
Ragan-Smith Associates, Inc.	Yes	SBE/SDV Plan: Proposer acknowledged a 15% participation of SBE/SDV over life of the project as required by the solicitation. Proposed the engagement of K. S. Ware and Associates, LLC for Geotechnical and Environmental Engineers, Booker Engineering, Inc. for Street Lighting, Traffic Signals, Electrical Engineering, Varallo Public Relations for Public Relations and Stakeholder Outreach, and Ashworth Environmental Design, LLC for Wayfinding, Street Furniture, Public Art.

## PNP Compliance Results From

Department Name: Public Works RFP/ITB Number: RFQ # 946580 Neely's Bend Road & Extension Design Services- A/E		
Primary Contractor	PNP Compliant (Yes/No)	Determination Comments/% of Participation Proposed or Bid
<b>DBS &amp; Associates Engineering, Inc.</b>	Yes	Proposer is compliant with the Procurement Nondiscrimination Program requirements having reached out to three certified MWBE firms as required by the Procurement Code. Proposed the engagement of Hawkins Partners (WBE) for Landscape Architect, Booker Engineering, Inc. (MWBE) for Lighting/Signing/Utilities, and Varallo Public Relations (WBE) for Public Relations. Consistent with the Procurement Code, actual dollar amounts will be confirmed upon contract award.
<b>Kimley-Horn and Associates, Inc.</b>	Yes	Proposer is compliant with the Procurement Nondiscrimination Program requirements having reached out to three certified MWBE firms as required by the Procurement Code. Proposed the engagement of L. I. Smith and Associates, Inc. (WBE) for Surveying and Right-of-Way/Easement Exhibits, Cannon & Cannon, Inc., (WBE) for Utility, Electrical, and Lighting Design, K. S. Ware and Associates, LLC (WBE) for Geotechnical Services and Varallo Public Relations (WBE) for Public Meetings, Public Relations/Website. Consistent with the Procurement Code, actual dollar amounts will be confirmed upon contract award.
<b>Parsons Brinckerhoff, Inc</b>	Yes	Proposer is compliant with the Procurement Nondiscrimination Program requirements having reached out to three certified MWBE firms as required by the Procurement Code. Proposed the engagement of Varallo Public Relations (WBE) for Public Relations Support, Geotek Engineering (MBE) for Geotechnical Engineering and Civil Infrastructure Associates (WBE) for Survey Support. Consistent with the Procurement Code, actual dollar amounts will be confirmed upon contract award.
<b>Ragan-Smith Associates, Inc.</b>	Yes	Proposer is compliant with the Procurement Nondiscrimination Program requirements having reached out to three certified MWBE firms as required by the Procurement Code. Proposed the engagement of K. S. Ware and Associates, LLC (WBE) for Geotechnical and Environmental Engineers, Booker Engineering, Inc. (MWBE) for Street Lighting, Traffic Signals, Electrical Engineering, and Varallo Public Relations (WBE) for Public Relations and Stakeholder Outreach. Consistent with the Procurement Code, actual dollar amounts will be confirmed upon contract award.

Date: 10/25/16  
 Metro Buyer: Terri Troup  
 BAO Rep: Tina R. Burt